

# 2020-02-25 ALAC Monthly Teleconference

## ALAC Teleconference

Meeting Number: AL.ALAC/CC.0719/1

---

**Date:** Tuesday, 25 February 2020

**Time:** 02:00 - 04:00 UTC (For the time in various time zones [click here](#))

**Zoom Room:** <https://icann.zoom.us/j/454717035>

Real time transcription (RTT) link: <https://www.streamtext.net/player?event=ICANN> [[streamtext.net](#)]

---

**Interpretation Available: Yes ( ES & FR - Simultaneous)**

[How can I participate in this meeting?](#) English Conference ID = 1638

[¿Cómo se puede participar en la teleconferencia?](#) Spanish Conference ID = 1738

[Comment participer a cette teleconference?](#) French Conference ID = 1838

---

AF: Abdulkarim Oloyede, Dave Kissoondoyal, Tijani Ben Jemaa

AP: Holly Raiche, Justine Chew ,Maureen Hilyard

EUR: Bastiaan Goslings , Joanna Kulesza (*apology*), Matthias M. Hudobnik (*apology*)

LAC: Carlos Raúl Gutiérrez, Humberto Carrasco, Sylvia Herlein-Leite

NA: Javier Rúa-Jovet , Jonathan Zuck, Marita Moll

Liaisons: Andrei Kolesnikov(SSAC), Barrack Otieno (ccNSO), Cheryl Langdon-Orr (GNSO), Yrjö Lansipuro (GAC)

---

### Participants:

**EN:** Maureen Hilyard, Vernatius Okwu Ezeama, Olivier Crepin-Leblond, Vanda Scartezini, Sebastien Bachollet, Hadia Elimawi, Alan Greenberg, Abdeljalil Bachar Bong, Daniel Nanghaka, Glenn McKnight, Judith Hellerstein, Nadira Al-Araj, Satish Babu, León Sanchez, Sarah Kiden,

**ES:** Sergio Salinas Porto, Humberto Carrasco, Alberto Soto,

**FR:**

**Staff:** Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, Evin Erdodu, Alperen Eken, Claudia Ruiz

**Apologies:** Joanna Kulesza, Loris Taylor, Yeim Nazlar (staff), Matthias Hudobnik,

### Interpreters:

**ES:** David and Veronica

**FR:** Claire and Jacques

**Call Management:** Claudia Ruiz

---

**Action Items:** [EN](#)

**Adopted Motions:** [EN](#)

**Decisions:** [EN](#)

**Recording:** [EN](#), [ES](#), [FR](#)

**Transcript:** [EN](#), [ES](#), [FR](#)

**Zoom Chat:** [EN](#)

---

## A G E N D A:

# Standing Agenda Items

1. Roll Call and Apologies and Confirmation of Quorum– Staff (4 minutes)
2. Welcome, Aim of the Meeting, Adoption of Agenda and Call for Any Other Business or other Amendments – Maureen Hilyard (5 minutes)
3. Review of [ALAC Action Items from 21 January 2020](#) - Maureen Hilyard (1 minute)
4. ALAC Policy Development Activities - Olivier Crepin-Leblond, Jonathan Zuck and Evin Erdodu (25 minutes)

## At-Large Policy Resources:

[At-Large Capacity Building Workshop - An Introduction to Policy Development at ICANN](#)  
[2019 ALAC Policy Comments & Advice](#)  
[At-Large Policy Summary](#)  
[At-Large Executive Summary page](#)  
[Multistakeholder Advice Development graphic](#)  
[Consolidated Policy Working Group \(CPWG\)](#)

## Recently Ratified by the ALAC (Since last ALAC Monthly Meeting)

[Proposed Final Report of the New gTLD Auction Proceeds Cross Community Working Group](#)  
[Executive Summary TBD](#)

## [Proposed Dates for ICANN Public Meetings 2024-2028 and Revised Dates in 2022](#)

The ALAC noted that ICANN has been striving to be more inclusive in an effort to engage more volunteers with diverse backgrounds. ICANN acknowledges the difficulty in getting new people to join and engage within ICANN and to increase the diversity of participants. The Multistakeholder Model Work Plan takes note of the importance to ICANN to develop pathways to enable effective participation. One of the more practical ways for ICANN to facilitate participation is for ICANN Org. to be more aware of and to avoid clashing with important holidays and religious days observed by volunteers who work countless hours to improve ICANN's multistakeholder advisory work. By avoiding these dates as much as possible it is showing all volunteers that ICANN Org understands their concerns and does its best to avoid conflicts.

The ALAC made several other suggestions regarding ICANN meeting dates in 2022 and from 2024-2028.

## [Third Accountability and Transparency Review Team \(ATRT3\) Draft Report](#)

The ALAC noted the ATRT review has produced a considerable amount of work in little time and this is laudable. Nevertheless, from an end-user perspective, ATRT should consider deliberating the following questions: (1) How can ICANN better address conflicts of interest? The ICANN community is relatively small, with relatively few actors involved in the process. Conflicts of interest, perceived or real, can impact negatively on ICANN's standing; (2) How can transparency be increased? (3) How can ICANN ensure that in cases where issues persist, processes are initiated to correct trajectory? (For example, if multiple reviews identify the same issue or if they find implementation to be lacking, how can this be fast-tracked transparently and effectively?) (4) Might it be necessary to "silo off" or ring-fence certain functions, including reviews, compliance, and other types of community oversight? (5) How can ICANN improve their responsiveness to community and review team questions and affairs, and what policies should be created to ensure these are dealt with? The ALAC also suggested taking several noted options into consideration, emphasizing from an end user perspective, more, not less, accountability and transparency is required from the ICANN community and org.

Overall, the ALAC supports the suggested changes to the ICANN Public Comment, public input as well as the accountability indicators. We believe those changes would make the Public Comments more effective and show better transparency. We strongly believe that a wide, open and inclusive process should be maintained in policy development process especially with input representing the multistakeholder environment. Policy development must be transparent, efficient and should not be biased or skewed towards a group.

## [ALAC Advice to the ICANN Board on ISOC/PIR Issue](#)

The ALAC noted the proposed sale of PIR to Ethos Capital has, understandably, created quite a stir, prompting commentary from many perspectives within the ICANN community, and applauds the efforts by the ICANN Board to clarify and make transparent, as much as possible, the process regarding the deal and to take the time to encourage the best possible result.

The ALAC Advice to the ICANN Board suggested (8) recommendations: (1) The Registry for .ORG must be organized as either a charitable non-profit [501c(3) in the US] or a "Benefit Corporation" (B Corporation); (2) One-third of the Registry Corporate Board must be representatives of charitable nonprofits; (3) One Board member selected by the ALAC; (4) The Registry for .ORG must enshrine in its bylaws that the principal focus of the domain is nonprofits and individuals and not commercial interests; (5) The Registry must enshrine in its bylaws a commitment to free speech and a resistance to takedown demands with a political basis; (6) The Registry must provide 6 months prior written notice to its registrants of any increase in wholesale price of their domain names registration renewal fees and the option of a 20-year renewal thereof at the pre-increase price; (7) The Registry Agreement must enshrine PIR prohibited practices such as bulk sales to commercial registrars; and (8) The Registry Agreement must establish a "DNS Abuse Ceiling".

## Additional:

- See ISOC/PIR Update (13 February 2020): A [letter](#) from Maarten Botterman to the Chair, Internet Society (ISOC), A [letter](#) from Jones Day to Public Interest Registry (PIR).
- "At-Large Valentine" submitted to the ICANN Board regarding [Proposed Amendment 3 to the .COM Registry Agreement](#).
- [ICANN Public Comment Update](#): See <https://alpha.icann.org/en/public-comment> and provide feedback by 13 March 2020 to [public-comment@icann.org](mailto:public-comment@icann.org).

## Public Comment for Decision

[Middle East and Adjoining Countries \(MEAC\) Strategy 2021-2025](#) 03 Apr 2020

## Current Statements (ALAC Advice, Comment or Correspondence)

Public Comment Name	Public Comment Close	Status	Penholder(s)
<a href="#">Draft FY21-25 Operating &amp; Financial Plan and Draft FY21 Operating Plan &amp; Budget</a>	25 Feb 2020	<b>VOTE</b>  (to be submitted on /before 25 Feb)	<a href="#">Ricardo Holmquist</a>  <a href="#">Marita Moll</a>
<a href="#">Second Security, Stability, and Resiliency (SSR2) Review Team Draft Report</a>	04 Mar 2020	<b>DRAFTING</b>	Drafting team volunteer(s):  <a href="#">Jonathan Zuck</a>  <a href="#">Alan Greenberg</a>  <a href="#">Lutz Donnerhacke</a>
<a href="#">Initial Report of the Expedited Policy Development Process (EPDP) on the Temporary Specification for gTLD Registration Data Team – PHASE 2</a>	23 Mar 2020	<b>DRAFTING</b>	Drafting team volunteer(s):  <a href="#">Hadia Elminiawi</a>
<a href="#">Draft Proposal for NextGen@ICANN Program Improvements</a>	31 Mar 2020	<b>DRAFTING</b>	Drafting team volunteer(s):  <a href="#">Laurin Weissinger</a>  <a href="#">Joanna Kulesza</a>  <a href="#">Glenn McKnight</a>
<a href="#">Name Collision Analysis Project (NCAP) Study 1</a>	31 Mar 2020	<b>DRAFTING</b>	Drafting team volunteer(s):  <a href="#">Justine Chew</a>  <a href="#">Gregory Shatan</a>
<a href="#">Revised Community Travel Support Guidelines</a>	13 Apr 2020	<b>DRAFTING</b>	Drafting team volunteer(s):  <a href="#">Judith Hellerstein</a>

## 5. Review of current ALS and Individual Member applications – Evin Erdodu and Alperen Eken (5 minutes)

For Information: [ALS application tracking page](#) and [Individual Members page](#)

### ALS Snapshot

Region	Number	Countries & Territories
<b>AFRALO</b>	61	32
<b>APRALO</b>	59	29
<b>EURALO</b>	38	18*
<b>LACRALO</b>	58	22
<b>NARALO</b>	24	3
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>241</b>	<b>104</b>

### ALS Application Status

<b>Certified (1)</b>	<b>#293 ACSIS COTE D'IVOIRE - AFRALO</b>
----------------------	--

<b>Decertification (0)</b>	None  AFRALO will begin the process of providing evidence to ask the ALAC to decertify MACSIS and several other ALSes, which are no longer active.  <u>Reference:</u> <a href="#">Decertification Wikispaces</a>  <u>Note:</u> AFRALO recently ratified their <a href="#">AFRALO Decertification Rules</a> .
<b>Vote (0)</b>	None
<b>Awaiting advice (8)</b>	<b>#313</b> Women's Technology Empowerment Centre - AFRALO (awaiting GSE feedback), <b>#311</b> Association des Utilisateurs des Technologies de l'Information et de la Communication - AFRALO (awaiting GSE feedback), <b>#310</b> GreenICT Initiative (GreenICTi) - AFRALO (awaiting GSE feedback), <b>#305</b> Battery Operated Systems for Community Outreach Uganda - AFRALO (negative GSE feedback, will move to AFRALO for feedback), <b>#304</b> Corporacion Asesorias para el Desarrollo de la Innovacion y Tecnologia - Asesorias IT - LACRALO (awaiting GSE feedback), <b>#282</b> Association pour le Développement des Sociétés de l'Information au Tchad (ADESIT) - AFRALO (awaiting AFRALO feedback)
<b>Due diligence (2)</b>	<b>#309</b> Initiative TIC et Citoyenneté - AFRALO (positive GSE feedback, undergoing due diligence), <b>#288</b> Liberia Information Technology students Union - AFRALO (awaiting applicant feedback - to confirm with AFRALO whether will be moved to "on hold" status)
<b>On hold (7)</b>	<b>#303</b> AgeCare Foundation (CRB) - AFRALO, <b>#299/308</b> China Internet Development Foundation - APRALO (Withdrawn), <b>#297</b> The Bear Foundation - NARALO (Withdrawn), <b>#292</b> Asociacion Civil Para la Investigacion Social y Tecnica de Internet (AGEIA España) - EURALO, <b>#270</b> BSDCongo - AFRALO, <b>#267</b> Surabhi Softwares, <b>#112</b> Arab Regional ISPs & DSPs Association (ARISPA) - APRALO

#### Individual Snapshot

Region	Number	Observers
AFRALO	14	3*
APRALO	27	0
EURALO	56	6
LACRALO	0	11
NARALO	31	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>128</b>	<b>20</b>

Recently accepted: 1- NARALO

Applications: 1 - AFRALO, 1 - APRALO

#### Other

- AFRALO Orientation Call TBD. Reference: RALO ALS and Individual Orientation Calls: [NARALO 06 September 2017](#), [APRALO 19 June 2017](#).

### 6. Reports and Discussion with At-Large Plus Leaders – Introduced by Maureen Hilyard (10 minutes)

- Liaisons: ccNSO; GAC, GNSO and SSAC
- WGs: CPWG and Sub-Committee on Outreach and Engagement
- RALO Chairs: AFRALO, APRALO, EURALO, LACRALO and NARALO

See: [At-Large Reports](#)

See: [At-Large Governance](#)

## For Discussion

### 7. Discussion with Leon Sanchez, ICANN Board Vice-Chair and Director Selected by At-Large - Maureen Hilyard (10 minutes)

## 8. Post ATLAS III/2020 At-Large Activities - Review and Development of Recommendations for the ALAC - Maureen Hilyard and Leads (15 minutes)

See: [Post-ATLAS III Activities](#)

Activity	Lead	Current Status	Recommendations for the ALAC
<b>Post-ATLAS III Reporting</b>	Eduardo Diaz	Progress of survey groups has been slow. Interviews, reports etc have been discussed but no definitive recommendations made as yet. Aim is to have a rough draft by 29 Feb & a final document before the virtual ICANN67 starts.	
<b>Policy Involvement</b>	Jonathan Zuck	Increased participation in policy development. Plans to engage in 67 delayed.	More language assistance on list would be interesting.
<b>Capacity Building</b>	Joanna Kulesza	Three sub-groups are making progress: 1) ICANN Learn Policy Development Course Team; 2) Onboarding Slide Deck Team; 3) Webinars Team	
<b>Outreach and Engagement</b>	Daniel Nanghaka	Working on SC O/E activities related to FY21 Regional O/E Strategies;	
<b>Communications</b>	Maureen Hilyard	Communications Strategy Document currently in progress; NPOC and GAC to be included in the development of ICANN Learn courses; GSE discussions held re Pacific Plan; Attended ITI consultation webinar.	

## 9. ALS Mobilization - Update and Next Steps - Alan Greenberg (5 minutes)

See: [ALS Mobilization Working Party](#)

## 10. ICANN67 - Discussion of how a Virtual Meeting will look - Maureen Hilyard, Jonathan Zuck, Joanna Kulesza and Gisella Gruber (15 minutes)

See: [ICANN67 - Cancún Meeting - March 2020](#)

See: [ICANN67 - FAQs](#)

- Skeleton of ICANN schedule will be discussed tomorrow at the SO-AC Chairs meeting.
- Proposed prioritisation of ICANN67 sessions ([At-Large Virtual Programme 8-20 March.pdf](#))
- Availability of Spanish interpretation for At-Large sessions (first language to be rolled out for virtual conferences - in LAC region)

## 11. AOB - Maureen Hilyard (5 mins)

- SO-AC Chairs meeting in LA at the end of Jan 2020 i) Planning and Prioritisation ii) Interaction with the Board and ICANN Org iii) Flexibility Fund
- Request from ccNSO for At-Large volunteers to join their ccPDP3 WG which will focus on "developing a review mechanism for decisions pertaining to the delegation, transfer, revocation retirement of ccTLDs". If anyone is interested please contact me and I can send you her letter of invitation about joining up.