

Webinars (24 April 2015)

To read the original announcement, please see: <https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2015-04-16-en>

WEBINAR: Cross Community Working Group (CWG) On IANA Naming Related Functions: Briefing on 2nd Draft Proposal for Public Comment

Following the request of the National Telecommunications and Information Administration (NTIA), an agency of the U.S Department of Commerce, for ICANN to "convene a multistakeholder process to develop a plan to transition the U.S. government stewardship role" with regard to the IANA Functions and related root zone management, a Cross Community Working Group (CWG-Stewardship) was formed with the purpose of developing a consolidated transition proposal for the elements of the IANA Functions relating to domain names.

The CWG-Stewardship held briefing webinars on the first draft proposal on 3-4 December 2014, and subsequently received nearly 60 public comments. Following the close of the public comment period, the CWG-Stewardship reviewed the comments and continued to work at an intense pace to prepare its transition proposal, through more than 30 teleconferences, a working session at ICANN 52 in Singapore in February, a face-to-face meeting in Istanbul in March and, most recently, during a two-day meeting block with over 12 hours of conferences to converge on the 2nd draft proposal.

With the aim to submit its final proposal to the IANA Stewardship Transition Coordination Group (ICG) by the close of ICANN 53 in June, the CWG-Stewardship highlights the importance of broader community input of their draft, for which the group has received independent legal counsel for structural considerations and external expertise to bolster operational sections.

The CWG-Stewardship will hold two identical webinars at different times to facilitate participation across time zones. The webinars will take place on:

- 24 April from 06:00 – 07:30 UTC (time zone converter [here](#))
- 24 April from 14:00 – 15:30 UTC (time zone converter [here](#))

Webinar Details & How to Attend

The webinars will be run in an [Adobe Connect room](#). If you are interested in attending the webinar and would like to receive dial-in details, please send an email to brenda.brewer@icann.org and indicate which time you would like to attend the webinar. Please note that the webinar will be conducted in English and will be recorded and transcribed. Subsequently the transcripts will be translated in the 5 UN languages and posted on the CWG-Stewardship Wiki [here](#).

Further information

For further information about the CWG-Stewardship's work, please see <https://community.icann.org/x/37fhAg>.

For further information about the ICG and the IANA Stewardship Transition, please see <https://www.icann.org/stewardship>.

Download the webinar slides here --> [Webinar Slides.pdf](#)

Webinar 1

24 April 06:00 UTC

Attendees: Alain Bidron, Annaliese Williams, Annebeth Lange, Antonia Chu, Anupam Agrawal, Bernard Turcotte, Boyoung Kim, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Christopher Wilkinson, Crystal, Elisabeth Ekstrand, Hadji Mmadi, Hyuno Kwon, Jaap Akkerhuis, Jia He, Jian-Chuan Chang, Jianka ng Yao, John Demco, Jonathan Robinson, Julia Charvolen, Julie Z, Karine Perset, Kelvin Wong, Laena Rahim, Liana Teo, Linlin Zhou, Lise Fuhr, Liu Yue, Mary Uduma, Minjung Park, Naomi Tandy, Nigel Hickson, Nina Elzer, Nurani Nimpuno, Olivier Crépin-Leblond, Patrik Fältström, Paul Kane, Peter Green, Peter Van Roste, Philadel Yeo, Sabine Meyer, Samiran Gupta, Sébastien Bachollet, Sorina Teleanu, Stanley Shan, Stephen, Susan Payne, Theo Geurts, Tom Dale, Valerie Heng, Wen Zhai, Yaovi Atohou, Yasuichi Kitamura, Yuri Takamatsu, ZC, Zheng Song, Zhiwei Yan (57)

Transcript:

[Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April.doc](#)

Webinar 2

24 April 13:00 UTC

Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April.pdf

AR	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-ar.docx Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-ar.pdf
FR	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-fr.docx Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-fr.pdf
ES	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-es.doc Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-es.pdf
PT	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-pt.doc Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-pt.pdf
RU	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-ru.docx Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-ru.pdf
ZH	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-ZH.dot Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 1 24 April-ZH.pdf

Adobe Connect Recording: <https://icann.adobeconnect.com/p5shdc5sqew/>

Audio MP3 Recording: <http://audio.icann.org/gnso/gnso-cwg-iana-24apr15-en.mp3>

Adobe Connect Chat:

Brenda Brewer: (4/24/2015 00:31) Welcome to the WEBINAR: Cross Community Working Group (CWG) On IANA Naming Related Functions: Briefing on 2nd Draft Proposal for Public Comment on 24 April.

Brenda Brewer: (00:53) HI all!

Minjung PARK: (00:55) Hello

Lise Fuhr: (00:56) Hello

Annebeth Lange, Norid: (00:57) Hi everyone

jaap akkerhuis (SSAC): (00:58) Hi all

Boyoung Kim: (01:00) Hi all~

nigel hickson: (01:00) good morning

Jian-Chuan Chang (KNET): (01:00) I suggest those who are not speaking please mute your microphone

Stephen: (01:00) Good morning...

Jian-Chuan Chang (KNET): (01:00) previous experience indicated that otherwise there will be much noise

Samiran Gupta: (01:01) good morning all!

Jian-Chuan Chang (KNET): (01:01) or echo

Elisabeth Ekstrand: (01:01) Good morning everyone

Jia He: (01:02) Hi everyone

Sabine Meyer (GAC - Germany): (01:02) hi everyone!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:03) hi

Stanley Shan 2: (01:07) this is stanley shan from china

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:08) hi Stanley

Grace Abuhamad: (01:08) Hi Stanley, welcome. Lise Fuhr is going through the presentation. we are on slide 3.

Attendees: Alain Durand, Alan Greenberg, Alexandrine Gauvin, Allan MacGillivray, Amr Elsadr, Anders Hektor, Andrew Harris, Anne Aikman-Scalese, Aparna Sridhar, Arianna Del Soldato, Ariel Liang, Ashley Heineman, Ashley Roberts, Avri Doria, Barbara Wanner, Bela Varsanyi, Bernard Turcotte, Berry Cobb, Bob Hinden, Brenden Duerbis, Caitrin Dwyer, Carlos Reyes, Carolyn Nguyen, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Christopher Wilkinson, Chuck Gomes, Clara Collado, Crescent, Dan O'Neill, Degezelle Wim, Elise Ferguson, Elise Gerich, Ellen Blackler, Etienne Tshishimbi, Frazaneh Badii, Gary Hunt, Gema Campillos, Gisella Gruber, Glen de Saint Gery, Goksu Kalkan, Gordon Chillcott, Graeme Bunton, Greg DiBiase, Jaap Akkerhuis, James Gannon, Jennifer Scott, Jim Baskin, Jim Prendergast, Jimmy Schultz, John Sweeting, Joly MacFie, Jonathan Robinson, Joseph Wright, Karen Mulberry, Lars Hoffmann, Laura Covington, Luis Furlan, Lynn St. Amour, Marika Konings, Mark Ayling, Mark Carvell, Mary Wong, Matthew Shears, Michael Niebel, Monica Soliño, Nacho Amadoz, Nicolae Vascautan, Osvaldo Novoa, P. Vergote, Paul Diaz, Paul Mitchell, Philip Corwin, Rafik Dammak, Roger Carney, Ron Sherwood, Ronald Schwaerzler, Russ Housley, Samantha Demetriou, Sara Bockey, Sarah Falvey, Sheryl Haristya, Sofia Hilali, Staffan Jonson, Steve Sheng, Taylor Bentley, Thomas Lowenhaupt, Tony Holmes (87)

Transcript:

Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April.doc

Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April.pdf

AR	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-ar.docx Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-ar.pdf
FR	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-fr.doc Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-fr.pdf
ES	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-es.doc Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-es.pdf
PT	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-pt.doc Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-pt.pdf
RU	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-ru.docx Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-ru.pdf
ZH	Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-ZH.docx Transcript CWG IANA Webinar 2 24 April-ZH.pdf

Adobe Connect Recording: <https://icann.adobeconnect.com/p4kj0j0scr5/>

Audio MP3 Recording: <http://audio.icann.org/gnso/gnso-cwg-iana-1400-24apr15-en.mp3>

Adobe Connect Chat:

Brenda Brewer: (4/24/2015 08:42) Hello all and welcome to the WEBINAR: Cross Community Working Group (CWG) On IANA Naming Related Functions: Briefing on 2nd Draft Proposal for Public Comment 14:00 UTC call on 24 April.

Bernard Turcotte - staff support: (08:56) morning all

Osvaldo Novoa: (08:57) Hello all

Jaap Akkerhuis -- SSAC: (08:59) Good afternoon all!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (09:00) hi

Staffan Jonson: (09:02) Hi all

Gary Hunt - UK Government: (09:02) Good afternoon....

CWG IANA: (09:03) Good afternoon

Stanley Shan 2: (01:08) yes,i know,

Grace Abuhamad: (01:09) great :)

Grace Abuhamad: (01:10) There are 131 participants as of today

Grace Abuhamad: (01:10) CWG grew since the slides were put together

nigel hickson: (01:11) @grace - well done; early in Europe...

Yasuichi Kitamura (At-Large): (01:11) sorry for my slow joining here.

Grace Abuhamad: (01:11) 131 participants, 19 members = 150 total

Grace Abuhamad: (01:12) thanks. 2am here in DC @nigel :)

Sébastien: (01:19) Hello where to get the presentation? Thanks

Grace Abuhamad: (01:19) Webinar Slides: <https://www.icann.org/sites/default/files/assets/cwg-stewardship-towards-final-proposal-23apr15-en.pdf>

Sébastien: (01:20) Merci

Grace Abuhamad: (01:21) de rien

Boyoung Kim: (01:21) can't hear

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:21) audio?

Yasuichi Kitamura (At-Large): (01:21) am I here?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:21) ohh dear

Brenda Brewer: (01:21) stand by please

Nurani Nimpuno: (01:21) Audio disappeared

Paul Kane: (01:21) Lise - sound has stopped

Olivier Crépin-Leblond: (01:22) no problem with the audio on telephone. Probably the problem is with the connection to Adobe

Yaovi Atohou: (01:22) asking for passcode now

Grace Abuhamad: (01:22) Please standby

jaap akkerhuis (SSAC): (01:22) Looks like we lost the phone bridge in adobe

Karine Perset: (01:22) CWG IANA

Karine Perset: (01:22) Passcode is CWG IANA I think

Jia He: (01:22) what do we need? pass code?

Karine Perset: (01:23) I do not have a mic

Samiran Gupta: (01:23) Brenda we have been knocked off the call. We cant hear anything .

stanley shan: (01:23) I am back again....

Jia He: (01:23) how do we gave the passcode?

nigel hickson: (01:23) This is very Kafkak like

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:23) for heavins sake!

Karine Perset: (01:23) Passcode is CWG IANA I think

Olivier Crépin-Leblond: (01:23) IT works now

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:24) need to go back a bit in thevppt

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (01:24) FWIW, at least I still have muted speaker, so no audio yet. Is Adobe connected to the bridge again?

Grace Abuhamad: (01:25) yes it's connected

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:03) Anne Aikman-Scalese - IPC - 7 am in Arizona Good morning!

James Gannon: (09:04) Afternoon all

Allan MacGillivray: (09:04) Good morning/afternoon one and all.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:05) Hi all -- today's slides were also posted on the Public Comment page. Here is the direct link: Webinar Slides: <https://www.icann.org/sites/default/files/assets/cwg-stewardship-towards-final-proposal-23apr15-en.pdf>

Jimmy Schulz: (09:07) Hi all

Jim Prendergast: (09:08) Thanks Grace

Grace Abuhamad: (09:10) We actually have 131 participants today! 6 new additions since we made the slides!

Grace Abuhamad: (09:11) so, this brings the CWG-Stewardship to 150 individuals total!

James Gannon: (09:11) IMportant to note anumber of participants still attended the F2F meetings without funding

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (09:11) true

Grace Abuhamad: (09:12) Thanks James. You are correct that about 12-15 have attended the interim meetings without funding.

James Gannon: (09:12) WOuld be interested to know is the CWG the largest WG ICANN has had?

Grace Abuhamad: (09:13) CCWG-Accountability is at 170 individuals ;) but we are a close 2nd.

James Gannon: (09:13) Ahha! Thanks Grace, a fountain of knowledge as always =)

Grace Abuhamad: (09:14) Too much time spent with these numbers :)

James Gannon: (09:15) =) Yeah I know that feeling.

Staffan Jonson: (09:16) Please mute

James Gannon: (09:16) Degezelle open mic

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:28) QUESTION: Regarding Community Empowerment Mechansims, what has been the legal advice with respect to the ability to "approve or reject board descisions" under California law ?

Grace Abuhamad: (09:29) noted @anne. thank you.

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:29) @Grace - affiliation is IPC if you need to say so.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:30) Anne, your question may be more appropriate for the CCWG-Accountability. Would you like me to forward this question to them?

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:31) Thank you, Jonathan.

Brenden Kuerbis: (09:32) @Anne it is a good question. As well as the ability for the community to deal with specific issues (e.g., IANA related) that the ICANN board may take versus more general accountability.

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:32) @Grace - I think I can ask Greg Shatan. Is there an upcoming Accountability webinar?

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:33) @Brendan - agree

Amr Elsadr: (09:34) <QUESTION> As accountability mechanisms being developed by the CCWG-ACCT are being relied on (which the ICANN board will need to approve), is the CWG considering independent accountability mechanisms in the event that CCWG recommendations are not, for one reason or another, adopted? <QUESTION>

Susan Payne - Valideus: (01:25) easiest was is to log out and back in again

Nurani Nimpuno: (01:25) Yes, I am now reconnected

stanley shan: (01:25) who know how to download the webiar slide?

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (01:25) ok, grace, thank. I found I had to turn on audio myself, although it was turned off centrally.

Grace Abuhamad: (01:25) @Stanley Webinar Slides: <https://www.icann.org/sites/default/files/assets/cwg-stewardship-towards-final-proposal-23apr15-en.pdf>

Grace Abuhamad: (01:25) Thanks @Patrik -- sory for the issue

Zheng Song: (01:25) Please reload adobeconnect in your browser

Zheng Song: (01:26) That got me back

Jia He: (01:27) goes well now

stanley shan: (01:27) @Grace Abuhamad Mercy

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (01:28) :-) :-)

Grace Abuhamad: (01:41) Public Comment Input Template: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/cwg-stewardship-input-template-pdf-22apr15-en.pdf>

Grace Abuhamad: (01:41) There is also a Word version posted

Grace Abuhamad: (01:42) the Email to submit comments: comments-cwg-stewardship-draft-proposal-22apr15@icann.org

Susan Payne - Valideus: (01:45) Could you explain again the make up of the PTI - did you say it is a wholly owned subsidiary of ICANN? Will the Board members of the PTI be a subset of the ICANN Board, or independent?

Anupam Agrawal: (01:46) Is PTI ging to be a seperate legal entity?

Stephen: (01:47) You are proposing that ICANN staff compose the board of PTI?

Jian-Chuan Chang (KNET): (01:48) +1 to Stephen

Jian-Chuan Chang (KNET): (01:48) same concern for me

Olivier Crépin-Leblond: (01:48) I have downloaded the presentation. Are slides 10 & 11 supposed to exist?

Grace Abuhamad: (01:49) Slides 10&11 are background slides

Grace Abuhamad: (01:49) not used in webinar today

Olivier Crépin-Leblond: (01:49) ah ok - thanks. - We'd need to tag them as such

stanley shan: (01:49) I think the post transition structure, the relationship between PTI and ICANN is a little bit like Guam (or some other U.S Unincorporated Territory) and United States. This PTI keeps close cooperation with ICANN, but not directly by ICANN

Olivier Crépin-Leblond: (01:49) the slide deck is likely to be shared

Jia He: (01:50) Does the portocal and IP functions will be also seperated from ICANN and into the PTI?

Julie Z: (01:50) Thank you. seems that CWG proposal is very different from the other two communities about setting up a new entity PTI and several new mechanisms, will CWG deal with the inconsistency, will CWG try to sell this concept to the other two communities?

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (01:53) The process we use in ICG is this (as Lise said, but let me be specific): "If ICG do find incompatibilities, ICG will ask the operational communities to resolve those.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:34) @Anne, the CCWG-Accountability is currently in a high intensity series of meetings. They plan to do webinars, but have not set a date(s) yet

Grace Abuhamad: (09:34) Noted @Amr

Amr Elsadr: (09:35) Thanks Grace. Apologies about the late submission.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:35) Nothing is late :) We have a lot of time for questions at the end of presentation and can go back to relevant slide(s) too

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:35) @Amr -extremelly important procedural question tthat you have asked. Has teh Board said they WILL follow the CCWG - ACCT recommendations?

Grace Abuhamad: (09:36) @anne, yes, the ICANN board made a statement on this in Singapore at ICANN 52 :<https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-3-2015-02-12-en>

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:37) Thanks Grace - I thought I remembered such a statement.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:37) For all "When ICANN receives these proposals, we will forward them promptly and without modification to NTIA. "

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:38) Thanks Grace.

Amr Elsadr: (09:38) Yes. Thanks you Grace.

Amr Elsadr: (09:38) *Thank :)

Grace Abuhamad: (09:38) you're welcome. happy to help

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:40) QUESTION - Who would be defined as the "Customers" of the post transition entity?

Jimmy Schulz: (09:40) sorry got to leave.. cu

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:40) Thank you Jonathan.

Russ Housley: (09:41) Question: Do you see the IETF and the RIRs as customers too? Your answer to the previous question leads me to believe that these are Naming community customers only.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:42) Noted @Russ

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:43) Great question Russ. And what about other stakeholders - e.g. from IPC point of view, "customers" of the smooth functioning of the new Whois service?

Avri Doria: (09:44) Anne, those are indorect customers of IANA services, but direct customers of ICANN policies and enfor cement.

James Gannon: (09:44) I think 'direct customers' would be abetter description for the CSC

James Gannon: (09:44) Agree with Avri

Amr Elsadr: (09:44) @James: +1

Avri Doria: (09:45) after this transtion IETf/RIS would still be ICANN's customers. and ICANN would use the PTI to get the work doen for tiself and its customers.

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:45) Of course there is tension here but it seems to me that even indirect customers should have input in the CSC

Avri Doria: (09:46) Anne, the CSC design does include liaisons from the indirect scustomers.

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:46) Thanks Avri. Very helpful.

Julie Z: (01:56) Thank you Patrik, the problem will then go back to the operational communities.....

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (01:58) Julie Z: The important thing to know is that ICG will NOT resolve issues, and that is one of the reasons the OC's have been working so hard (as Jonathan now describes) to minimize risk for such incompatibilities.

Julie Z: (02:00) thank you

Jonathan Robinson: (02:00) Thank-you. Good questions.

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (02:02) While discussing multi stakeholder, we should separate question on this process be multi stakeholder and how multi stakeholder the solutions are.

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (02:02) NTIA specifically required the process that leads to a solution to multi stakeholder.

Grace Abuhamad: (02:06) We call them "implications" to match the ICG RFP text

Patrik Fältström - SSAC: (02:08) Very well done! Thanks!

Sébastien: (02:08) Thanks

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (02:08) good call thanks Lise (and Jonathan), thanks everyone...

Yaovi Atohou: (02:08) Thanks

Jian-Chuan Chang (KNET): (02:08) Thank you Lise

Julie Z: (02:08) thanks

Bernard Turcotte - staff support: (02:08) bye all

Tom Dale (ACIG GAC Secretariat): (02:08) Thank you, very helpful.

Susan Payne - Valideus: (02:08) thanks all, ver useful

Wen Zhai: (02:08) Thank to all. Bye~

Minjung PARK: (02:08) thank you Lise and everyone

nigel hickson: (02:08) Indeed; really great! well done and good start to day

Brenden Kuerbis: (09:47) @Russ, as Jonathan said, CWG couldn't presume anything about numbers, protocols. But that doesn't mean those communities couldn't review this proposal and revise theirs accordingly (e.g., with whom they contract) if they see advantages in doing so.

James Gannon: (09:47) +1 Brendan

Amr Elsad: (09:47) @Anne: My personal concern with including indirect customers would be bringing ICANN policy issues to discussions in IANA where they don't belong. The concerns of indirect customers could and should be dealt with in ICANN. Does that make any sense?

Avri Doria: (09:48) Brenden that is right, had they ever said, or ere to say in the future, that they wanted to move their contract from ICANN to the IANA, they would then become direct customers of IANA.

Anders Hektor: (09:48) CSC seems mainly to conduct monitoring to react post hoc, so how is oversight conducted?

Avri Doria: (09:48) Amr, and that is why they are liaisons and not regular members of the CSC.

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:48) I think NCSG is also an indirect customer and that there should be input in real time when issues arise in the context of the new entity - it has a separate Board of Directors after all.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:48) @Anders -- is your question for the Chair or for the chat?

Anders Hektor: (09:49) Yes, sorry, it's a question :)

Grace Abuhamad: (09:49) Noted!

Anders Hektor: (09:49) Thanks Grace!

James Gannon: (09:49) @Anne the important thing is to keep the IANA focused on operational concerns and not policy concerns, hence the liaisons rather than full members for indirect customers

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:50) I think there are indirect customers with significant concerns about operational matters.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:50) Public Comment Input Template: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/cwg-stewardship-input-template-pdf-22apr15-en.pdf>

Staffan Jonson: (09:50) Anders: Yes CSC is mainly for monitoring. Oversight is e.g. in IANA function REVIEW IFR

Grace Abuhamad: (09:50) The Email to submit comments: comments-cwg-stewardship-draft-proposal-22apr15@icann.org

James Gannon: (09:52) Johnnatan can you speak a little about how we decided the CSC composition re direct customers and liaisons from indirect customers

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:52) Security stability - trust in the DNS - for everyone - including those who need to be protected as to free speech and those who need to protect consumers from counterfeit goods.

Grace Abuhamad: (09:53) Noted @James

James Gannon: (09:53) @Anne Those are policy matters in my opinion rather than matters in the operation of the IANA rather than the operation of ICANN

James Gannon: (09:53) *IANA

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:54) @James - policy is made in the policy-making process and then implemented via the contracted parties and how those obligations are executed = operational concerns.

Amr Elsad: (09:54) Thanks Jonathan and Grace. That's helpful.

Matthew Shears: (09:54) CSC is really about managing the day to day performance of the IANA functions

James Gannon: (09:55) Yes but they are ICANN operational concerns, not in every case IANA operational concerns

Staffan Jonson: (09:55) I would like to agree with James. Separation between direct operations and technical overview on the one hand, and the broader meaning of Policy on the other hand are very different, and indicates different process and remedies

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:56) Thanks all. I think I just need to study the CSC structure and input process for indirect customers.

James Gannon: (09:57) And in the cases, though limited, where they somehow become IANA operational concerns that is why we have the liaisons there. Indirect customers are important but the concept is to keep IANA as technically focused as possible

James Gannon: (09:58) +1 Staffan

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (09:59) @Steffan - To be clear, I am not talking about policy making - rather about execution of policy at the operational level.

Avri Doria: (09:59) Anne which policy implementation?

Grace Abuhamad: (10:00) 2nd Draft Proposal (with annexes): <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/cwg-stewardship-draft-proposal-with-annexes-22apr15-en.pdf>

Grace Abuhamad: (10:00) that is the 'long' form

Grace Abuhamad: (10:02) the document is unsynced, so you can scroll at your ease

Anne Aikman-Scalese: (10:03) @Avri - In the possible new Whois structure, there are complicated mechanisms for proper execution - IF these ever come to fruition, proper operational operation will have significant impact for numerous stakeholders. Indirect customer input is fine - I need to study the CSC structure.

Grace Abuhamad: (10:03) As a reminder, you need to save and submit your form to Email to submit comments: comments-cwg-stewardship-draft-proposal-22apr15@icann.org

Avri Doria: (10:04) Anne, but these would probably not involve IANA. The only whois it deals with is of the TLD registry itself.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr: (10:04) thanks Jonathan... thanks everyone... bye for now...

Amr Elsadr: (10:04) Thank you very much, Jonathan and Grace.

Staffan Jonson: (10:04) Thank You all

Graeme Bunton - RrSG: (10:04) thanks

Amr Elsadr: (10:04) Thanks all. Bye.

Lynn St.Amour: (10:04) Thank you all,

James Gannon: (10:04) @Anne IANA wouldn't have anything to do with that policy, apart from any impact on root WHOIS

Jaap Akkerhuis -- SSAC: (10:04) by all

Monica Soliño UYNIC: (10:04) ye