SO/AC Meeting #16 (12 January 2017 @ 13:00 UTC)

Attendees:

Sub-group Members: Alan Greenberg, Andreea Brambilla, Avri Doria, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Christopher Wilkinson, Erich Schweighofer, Herb Waye, Jorge Villa, Julf Helsingius, Michael Abejuela, Olga Cavalli, Sebastien Bachollet, Steve DelBianco, Thomas Rickert   (14)

Observers/Guests: Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong, Mark Carvell   (2)

Staff: Brenda Brewer, Lars Hoffmann, Nathalie Vergnolle

Apologies: Farzaneh Badii, Kavouss Arasteh

** If your name is missing from attendance or apology, please send note to acct-staff@icann.org **

Transcript

- Word Doc
- PDF

Recording

- Adobe Connect Replay
- mp3 Replay

Agenda

0. Call Administration (2-5 min CLO)

   *apologies received from: Farzaneh Badii

1. Review of any AI's from call #15 on December 15th

2. Updates:

   * Input from the Survey sent to SO and AC's

   * Any Sub Team Activities since our last call

3. Discussion, current DRAFT documentations readings and review

   a) Data Capture documentation of input materials from SOAC's

   b) Overall Reporting See https://docs.google.com/document/d/14XrP2QiGv04qNtn_EuOR3nEc6uAN2ySlpQM5f69PNI8/edit?usp=sharing[docs.google.com][docs.google.com]

    - track 1. Review and discuss time line and process for Drafting ST1 to conduct Data Capture and Develop Recommendations to improve SO and AC processes for accountability, transparency, and participation that are helpful to prevent capture.

    - track 2. Evaluate the proposed "Mutual Accountability Roundtable" to assess its viability and, if viable, undertake the necessary actions to implement it. The preliminary conclusion in the doc on page 4

    - track 3. Assess whether the Independent Review Process (IRP) should be applied to SO & AC activities.------ The preliminary conclusion in the doc on page 5 -----> Discussion regarding this outcome and CCWG Plenary.

4. Next Meeting and future Meeting schedule

       ○ 19 January @ 05:00 UTC ??
       ○ 26 January @ 13:00 UTC

5. AOB and review of any AI's

Notes (including relevant parts of chat):

0. Call Administration (2-5 min CLO)

   · No audio only, roll call will be taken from the AC room.

   · No SOI updates.

   · Please test your audio, staff can get you a dial-out if anyone needs one

1. Review of any AI's from call #15 on December 15th

- Thanks to all who were able to contribute over the break to assembling responses from the questionnaire.

- Still accepting volunteers to join the team in charge of analyzing the responses.

- request to change the time of 19 January @ 05:00 UTC: not possible - the 19:00 slot is not available.

2. Updates:

   * Input from the Survey sent to SO and AC's

      - have received substantial inputs

      - **Steve DelBianco:** All 7 of the responses received are here: https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/0B2CLsyXLvhweOVZLSWctMVhTaUU [drive.google.com]

      - asking Stafff to add the responses to the wiki

      - **Brenda Brewer:** already done. See SOAC documents here: https://community.icann.org/x/IBWOAw[community.icann.org]

      - **Steve DelBianco:** We did not receive a response from ALAC or from RSSAC, as far as I can tell

      - **Alan Greenberg:** ALAC response is coming, in about 2 weeks (estimated by end of January). ALAC was busy with the review.

      - **CW:** I would like to get a heads up e-mail when a new response is received.

      - Cheryl: we will, probably by a message to the full list

      - Steve: do we know if RSSAC plans to provide a response? if not, could we reach out to them?

      - **Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO):** we will make a follow-up with RSSAC, viable CCWG Co-Chairs (Thomas)

      - There are a few more constituency groups that have not responded, not sure if they will.

      - **Thomas Rickert:** We can switch to "harassement mode" to get more responses

      - **avri doria:** we have a response from NCUC, not NCSG. i will look into getting one from the NCSG

      ACTION (Thomas Rickert): reach out to RSSAC to find out if they will provide an answer to the SO/AC questionnaire, and get an understanding from the various GNSO subgroups of which ones plan to provide a response.

         * Any Sub Team Activities since our last call

      - sub team activities ducktale into agenda item 3

3. Discussion, current DRAFT documentations readings and review

   a) Data Capture documentation of input materials from SOAC's

      - **Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina:** Cherly, as I have expressed I volunteer to be part of the drafting team.

      - **Steve DelBianco:** Our task in Track 1 is to "review and develop recommendations" on SOAC Accountability, per this Bylaw: Section 27.1. WORK STREAM 2, (b) The CCWG-
      Accountability recommended in its Supplemental Final Proposal on Work Stream 1 Recommendations to the Board, dated 23 February 2016 ("CCWG-
      Accountability Final Report") that the below matters be reviewed and developed following the adoption date of these Bylaws ("Work Stream 2
       Matters"), in each case, to the extent set forth in the CCWG-Accountability Final Report:
      (iii) Supporting Organization and Advisory Committee accountability, including but not limited to improved processes for accountability, transparency, and participation that are helpful to prevent capture;

      - **Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO):** huge thanks to all who have contributed to this work so far and especially Farzaneh

      - Steve: We have quite a bit of work to do, have to read all the responses in detail, and we need to organize our work

      - Who had stepped forward to help? Steve, Olga. We don't have the people to do the work on this call.

      - **Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina:** There were other volunteers, maybe they are not in the call now

      - **Michael Abejuela (ASO):** I am happy to assist in this work

      - **CW:** I volunteered for something last year, but I have a holiday blank as to what exactly I was supposed to do.

      - Can staff go back to previous notes to see who else had volunteered?

      - Steve: any comments from the group on the work that was done by the drafting team so far?

      - Alan: we shouldn't get too much in the details in our recommendations, the intent is more important than the implementation.

      - **Michael Abejuela (ASO):** We should be careful on taking the stance of "recommending" vs. stating an observation and stating a principle of accountability for which we strive. Agree with Alan that it should not be a mandate particularly in implementation of a particular principle.

· Steve: We should be explicit in what was reported. For example, with regards to decision appeal mechanisms, we could 1) identify which SO/AC have
any, and which don't, 2) from there we could make the recommendation that those who don't have one consider implementing one.

· Cheryl: we need to carefully weigh in if our recommendations are implementable.

· Constituency groups each have a charter. We can get inputs from these charters.

· **avri doria:** the NCSG chater is at: <https://gnso.icann.org/en/improvements/ncsg-charter-05may11-en.pdf>[gnso.icann.org]

· **Sebastien (ALAC):** http://www.npoc.org/media/files/NPOC_Charter_Approved_06-24-2011.pdf[npoc.org]

b) Overall Reporting See https://docs.google.com/document/d/14XrP2QiGv04qNtn_EuOR3nEc6uAN2ySlpQM5f69PNI8/edit?usp=sharing[docs.google.com][docs.google.com]

    - track 1. Review and discuss time line and process for Drafting ST1 to conduct Data Capture and Develop Recommendations to improve SO and AC processes for
accountability, transparency, and participation that are helpful to prevent capture.

    - track 2. Evaluate the proposed "Mutual Accountability Roundtable" to assess its viability and, if viable, undertake the necessary actions to implement it. The preliminary
conclusion in the doc on page 4

    - track 3. Assess whether the Independent Review Process (IRP) should be applied to SO & AC activities.
------ The preliminary conclusion in the doc on page 5 -----> Discussion regarding this outcome and CCWG Plenary.

· Cheryl: Only 7 weeks left before Copenhagen.
We would like to have a document ready in advance to send to the CCWG, in order to receive guidance from the plenary
during the F2F meeting. Overall reporting document needs to continue to be updated and worked on, not only during these calls but also in
between.

· **CW:** since I shall leave the call early, please note lthat under Track 2 (MART) and Track 3 (IRP), my point of view is reflected in the draft report, so I would not support
substantive amendment.

4. Next Meeting and future Meeting schedule

· 19 January @ 05:00 UTC

· 26 January @ 13:00 UTC

· 02 February @ 19:00 UTC

· 09 February @ 05:00 UTC

· 16 February @ 13:00 UTC

· 02 March @ 05:00 UTC

5. AOB and review of any AI's

Action Items

ACTION (Thomas Rickert): reach out to RSSAC to find out if they will provide an answer to the SO/AC questionnaire, and get an understanding from the various GNSO subgroups of which ones plan to provide a response.

Documents Presented

- SOACAccountabilityReportDraftv1.docx.pdf
- Data-Capture-Accountability.pdf

Chat Transcript

Brenda Brewer: (1/12/2017 06:34) Good day all and welcome to SO/AC Accountability Subgroup Meeting #16 on 12 January 2017 @ 13:00 UTC!

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (06:53) Hi, my schedule changed and I can join the call, so apologies sent are no longer valid :)

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (06:53) Happy new year!

Brenda Brewer: (06:53) Great! Welcome Olga!

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (06:54) Hi dear Brenda Happy New year!

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (06:54) My mic does not work but I can hear without problem

CW: (06:58) Best wishes for the New Year. CW

Steve DelBianco: (07:10) All 7 of the responses received are here: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__drive.google.com_drive_folders_0B2CLsyXLvhweOVZLSWctMVhTaUU&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=xOz0hB_h7wmq-thFqazX1nVS1KW06H7pGVv8_Eb5yPE&e=

Steve DelBianco: (07:10) We did not receive a response from ALAC or from RSSAC, as far as I can tell

Brenda Brewer: (07:13) See SOAC documents here: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_x_IBWOAw&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=0nUAmdYZZFPvWNUX6pngfj0AvenJ_A9YsExEWZmdErw&e=

Brenda Brewer: (07:14) My pleasure

Alan Greenberg: (07:14) It is coming

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:15) great to have this sorted repository for this part of our work thx Brenda

CW: (07:15) I would like to get a heads up e-mail when a new response is received. I just saw that a few minutes ago. Thankyou Brenda. CW

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:15) Christopher we will

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:16) probably by a message to the full list

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:18) I am carefully and deliberately remaining silent on this *at this stage *

Alan Greenberg: (07:18) Wise!

Steve DelBianco: (07:19) RIght, Sebastien.   These consulting organizations take turns reviewing the several AC/SOs

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:21) Hi Brenda the document sent by Farzaneh is the first one in thelist of the wiki, isnt it?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:23) we will make a follow-up with RSAC, viable CCWG Co-Chairs of course so

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:23) it against Thomas and I

Steve DelBianco: (07:24) Farzi's draft Google Doc (displayed) is also at https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1OyUsSISvrcvotPpTCSqpAr4iqz7edoyUKPQD0ef-2DYj0_edit&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=Zg_82qLsWAG05XD4r5qstxYn9Wr8wVkgWEZT-R03pFk&e=

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:25) Cherly, as I have expressed I volunteer to be part of the drafting team.

Steve DelBianco: (07:26) Our task in Track 1 is to "review and develop recommendations" on SOAC Accountability, per this Bylaw: Section 27.1. WORK STREAM 2, (b) The CCWG-Accountability recommended in its Supplemental Final Proposal on Work Stream 1 Recommendations to the Board, dated 23 February 2016 ("CCWG-Accountability Final Report") that the below matters be reviewed and developed following the adoption date of these Bylaws ("Work Stream 2 Matters"), in each case, to the extent set forth in the CCWG-Accountability Final Report:(iii) Supporting Organization and Advisory Committee accountability, including but not limited to improved processes for accountability, transparency, and participation that are helpful to prevent capture;

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:26) huge thanks to all

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:27) who have contributed to this work so far and especially Farzaneh

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:28) indeed Stev

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:30) this is pure Datacapture at this stage, much appreciated of course and a true starting point. but *much* work in the next step of analysis to come now

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:30) Olga volunteerred

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:30) I have no mic

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:32) There were othrer volunteers, maybe they are not in the call now

Michael Abejuela (ASO): (07:32) I am happy to assist in this work

CW: (07:32) I volunteerred for something last year, but I have a holiday blank as to what exactly I was supposed to do.

Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong: (07:33) the end paragraph of point 3 it is the same that point 4

Thomas Rickert: (07:33) We can switch to "harassement mode" to get more responses :-)

CW: (07:33) Okay. Steve.

Thomas Rickert: (07:34) I am happy to reach out to the GNSO Chair for help and talk to individual groups

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:34) pretty sure it was this zest Christopher

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:34) thx Thomas

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:35) great Steve thx

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:36) No more closed meetings in GAC :)

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (07:37) :)

Steve DelBianco: (07:38) This is the question we asked: - Do your AC/SO have mechanisms by which your members can challenge or appeal decisions and elections? Please include link where they can be consulted.

Michael Abejuela (ASO): (07:40) We should be careful on taking the stance of "recommending" vs. stating an observation and stating a principle of accountability for which we strive. Agree with Alan that it should not be a mandate particularly in implementation of a particular principle.

CW: (07:40) since I shall leave the call early, please note lthat under Track 2 (MART) and Track 3 (IRP), my point of view is reflected in the draft repoort, so I would not support substantive amendment. CW

Steve DelBianco: (07:41) THank you , CW.   When you can, please look at the Track 1 document and offer your suggestions there

CW: (07:42) OK Steve. I need to read all the new documents to get back on stream here.

avri doria: (07:46) do we expect to receive on for the GNSO itself?

avri doria: (07:46) ok, thanks

avri doria: (07:46) NCUC not NCSG

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:46) sorry my audio dropped out

avri doria: (07:47) i will look into gettig one from the NCSG

Sebastien (ALAC): (07:48) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__www.npoc.org_&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=jTSqUdaLlQ8U7-GSEEjz0D3JMaKufG4dBN7fQV_UdqU&e=

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:48) good plan as fall back if we can

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:49) thx Avri

avri doria: (07:49) no a charter was approved at their founding

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:49) best to check

avri doria: (07:49) will take a look for it.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (07:49) exactly Alan

Sebastien (ALAC): (07:50) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__www.npoc.org_media_files_NPOC-5FCharter-5FApproved-5F06-2D24-2D2011.pdf&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=4HDDF3X7j7R4cECIh4tC0E57g1tkY_ft2n8JTKA7Sa4&e=

Alan Greenberg: (07:50) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__www.npoc.org_media_files_NPOC-5FCharter-5FApproved-5F06-2D24-2D2011.pdf&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=4HDDF3X7j7R4cECIh4tC0E57g1tkY_ft2n8JTKA7Sa4&e=

avri doria: (07:51) fyi, though i will get the questions answered, the NCSG chater is at: <https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__gnso.icann.org_en_improvements_ncsg-2Dcharter-2D05may11-2Den.pdf&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=WIIRW0FhQylCuN9kp62o7h5Z6Q5DP_S8YNlWWv0hdbQ&e= >

Thomas Rickert: (07:51) I will be chasing NPOC

avri doria: (07:53) is ALAC providing one?

Alan Greenberg: (07:55) Sorry was in process of connecting to my next meeting. One what? A reply to the questions? If so, yes

CW: (07:55) B'ye, C.

Steve DelBianco: (07:59) Per today's call, I added to the Track 1 document: Track 1 charter, and the questions we sent to the AC/SOs.

Steve DelBianco: (08:00) see https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1OyUsSISvrcvotPpTCSqpAr4iqz7edoyUKPQD0ef-2DYj0_edit&d=DgIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=kbiQDH54980u4nTPfwdloDLY6-6F24x0ArAvhdeDvvc&m=2IPYz89KNFjY7WaQeK3JyOtXZ-E4uJ99oNjxw68pRfI&s=Zg_82qLsWAG05XD4r5qstxYn9Wr8wVkgWEZT-R03pFk&e=

Alan Greenberg: (08:00) KInky!

Herb Waye Ombuds: (08:01) so long folks... all the best

Michael Abejuela (ASO): (08:01) Thank you everyone, bye!