

ALAC meeting to consider RALO advice 2013-03-08 AC Chat

- Gisella Gruber-White: Welcome to the ALAC Exceptional ALAC meeting to consider RALO advice on objection statements to the new gTLD application on Friday 8 March 2013 at 1800 UTC
- Gisella Gruber-White: Agenda: <https://community.icann.org/x/8JNwAg>
- Yaovi Atohoun: I am on the bridge. I can hear you all. Like you cannot hear me speaking
- Yaovi Atohoun: Please did you put me on MUTE?
- Yaovi Atohoun: Please could you have the operator call me ? +251 1 1515 76 00 room 924
- Gisella Gruber-White: @ Yaovi - we are dialling out to you
- Oksana Prykhodko: Hi, everybody!
- Heidi Ullrich: Please everyone mute their speakers!
- Heidi Ullrich: The source of the echo is from a computer not the Adigo conference lines
- Alan Greenberg: Fascinating (IMHO) trivia for the day. In the song, the Twelve Days of Christmas, there are MANY different version with different things on the various days (and if various orders). The 1st 6 days always seem to be the same, but the last 6 are all over the place.
- Yaovi Atohoun: I will mute my speaker once I am called
- Yaovi Atohoun: My line is muted now
- Heidi Ullrich: Welcome Yaovi!
- Heidi Ullrich: Yaovi, please mute your speaker now
- Dev Anand Teelucksingh: Hi, everyone
- Dev Anand Teelucksingh: indeed, the echo is annoying
- Dev Anand Teelucksingh: but appears to have gone
- Yaovi Atohoun: Yes
- Heidi Ullrich: 5 ALAC members
- Heidi Ullrich: 7 ALAC members now
- Gisella Gruber-White: Welcome Evan - are you only on AC - correct?
- Gisella Gruber-White: @ Evan - no audio?
- Gisella Gruber-White: Titi is on the audio bridge but can not stay for long
- Heidi Ullrich: All of you should have scrolling rights now
- Evan Leibovitch: I am here and can hear the AC audio. I can only comment here in the chat, though
- Gisella Gruber-White: @ Evan - thanks!
- Heidi Ullrich: We are now quorate
- Yaovi Atohoun: What is the meaning of .??
- Yaovi Atohoun: thanks
- Evan Leibovitch: My question... Don't know who it's for... Is about PICs. Should I ask now or wait for later?
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: later
- Evan Leibovitch: OnOK
- Heidi Ullrich: Welcome Eduardo!
- Gisella Gruber-White: Welcome Eduardo
- Heidi Ullrich: Now 9 ALAC members
- Gisella Gruber-White: Carlton will be joining us shortly
- Eduardo Diaz: I in the bridge. Soorry for being late. I was tied up in another meeting (not related)

- Avri Doria: Not only is it not a true community objection, it is not an At-Large community.
- Evan Leibovitch: I also want to know what happened in other regions, especially those who voted to advance the objections
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: @Avri - that's open to interpretation and we can agree to disagree on it. :)
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: I'll speak to this in a moment --- Legal has come back to us
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Just summarize regional positions, Dev.
- Evan Leibovitch: IMO any community outside the ICANN bubble is part of the At Large community
- Avri Doria: This was a discussion that should have been held before the RG started its work as I frequently requested.
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: +1 @Evan.
- Avri Doria: Well you have ignored the question for a year, so what else is new?
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: @Avri and you have ignored the reply just now.
- Avri Doria: I heard it very clearly. And I see this as ALAC gaming the system.
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: The reply to this question is that it is not for this community to decide.
- Evan Leibovitch: Depends. See my answer above. I don't think it's under dispute.
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: I can't say that I am happy about the reply.
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: but there you go.
- Alan Greenberg: This meeting is only scheduled for 1 hour. I hope we will have time for discussion among ALAC members...
- Avri Doria: I am not speaking. if you want me to drop off say so.
- Alan Greenberg: Why would we want you to drop off?
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: it's all transparent so everybody can remain on the call. However, I will give speaking preference to ALAC members
- Avri Doria: I am not trying to speak.
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Thanks, Dev. Your Review Team is to be commended on its work.
- Evan Leibovitch: If you're not speaking, how do I know you're not speaking? ;-)
- Oksana Prykhodko: I fully support Wolf's decision to abstain
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: PICs = Public Interest Commitments Specifications
- Evan Leibovitch: Abstention here meant "don't proceed with objection"
- Evan Leibovitch: (whether intended that way or not)
- Avri Doria: I think abstaining is a very good option in the face of insecurity about the legitimacy of the objection. I think that it risks ALAC future ability to participate in such operational decisions if it forces ICANN to spend funds on a frivolous objection - frivolous because it depends on an expansive definition of ALAC as representing the world and all of its communities. By that logic, you should have objected to every standard gTLD whose application did not have community support. You didn't. You only apply that logic here because of effective lobbying.
- Yaovi Atohou: Disconnected but listening via my computer AUDIO
- Gisella Gruber-White: @ Yaovi - would you like a dial-out again?
- Yaovi Atohou: you can wait please. I am listening from my computer audio
- Evan Leibovitch: Question about enforceability. What is the penalty for abrogating them?
- Oksana Prykhodko: @Evan Exactly. I think that at first we have to elaborate clear criteria for such objections - and this is the main achievement of Dev's group
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Termination of contract, Evan.
- Avri Doria: As I understand the PIC, the penalty varies and can go all the way to removal.
- Avri Doria: There is good reason to comment strongly on the PICs to make sure they include enough details for enforcement.
- Yaovi Atohou: @Gisella: I am connected again Thanks
- Avri Doria: All PIVC will be commented on
- Avri Doria: s/PIVC/PIC

- Evan Leibovitch: Let's not forget our role as alac.. The ability to comment at any time about anything
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Yes, much work lies ahead.
- Holly Raiche: @ Avri - first part of the PIC enforcement is a dispute resolution process - that has not been spelled out. That's before any compliance process!
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/newgtldrg/>
- Avri Doria: Holly, true. would you deny the Registries a chance to dispute. As for the form of that, it will be like the other DRPs they have already crafted.
- Evan Leibovitch: We can make advice on PICs independent of any action on the objections.
- Holly Raiche: @ avri. It is a bit difficult to comment on no text. I am not against anyone having an opportunity to settle the matter first. But there seem to be a few steps before anything happens - and the operative word is 'seems' - we don't know.
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: basic test of effect on community still needs to be met not just Whose Letterhead or signature is used on input to influence
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: ++++ to Rinalia.
- Evan Leibovitch: Question of Olivier and alac
- Evan Leibovitch: should we consider advice to the Board on PICs independent of what we
- Evan Leibovitch: do with the objections
- Avri Doria: So GAC will consider them, but PICs are too new for the ALAC?
- Gisella Gruber-White: Titi has left the call
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: they should have as much
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: @Avri where did you get this idea that PICs are too new for the ALAC?
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: ch or more influence on you as ANY Other correspondence
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: as much or more
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: GAC will still work on its objections process in Beijing. So that's a lot more time they'll have to discuss these matters.
- Avri Doria: That is what I understood Rinalia to be suggesting. That PICs weren't here before so we can't consider them now.
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: ++Edward
- Evan Leibovitch: I can't speak. Please read my question in chat
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Edward
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: RALOs had not/little access to the PICs. I do not think that the ALAC should disregard the PICs now that they are published.
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Sorry auto text Edward
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Yes, Alan!
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: +1
- Holly Raiche: @ Alan +1
- Evan Leibovitch: So approving the objection is just the start of a negotiation?
- Avri Doria: I do hope the ICC considers this meeting in their deliberations.
- Alan Greenberg: as I read the process
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: That's how I would see it as well, Evan.
- Holly Raiche: @Evan. In response to you, I think that is what Alan was getting at
- Heidi Ullrich: Welcome, Carlton!
- Carlton Samuels: Hi All
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: Exactly Alan ++
- Oksana Prykhodko: @Alan +1
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: ++++1 Alan
- Gisella Gruber-White: Carlton has joined the call

- Yrjö Länsipuro: Alan +1
- Carlton Samuels: If it is Alan say what it is then it is palatable.
- Avri Doria: Alan makes a good argument. I wonder, though, whether that was the original purpose of the Objection. Interesting though.
- Carlton Samuels: However, it was increasingly clear that the expectation was the ALAC is voting to say. "we object to this string being delegated">!
- Alan Greenberg: @Avri, not sure at which point you asked sent that last msg. What was it in relation to?
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: lol
- Avri Doria: Alan, your redefinition of Objection, to a way to enter dispute resolution in order to change an application or affect the PIC.
- Evan Leibovitch: Olivier can always get the "sense of the floor", then turn that into a vote.
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: "sense the temperature" is better :-)
- Evan Leibovitch: It worked for WCIT
- Seth Reiss: @Alan+1
- Avri Doria: Has OCL been ITU'ed
- Gisella Gruber-White: Carlos Aguirre joined the English channel
- Evan Leibovitch: Hi Carlos!
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: lol
- Alan Greenberg: Thanks Avri. Applicant Guidebook 3.2.4 gives option in the event of an objection and it includes reaching settlement between objector and applicant. If that does not result in a friendly outcome, there is also the option of mediation.
- Alan Greenberg: PIC was of course not mentioned in the AG, but that is now part of the equation.
- Avri Doria: Alan, as I said, an interesting spin.
- Alan Greenberg: Wasn't disputing what you said, just providing reference.
- Carlton Samuels: The objection to the string 'health' is basically that a delineated community is disadvantaged and the applicants are not members of the community or covenant to that community. Is this not what this means?
- Avri Doria: Alan, I feel that you have helped another angel to climb onto the head of this pin.
- Alan Greenberg: Carlton, don't think so. No requirement for an applicant to be the part of an impacted community, just that the community would be served well.
- Alan Greenberg: BIG PIN!
- Yaovi Atohou: thanks
- Alan Greenberg: When you look at microphotographs of bugs, it is always amazing how much detail there is in something that normally looks like a black spot. Or the head of a pin. <http://media.smashingmagazine.com/images/macro-photography/47.jpg>
- Alan Greenberg: has to be one by one!
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: indeed!
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Just needed that to be clear. :)
- Dev Anand Teelucksingh: Community objections grounds : <https://community.icann.org/display/newgtldrg/community+objection+grounds>
- Evan Leibovitch: +1
- Evan Leibovitch: some PICs are more equal than others :-)
- Evan Leibovitch: Fair nuff
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: huge thanks to Dev et.al.
- Oksana Prykhodko: Great work, Dev!
- Seth Reiss: Yes, thank you Dev
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Tremendous effort!
- Heidi Ullrich: Great job, Dev and RG team!
- Alan Greenberg: Has the IO decided to file ANY objections?

- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: on health?
- Alan Greenberg: On anything
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Yes,
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Dev has posted.
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: africa, islam... among others
- Evan Leibovitch: BTW, Adobe Connect for Android really sucks
- Evan Leibovitch: I guess I should be thankful it works at all
- Avri Doria: The IO decided not to file any objections
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Really?
- Olivier Crepin-Leblond: surprising
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: I wonder what that mail was about.
- Evan Leibovitch: What, the Donuts mail?
- Evan Leibovitch: Yeah, all strange
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: oh sorry, my mistake. THat mail was about the IO's comments on those strings. LOL. I'm very sleepy.
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: :-) :-
- Avri Doria: One thing that letter did was wake me up to the memoery of the scope issue.
- Cheryl Langdon-Orr: thanks all bye for now...
- Carlton Samuels: Thank you all. Please record my paticipation in this meeting. It is very important to me for the record
- Carlton Samuels: Thanks all
- Eduardo Diaz: Gracias
- Eduardo Diaz: and bye
- Avri Doria: For fear of SOI, I had blacked all things RG from my attention, until that letter and the NARALO call.
- Rinalia Abdul Rahim: Bye!
- Dev Anand Teelucksingh: Thanks all, bye!
- Avri Doria: Blanked not Blacked
- Aída Noblia: Muchas Gracias. Bye!
- Avri Doria: bye all, loved doing real time commentary on your meeting.
- Yaovi Atohoun: bye