

Zoom chat: Tuesday, 15 June 2021 - At-Large Policy

Session 2: ccTLD governance models - Testimonies from At-Large end users

01:10:37 Heidi Ullrich: Welcome. All.

01:10:59 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Abrazo Alberto!

01:11:11 Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org: Hello, my name is Gisella Gruber and I will be monitoring this chat room. In this role, I am the voice for the remote participants. Please note that I will read aloud comments/questions submitted in English within the time set by the Chair of this session.

When submitting a question or comment that you want me to read out loud on the mic, please start with a <QUESTION> and end with a "</QUESTION>" or <COMMENT> </COMMENT>. Text outside these quotes will be considered as part of "chat" and will not be read out loud on the microphone.

01:11:24 Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org: To listen to the interpretation, please click on the interpretation icon in the Zoom toolbar and select the language you will listen to and/or speak during this session.

This session also includes automated real time transcription. By clicking on the "closed caption" button in the Zoom toolbar you can view the real time transcription. This transcript is not official or authoritative.

Please note that chat sessions are being archived and follow the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior: <http://www.icann.org/en/news/in-focus/accountability/expected-standards>.

01:11:52 Abdulkarim Oloyede: hello

01:12:05 Maureen Hilyard: Hi AK

01:12:19 Frank Anati: hi everyone

01:13:07 Abdulkarim Oloyede: Hi Maureen

01:14:16 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: nothing 'mere' about Katrina ;-)

01:14:25 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: indeed!

01:14:55 Calvin Browne: Morning, all from Johannesburg.

01:15:22 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez: Greetings Calvin!

01:15:28 Isobel Egerton: Good evening here in New Zealand all.

01:15:33 sergio salinas porto LACRALO: Hi all!

01:15:40 Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC: Hello.. sorry for being late.. greetings from Mauritius

01:16:03 Keolebogile Rantsetse: Good Morning. Keo from Botswana

01:16:16 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Many ccTLDs precede ICANN itself!

01:16:42 Chokri Ben Romdhane: Good Morning from Tunis

01:16:45 Maureen Hilyard: @Isobel.. welcome , also from NZ at the moment

01:17:05 Heidi Ullrich: See ISO 3166 list - <https://www.iso.org/iso-3166-country-codes.html>

01:17:53 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez: ICANN nor the ccNSO decide what is a country or territory

01:20:27 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Very interesting

01:21:50 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Good attendance @ this session.

01:22:43 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Thanks @Katrina well delivered indeed!

01:23:19 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: Well done Katrina

01:23:21 Amrita Choudhury: Question: who are the individuals who own ccTLDs

01:25:44 Norman Angel: Great presentation @Katrina!

01:26:03 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: sorry --- they own domains under ccTLD

01:26:16 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: nobody owns a CCTLD itself. Sorry for the confusion

01:26:32 Amrita Choudhury: Thanks OCL

01:26:34 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: well --- none of the people presenting own a ccTLD :-)

01:27:07 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: thanks Katrina.

01:27:41 DANIEL K. NANGHAKA: some ccTLDs are run by Private Companies or Individuals

01:28:17 Peter Koch (DENIC eG): RFC1591 provides some additional perspective of "ownership" in this regard

01:28:58 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Yes it is Management of as opposed to ownership as such

01:29:14 Sven Echternach: Q: Why are annual registration fees for African ccTLDs so much higher than for Western European TLDs (with few exceptions)?

01:29:27 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: its a delegation

01:29:49 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: .br from Brazil is a not for profit with a multistakeholder governance model , our governance committee has representatives from all interested parts. I am alternate member of this committee nowadays, elected by peers

01:30:11 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: unmute

01:30:57 Lianna Galstyan: We run .am for Armenia and the Registry is non-for-profit

01:31:18 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liason ccNSO: @Sven, most of the costs are tied to operating costs. In countries where operating costs are lower the cost of domain names is low

01:32:40 Sven Echternach: @Barrack, Thank you for explaining

01:33:03 Bob Ochieng: The OECD 2006 report that looked into this matter had very interesting results.....it concluded that out of the three predominantly practised governance models, i.e public interest / MSM model, Government run models and private sector run models, non is actually superior to the other....especially if the process of identifying that model is all inclusive....In other words, the process needs to be MSM, but the result not necessarily...

01:33:05 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liason ccNSO: Welcome @Sven

01:35:03 Roberto: @Bob - interesting! thanks for sharing the info

01:35:57 Ricardo Holmquist: I think the Internet has changed a bit since 2006

01:36:20 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liason ccNSO: @Daniel, we have some Legacy issues where Internet Pioneers who started running some ccTLDs are built Special Purpose Vehicles and are allowed to operate the ccTLDs. However the understanding is this is done on behalf of the people in that particular territory. There is no way one can operate the ccTLD without the blessing of the Government / Territorial leadership

01:36:50 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: <Comment>. The important fact that cc governance models span the whole spectrum from public /governmental to private/for profit cannot be understated: it is quite important to Internet Governance itself and the preservation of the multistakeholder model: the great diversity of types of entities involved not only ensures a wide variety of views in pertinent discussions, it is also, IMHO, a critical argument against multilateralism and state based models. And as Holly mentioned even non-sovereign territories can participate as equals, which by the way it's a particular source of pride for myself, as my friends at .PR run a great, non governmental ccTLD.

01:37:09 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: a concern for all of the AU Internet Significantly Interested Parties

01:37:10 Roberto: @Ricardo - that's also very true - it would be nice to have a more recent study

01:37:20 Sébastien Bachollet: .cc or .cx?

01:37:59 Abdulkarim Oloyede: Interesting Holly

01:38:15 Chokri Ben Romdhane: <Question>Are there any local laws or jurisdictions that require a government institution to use exclusively the local ccTLD in your country or region</question>

01:38:22 Harold Arcos: thanks @Holly,,

01:38:43 Jahangir Hossain: Informative @Holly , Thanks

01:42:17 Dean Marks: <Question> Was .CX--the domain with problems described by Holly--on sold to Verisign and leased by Verisign as described on Holly's slide? <Question>

01:42:42 Bob Ochieng: @Ricardo, I actually think the Principle of "Process being multistakeholder" still applies...even today..

01:43:00 Pat Kane (VRSN): .CX is not operated by Verisign

01:43:07 Sébastien Bachollet: For France

01:43:44 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liaison ccNSO: @dean, do we say sold or leased? you cannot sell a ccTLD can you?

01:44:44 Stephen Deerhake (.as ccNSO Councilor): <COMMENT>Holly, can you provide documentation /references to support your claims regarding the use of .cx domains for inappropriate uses that you alleged in your presentation?</COMMENT>

01:45:06 Holly Raiche: @ Dean - As I said, there is a strange entry in Wikipedia that says it was sold in 2019 - I have asked a few people who don't have further details. But Until then, yes, names were sublet by Version through the American's c company eNIC. So to reply to Pat, Version is (until 2019??) the administrator and sublets.

01:45:26 Thuy Mai: Question: Is there any country's law that stipulates the ccTLD is public resources and registrants only owns the right to use it, not the domain names themselves?

01:45:56 Ricardo Holmquist: @Bob: agree, it seems the ccTLD with a MSM model are the best. Don't mind who actually has the delegation

01:45:59 Dean Marks: @Barrack--I don't know. I was taking that language from Holly's slide.

01:46:01 Pat Kane (VRSN): I apologize Holly, I was in another session so I don't have context to your question

01:46:46 Dean Marks: @Holly and @Pat--thanks for your answers to my question. Much appreciated.

01:47:06 hadia Elminiawi: translation working well

01:47:18 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Abrazote Beto!

01:47:34 Holly Raiche: And Stephen - it's been in the press recently. If you would like, I'll dig up references, but in conversations I have had (including with relevant people in the Australian government) the Australian government has not been happy with the way CX has (not) been managed

01:47:43 Herb Wayne Ombuds: Sorry for late arrival... Greetings from the ICANN Office of the Ombuds. Our virtual Office is open for drop-in visits during ICANN71. Details are posted in the discussion forum on the main ICANN71 page. Anyone wishing to speak with the Ombuds team of Herb & Barb can also reach us at ombudsman@icann.org

Stay safe and be kind.

01:47:50 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://hosterstats.com): Is .CX being mixed up with .CC? (Think that .CC is Verisign administered.)

01:48:33 Pat Kane (VRSN): @John - Verisign operates .CC under agreement with the Shire of the Cocos, yes

01:50:06 Calvin Browne: <question>Yeah - I'm also curious as to the statistics mentioned by Stephen's question?

01:50:07 Holly Raiche: CX is the problem. Version managed through eNIC (the company that originally applied to IANA (ICANN didn't exist yet) .

01:50:11 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: Un abrazo Alberto

01:50:12 Ricardo Holmquist: Gracias Alberto!!

01:50:17 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://hosterstats.com): @Pat it can get a bit confusing tracking all the ccTLDs.

01:50:21 Holly Raiche: Thanks Alberto

01:51:03 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Humberto mi amigo!!!!

01:51:05 sergio salinas porto LACRALO: si hermano se te escucha!

01:51:25 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Decano!!!!

01:51:35 Holly Raiche: well done Humberto - Congratulations

01:51:37 alberto soto: De nada Ricardo, you are welcome Holly!

01:51:47 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: Felicitaciones Decano Carrasco!!

01:52:07 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: congratulations to Humberto!

01:52:18 alberto soto: Otro Pablo!

01:52:26 Yrjo Lansipuro: Congrats Humberto!

01:53:16 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: Congratulaciones Humberto !

01:53:18 Sarah T Kiden: Congratulations Humberto!

01:53:41 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: Hola Vanda, un abrazo grande

01:54:01 Pat Kane (VRSN): @Holly - eNIC is the Verisign entity that operates .CC not .CX

01:55:20 Maureen Hilyard: Yes congratulations Humberto!

01:55:58 Narayanaswamy Baluswamy: Congratulations Mr. Humberto

01:56:00 Maureen Hilyard: Hi Andrew

01:56:27 Lito Ibarra: <COMMENT> Conceptually and historically, a ccTLD is part of the Internet core for each country or territory, and should serve its own community from the Internet development and deployment perspective </COMMENT>

01:56:31 souleymane OUMTANAGA-ccNSO Council: Hello Andrew

01:58:15 Roberto: @Lito - the problem is that, as for every valuable asset, the country can decide to do other things with it instead of sticking to the originally intended use

01:58:52 Roberto: And there's nothing that ICANN can do about

01:59:26 Lito Ibarra: Sadly true, Roberto

01:59:35 Ricardo Holmquist: +1 Roberto. Specially in nowadays

02:00:11 desiree_miloshevic: e.g. .ME has special price for local users

02:00:21 Bob Ochieng: Paragraph 63 of the Tunis agenda reads. Countries should not be involved in decisions regarding another country's country-code Top-Level Domain (ccTLD). Their legitimate interests, as expressed and defined by each country, in diverse ways, regarding decisions affecting their ccTLDs, need to be respected, upheld and addressed via a flexible and improved framework and mechanisms.

02:01:13 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liaison ccNSO: +1 @Lito

02:01:32 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: interesting different aspects of governance for different countries...

02:01:49 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liaison ccNSO: +1 @Bob, we need another Tunis refresher/revisit

02:03:09 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: <question> I have a question to anyone. which cc has already adopted RDAP?? < question>

02:03:16 alberto soto: nic.ar in figures: https://nic.ar/es/dominios/en_cifras

02:03:40 alberto soto: <https://nic.ar>

02:04:13 Holly Raiche: Thanks Pat - CLO tells me I missed the names up - so my apologies. I've corrected things one too many times. CC - Cocos - is the worry. and yes, Version manages it through eNIC. And I am still baffled by the Wikipedia entry that it, in 2019, it has been registered and used by another company

02:04:38 Holly Raiche: Sorry - Versign

02:05:26 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://hosterstats.com): Wikipedia can be a bit unreliable at times due to it being editable by anyone.

02:05:26 Pat Kane (VRSN): @Holly - the entry in Wikipedia references a second level domain [co.cc](#), not the entire top level domain (TLD)

02:05:56 Seun S. Ojedeji: Lol @Olivier

02:06:37 Maureen Hilyard: Nice to have you back with us, Javier

02:06:44 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: statistics [from.br](#) : <https://registro.br/dominio/estatisticas/>

02:06:51 Holly Raiche: Thanks Pat. So it would simply be a sublet of [.co.cc](#) - not the whole [.cc](#) - thus still managed through eNIC

02:07:43 Pat Kane (VRSN): correct Holly. the ccTLD is still a Cocos Islands asset and we operate it under an agreement with the Shire

02:07:54 Holly Raiche: (and John - totally agree - but the entry did raised questions in my mind)

02:08:31 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: @Javier - well said

02:09:07 Dean Marks: Here is an interesting recent article I just found on [.cc](#) <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2021/jun/08/australia-urged-to-take-control-of-cocos-cc-internet-domain-to-foil-scammers-and-child-abuse-sites>

02:10:18 Rieke Poppe - [One.com](#): .dk only rents the right to use the domain

02:11:38 Holly Raiche: @ Pat - is Brian Cartnell still in the [.cc](#) picture or did he give his interests in [.CC](#) to Version - or is he, as CEO of eNIC, still in the picture?

02:11:52 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: FOI in 60 sec good like @Katrina

02:11:53 alberto soto: Yes Katrina, we need more time

02:12:33 Pat Kane (VRSN): @Dean - the data here is based upon two reports from 2016 and 2019 . Since then Verisign has joined IWF and address the activity

02:12:54 Holly Raiche: (sorry again - Verisign - my computer keeps 'correcting' the name

02:12:57 Pat Kane (VRSN): @Holly - Cartmell has not been in the picture since around 2001

02:12:59 alberto soto: Yes Vanda, [nic.ar](#)

02:13:04 Holly Raiche: Thanks Pat

02:13:39 hadia Elminiawi: Humberto the translation works well

02:13:44 Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC: We should never apologise to use our language of choice

02:15:20 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Extraordinario Alberto!

02:15:26 Bart Boswinkel ICANN Org: The Framework of Interpretation that was mentioned can be found here: https://ccnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/filefield_46435/foi-final-07oct14-en.pdf

02:15:27 Romina Guirado (.ar): <http://bfa.ar/>

02:15:34 Seun S. Ojedeji: @Dave yes but if the person wants to communicate to someone yes then use the supported languages

02:15:50 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Thanks @Bart

02:16:40 hadia Elminiawi: the sound is breaking

02:16:56 Bart Boswinkel ICANN Org: The FOI is interpreting RFC1591

02:17:22 alberto soto: Dear, I have a medical appointment, and I must go at this time. If there are inquiries, please I will answer them by email.

02:17:31 Dean Marks: @Pat--thanks for the clarification. The article was just from last week, so that's why I thought it might be of interest to share. Congrats on joining IWF.

02:17:34 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/html/rfc1591>

02:17:36 alberto soto: Sorry!!

02:17:48 Jonathan Zuck: [.CC](#)

02:17:53 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Take care stay safe @Alberto

02:17:53 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Cuidate Beto!

02:18:03 alberto soto: Gracias Javier!

02:18:04 Pat Kane (VRSN): @Dean. Thanks

02:18:14 Lucien Castex: Très intéressant

02:18:17 Lito Ibarra: Cuidate, Alberto

02:18:24 alberto soto: Gracias ito

02:18:47 alberto soto: Bye Bye y disculpas!!

02:20:33 Lucien Castex: xD

02:20:57 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Time Mx you will get it eventually @OCL :-)

02:21:01 Rieke Poppe - [One.com](#): I'd like to hear from Stephen though :(

02:21:01 Pat Kane (VRSN): Thank you Holly

02:22:16 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](#): Some governments have that eventuality in legislation where they can act to replace the registry operator in some cases.

02:22:57 Holly Raiche: There is a redelagation process that can be invoked if the country is unhappy with how a name is being managed

02:23:10 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: CcTLDs are fully self governing, only subject to local law.

02:23:16 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: It is important to point out that ccTLDs precede ICANN and many of us work with an MoU

02:24:21 desiree_miloshevic: The new ccNSO policy on retirement would address the FOIWG <https://ccnso.icann.org/en/workinggroups/pdp-retirement.htm>

02:24:37 Holly Raiche: @ John, as I mentioned, our legislation does allow our communications regulator to name a different manager - which would then require application for redelegation

02:25:09 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](#): @Holly Most countries with that kind of legislation have learned the hard way.

02:25:35 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: thanks Stephen

02:26:12 Lito Ibarra: Right, Pablo. Many of us work with a MoU or an Accountability Framework

02:26:41 Holly Raiche: And that includes Australia. Originally, .au was managed by an individual in Melb IT - and it took a bit of time and effort to get the management of .au away from him and given to auDA

02:26:42 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: yes...

02:28:17 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: Great points Barrack

02:28:34 Maureen Hilyard: +1 to Barrack

02:28:41 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](#): @Holly It is a good thing to have that kind of failsafe in legislation.

02:28:46 Holly Raiche: Thanks Barrack

02:28:55 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: ccTLDs play an important role in the scientific and economic development of their respective countries. of

02:29:10 Eberhard Lisse: The point about CS was that it was re-used by the ISO within a few years after the split of Czechoslovakia for Serbia and Montenegro.

02:29:34 Seun S. Ojedeji: AFRALO(ALSes and individual members) should certainly get involved in the national DNS forum @Barrack, thanks for the heads-up

02:29:54 Peter Koch (DENIC eG): Not only are ccTLDs different from gTLDs, they also differ from each other. This is a feature.

02:30:08 Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC: +1 Seun

02:30:18 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](#): @Eberhard there were still some legacy [.CS](#) DNSes in various zones. Then there is the example of [.SU](#) ccTLD.

02:30:19 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: +1 Peter

02:30:29 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liaison ccNSO: +1 Seun

02:30:31 Javier Rúa-Jovet ccNSO Council: @OCL: some organizations that mistreat their customers keep existing: they are called authoritarian states!

02:30:34 Holly Raiche: I hope I made clear that auDA processes always allow input from end users on its panels.
02:30:40 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Excellent session Thank you ccNSO appreciate ypu vital input!
02:30:48 Herb Waye Ombuds: Great informative session... very professional and respectful... stay safe and be kind.
02:30:59 Maureen Hilyard: Thank you Katrina for participating. Really appreciated your inputs.
02:31:00 hadia Elminiawi: The national DNS forum is a good idea +1 to sebastien including users
02:31:05 Sarah T Kiden: Yes indeed. Great session
02:31:06 Roberto: @Eberhard - since then ISO 3166-MA has changed the procedures to avoid that happening again
02:31:09 Maureen Hilyard: We must do this again with the ccNSO
02:31:09 Amrita Choudhury: Thank you for the informative session
02:31:13 Dean Marks: Thanks for this great session and to all the speakers!
02:31:23 Humberto Carrasco: Thanks a lot!! Have a wonderful day!!
02:31:25 Bob Ochieng: Thanks and bye
02:31:28 Eberhard Lisse: John, SU is not an ISO Code element, but exceptionally reserved and hence not comparable at all to the CS situation
02:31:29 Raymond Mamattah: Beautiful hosting! See you in ICANN72 f2f.
02:31:39 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liason ccNSO: Thank you Hadia for a great session
02:31:40 Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong: Bravo pour cette formidable session
02:31:51 Juliana Harsianti: Thank you for organize the session
02:32:11 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://hosterstats.com): @Eberhard True but they are both legacy countries.
02:32:13 Maarten Botterman: Thanks - great session - good to have this "case study" approach to demonstrate the diversity ... and clearly sketch the "independence" from the cc's
02:32:21 Eberhard Lisse: Roberto, I am aware of this
02:32:23 Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC: Thanks for this interesting session.. Thanks and bye to all.. looking forward for the next session
02:32:42 Dr. Pablo Rodriguez - ccNSO Council: Thank you Hadia, Olivier, and the entire ALAC for an excellent session.
02:32:49 ALI Hadji: Thanks to all, and +1 for the DNS national mentionned Barrack. It's will be a good approach.
02:33:22 Adam Peake ICANN org: Apologies for joining the session late. Perhaps someone has already sent a link to this interview with DENIC's CEO Jorg Schweiger. Org covers a lot of interesting issues and relevant to this session <https://goldsteinreport.com/denic-jorg-schweiger-security-new-tlds-icann-gdpr-future-domains/>
02:33:29 Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond: A Secure and reliable experience
02:34:08 Roberto: @Eberhard - of course I know you are - but was mentioning it because I believe that other readers of the chat are not
02:34:16 Adam Peake ICANN org: Apologies, auto correct of Jorg to Org!
02:34:25 Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org: Many thanks to the organisers, speakers and all participants.
02:34:49 Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Thanks everyone... Bye for now...
02:34:50 Andrew Molivurae: Thank you Hadia, Olivier and all for a great session.
02:34:52 Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC: +1 Adam
02:34:57 Chokri Ben Romdhane: Thank you all
02:34:58 John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://hosterstats.com): Later all/Thanks
02:35:00 Narayanaswamy Baluswamy: Thanks to Oliver, Javier, Sebastian, Pablo, n Sataki
02:35:00 Barrack Otieno ALAC Liason ccNSO: Great moderation OCL, bye
02:35:01 Vanda Scartezini - Brazil: great meeting thanks to all
02:35:03 Lucien Castex: xD thanks Olivier
02:35:05 Bikram Shrestha - Nepal Internet Foundation: Thank you !!!
02:35:06 Lito Ibarra: Thanks everyone
02:35:08 Adriana Lazzaroni (.it): Thank you all
02:35:08 Keolebogile Rantsetse: Thanks great session
02:35:10 Maureen Hilyard: Thank you Olivier for a great and entertaining session
02:35:10 Roberto: I remember the panic at the time of .cs - I was working for IAEA, who is a permanent member of ISO 3166-MA
02:35:11 Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC: Thanks and bye to all
02:35:11 hadia Elminiawi: Thank you all and bye for now
02:35:11 Seun S. Ojedeji: thanks and bye
02:35:18 YingChu Chen: Thank you .