

# Zoom Chat: 2022-03-08 NARALO Monthly Meeting: "Blockchain, NFTs, and Decentralized Domains - What is the impact on end-users, internet security and stability, and ICANN?"

18:54:49 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Hello, my name is Yeim Salam and I will be monitoring this chat room. In this role, I am the voice for the remote participants. Please note that I will read aloud comments/questions submitted in English within the time set by the Chair of this session.

When submitting a question or comment that you want me to read out loud on the mic, please start with a <QUESTION> and end with a "</QUESTION>" or <COMMENT> </COMMENT>. Text outside these quotes will be considered as part of "chat" and will not be read out loud on the microphone.

To listen to the interpretation, please click on the interpretation icon in the Zoom toolbar and select the language you will listen to and/or speak during this session.

As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

Please note that chat sessions are being archived and are governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior:

18:54:52 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:

<http://www.icann.org/en/news/in-focus/accountability/expected-standards>

19:16:46 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Folks today's session I am providing to all the LINKED IN for our speakers

19:17:03 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Speakers today Jeff Neuman Linked in <https://www.linkedin.com/in/jneuman/> Tom Barrett Linked In <https://www.linkedin.com/in/thomasbarrett/>

19:17:23 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Today's presentation as an Ebook

19:19:06 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

<https://fliphtml5.com/gnel/ggga>

19:23:09 From Chokri Ben Romdhane to Everyone:

Hi @Siva @Glenn and all

19:24:46 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Greetings all

19:24:54 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:

Glenn, you just don't sound like yourself!

19:25:21 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Speakers today Jeff Neuman Linked in <https://www.linkedin.com/in/jneuman/> Tom Barrett Linked In <https://www.linkedin.com/in/thomasbarrett/>

19:26:07 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:

You say "alter ego", I say "clone". They're coming for us!

19:26:45 From Silvia Vivanco - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Hello everyone!

19:26:59 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

looks good Glenn.

19:27:05 From Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Suits you Glenn!

19:27:07 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

looks fashionable

19:28:46 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Thanks Gisella

19:28:48 From J-P Voilleque - ICANNWiki to Everyone:

"SLIDES?!" :)

19:28:49 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Good morning!

19:29:23 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:

makes sense Judith

19:29:37 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Silva can you post the link to the election page

19:30:01 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

Hello everyone. Jeff Neuman #2 is for monitoring the chat. #1 is for presenting ;)

19:30:06 From Dave Kiskoondoyal to Everyone:

Hello everyone

19:30:11 From Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org to Everyone:

The slides are posted here: <https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/At+Large+Meetings++Tuesday%2C+08+March+2022>

19:30:12 From Silvia Vivanco - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Election page: <https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/2022+NARALO+Regional+Selections>

19:30:16 From Tom Barrett - EnCirc to Everyone:

hi Dave!

19:30:26 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

Plus, I hear that Jeff Neuman #2 is much nicer than #1

19:30:37 From Dave Kiskoondoyal to Everyone:

Hi Tom and all

19:30:53 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Hi everyone. welcome to the session today

19:30:58 From Kapil Goyal - DAV College to Everyone:

Greetings from India!!

19:31:03 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Here is the link for the NARALO election

19:31:08 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

<https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/2022+NARALO+Regional+Selections>

19:31:09 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

Hey folks!

19:31:13 From Kapil Goyal - DAV College to Everyone:

hi Glenn Sir

19:31:23 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Hi Kapil

19:32:07 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

The Linked in for the speakers today

19:32:09 From Silvia Vivanco - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Warm welcome to the NARALO ICANN 73 meeting!

19:32:27 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Jeff Neuman Linked in <https://www.linkedin.com/in/jneuman/> Tom Barrett Linked In <https://www.linkedin.com/in/thomasbarrett/>

19:32:33 From Phil Buckingham to Everyone:

Hi Tom , Jeff,

19:32:37 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Thank you @Silvia

19:32:40 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

Hello all

19:32:45 From Tom Barrett - EnCirca to Everyone:

hi Phil!

19:34:01 From Kapil Goyal - DAV College to Everyone:

kindly share you tube web link

19:35:34 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

what was its name to google?

19:36:03 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:

NASIG 2021 full name north american school of internet governance

19:36:56 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/naralo](https://www.facebook.com/groups/naralo)

19:37:10 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

TWITTER: @teamnaralo (<- Don't forget to follow us!)

19:37:20 From Simone Catania - Fellow to Everyone:

Thanks NARALO for bringing up the topic of decentralization. It's a very interesting and actual topic since it will def impact all of us in the future somehow.

19:37:22 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Thanks @Judith

19:37:35 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

NARALO Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)

YOUTUBE: [https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCbzuz\\_mvdpYOW5slFEryUDg](https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCbzuz_mvdpYOW5slFEryUDg)

19:37:44 From Kapil Goyal - DAV College to Everyone:

Great Topic for discussion

19:38:04 From Kapil Goyal - DAV College to Everyone:

thanks eduardo diaz

19:38:32 From Puteri Ameena to Everyone:

+1 Simone

19:40:21 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:

As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

19:44:20 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Speakers today Jeff Neuman Linked in <https://www.linkedin.com/in/jneuman/> Tom Barrett Linked In <https://www.linkedin.com/in/thomasbarrett/>

19:44:25 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:

Yes Yes No

19:44:38 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

I wish "not just no, but heck no" was an option

19:44:55 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

Hi Jeff, hi Tom

19:44:56 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

I own cryptocurrency, I have a hardware wallet, I have NFTs.

I'm also a smart contracts developer building a platform very related to this talk.

19:44:58 From Michael Kovach to Everyone:

No, What?, No

19:45:06 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:

+1 to David

19:45:06 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

and hello everyone :)

19:45:18 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

I bought my first NFT last weekend...

19:45:32 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

As a programmer, I'm fascinated by Ethereum

19:46:00 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

not getting the quiz on my phone

19:46:00 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

I recently bought one recommended by Tom recently

19:46:04 From YingChu Chen to Everyone:

It is more difficult to buy crypto-currency now.

19:46:07 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
Lol. I've had a hardware wallet for 2-3 years or so, bought my first crypto last weekend.

19:46:11 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
i sold my first nft a couple weeks ago

19:46:35 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:  
good for you Trace

19:46:37 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Warren Buffet had a long hard stand against crypto currency...until recently!

19:46:38 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
Congrats @Trace

19:47:03 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
@Jonathan, you should look into web3

19:47:20 From Alexiaa Jordan, ICANN Fellow to Everyone:  
No I don't own an NFT, but that is because the ONLY NFT I WANTED TO OWN was sold out in minutes!

19:47:24 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Welcome to the 210 attendees

19:47:30 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:  
@Trace would you like to share what you sold

19:47:31 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
I finally jumped in and learned about it and bought an [envovaverse.com](https://envovaverse.com) NFT, mainly since it's a project by some of my friends.

19:47:38 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Ebook of the slides today

19:47:47 From Alexiaa Jordan, ICANN Fellow to Everyone:  
Nas (Important American rapper) sold NFT's of his songs and I wanted to own a portion :-)

19:47:48 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
I can relate to you @Alexiaa !

19:47:50 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:  
Can't wrap my mind around NFTs, if they don't give you the right to exploit them.

19:47:58 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
<https://fliphtml5.com/gnel/ggga>

19:48:11 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Folks I will be monitoring the questions and comments

19:48:14 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
@Jonathan....hold that thought

19:48:27 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
This was the NFT I sold, since someone asked, sorry if spam: <https://opensea.io/assets/matic/0x2953399124f0cbb46d2cbacd8a89cf0599974963/51341614016902374096538319244593694453896511790082624932333963410636147785839>

19:49:07 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:  
Thanks Trace nice

19:49:12 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
@Jonathan: I got a challenge with that too. I'm quite technical and I've been told I should get this all. Many people told me so over years and years, lol and I have some sort of blocker.

19:49:35 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
those are amazing artworks @Trace!

19:49:35 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Here is early page on resources on today's topic. please add your suggestions

19:49:36 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
[https://bit.ly/ICANN73\\_Blockchain](https://bit.ly/ICANN73_Blockchain)

19:50:04 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
@Glenn, the link says that the access is denied and have to request access

19:50:14 From Kapil Goyal - DAV College Amritsar to Everyone:  
Thanks glenn

19:50:44 From Ben Rachad Sanoussi to Everyone:  
Thank Glenn

19:50:49 From Ben Rachad Sanoussi to Everyone:  
but acces denies

19:50:57 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
Perhaps the problem, Frank, is not that you don't understands the basic of the technical issues but the more general question of what real use case this is solving in some better way than other technologies.

19:51:00 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Changed the access to anyone to be an editor

19:51:01 From Alexiaa Jordan, ICANN Fellow to Everyone:  
I struggle with the definition of blockchain including this element of "un-disruptability"

19:51:08 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
[https://bit.ly/ICANN73\\_Blockchain](https://bit.ly/ICANN73_Blockchain)

19:51:15 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Let me know if you have access

19:51:29 From Alexiaa Jordan, ICANN Fellow to Everyone:  
Bc we're basing serious things off of the idea of blockchain being indestructible and I find absolute states are generally untrue

19:51:31 From Sébastien Bachollet to Everyone:  
Ok glenn

19:51:38 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
@Glenn, it's available now. thank you :)

19:51:38 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
Money = Faith in Government

19:52:17 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
I already really like the tone of this presentation.

19:53:08 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
Jeff has a way of explaining the fundamentals very well

19:53:10 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

For the latecomers here is the Linked in for our speakers today

19:53:11 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Speakers today Jeff Neuman Linked in <https://www.linkedin.com/in/jneuman/> Tom Barrett Linked In <https://www.linkedin.com/in/thomasbarrett/>

19:53:19 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

This meeting is being livestream to the following social media channels. Let your networks know.

- NARALO Membership Facebook channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
- o FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/naralo](https://www.facebook.com/groups/naralo)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Facebook Group channel (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- o FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/isocpr](https://www.facebook.com/groups/isocpr)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Facebook Fan channel (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- o FACEBOOK: Facebook Fan Page @ <https://www.facebook.com/isocpr>
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Twitter channel
- o TWITTER: @isocpr (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- NARALO Twitter Channel
- o TWITTER: @teamnaralo (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
- o YOUTUBE: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCeO1eO7Cjm0qRAu2aOReyGA>
- NARALO Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
- o YOUTUBE: [https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCHzuz\\_mvdpYOW5sIFeryUDg](https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCHzuz_mvdpYOW5sIFeryUDg)

19:53:53 From Vittorio Bertola to Everyone:

Blockchains are undisruptable as long as you don't disturb the five Chinese miners with server farms in Kazakhstan that can pay the electricity bill of a small country to keep them running :-)

19:54:46 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

@vittorio you make a good point about the energy demands

19:55:05 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:

REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name /Surname), you may be removed from this session.

19:55:09 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Vittorio is that Block Chain or just Crypto Currency?

19:55:19 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

IEEE Spectrum had a good article on the energy demands will look for the article

19:55:44 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

Wallet operators have access to the real identity of the owner of the pseudonymous number

19:55:56 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:

Blockchain is a great way to accelerate the adoption of green energy.

19:56:12 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

FYI

19:56:13 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

<https://spectrum.ieee.org/cryptocurrency-blockchains-dont-need-to-be-energy-intensive>

19:56:17 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

@Marc that's a blanket statement that isn't true in all cases.

19:56:26 From Tom Barrett - EnCirc to Everyone:

the migration from proof of work to proof of stake will help address the electricity usage by blockchains

19:56:27 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:

Luis, I agree

19:56:56 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Thanks @Glenn

19:56:57 From Rick Wilhelm (PIR) to Everyone:

I don't think that all economists agree that Bitcoin is a hedge against inflation

19:57:01 From Alan Greenberg to Everyone:

@Luis, except for the blockchain farms that are coal powered!

19:57:58 From Puteri Ameenah - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:

or submersible servers

19:58:07 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whitehouse.gov/)) to Everyone:

Actually the proceeds from the NFT I bought is also used to finance green projects and they also plant trees as an offset

19:59:01 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

Proof of Stake of course comes with its own set of problems, and the migration has been talked about for a long time without yet being realized.

19:59:23 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

The smart contract is written - just in code

19:59:38 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

I missed how Crypto Currency is inflation proof! Inflation is not just a consequence of governments printing more money (banknotes or otherwise). It is also a function of market demands and availability of resources and all what goes in between

19:59:42 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:

Many smart contracts are legal agreements as they are covered in the electronic translation act that US has signed

19:59:44 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

In code that can (and has been) buggy.

19:59:48 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

My apologies to not acknowledge at the beginning the Netgen and Fellows to the call. welcome and please don't hesitate to add your ideas to the chat

20:00:01 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:

Thank you, Glenn

20:00:06 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:

US is also part of the electronic convention which is managed by UNCITRAL

20:00:31 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Thank you @Glenn

20:01:17 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whitehouse.gov/)) to Everyone:

insurance? :D

20:01:34 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

lol

20:01:35 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:  
20:02:17 From Dawn Shackleton to Everyone:  
what about tax on earnings from the lease of your car Jeff?  
20:02:28 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
Contracts for things like insurance which require subjective review of claims is not a good fit for smart contracts  
20:02:36 From Nojus Saad - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
<QUESTION > How resistant those smart contracts are to cybersecurity attacks and hacking? <QUESTION >  
20:02:38 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
A few years ago the IEEE Foundation and UN Foundation was looking at Individual records. ie medical etc and perhaps NFT is a good approach  
20:02:43 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
@Dawn IRS always finds a way ;)  
20:02:45 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
Why is blockchain smart contracts a superior technology for achieving this, apart from others that are currently integrated into automotives? Eg, remote engine start/stop via Internet is already a thing without needing a blockchain to achieve it.  
20:02:48 From Justin Mack (MarkMonitor) to Everyone:  
The /inflation/ statement simply means no more "money" can be printed - the total number of coins is fixed. The "value" that humans place on those coins - such has how much a coffee costs in BTC - is very much subject to inflation.  
20:02:59 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Thanks @Glenn  
20:03:03 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Think of the thousands of refugees and no medical records as they flee  
20:03:43 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
Conventional databases are also able to track one owner at a time.  
20:03:50 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
I would think of passports would benefit from this idea  
20:03:55 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Agree @Justin  
20:04:32 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
The reference to that work of art, semantically different than that work of art.  
20:04:35 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:  
REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name /Surname), you may be removed from this session.  
20:04:38 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Can it be stolen like a Picasso?  
20:04:40 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
@David Charles Lawrence - because the technology you mention (automated start connected to the internet) is not connected to payment and other transactions between private individuals which can be executed from a smart contract  
20:04:43 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:  
So does that person get the copyright to the image, the ability to license it, etc.?  
20:04:56 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
utility is where NFT thrives, I'm in an agricultural DAO  
20:05:01 From Sander Steffann to Everyone:  
A big problem is that the NFT often contains a URL that "is" the object, and the URL can change/break without involving the NFT, so suddenly you own something completely different  
20:05:23 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
yeah, hosted jpgs and txt files is just layer 1 of NFT  
20:05:26 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
\$100 USD in US Currency in 2015 lost 16% of its value. \$100 USD in Bitcoin in 2015 would be worth over \$20,000 USD today.  
20:06:08 From Frank Anati - ICANN73 fellow to Everyone:  
hi everyone Frank Anati from Ghana  
20:06:16 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
The NFT is enhancing the ability to participate in tournaments how ... ?  
20:06:19 From Sander Steffann to Everyone:  
Hi Frank  
20:06:35 From Chokri Ben Romdhane to Everyone:  
<Comment>blockchain are not so transparent for all user, node owners, have more informations about these transactions then others</Comment>  
20:06:35 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
David, I'm assuming with smart contracts  
20:06:49 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
Right, but the use case is improved how?  
20:06:53 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
@Luis that is until people lose interest in bitcoin (if circumstances didn't work for its favor)  
20:06:53 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:  
Hi Frank, nice name :)  
20:06:57 From Frank Anati - ICANN73 fellow to Everyone:  
hi @Sander  
20:07:01 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
Allocating prize funds as a start  
20:07:04 From desiree\_miloshevic\_evans to Everyone:  
Q: If we skip the production point of cryptocurrencies and validation - which can be done by mining - it is worth noting it is highly energy intensive. We should not ignore the environmental Impact of cryptocurrencies?  
20:07:11 From Laura Diaz to Everyone:  
How can cybersecurity challenges be addressed in NFTs?  
20:07:25 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
And creating artificial digital scarcity in virtual words is not as compelling as the people who want to sell it to you seem to think it is.  
20:07:39 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
It depends on whether copyright was include din the NFT  
20:07:41 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
@Chokri Ben Romdhane Anyone can usually run a node and obtain all of the information, it's publicly available and not gate-kept.

20:07:47 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
 @Ahmed unlike the US Dollar, the value of bitcoin is not based purely on faith. The value of the electricity is also priced in.

20:07:50 From Nojus Saad - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
 <QUESTION> Would you agree that the popularity of NFTs nowadays are contributed largely by the Copywrite privilege of individuals? <QUESTION>

20:08:00 From Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org to Everyone:  
 When submitting a question or comment that you want me to read out loud on the mic, please start with a <QUESTION> and end with a "</QUESTION>" or <COMMENT> </COMMENT>. Text outside these quotes will be considered as part of "chat" and will not be read out loud on the microphone.

20:08:05 From Frank Anati - ICANN73 fellow to Everyone:  
 thanks, @Frank Michlick

20:08:18 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
 Also depends on whether the person minting the NFT owns copyright or any rights to begin with. There is virtually no verification / validation

20:08:31 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
 Moral or Economic rights ?

20:08:37 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:  
 So, absent a transaction such as an event entry, etc., there's no real value to an NFT then

20:08:39 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
 Any rights

20:08:52 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
 @zuck - arguably...

20:09:04 From J-P Voilleque - ICANNWiki to Everyone:  
 web 3 --> clickwrap 3

20:09:05 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
 <QUESTION>When there is a bug in the code of the smart contract and a theft happens (as has occurred) what remedies are available?</QUESTION>

20:09:06 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 Fellow to Everyone:  
 Interesting

20:09:09 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
 NFTs are roughly equivalent to baseball cards imo.

20:09:12 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
 @zuck - depends on a lot of factors

20:09:29 From Dietmar Lenden - Com Laude Group to Everyone:  
 nice presentation Jeff - very interesting

20:09:35 From Jacques Latour to Everyone:  
 Yesterday in Krebs on Security: "By using a smart contract, an operator can trustlessly sell their victims a decryption key for money," Ladish wrote. "That is, a victim can send some money to a smart contract with a guarantee that they will either receive the decryption key to their data or get their money back. The victim does not have to trust the person who hacked their computer because they can verify that the smart contract will fairly handle the exchange."

20:09:36 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 Fellow to Everyone:  
 So if someone gifts me NFT , it has no value, because no transaction occurred?

20:09:47 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
 @Luis - that was the traditional use, yes. But it has (and still is) evolving.

20:09:52 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
 Yes @Luis, but that does not guarantee it's gonna hold its value - especially if it did not get general consent and approval from major corporations and governments

20:09:54 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
 Agree with Jeff

20:09:59 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
 @Samik - they can only gift it to you through a blockchain transaction

20:10:11 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
 That argument applies to every investment @Ahmad

20:10:14 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
 On this next topic, Tom and have some different views which we will cover ;)

20:10:27 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
 Lots of great discussion in the chat. It seems we need to continue this discussion . IEEE has a great Blockchain group and ISOC SIG also exists

20:10:27 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
 <QUESTION> what happens to the NFTs if the cryptocurrencies value fluctuates? </QUESTION>

20:10:47 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
 NFTs have value independent of any cryptocurrency

20:11:01 From Seun S. Ojedeji to Everyone:  
 @Jonathan yeah just like there is really no value in physical notes if it doesn't exchange for something of value.....crypto, NFT etc are now being exchanged for things of value and that makes them a fuzz

20:11:04 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:  
 All if these things essentially represent a bet that someone who has what you want will be willing to accept the cryptocurrency or NFT in exchange for something that you want. As opposed to normal money, where you have a government basically requiring people who live their to accept their currency.

20:11:10 From Sander Steffann to Everyone:  
 NFT value is not tied to the currency, the only value is what the seller asks and the buyer is willing to pay

20:11:12 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
 You may purchase an NFT via a cryptocurrency, but that NFT has its own value

20:11:16 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
 Folks we will try to collect all the questions and followup with the speakers

20:11:31 From Chokri Ben Romdhane to Everyone:  
 @Conor But in most cases you are constrained to use others nodes

20:11:50 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
 @Puteri - this can change the value of the NFT. Fir example, you have to pay to mint (create) the NFT, called "gas". The price of gas fluctuates wildly based on a variety of factors so you could end up paying more for gas than the NFT is worth

20:12:07 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
 @Glenn, sad to say that ISOC Blockchain SIG is no longer available. they closed it last year :/

20:13:01 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
 @puteri ISOC and SIGs has become an issue. I suggest joining the IEEE Blockchain group

20:13:31 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
 thanks for the responses @Jeff, @Sander, @Marc



20:13:39 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
got it, thanks @Glenn!

20:13:54 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Sorry we can't handle all the excellent questions and we are impressed with the community participants joining in the discussion and helping to answer these questions

20:14:14 From MH Masum-ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Thanks Glenn

20:14:18 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
@Puteri: Sad indeed!

20:14:29 From Laura Diaz to Everyone:  
Thanks for your answer @mark

20:15:06 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
Everybody needs domains :)

20:15:44 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:  
As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:15:47 From Jacques Latour to Everyone:  
I disagree... I think....

20:15:49 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
@frank is your tongue stuck in your cheek:)

20:15:54 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
<QUESTION>If a brand's trademark is used by a pseudonymous non-holder on the decentralized web, what remedies could be possible for the legal mark holder?</QUESTION>

20:15:59 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
We will talk more about alternate roots in this presentation

20:16:01 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
I can confirm that mandatory disclosure of WHOIS information is very unacceptable for the general web3 community.

20:16:08 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
Jacques. On everybody needing domains?

20:16:25 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
@ jeff can you answer David's question?

20:16:30 From Sébastien Bachollet to Everyone:  
Maybe you can avoid using War in the current situation!!!!

20:16:36 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:  
IMPORTANT REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:16:42 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:  
I'm interested to see Marc's response to David's question.

20:16:43 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
@David - the same remedies that exist in the real world.....just not easy to find the infringer

20:16:45 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
Jacques: That would explain your expansion into security :)

20:16:50 From Jacques Latour to Everyone:  
@frank, on SSI being diverse from ICANN ...

20:16:58 From Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:  
Kindly RENAME yourselves in order to join the main room again. I have sent you a couple of reminders. If you don't know how to do this, please let me know your FULL name

20:17:02 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
Metamask supremacy!

20:17:04 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:  
Jeff - I disagree. You can't file a UDRP/URS action on a blockchain name

20:17:21 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
Which is not the same remedies.

20:17:33 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:  
I wonder how long it will be before we see a significant amount of counterfeiting of cryptocurrencies....

20:17:42 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
<QUESTION> What would you suggest for a brand wanting to use PUNYCODE domains? An ICANN proxy redirect ([hns.to](https://hns.to)) OR teaching users to Resolve (Fingertip/Bob) OR something else? </QUESTION>

20:18:17 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
Ah I see Jaques. I'd love more discussion on the alt root part, too, as there's a history of appearing and disappearing alt roots in the past. And of course potential collision in the next new TLD round.

20:18:26 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:  
IMPORTANT REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:18:39 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
We are just getting to that Frank

20:18:42 From Dirk JUMPERTZ (.eu) to Everyone:  
for those interested in the practical experience of setting up a web3 webpage... blogpost by Dries Buytaert (Mr Drupal): <https://dri.es/my-first-web3-webpage>

20:18:54 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Siva what is your question?

20:19:00 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:  
sorry Jeff, I saw you write - "but wait there's more"

20:19:07 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
@ David - it is unclear what remedies are available for trademark infringement on a decentralized blockchain. In a virtual world administered by a centralized company this answer is easy. But who do you go after for trademark infringement in a decentralized blockchain and who enforces it?

20:19:59 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
@Marc - the same laws apply, but you are correct, it is hard to find the who to go after

20:20:18 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

@Marc - good point, no UDRP, but laws still apply.

20:20:23 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:

IMPORTANT REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:20:27 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@Jeff - what laws? What jurisdiction is the decentralized blockchain in / subject to?

20:20:28 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:

How can the same laws apply in an unregulated space?

20:20:29 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

I just want to add that "immutability" or "irrevocability" is not absolutely necessary for blockchain-based domain systems. It is possible to have dispute resolution, but users will be resistant to providing personal information (i.e. WHOIS data).

20:20:29 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

should I wait Glenn?

20:20:31 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Marc, maybe this should become part of the "coding" of blockchain to prevent such issues

20:20:32 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Due to time we are unable to answer all the questions.

20:20:34 From Laura Diaz to Everyone:

So this can be used, for example in the current context, by Russian users who due to the sanctions have no access to money because of the expulsion from SWIFT?

20:20:41 From Heidi Revels to Everyone:

Good point, Emma.

20:20:41 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:

The remedies are generally the same. The process may be different.

20:20:56 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

I heard you mentioning my hand

20:21:00 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

We are seeing similar issues where the bad guy create imposter websites and get victims to pay in crypto. Impossible to identify the bad guys, access the funds, or get a remedy for the victim

20:21:06 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Siva we are not opening the mic. you need to type your question and at the end of this section we will your question up

20:21:29 From Rick Wilhelm (PIR) to Everyone:

<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/unique-authoritative-root-2012-02-25-en>

20:21:30 From Simone Catania - Fellow to Everyone:

@Laura Diaz, this is indeed happening in Ukraine and Russia.

20:21:31 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

ok.. missed that. Thanks

20:21:43 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@Ahmad - that would be great to code in IP protection and remedies, but someone / party must still administer such

20:22:22 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:

IMPORTANT - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name /Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:22:32 From Gisella Gruber - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:

IMPORTANT REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:22:46 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

<question> The decentralized web, the alternate route without intermediaries claim to have privacy safeguards built in, but isn't everyone centralizing all personal data around his digital wallet?

20:22:55 From YingChu Chen to Everyone:

<comment> Some problems still exist in blockchain technology. For example, there is no data portability in different blockchain technology. Polkadot (<https://polkadot.network/>) is trying to solve this problem. After all, data portability and interoperability make the digital economy and new services.

The web browser with cryptocurrencies wallet extension is easy to pay, to support the creator. But there will be some security risks cyber hygiene issues with this solution. </comment>

20:23:04 From Laura Diaz to Everyone:

Thanks @Simone

20:23:27 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Marc, that's correct. I'd like to think that someday there will be an MSM organization like ICANN that will govern that space

20:24:05 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

And, this through alternate routes with no governance structure. Wouldn't it be far far more safer to build this as part of the DNS, with the unique features as have emerged?

20:24:05 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:

@Ahmad - the point of web3 is that it is decentralized. It is appealing to actors because of it's lack of regulation.

20:24:34 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

@Sivasubramanian M - Governance can be built into the smart contracts. All ICANN policies can be satisfied.

20:24:56 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Folks this section by Jeff is focused on " Implications for Internet Security and Stability, please focus your questions on this issue please

20:25:01 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

Those alternate routes had no practical penetration.

20:25:31 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Emma - decentralized and lack of regulation do not have to mean the same thing. They can coexist and make a better system together

20:25:32 From Phil Buckingham to Everyone:

Real Names - Keith Teare

20:26:02 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

That is decentralized and regularized working together!

20:26:16 From Jacques Latour to Everyone:

Jeff said if you have a domain with DNSSEC and DANE, it can be your identity in Self Sovereign DID...

20:27:19 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

Hi Phil

20:27:46 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:



I forgot about Realnames, I had a person "registration" there.

20:29:07 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

Who issues this warning? "If you touch it..." ?

20:29:36 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

We have 30 minutes to the session and we will do our best to incorporate your questions

20:29:49 From Suzanne Woolf to Everyone:

Paul's comment was an observation of what would happen, not a prescription of what should happen.

20:29:53 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@Ahmad - there will never be a MSM organization like ICANN that will govern blockchain - that is really the whole point of the blockchain and whole Web3 movement - it is completely decentralized

20:30:07 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

thank you Glenn

20:30:29 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

if you want to share any resources here is a link to a shared google doc

20:30:31 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

[https://bit.ly/ICANN73\\_Blockchain](https://bit.ly/ICANN73_Blockchain)

20:30:42 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

Decentralized doesn't mean lack of governance. Many of the protocols have governance mechanisms built in.

20:31:37 From Simone Catania - Fellow to Everyone:

I own a .wallet NFT domain to connect my digital wallet. It makes everything easier. Just like the DNS, it turns a long alphanumeric string into a user-friendly and easy-to-remember name.

20:31:37 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

Tom and I do not share the same views on Handshake and Unstoppable.

20:31:39 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

<question> How are ICANN TLDs registered through any of these services? How is the registration data in the blockchain bridged to the ICANN registration data?

20:31:48 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

If people are interested in more on this subject and if you would like to be a presenter please let Eduardo and myself know

20:32:03 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

thanks Siva for the question I will ask it to Tom and jeff

20:32:06 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

@Siva - .ENS is the only one that recognizes ICANN

20:32:21 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

The others are intentionally designed around ICANN

20:32:23 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

i.e are the ICANN TLDs registered through these services as if these blockchain services were CryptoRegistrars?

20:32:27 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Waiting Room Participants:

REMINDER - As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name /Surname), you may be removed from this session.

20:32:32 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

and are designed to compete with ICANN

20:33:29 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

yes @Marc. What happens when issues related to lack of governance and people not able to talk to a "certain entity" to get what they see as "their rights" back?

20:33:50 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

There is no regulation of Handshake or Unstoppable Domains

20:33:53 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

<question> Please explain "temporarily reserved ICANN root and top 100,000 websites"

20:34:02 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

with the increase of such issues, there will be a need for some sort of governance so people won't lose faith in the system

20:34:04 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@Ahmad - great question. No one knows the answer

20:34:25 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

It means that no one can own in the Handshake Domains top level domains that match TLDs in the ICANN root

20:34:45 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Thanks @Marc. that's just my own thinking process of what will come next. I might be totally wrong

20:35:03 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:

great points there @Ahmad

20:35:04 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

Still a potential problem in the next round.

20:35:38 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Thanks @Puteri

20:36:14 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

It is important to note however that Registries do not "OWN" their TLDs.

20:36:18 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](https://www.whc.ca)) to Everyone:

also a problem if the current operator changes at one point - bound to go out of sync

20:36:24 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

They have an Agreement with ICANN to run those TLDs.

20:36:25 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:

Then doesn't it lose its appeal to the majority of actors in the web3 space?

20:36:39 From YingChu Chen to Everyone:

<comment> But general users need to set their browsers to see handshake TLD directly.</comment>

20:36:40 From Phil Buckingham to Everyone:

so these reserved domains have a premium value ???

20:36:53 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:

My icann site has some information and a link to get a free Handshake TLD domain, is it okay to post?

20:37:08 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

But this reserving process only works to minimize collision with existing TLDs. As soon as the next round starts (whenever that might be) then the potential for significant collision begins

20:38:03 From John Crain to Everyone:

Good point Marc: So if during the ICANN process the string is applied for and given to a registry will Handshake take it off of their existing registrant and reallocate to the registry in the ICANN DNS?

20:38:06 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

It is also worth noting that there are colliding strings in Handshake. .Music, .kids and .hotel I believe are delegated in the Handshake Alternate Root AND in the ICANN Root now.

20:38:13 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

There are some research papers that show counts of bad-faith registrations on decentralized platforms. I don't have the links on hand unfortunately.

20:38:17 From Justin Mack (MarkMonitor) to Everyone:

Exactly Marc, multiple parties might be interested in spending \$185k+ to license .CRYPTO during the next round.

20:38:19 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Emma: what was your question about?

20:38:37 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:

Introducing a governing body to the blockchain/web3 space

20:38:39 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

This meeting will be available for all to see at any time in one of the following social channels. Share with your networks.

20:39:01 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

- NARALO Membership Facebook channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
- o FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/naralo](https://www.facebook.com/groups/naralo)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Facebook Group channel (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- o FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/isocpr](https://www.facebook.com/groups/isocpr)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Facebook Fan channel (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- o FACEBOOK: Facebook Fan Page @ <https://www.facebook.com/isocpr>
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Twitter channel
- o TWITTER: @isocpr (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- NARALO Twitter Channel
- o TWITTER: @teamnaralo (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
- o YOUTUBE: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCeO1eO7Cjm0qRAu2aOReyGA>
- NARALO Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
- o YOUTUBE: [https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCHzuz\\_mvdpYOW5slFEryUDg](https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCHzuz_mvdpYOW5slFEryUDg)

20:39:04 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@John Cain - no idea. Only Handshake knows. But with decentralization, can you even pull it down after the fact?

20:39:06 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

There is no one governing body for any of the blockchain Domains. That's the point.

20:39:23 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Wow the comparison of handshakes vs icann

20:39:31 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Emma: doesn't have to. Think of how ICANN does actually increase the faith in the DNS and not vice versa. decentralized and MSM can work beautifully together

20:39:49 From John Crain to Everyone:

@Marc I've not seen comparisons of collisions between the various alt roots

20:39:54 From Bill Doshier to Everyone:

Strong demand for tlds. Awesome!

20:40:01 From Phil Buckingham to Everyone:

Wow !

20:40:13 From Justin Mack (MarkMonitor) to Everyone:

Here is a research paper on ENS and possible abuse in that space:

20:40:15 From Justin Mack (MarkMonitor) to Everyone:

<https://arxiv.org/pdf/2104.05185.pdf>

20:40:17 From Nick.Wood to Everyone:

Until there is interoperability, picking winners and losers in blockchains is an issue

20:40:18 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

In the Handshake "root", there is no diligence done on any operators, no protections for third parties, no MSM, and in fact a deliberate disdain for ICANN

20:40:28 From MH Masum-ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

awesome and details explained

20:40:42 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

Unsurprisingly, some people see that as all downsides.

20:40:47 From Frank Michlick (WHC.ca) to Everyone:

the top websites, was that the alexa list?

20:40:58 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@Nick wood - - totally agree

20:41:01 From Frank Michlick (WHC.ca) to Everyone:

thanks Tom

20:41:01 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

reposting

20:41:03 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

<question> The decentralized web, the alternate route without intermediaries claim to have privacy safeguards built in, but isn't everyone centralizing all personal data around his digital wallet?

20:41:30 From Matthew Lindbergdashwork to Everyone:

To Tom Barrett -- I use the Encirca domain registry, and I appreciate the ownership and registration controls that follow ICANN standards. Do you see an opportunity for these standards to bring consistency and verifiability to blockchain transactions?

20:41:34 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

sorry Siva you are posting more than one question. I read one of them. I didn't do this one

20:41:45 From John Crain to Everyone:

If it is not using the signed version of the ICANN published root.. It's an alternate root

20:42:12 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:

Thanks John for the clarification , Welcome John to our session

20:42:21 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

Handshake Domains actively market the fact that they are rebelling against ICANN and the authoritative root

20:42:43 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
that's really unfortunate @Jeff

20:42:45 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
@Siva - yes the major wallet operators know the identity of the person with the anonymous wallet issued by them. the big ones have KYC requirements to prevent money laundering, which crypto and NFTs are great for

20:42:46 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
Just to confirm, not all users in the blockchain domain space are against ICANN.

20:42:49 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:  
@Jeff, I suppose we suffer from being "elites"

20:42:50 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
I wonder if it's 30 days because the transaction throughput on blockchains is terrible.

20:43:10 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
There is not some global "anti-governing body" sentiment in blockchain domains.

20:43:20 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
The only service that attempts to work with the ICANN root is the ENS.

20:43:59 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
I agree with you on that Jeff. Just pointing out that it's not built-in and can be manipulated for future platforms.

20:44:31 From John Crain to Everyone:  
@Connor for me it's not about being for or against. I want clear understanding of the pros and cons of various solutions. If you read the 'Buyer Beware' blog you will see that much of it was about being clear to the consumer/buyer

20:44:33 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Folks the session is being recorded and as mentioned we are happy to discuss with the community on future topics for NARALO and the next ICANN meeting

20:44:47 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
In short....no consumer protections.

20:44:54 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:  
Can you clarify what you mean by Mega Root?

20:45:49 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
As Tom states....there is no uniformity

20:46:15 From Alan Greenberg to Everyone:  
So we need a hyper-root pointing to the alternative roots!

20:46:19 From Dirk JUMPERTZ (.eu) to Everyone:  
<COMMENT>malware has been using the .onion extension for a while, how long until the "stub resolver" for decentralized domains will be added to bots and malware so it can access this hidden universe?</COMMENT>

20:46:40 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
Or, the root expanded as a hyperroot @alan

20:46:42 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
@Alan - That is right. The irony with multiple roots is that you need a single root to point to the root

20:47:28 From John Crain to Everyone:  
That sounds like a really simple solution for the user.. NOT The users data goes different places depending on me remembering which software/app I use.. And remember the web/browsers is not the Internet

20:48:00 From Suzanne Woolf to Everyone:  
@Jeff it's roots all the way down :- ) but these names are not, in ICANN lingo, part of "the Internet's system of globally unique identifiers"

20:48:01 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
@alan, if there is a hyperroot with such an architecture, it would need quite a bit of streamlining of the alternate space, even if such a hyperroot process is wise

20:48:12 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:  
Gotta drop - great session

20:48:17 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
Does ICANN have any talks about this topic area planned that aren't by people trying to sell this vision of the future?

20:48:17 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
So, this is why this is such a big issue. Every issue we discuss here at ICANN is meaningless to the alternate roots. While we argue and make it more difficult to launch new TLDs, alternate roots are proliferating

20:48:54 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
@Jeff the weakness of the alternate root is in proliferation

20:48:59 From John Crain to Everyone:  
ICANN is mostly concerned about how this will affect the users.

20:49:15 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
Folks we have 10 minutes we are going to finish the slides and ask another set of poll questions. Please don't leave

20:49:23 From Jacques Latour to Everyone:  
I put dibs on Latour with Brave ;) Where do we record that?

20:49:25 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
@John - ICP-3 requires ICANN to be concerned about more

20:49:29 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
@John yes its a main purpose of this session

20:49:37 From John Crain to Everyone:  
Which is an effect of the other issues

20:49:49 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
There are many implications for end-users that extend beyond what's been presented here.

20:49:57 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
ICP 3 stated that ICANN must oppose the proliferation of alternate roots

20:50:02 From Chokri Ben Romdhane to Everyone:  
Thank you all

20:50:17 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
I really hope that ICANN will work with upcoming blockchain naming systems. It's very possible for them to work together.

20:50:21 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
What does opposition look like?

20:50:23 From Frank Michlick (WHC.ca) to Everyone:

Wonder if the Universal Acceptance group is also looking at that

20:50:25 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

True @David

20:51:07 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:

Great summary of the whole topic Jeff and Tom! Thank you!

20:51:12 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:

It will be fascinating when the folks doing these alternative routes move past the benefits of circumventing ICANN and discover the down sides of their new model.

20:51:21 From John Crain to Everyone:

@Connor BlockChain does not equal AltRoot and there are many many great uses for blockchain technologies

20:51:28 From Dietmar Lenden - Com Laude Group to Everyone:

great presentation guys - very interesting

20:51:52 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:

[new.net](http://new.net)

20:51:59 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:

was another one

20:52:15 From Dirk JUMPERTZ (.eu) to Everyone:

<COMMENT>For most users the internet access gate is Google/BING or any other search engine. This relies on the DNS hierarchy that exists today.</COMMENT>

20:52:39 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

reposting:

20:52:40 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

Who issues this warning? "If you touch it..." ?

20:52:53 From Robert Nkambwe (ICANN73 Fellow) to Everyone:

this is my most interesting topic so far tho a bit confusing for newcomers!

20:52:55 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

as in the slide

20:53:22 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:

The "Problem" is that the alternative routes are not waiting for ICANN.

20:53:30 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:

It is happening

20:53:32 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:

I agree with Jeff Neuman

20:53:37 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

@Jeff that is a weak argument

20:53:40 From Phil Buckingham to Everyone:

let them go head to head

20:53:45 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

It is @Robert - except that I have more questions than answers now

20:53:45 From peter to Everyone:

I agree with Jeff

20:53:48 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:

do search engines index alt root websites yet?

20:53:54 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

i.e your argument that ICANN shouldn

20:53:58 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:

Not at all. How can they?

20:54:07 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

Hard no.

20:54:23 From Nojus Saad - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Absolutely YES

20:54:24 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

Yes!

20:54:26 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:

I don't think the decentralized web would want that

20:54:29 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

yes

20:54:43 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:

Even if ICANN wants it is not going to happen

20:54:53 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

I have been pushing ICANN policies in a decentralized community. People are open to it.

20:54:54 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

How can ICANN possibly control the decentralized web?

20:55:06 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:

@Marc: exactly

20:55:27 From Bill Doshier to Everyone:

So if blockchain fails/crashes/ is hacked, this all goes away?

20:55:47 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:

ICANN cannot regitherulate alternate roots at all....but that doesn't mean they have to cave to them

20:55:57 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:

Harm is harm, whether deliberate or not

20:56:02 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

@Frank, they might consider it if there's a high demand among their user base

20:56:04 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:

Mens Rea matters.

20:56:09 From Connor Bode to Everyone:

ICANN can maintain its position as the global root by working with decentralized naming systems

20:56:10 From Marc Trachtenberg to Everyone:

@ Marinits like saying that the US should be able to control what China does. Great to think it but...

20:56:31 From Jeff Neuman #2 to Everyone:  
 @Bill - Harm caused by those that intentionally circumvent the rules should not be catered to

20:56:45 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:  
 Exactly @Bill. We need to differentiate "blame" and "response."

20:57:02 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
 that would amount to ICANN preemptively recognizing the TLDs that exist in the alt root

20:57:05 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
 That's a really tough question.

20:57:11 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:  
 @Jeff, sure. But that doesn't mean that we ignore harm caused accidentally

20:57:15 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
 so No to poll 6

20:57:15 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
 @Marc when they see the benefit of ICANN. but not necessarily ICANN, can be a similar organization among them that will work with ICANN to try to eliminate the issues

20:57:15 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
 I'm not a pragmatist when it comes to the chart for jumping the chasm, but I sure am when it comes to namespace confusion.

20:57:25 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
 Eduardo over to your to wrap up

20:57:31 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:  
 @Marc: China would not agree on that ;)

20:57:53 From John Crain to Everyone:  
 Simple questions about complex problems

20:58:10 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:  
 Which is why I voted no

20:58:14 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:  
 great topic, thank you @Glenn, @Tom and @Jeff

20:58:14 From John Crain to Everyone:  
 The answer to most of these are "It depends"

20:58:15 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:  
 Remember that this presentation can be shared from the following social media channels.

20:58:17 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
 Each of these polls require time for the question to sink in, some arguments for and against before the question is answered

20:58:18 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
 If lots of users are using it, you should try to help them, not limit them. IMO

20:58:23 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:  
 Maybe we need to think of a new mode

20:58:26 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:  
 model

20:58:26 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
 Questions too complex for a poll

20:58:27 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
 It would be interesting to measure actual usage when considering these things, unlike say the high rate of wash trading in crypto that implies a lot of user activity but really represents far fewer impacted people.

20:58:28 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:

- NARALO Membership Facebook channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
  - o FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/naralo](https://www.facebook.com/groups/naralo)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Facebook Group channel (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
  - o FACEBOOK: Facebook Group Page @ [facebook.com/groups/isocpr](https://www.facebook.com/groups/isocpr)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Facebook Fan channel (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
  - o FACEBOOK: Facebook Fan Page @ <https://www.facebook.com/isocpr>
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Twitter channel
  - o TWITTER: @isocpr (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- NARALO Twitter Channel
  - o TWITTER: @teamnaralo (<- Don't forget to follow us!)
- ISOC Puerto Rico (ALS) Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
  - o YOUTUBE: <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCeO1eO7Cjm0qRAu2aOReyGA>
- NARALO Membership YouTube Channel (<- Don't forget to subscribe!)
  - o YOUTUBE: [https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCHzuz\\_mvdpYOW5slFeryUDg](https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCHzuz_mvdpYOW5slFeryUDg)

20:58:32 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:  
 +1 to Judith

20:58:37 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
 Time is up , Eduardo over to you

20:58:37 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
 especially in the case of a topic as new as this

20:58:47 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:  
 How much use of non-ASCII (IDN) alternative routes is there? Hmmmm

20:58:47 From j william semich to Everyone:  
 How many votes counted total on these questions?

20:58:48 From Justin Mack (MarkMonitor) to Everyone:  
 If you lose your wallet, your NFT domain is gone forever.

20:58:52 From Alexiaa Jordan to Everyone:  
 Exactly, so they don't have protection from harm anyway

20:58:53 From Roland LaPlante to Everyone:  
 alternate roots are infinite and ever evolving; we can never have another round

20:59:05 From peter to Everyone:  
 + 1 roland

20:59:06 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:  
 Thank you all - bye for now

20:59:06 From Frank Michlick ([WHC.ca](http://WHC.ca)) to Everyone:  
I have to jump into another meeting, but thank you again

20:59:07 From Connor Bode to Everyone:  
This was an excellent presentation, thank you!

20:59:14 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
if your wallet is hacked all your data, all your data from everywhere is gone

20:59:15 From Martin Kuechenthal to Everyone:  
Once again: well done Tom and Jeff!

20:59:17 From Alexiaa Jordan to Everyone:  
Yeah, this presentation. = A1

20:59:17 From Phil Buckingham to Everyone:  
Fabulous Tom , Jeff. Opened up a hornets nest ..

20:59:18 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:  
big fun. Thanks guys!

20:59:20 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:  
Thank you both for the discussion

20:59:20 From Rich Phillips to Everyone:  
There is either a governing body or not.

20:59:20 From Dave Kissoondoyal - ALAC - Mauritius to Everyone:  
Very interesting session. Thank-you Naralo

20:59:21 From Eduardo Díaz - NARALO Chair to Everyone:  
You can share this presentation from one of the social media channels above

20:59:25 From Stu Homan to Everyone:  
Great presentation

20:59:28 From LUCA BARBERO to Everyone:  
Thanks

20:59:29 From Pari Esfandiari to Everyone:  
Thank you very much

20:59:31 From Alexander Wood to Everyone:  
Thanks Jeff and Tom.

20:59:31 From Roland LaPlante to Everyone:  
great topic--well done- thanks

20:59:32 From Chris Niemi to Everyone:  
Thanks all

20:59:32 From Emma De Amicis to Everyone:  
Thanks!

20:59:33 From Ashley Roberts to Everyone:  
Thanks for a very interesting session.

20:59:34 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Fabs, Applause for you all

20:59:35 From Rich Phillips to Everyone:  
Thank you!

20:59:37 From Trace Proctor to Everyone:  
Excellent session.

20:59:37 From YingChu Chen to Everyone:  
Thank you.

20:59:38 From Ahmad Aghar - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Thank you everybody!

20:59:39 From Lito Ibarra to Everyone:  
Thanks everyone. Very interesting

20:59:41 From Matthew Lindbergdashwork to Everyone:  
Thank you Jeff and Thomas

20:59:41 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
Thank you

20:59:44 From Luis Rolfo, NextGen to Everyone:  
Thank you all. This was great.

20:59:45 From Samwel Kariuki to Everyone:  
thank you

20:59:46 From Jacqueline Morris to Everyone:  
Thanks. It was excellent!

20:59:50 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:  
thanks all and our apologies we ran out of time today

20:59:51 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
Timely discussion

20:59:53 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:  
Thanks

20:59:54 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:  
Thank you

20:59:54 From Marita Moll to Everyone:  
Excellent. Things to think about for sure

20:59:56 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
thank you everyone. this has been exciting!

21:00:00 From David Charles Lawrence to Everyone:  
"Evolving" is an interesting term to use here, because of course some evolutionary changes are dead ends. They did not represent an improvement in suitability for the environment.

21:00:01 From Dirk JUMPERTZ (.eu) to Everyone:  
thanks, great prez

21:00:02 From Puteri Ameena - ISOC Malaysia to Everyone:  
looking forward to future discussions



21:00:03 From Nojus Saad - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Great session

21:00:04 From Silvia Vivanco - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Great session!!

21:00:07 From Silvia Vivanco - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Thank you all

21:00:09 From Aris Ignacio to Everyone:

thank you

21:00:10 From Laura Diaz to Everyone:

Thank you!

21:00:11 From Seun S. Ojedeji to Everyone:

Thanks cheers!