

# Post-WCIT Webinar 2013-01-17 AC Chat transcript

Gisella Gruber-White:Welcome to the post-WCIT Webinar on Thursday 17 January 2013 at 1400 UTC

Gisella Gruber-White:Agenda: <https://community.icann.org/x/8oRZAg>

Darlene Thompson:I can hear you through Adobe

Darlene Thompson:Yes

Tijani BEN JEMAA:hi everybody

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:oops I git cut out

Yaovi Atohoun:Hello everybody

Ron Sherwood:Hi, Gisella... there is no audio option available

David Olive:Greetings All

Juan Manuel Rojas:Hi Gisella, Adobe audio is available only in English?

Juan Manuel Rojas:yes please, I will need a dial-out. Thanks.

Gisella Gruber-White:Juan Manuel - we can call you to join you to the SPanish line

alberto soto:Hi everybody!

Adela Danciu:Hello!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Hi David

Fatima Cambronero:hello everybody

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Hi

Juan Manuel Rojas:Good morning, afternoon or evening everyone

Murray Mckercher:Hello from Toronto

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Hi

Sylvia Herlein:Hello from Brazil

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Hi

Roberto:Hi from Vienna, under half meter of snow

Murray Mckercher:Gisella . I need to dial in from my mobile

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Wow Roberto now that really makes me envious expected 43=44C here later today with extreeme fire risk

Veni Markovski:hi, everyone

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Hi Veni

Roberto:Q to staff: Adobe connect audio is quite good, pls confirm I do not need to call to follow the discussion

Gisella Gruber-White:@ Roberto - you can stay on dobe Connect to follow

Roberto:@Gisella: Thx

Rudi Vansnick:best wishes to you and Loesje for a marvelous, prosperous and healthy 2013

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:thankyou Rudi

Evan Leibovitch:Hello from the other side of Toronto

Rudi Vansnick:sorry wrong window

Rudi Vansnick:too many meetings overlaps

Yaovi Atohoun:Has the webinar started? I am on the French channel.

Gisella Gruber-White:1 minute and we will start

Andres Piazza:Hello Everybody! Nice to be here...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:starting now(ish)

nigel [hickson:good](#) afternoon all

Veni Markovski:good morning, nigel.

Yaovi Atohoun:Thank you Heidi

Murray Mckercher:Bonjour Olivier

Maria Farrell:Morning / hello, all!

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):Morning all, sound ok

Bill Drake:Hi I just got on and am having audio problems

Joao Carlos Caribe:Hello folks, nice to be here ;)

Bill Drake:Olivier Could you move me to later in the list of speakers please

Narine Khachatryan:Hello, everybody

Gisella Gruber-White:Welcome to everyone.

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:Yes Bill -- how about after Avri?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:G I have been disconnected

Gisella Gruber-White:@ CLO- - dialling you now

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:ta

Veni Markovski:can you speak louder?

Veni Markovski:and there is an echo that ruins it

Joly MacFie:an echo on Avri

Veni Markovski:I can't hear anything

Veni Markovski:too much echo

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):too much echo from Avri

Joao Carlos Caribe:impossible to hear...

Veni Markovski:Olivier, can you please, tell her?

Veni Markovski:She might not be reading these notes...

Veni Markovski:and ask operator to fix the problem?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Nigel may have his mike still open

Tijani BEN JEMAA:Avri, you have an echo

Narine Khachatryan:too much echo

Ron Sherwood 2:Avri cannot be heard

Heidi Ullrich:Sorry, we are trying to improve Avri's audio

Heidi Ullrich:Sorry to the ES and FR channels

Tijani BEN JEMAA:very bad for the comprehension

Evan Leibovitch:some kind of tin-can echo

Joly MacFie:I'd say mute Nigel

Joao Carlos Caribe:This could be connection by phone? It appear the usual TELECOMUNICATION low quality service, connecting to Internet HIGH quality one

Roberto:It's not that bad on Adobe, although still with echo

Tijani BEN JEMAA:dropped  
Evan Leibovitch:Ah, ok now  
Veni Markovski:oh, now it is much better!  
Heidi Ullrich:We'll dial you back, Tijani  
Heidi Ullrich:Much better, Avri  
Cheryl Langdon-Orr:the echo was Nigel  
Gisella Gruber-White:Apologies for the audio issue - this has been resolved  
nigel hickson:completely agree with Avri; excellent points on what was good in Treaty!  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):its ok now thank you  
Joly MacFie:QUESTION: What about the WSIS?  
Joao Carlos Caribe:Cool! Running down the polarized concept of Internet Cold War...  
Natalia Enciso:Have to leave AC, will continue on my cell.  
Evan Leibovitch:It's no surprise that ICANN looks at ITU from the outside, seeing as many of the participating countries would have ICANN functions replaced by governments.  
Evan Leibovitch>Welcome, Andrés!  
alberto soto:My apologies, I must retire for a work call, sorry  
nigel hickson:Evan; think ICANN is beginning to change focus from "outside" to "inside"  
Evan Leibovitch:Agreed, but that's easier said than done. Changing focus requires far more transparency and equitable participation.  
Olivier Crepin-Leblond:Bill -- you can take a little more time. We have 90 minutes.  
Avri Doria:unfortunately I committed to a 60 minute meeting as was originally scheduled so will have to leave on the hour, but will try to pay attention to the adobe  
Olivier Crepin-Leblond:This is noted, Avri. Thanks  
Avri Doria:The WTSA background to the demand for a registry, which Andreas mentioned, was quite interesting. Basically as they see the guarantees of IPv6 everywhere start to sour due to the lack of global take-up, they are in trouble with their bosses for having promised IPv6 as a solution. So they want a way to get access to the 50% of IPv4 addresses that are still available in IPv4 legacy space.  
Roberto:Avri, later can you elaborate more on this, maybe on the mailing lists?  
Avri Doria:Roberto, sure. On which list? And on which list can I do it without getting staked as a heretic.  
Roberto:ALAC has no ethics by definition  
Avri Doria:Roberto: hahaha  
Andres Piazza:Yes, Bill. That is right. The definition does not include the internet, and the articles (spam) does not include the Internet either... but the proposal and the intention IS ABOUT THE INTERNET.  
Heidi Ullrich:Avri, staff will create a wiki page for comments. We will provide a link in a moment  
Andres Piazza:Regarding the challenges that Nigel was listing, I want to help: WTPF, WSIS+10, CSTD Enhanced Cooperation, and ITU-T Study Groups 2 and 3 discussions regarding IP Addresses.  
Evan Leibovitch:Question (of all speakers) to follow up on some points by Bill: At the start of the conference, ITU chair Touré promised decision-making by consensus and that the Internet would not be brought into ITRs. At the conference both those commitments were broken. Does this damage the ongoing viability and utility of the ITU? Or is the main casualty just Touré? Now there is talk in some circles of de-funding. To what extent is ITU itself threatened?  
Avri Doria:Bill, it is not even certain that ICANN can participate in WTPF  
Heidi Ullrich:A discussion wiki page has been created for questions/comments: <https://community.icann.org/x/4gFIaAg>  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):Its clear that there is need for ICANN to find a way to participate more intimately  
Avri Doria:Evan, the UN and ITU, and in fact every governmental gathering including the GAC, can do anything they want process-wise and call it anything they want. I am sure they did not follow the exact process for voting, so it wasn't a vote.  
Roberto:Avri: we did in 2009, Lisboa. I was the speaker for ICANN.  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):thanks Heidi for the link  
Heidi Ullrich:You are welcome.  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):Roberto, what were the achievements of ICANN's involvement then?  
Avri Doria:Roberto, where you participating as ICANN, registered as part of an ICANN delegation - or just part of another delegation or a special invite.  
Bill Drake:Roberto: ICANN was asked to speak in Lisbon, but we (civil society) were told we could not  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):I hope that that ICANN community page will be utilized  
Evan Leibovitch:Heidi: Do I need to repeat my question in Confluence?  
Andres Piazza:@Evan: 22 countries signed ITRs in 1988, and 89 countries signed ITRs at 2012. There was more attention to the ITU than ever. The consensus was broken, true, but there was a lot of processes oriented to consensus. I would not say that ITU has now lack of legitimacy. They talked about the Internet a lot at the conference and they had a non binding resolution, but there was consensus regarding the role of the Multilateral Bodies with the Internet. The level of discussion is rising and was better than ever. So, hard to say.  
Roberto:@Bill; I understand. I was replying to Avri's message talking specifically about ICANN, not generally about civil society  
Victor Ndonang:Question: During the WCIT12 closing session, the ITU Secretary General said: "I look forward to the opportunities that lie ahead and all that can be achieved by ITU and ICANN together in a positive spirit of collaboration. So let me repeat once more, the ITU has no wish or desire to play a role in physical Internet resources such as domain names. And the work of ICANN and ITU can be and should be fully complementary."In other words, It seems like the WCIT-12 was definitely about the ITU "controlling the Internet" but not the ITU "controlling the work of ICANN". Is that a result of the diplomatic work of the ICANN leading team or a result of a secret arrangement between the ITU and ICANN? Can panelists please share their views or thoughts on that?  
IDN:(OffTopic: Will the clarifying questions be posted publicly?)  
Andres Piazza:@Victor, I can't answer that.  
Heidi Ullrich:@Evan, no, the wiki page is for comments/questions and further discussion after this call.  
Heidi Ullrich:or for questions that are not addressed during this call.  
Andres Piazza:This is an excellent article by article summary, BTW  
Carlton Samuels:@OCL: The argument over defining 'recognised' operating agencies is A LOT deeper than the surface suggest.  
Veni Markovski:Well, not "taking over", but declaring that the ITU will take it over. There's a difference. Nobody seriously believed that the ITU can increase its mandate at \*this\* conference. But there's PP-14 coming, so stay tuned.  
Andres Piazza:@Veni +1  
Roberto:@avri: official ICANN delegation, Vint could not make it, so I went. see <http://www.itu.int/osg/csd/wtpf/wtpf2009/statements/>  
Heidi Ullrich:@IDN - the ICANN community wiki pages are public - community.icann.org  
nigel hickson:Just on ICANN and WTPF; we are (I am) on Expert Group and we will be at WTPF in May; I am hoping Fadi Chehade may be able to attend start. I also hope we can discuss overall Community approach to WTPF in Beijing.  
Carlton Samuels:@recognized operating agencies: Look at Article 5 and see the implications.  
Andres Piazza:RE: WTPF. Paul Wilson, APCNIC's CEO is member of the experts group as well.  
nigel hickson:Yes; and ISOC!  
IDN:Thanks Heidi.

Andres Piazza:<http://www.itu.int/md/S12-WTPF13IEG1-C-0003/en> List of Experts. From my side (RIRs): 3 experts from APNIC and 2 from ARIN.

Andres Piazza:@Nigel, Right! Isoc has 2 more.

Bill Drake:ITU has ok'ed me to participate in the IEG but it turns out I have a schedule conflict. No civil society in the planning.

Bill Drake:when does this meeting end?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:at the 1530 UTC

Bill Drake:ah

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):i have a question

Evan Leibovitch:I have a bad cold and would prefer someone else read my question.

Tijani BEN JEMAA:dropped

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:@Evan -- you can type it here if you wish

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:Tijani -- let me know when you're back

Tijani BEN JEMAA:ok

Victor Ndonnang:@Andres: Thanks. To say it clearly; does ICANN really have to worry about the post-WCIT12? If yes in which points?

Evan Leibovitch:@Olivier, I typed it above.

Gisella Gruber-White:@ Gideon - are you able to speak?

Gisella Gruber-White:After Tijani.

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):no i think am on mute

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):ok

nigel hickson:can I respond please

Carlton Samuels:@Tijani: +1 - If ever an official ICANN delegation, it must be 'balanced'!

Roberto:Sorry, I had planned for 1h only, I have to leave

Gisella Gruber-White:@ Gideon - all lines have been unmuted and your microphone on Adobe Connect is unmuted as well

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:@Roberto - thanks for attending

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):i think i have a problem

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):i have lost all audio

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:possibly your mic is not connected?

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):sorry

Bill Drake:At the end of the meeting, ITU secretariat claimed that stakeholders could have spoken if they wanted to

Avri Doria:i have left the call, but can answer written questions in adobe

Victor Ndonnang:+1 @Tijani. The ITU is a member states organization. I just wonder how can ICANN have an official delagation to ITU?

Avri Doria:ISOC has an agreement, why not ICANN

Joly MacFie:Mute Nigel!

Joly MacFie:)

Juan Manuel Rojas:Sorry all, I have to go. I have another call.

nigel hickson:Avri; an issue as I noted for Board!

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):With the difference of the two blocks, what can be done to kind of have a consensus because the internet is liberalized and it has grown that way....perhaps the involvement of ITU must be clearly defined so that there s no conflict

Veni Markovski:Things are pretty simple: ITU can deal with ITC (and Internet), only if it changes the mandate, which can happen only at the Plenipot.

Veni Markovski:Dubai was just a rehearsal.

Bill Drake:Veni: ITU would say it already has lots of mandates to deal with the Internet

Bill Drake:Resolutions a go go

Carlton Samuels:@Veni on how you change the ITU mandate: +1

Andres Piazza:@Veni, Carlton +1

Bill Drake:ITU doesn't have to take over ICANN functions to affect the environment in which ICANN operates

Carlton Samuels:And might I ask, what or who constitute the 'electorate' at the Pleni?

Heidi Ullrich:Joly, your question posted on the wiki has been noted.

Victor Ndonnang:Thanks @Olivier.

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:@Victro - you're welcome

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:@Vactor

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:@Victor --- third time..

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:sorry

Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):+1 VEni

Avri Doria:ITU is one of the stakeholders.

Victor Ndonnang:Thanks @Bill, @Nigel for the explanation.

Avri Doria:it is just that they are not the primary stakeholder, not the focal point for Ig

Carlton Samuels:@Bill: Hope spings eternal!

Carlton Samuels:\*springs\*

Heidi Ullrich:@Nigel, a question for you from Joly: There is a WSIS meeting in Paris in February 2013. Will ICANN be represented?

nigel hickson:Fine; will answer; N

Sylvia Herlein:Sorry I have to go! very interesting until now. Tks to all!

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:thanks Sylvia

Avri Doria:WSIS+10

Bill Drake:Anyone can go

Bill Drake:I have a contrary view on WSIS + 10. I don't think the meeting will be of much significance

Joly MacFie:I'd appreciate if you'd comment on that on either the list or the wiki, Bill.

Fatima Cambroner:why @Bill? +1 @Joly

Evan Leibovitch:It's my understanding that the ALAC Future Challenges WG will be discussing how ICANN cand At-Large can best act in response to the WCIT developments. If you're interested in participating, please contact At-Large staff or one of the WG chairs (myself or Jean Jacques Subrenat)

Yaovi A:+1 @Olivier, more work for tha ALSes at the national level

Andres Piazza:@Olivier +1 on ALSs at National Level

Carlton Samuels:@Bill on WSIS+10: +1 The Agenda sends the message

Carlton Samuels:Well things can go wrong.....but the Agenda does not suggest much movement beyond the status quo

Wolf Ludwig:Thanks to the speakers for this interesting briefing!

Joly MacFie:Thanks Bill, I wondered why people seemed unconcerned.

Heidi Ullrich:Thanks very much to all the speakers and and the participants!

Carlton Samuels:Thanks to all, bye

Darlene Thompson:Thank you all!

Heidi Ullrich:and the wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/Post-WCIT+Webinar++Discussion+Workspace+++January+2013>

Yaovi A:Thanks

Heidi Ullrich:is open to all  
Fatima Cambroner:thanks to all!  
Jose Arce:Thanks, bye all  
Adela Danciu:thank to all speakers for their insights!  
Fatima Cambroner:bye  
Alexander Urbelis:Goodbye  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):bless you all  
Silvia Vivanco:Thank you all  
Gideon (DotConnectAfrica):bye  
Vanessa Cravo:Tks! bye  
nigel [hickson:thanks](#)  
Victor Ndonnang:Thanks to the organizers and panelists. Bye!  
Dick Kalkman (isoc.nl):Thank you all