

# At-Large Workspace: Updated Operating Standards for Specific Reviews

Public Comment Close	Statement Name	Status	Assignee (s)	Call for Comments Open	Call for Comments Close	Vote Open	Vote Close	Date of Submission	Staff Contact and Email	Statement Number
20 February 2019	<a href="#">Updated Operating Standards for Specific Reviews</a>	<b>ADOPTED</b> 13Y, 0A, 1N	<a href="#">Gregory Shatan</a> <a href="#">Jonathan Zuck</a>	13 February 2019	19 February 2019	20 February 2019	24 February 2019	20 February 2019	Lars Hoffmann <a href="mailto:lars.hoffmann@i-cann.org">lars.hoffmann@i-cann.org</a>	AL-ALAC-ST-0219-05-01-EN

Hide the information below, please click [here](#) >>

## Brief Overview

**Purpose:** This public comment proceeding seeks to solicit input on the [updated Draft Operating Standards for Specific Reviews](#) (Operating Standards). The Operating Standards aim to ensure that ICANN's Specific Reviews are conducted in a transparent, consistent, efficient, and predictable manner, while supporting the community's work to derive the expected benefit and value from review processes. Areas of guidance in the Operating Standards, as mandated by the ICANN Bylaws, include review team selection process, conflict of interest practices, confidential disclosure to review teams, review team decision-making practices, and guidelines on how review teams are to work with and consider independent expert advice. Specific Review teams currently conducting reviews are encouraged to use these Draft Operating Standards as a reference for their work.

**Current Status:** The current draft is an update to the [Draft Operating Standards](#) that were published for public comment in October 2017. ICANN organization has incorporated [public comments](#) received on the October 2017 draft, as well as community feedback on [proposed updates](#) in several key areas of importance that were [presented](#) via two webinars in October 2018.

**Next Steps:** ICANN organization will incorporate feedback from this public comment proceeding into an updated final document. The final document will be presented to the ICANN Board, with the aim of Board adoption in April / May 2019. A public session on the final document is planned for ICANN64.

## Section I: Description and Explanation

The Operating Standards aim to ensure that ICANN's Specific Reviews are conducted in a transparent, consistent, efficient, and predictable manner, while supporting the community's work to derive the expected benefit and value from review processes. The Operating Standards are subject to the relevant provisions in the ICANN Bylaws that govern Specific Reviews (see Article IV, [Section 4.6](#)).

The updated Draft Operating Standards for Specific Reviews address, among other things:

- Review team candidate nomination and member selection
- Scope setting
- Roles and responsibilities
- Review team working methods
- Dispute resolution
- Review output
- Amending the Operating Standards

## Section II: Background

ICANN organization has developed the Operating Standards to provide guidance on conducting Specific Reviews, as mandated by the [Bylaws](#). The development process began shortly after the adoption of the Bylaws in consultation with the community. ICANN organization has held public sessions on the Operating Standards to socialize drafts and solicit community input at [ICANN57](#), [ICANN58](#), [ICANN60](#), and [ICANN63](#). ICANN organization has also conducted webinars on the Operating Standards in [February 2017](#), [October 2017](#), and [October 2018](#).

This current version is an update from a prior version that was available for public comment from 27 October 2017 through 2 February 2018.

Modifications are based on:

- Public comments on the October 2017 [Draft Operating Standards](#) and community feedback received during a [cross-community session](#) at ICANN60 in Abu Dhabi
- Public comments received on the [Long-Term Options to Adjust the Timeline for Specific Reviews](#)
- Best practices and process improvements from Specific Reviews that were launched and/or conducted under the new Bylaws
- Feedback on [proposed updates](#) to the October 2017 [Draft Operating Standards](#) in several key areas of importance, as presented to the community during [webinars](#) in October 2018.

## Section III: Relevant Resources

- [Draft Operating Standards for Specific Reviews](#) for public comment (October 2017)
- [Cross-Community Session: Operating Standards for Specific Reviews](#) (ICANN60 Abu Dhabi, October 2017)
- [Long-Term Options to Adjust the Timeline for Reviews](#) for public comment (May 2018)
- [Proposed updates](#) to the Draft Operating Standards (October 2018)
- [Webinars](#) on proposed updates to the Draft Operating Standards (October 2018)

## Section IV: Additional Information

## Section V: Reports

## FINAL VERSION SUBMITTED (IF RATIFIED)

*The final version to be submitted, if the draft is ratified, will be placed here by upon completion of the vote.*



AL-ALAC-ST-0219-05-01-EN.pdf

---

## FINAL DRAFT VERSION TO BE VOTED UPON BY THE ALAC

*The final draft version to be voted upon by the ALAC will be placed here before the vote is to begin.*



AL-ALAC-ST-0219-05-00-EN.pdf

---

## DRAFT SUBMITTED FOR DISCUSSION

*The first draft submitted will be placed here before the call for comments begins. The Draft should be preceded by the name of the person submitting the draft and the date/time. If, during the discussion, the draft is revised, the older version(S) should be left in place and the new version along with a header line identifying the drafter and date/time should be placed above the older version(s), separated by a Horizontal Rule (available + Insert More Content control).*

*The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) appreciate the opportunity to participate in the public comment on Updated Operating Standards for Specific Reviews. The ALAC understands that the specific reviews are a critical part of the accountability framework put in place as part of the IANA transition and that with some experience now behind us, it's important to carefully define the process and the roles of the various players including the ICANN community, ICANN ORG and the ICANN Board. The ALAC appreciates the work that has gone into these updates and considers them essential for the health of these accountability mechanisms and ICANN itself. While there are some concerns about the potential for too much process associated with these already challenging reviews, it is the view of the ALAC that this level of specificity is necessary to prevent misunderstandings and missteps by any of the parties involved in the review. Scope should be well defined within the confines of bylaws and review teams should be free to pursue their mandate within that scope. Accordingly, the ALAC would like to voice our strong support for these updates to the Operating Standards for Specific Reviews.*