Meeting Notes

2022

2 March 2022
agenda | Zoom replay | audio | transcript | chat | attendance

2021

12 May 2021
agenda | Zoom replay | audio | transcript | chat | attendance

2020

18 November 2020

agenda | screen recording | audio | transcript | chat | attendance

20 May 2020

agenda | screen recording | audio | transcript | chat | attendance

06 April 2020

agenda | screen recording | mp3 | transcript | attendance

2019

15 May 2019

agenda | screen recording | chat | mp3 | transcript | attendance

20 Feb 2019

agenda | ac chat | ac recording | mp3 | transcript | attendance

2018

ICANN64 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

agenda | transcript | ac recording

---

21 September 2018

agenda | mp3 | ac recording | ac chat | attendance | transcript

---

31 July 2018: CCWP-HR: Due Diligence and Why it matters

agenda | mp3 | mp4 | ac chat | attendance

---

01 June 2018

agenda | transcript | mp3

---

03 May 2018

agenda | transcript | mp3 | attendance

---

06 Feb 2018

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

ICANN 60 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

agenda | transcript | audio

2017

ICANN60 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

agenda | transcript | adobe connect streaming

ICANN 58 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

agenda | transcript | adobe connect streaming **|** ac chat

Community gTLD Applications and Human Rights webinar

agenda | presentation | transcript | mp3 | attendance

2016

ICANN57: Hyderabad

agenda & presentation | adobe connect streaming

---

21 Oct 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

07 Oct 2016 | CCWP SG 1

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

17 June 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

17 May 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

25 Apr 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

ICANN 55: Marrakech 5 - 10 March

NCSG-CCWP ICANN and Human Rights (agenda | transcript | audio stream)

NCSG-CCWP ICANNs Corporate and Social Responsibility to Respect Human Rights working session (agenda | transcript | audio stream | virtual room stream)

GAC HRIL and CCWP on ICANN's Corporate and Social Responsibility to Respect Human Rights (transcript | virtual meeting room)

---

26 Feb 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

10 Feb 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

21 Jan 2016 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

2015

18 Dec 2015 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | ac chat | attendance

---

27 Nov 2015 | CCWP

agenda | transcript | mp3 | AC chat | attendance

---

21 Oct 2015 | ICANN 54 | Morning Session

agenda & presentation | transcript | virtual meeting room stream | AC chat | attendance

---

21 Oct 2015 | ICANN 54 | Working session

agenda & presentation 1, 2 | transcript | audio stream | virtual room stream

---

21 Sep 2015 | CCWP

agenda | mp3 | Transcript | AC Chat | Attendees

Date	Agenda	Audio	Transcript	AC Chat	Attendees

17 Aug 2015	**1.** Short evaluation on ICANN 53 BA. **2.** Works as agreed. **a.** 1. chart **b.** 2. legal **c.** 3. administrative 3. CCWG accountability & human rights 4. Other issues	mp3	PDF	MaryamBakoshi:Dearall, welcome to the CCWP on ICANN & HR call on Monday, 17th Aug 2015 at 13:00 UTC MaryamBakoshi:MeganRichards& Sara Bockey have joined the meeting MaryamBakoshi:RafikDammakhasjoined MaryamBakoshi:Nielshasjoined matthewshears:hello MaryamBakoshi:MatthewSHearsandmariliaMarciel have joined MaryamBakoshi:TatianaTropinahasjoined MariliaMaciel:Helloall! Megan Richards, EuropeanCommission:muchbetter ! MariliaMaciel:Sure. TatianaTropina:Hieveryone! MariliaMaciel:Yes MariliaMaciel:Maybewecansee the agenda on screen? Niels ten Oever - Article19:1. Short evaluation ICANN2. Works as agreed. 1. chart 2. legal 3. administrivia3. CCWG accountability & human rights4. other issues Marilia Maciel:Perfect Marilia Maciel:Lostaudio, Niels Megan Richards, European Commission:wehavelost yourvoiceNiels! Maryam Bakoshi:Alexandra, Avri Doria, Stephanie Perrin & Farzaneh have joined Maryam Bakoshi:Nileswillrejoin soon matthew shears:seemtohave audio issues Maryam Bakoshi:Wearecalling him now Marilia Maciel:Ok, thanks, Maryam Maryam Bakoshi:Weareworking to get Niels back on the line Niels ten Oever - Article19:yyou lost me? MaryamBakoshi:Yes Niels ten Oever - Article19:aii MariliaMaciel:Yes,noaudio MaryamBakoshi:Theoperatorhasbeen trying to call you Niels ten Oever -Article19:canyou call me again? Niels ten Oever - Article19:Ijusthung up now Niels ten Oever - Article19:plscallme again Niels ten Oever - Article19:wheredidyou lose me? matthew shears:Iamhere (I think) Megan Richards, European Commission:atthebeginning !! TatianaTropina:canyouhear me? Niels ten Oever - Article19:Nowe cannot hear you Maryam Bakoshi:No Tatiana Tropina:toobad Maryam Bakoshi:Tatianado you have a number we can sial out to Maryam Bakoshi:*dial Tatiana Tropina:+4917635423791 Maryam Bakoshi:AmrElsadr has joined Maryam Bakoshi:@Tatiana - calling you now Marilia Maciel:Vacationsfor you guys, in Europe I think :) Maryam Bakoshi:YesTatiana is on the line Marilia Maciel:Avri? Matt? :) matthew shears:Ithink that the accountabillity proposal is also asking for input from commenters on the issue of human rights in the bylaws in parallel Megan Richards, European Commission:thisis what the report seems to say but perhaps this is evolving: • Work plan for Work Stream 2 to: o Enhance diversity and the culture of transparency within ICANNo Further address concerns about community accountability. The 2nd Draft Report includes a recommendation for regular structural reviews of SOs and ACs to assess their accountability towards their participants as well as towards the stakeholders they are designed to represent.o Elaborate on a Commitment to human rights in the ICANN Bylaws.• Details on an implementation plan for Work Stream 1, including a Bylaws drafting process. Megan Richards, European Commission:sorry- wrong cut and paste !! apologies matthew shears:intermsof strategy it will be important for a number of diverse entities to input on this inthepublocconsultation- thecommentrevirewprocessdoes not weight the inputs so more inputs on issuesofconcernsuchasHR is important Avri Doria:iplanto put in my own comment on the issue. Avri Doria:bothHRrelated and other. matthewshears:+ 1 matthewshears:Ithinkwe have to leave a lot of this to WS2. If we start to get into the detail the bylaw may get very long and cumbersome Tatiana Tropina:Ithinkit is better to avoid detailing bylaws in order to avoid long legal debates which can get us to nowhere and delay the changes we want matthew shears:yep Tatiana Tropina:*again I don't know how far this discussion went before, may be I am just repeating what has already been discussed many times Megan Richards, European Commission:perhapsitsa problem with the mike - inanutshelllagree withmarilia'scomment Maryam Bakoshi:HiMegan, please could you provide your number for dial out Amr Elsadr:@Matt: RE: HRs in WS2, that sounds logical to me, so +1. For now, some form of commitment from the CCWG to include HR issues in WS2 wouldn't be such a bad thing though. Megan Richards, European Commission:Mynumberis +322 2962443 butmariliasaid exactly what I was going to say - Avri Doria:The Corporation shall operate for the benefit of the Internet community as a whole, carrying out its activities in conformity with relevant principles of international law and applicable international conventions and local law and, to the extent appropriate and consistent with these Articles and its Bylaws, through open and transparent processes that enable competition and open entry in Internet-related markets. To this effect, the Corporation shall cooperate as appropriate with relevant international organizations matthew shears:shamewecan't just asterisk the bylaw above after the word conventions and add if need be UDHR and ICCPR Tatiana Tropina:@Matthew, it's articles of incorporation I think :) matthew shears:thanks Megan Richards, European Commission:thearticlesof incorporation cover all Avri Doria:... coverl all that are relevant ... applicable ... and to the extent apprpproprote consistent with the bylaws. TatianaTropina:Yes, in a general way Megan Richards, European Commission:theArticles take precedence over the bylaws - the bylaws can limit the application or clarify the specific provisions Tatiana Tropina:+1 to Megan. I see any changes made to bylaws as clarification of this general commitment Megan Richards, European Commission:ICANNhasagreed to apply the applicable and relevant provisions by virtue of the provisions of its ARticles of incorporation - public international law and its application is a separate issue and not what we should be discussing here matthewshears:agreewithsimple phrasing for bylaws Avri Doria:thosearenot my concerns, as much as the concerns oftothers. isupportthe most general language. Tatiana Tropina:Iactuallydon't see any way to make otherthansimplewordingof bylaws Megan Richards, European Commission:amrespondingin the chat then Megan Richards, European Commission:weshouldensure that the work is not duplicating that done in GAC HRwgand other fora matthew shears:goodpoint- have the GAC discussions evolved since the meeting in BA? Megan Richards, European Commission:notyetbut would be a pity if the various groups were to either duplicate or heavens forbid contradict that of each other Avri Doria:Isn'tthe GAC havingasimlardefinitionalissues as the WP4 is having Megan Richards, European Commission:thanksandapologies for no voice :-) matthew shears:thanksNiels, all Tatiana Tropina:thanks! Niels ten Oever -Article19:Thanksall! MaryamBakoshi:Thankyouall	
29 May		mp3	PDF		

2015	- - Introductions - - Report - Comments? -Issue on behalf of who? - Approval procedure - - Sessions in BA - - Update on other community activities			Maryam Bakoshi:Dearall, welcome to the ICANN and HR call on Friday 29th May 2015 Maryam Bakoshi:RafikDammakand Niels Ten Oever have joined the meeting Maryam Bakoshi:Welcome Marilia Maciel:Helloall! Maryam Bakoshi:WelcomeMarilia rafik:non Maryam Bakoshi:Monikahasjoined rafik:maybesheis shy :) Monika Zalnieriute:xxxxxxxxxxxxxx Monika Zalnieriute:Ialsoright it here:) Monika Zalnieriute:haha, I read that I am shy here:) Monika Zalnieriute:ok, I wait for the call then! Niels ten Oever -Article19:Monika,canyou pick up? MonikaZalnieriute:Istilldidnotgeta call rafik:whojoined? Maryam Bakoshi: Pranesh Prakash Monika Zalnieriute:butI can hear You though, Maryam Bakoshi:VipulKarbhanda Maryam Bakoshi:havebothjoined Monika Zalnieriute:mayebsomeoneknow, what I should click to make my mic work? Niels ten Oever -Article19:CliclonthemicMonika Alexandra:hi! MaryamBakoshi:Alexandrapleasecouldyoustateyour full name for record purposes. Thank you Alexandra:Maryam,it'sAlexandra Kulikova MariliaMaciel:Pleasestarttherecording MonikaZalnieriute:yes,Ican, MariliaMaciel:Please,canwelet the ppl on the phone introduce themselves? Alexandra:i'mnotsure I won't be able to speak though unfortunately(Marilia Maciel:Please, mute your mics rafik:nielsshouldsdisablethe mic for his adobe connect :) Marianne F:Hiall,thereis feedback so we are hearing Niels twice Marianne F:You'rewelcomMonika,apologiesfor the lengthy email nonetheless! :) Marilia Maciel:Whatisthe deadline to comment? Niels ten Oever - Article19:Dependsifwe want to print it nicely Niels ten Oever - Article19:Ifwewant it to be gone via editor, design and print, we will need to have it done by Monday rafik:@Niels it is a working document for CCWP to continue the discussion, expecting the CCWP to produce its first delvierable Niels ten Oever - Article19:Indeed, so we need toagreeonaapprovalprocedure(point 1.3 :)) rafik:Iwouldsee it as an "issue report" not necessarily neededanapproval,itis more research work to give input Niels ten Oever - Article19:let's discuss this under the next point Pranesh Prakash:Ifwedon'tmake a strong defence of HR, who will? :-) Having said that I don't think there's a need to establish a duty to protect on ICANN's part. Marianne F:OFcourse, they do have this responsibility just we need to proceed step by step. So if the point is made in a note then it is there on the record to be used and referred to later if need be (just reiterating verbal point in writing) Niels ten Oever - Article19:+1 Pranesh Prakash:+1 Maryam Bakoshi:NigelHicksonhas joined Marilia Maciel:Audioissueshere. Will have to go out and enter again, sorry Marianne F:+1 from me for leaving it inasexample; just to edit and tighten up for now and indicate there option of more detailed analysis later Pranesh Prakash:+1 to Marianne Monika Zalnieriute:Guys, I agree to have it as an example: would You like to have it a shorter part though for now? MonikaZalnieriute:inthisparticular report? MonikaZalnieriute:+ Lee; it might be too much stuff. MonikaZalnieriute:Allatonce. Marianne F:Hi, if the feeling is to keep it in then perhaps as a note? But Lee is pointing out the timing issue so I would defer to those who know ICANN better than I do Marianne F:Pleasemutemics when typing! :) Marianne F:Ifindoubt leave it out Alexandra:Agreethatthe UDRP part might draw attention from the substantial issues int hefirstpartintheshape it is now Alexandra:Imighthave missed it -couldsmbpleaseremind again how GAC is going to be engaged? Pranesh Prakash:Apologies. I have to leave now. But would just like to reiterate that wemustI(strategically) bear the burden of being the people who take positions on sensitive commercial issues. If we don't, no one else will. We can build bridges after we have some rough position. Marianne F:+1 from mePranesh; point well taken, cheerio! rafik:@Alexandra we have some GAC members in the CCWP, it has its own working group and Lee is basically doing the liaison. maybe Lee can elaborate here Marilia Maciel:Maybewecould move to the session in BA? Monika Zalnieriute:SoI would like to get the idea what do we do?: please type in here, so I could briefly have an idea who is for LEAVING the UDRP and who is for TAKING OUT Niels ten Oever - Article19:Theconsensusseems to be that it could be mentionedasan shortexample, but weleaveourtthelonger expose. Alexandra:sorry Marilia Maciel:Yes, that is my feeling too Alexandra:I'lltype rafik:@monika in few words more coming work for you :) Monika Zalnieriute:Ok, how long - and how detailed - simply a page or so or approx how long? Niels ten Oever -Article19:Shorter MarianneF:Mentionit, keep it short as a concrete example vs. a full expose. MonikaZalnieriute:yes,yes, so simply asinglerefernece, You mean -thatsit? MonikaZalnieriute:shorterthanapage, You mean? Niels ten Oever - Article19:Yes MonikaZalnieriute:simplylikeanexamplementione, in a sentence?:) Alexandra:guys, just a quick comment/observation: an elaboratedescriptionof thisonecase study now will definitely attract criticism from Russian GAC representatives - as at theSignaporemeeting they were very vocal on the Crimean domains issue from the HR perspective. It's a verydebateableissue in terms of how exactly thatrelatesto theICANNremit, but if theHRtalkstarts with UDRP in detail I can expect the reaction :) what I mean is that there seems to be a strong link for themberweenICANN and thatincidetin the HR context. I can expect there will be efforts to stick it in Marianne F:..I see your point but won't there be this sort of push back anyway? If this example really could become a red herring (forgive the pun) then leave it out for now. We can always put it back in... Alexandra:yeahI guess you're right.. But it would be good to at least formulate some stance on the issue from the group? or have a longer least of potential case studies for future Alexandra:*list rafik:therewillbe pish back for many topics, that is why we have to work on consensus and "educate" Marilia Maciel:Yes, open to collaboration/endorsements rafik:weneedto get CCWP to have ownershiponitwowndeliverable Marianne F:Iagree; send the final version of the report to the CCWP for comments. People comment best when there is something concrete to comment on. rafik:thepublicsession is not clashing with important sessions rafik:kathy is not coming to BA Marilia Maciel:Iwouldgobitfurtherand ask them for theiraseesment Marilia Maciel:somesortof responsibility to speak Marilia Maciel:great Marilia Maciel:Perfect Alexandra:thanksNiels Marianne F:ThanksNiels, thanks all for a great meeting Marilia Maciel:Thanksall Marilia Maciel:Byeall! Alexandra:thankseveryoneandbye!	

30 Mar 2015		mp3	Word, PDF	Maryam Bakoshi:Dearall, welcome to the ICANN and Human Rights Call on Monday, 30th March 2015 Benjamin Akinmoyeje:HelloMaryam Maryam Bakoshi:Dearall, please kindly state your name and organization in the chat windon for record purposes Maryam Bakoshi:*window Niels ten Oever - Article19:Tentativeagenda is here: Niels ten Oever - Article19:1. Introductions Niels ten Oever - Article19:2. Discussion or objective and scope of the CCWP Niels ten Oever - Article19:3. Discussion of potential research topics Niels ten Oever - Article19:4. Update on related work in other constituencies and workstreams Niels ten Oever - Article19:5. Outreach jorge cancio GAC-Switzerland:Hiall, I'm Jorge Cancio, GAC-Rep for Switzerland Chris LaHatte:goodmorning/evening nigel hickson:Goodafternoon from Geneva HR:goodafternoon from Brussels - I willunfortunatelyhave to leave about 14:15 - apologies Niels ten Oever - Article19:Justto make sure everyone has the text of the CCWP draft charter:https://etherpad.mozilla.org/icannhrdraft rafik:hi rafik:howis HR? matthew shears:hello Marilia Maciel:hereuntil the window of the plane closes Marilia Maciel:nosound though HR:Iam also here - Megan Richards (European Commission) - my name comes up as HR - I guesss the signin rather than name Amr Elsadr:HiMegan..., if you like, you can edit your info using the menu at the top-right of the AC window. jorge cancio GAC-Switzerland:thecontent of the chat just disappeared... Niels ten Oever - Article19:https://etherpad.mozilla.org/icannhrdraft jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:thanks rafik:HiMegan, you are welcome :) Niels ten Oever - Article19:https://etherpad.mozilla.org/icannhrdraft Amr Elsadr:Archivesofthe email list are here: http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/cc-humanrights/ Alexandra:Hieveryone, inlisteningonlymodeunfortunately Amr Elsadr:ThisACroom is audio enabled, so you can use it to speak without dialling into the conference. matthew shears:IstherealCANNWP template? matthew shears:whenwewere doing the Charter for the CCWGAccountbailitythere was a template - granted it is a WGnotWP but just wondered Amr Elsadr:Great. Thanks. Amr Elsadr:Bringingin/recruiting the expertise would be fantastic. jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:Asinformationunder 4: GAC agreed in Singapore to form a working group on human rights and international law jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:Itisnow being constituted, with a large number of interested GAC members, and with the work being lead by Peru Amr Elsadr:@Jorge: That's wonderful. Looking fwd to seeing what this WG comes up with. Thanks. matthew shears:ithinkit will be important to ensure linkagesbetwenthe WP and the WG - maybe it should be written into the charter Amr Elsadr:Iseethis now in the text on theetherpad, which answers my earlier question: To propose procedures and mechanisms with the aim ofproducingassessmentson if and how policies and procedures underdevelopedand/or being implemented may impact on human rights. MonikaZalnieriute:Iamhere, I can hear everything, but I am not sure I can speak. MonikaZalnieriute:DoYouhearme? Amr Elsadr:@Monika: Click on the phone icon on the top left of the screen. matthew shears:Ilikethe idea of looking at HR in the broader framing of CSR - it might be easier for the SOs and ACs to understand (and be open to) Maryam Bakoshi:@Monika, please give me your number and I will dial out to you Monika Zalnieriute:Ok, I have turned my mic, it should work, Monika Zalnieriute:aha, ok, my phone no xxxxxxxxxxxx Maryam Bakoshi:Diallingoutto you now Maryam Bakoshi:Yeswecan Niels ten Oever - Article19:Yeswecan Niels ten Oever - Article19:goahead Monika Zalnieriute:Ok, so do I speak now? Niels ten Oever - Article19:Yes, pls go ahead Niels ten Oever - Article19:Westilldon't hearyouMonika MonikaZalnieriute:Cool, I hear everything, and I think I agree with Niels matthew shears:areeNiels - we should focus where we add value and focus -forforexampleon CSR Monika Zalnieriute:Iseeits pretty much clear that we should focus most of our attention on CSR, Alexandra:Itmightbe useful to look at the Global Network Initiative experienceinHRaudit Amr Elsadr:@Monika: I'm not entirely convinced that CSR should be the focus. The real needofHR consideration in ICANN is on how the policies affect domain name holders. This is done using the governance mechanisms via the contracts between ICANN and the registries and registrars, as well as the contracts between the registrars and the registrants. AmrElsadr:I'mnotsayinthat CSR should be excluded, but it shouldn't dominate the focus of the group. Avri Doria:aplogiesforbeinglate. ithoughtit was later. matthew shears:businessresponsibilityto respect HR: http://www.ihrb.org/pdf/state-of-play/State-of-Play-Full-Report.pdf nigelhickson:AssumeLeecantalkonCOEwork? matthew shears:@ Amr - understand your point re CSR - but I guess my feeling is that using that approach as an umbrella may make the issue for palatable Amr Elsadr:@Matt: Looks interesting. Will have to put a couple of hours aside to go through it. :) matthew shears:hasthisbeen circulated more broadlyLee? jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:willashort summary of this call be circulated? matthew shears:Ithinkit will be very important going forward that this WP has the fullest visibility of what is going on vis-a-vis ICANN and HRbpothinside andoutsideICANN Amr Elsadr:Thanksall. Bye. matthew shears:thanksNiels all Chris LaHatte:thanks Maryam Bakoshi:Thankyouall jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:thanks AnrivdSpuy:Thanks.	Niel Ten Oever, Rafik Dammak, Amr Elsadr, Marilia Marciel, Benjamin Akinmoyeje, Jorge Cancio, Concettina Cassa, Chris Lahatte, Nigel Hickson, Alexandra, Lee Hibbard, Matthew Shears, Monika Zalnieruite, Megan Richards, Jean-Jacques Sahel, Stephania Milan, Avri Doria