

Zoom chat: 2022-03-09 At-Large Policy Session 3: Protecting the Rights of Registrants and End Users for a Secure and Stable DNS

18:54:09 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Hello, my name is Yeim Salam and I will be monitoring this chat room. In this role, I am the voice for the remote participants. Please note that I will read aloud comments/questions submitted in English within the time set by the Chair of this session.

When submitting a question or comment that you want me to read out loud on the mic, please start with a <QUESTION> and end with a "</QUESTION>" or <COMMENT> </COMMENT>. Text outside these quotes will be considered as part of "chat" and will not be read out loud on the microphone.

To listen to the interpretation, please click on the interpretation icon in the Zoom toolbar and select the language you will listen to and/or speak during this session.

As requested verbally, please rename your sign-in name with your full name. If you do not use your full name (e.g. First Name + Last Name/Surname), you may be removed from this session.

Please note that chat sessions are being archived and are governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior:

18:54:11 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:

<http://www.icann.org/en/news/in-focus/accountability/expected-standards>.

19:17:17 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

Hi. Milton here

19:17:35 From Brian Gutterman - ICANN org to Everyone:

Hello all

19:19:56 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:

hello all ;)

19:21:02 From YAOVI VENUNYE AZASOO to Everyone:

Greetings from Togo

19:23:04 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

Howdy Edmon,- you in HK?

19:28:30 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:

Hi Milton - Thank you for being with us today

19:29:39 From CMR CAPDA Michel TCHONANG LINZE to Everyone:

Greeting from Cameroon, nice to be here

19:30:09 From Vanda's iPhone 6S to Everyone:

Hi everyone good day to all

19:30:14 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:

Hello Welcome

19:30:43 From Alfredo Calderon (ICANN73 Mentor) to Everyone:

Welcome to all Fellows, NextGen and Newcomers.

19:30:59 From Dave Kiskoondoyal (Mauritius) - ALAC to Everyone:

Hello everyone

19:31:03 From Herb Wayne to Everyone:

Greetings from the Office of the Ombudsman. The Ombuds team is available all week in our virtual office. The Zoom room details are on the Conversation page of the ICANN73 home page under Discussions. Stay safe and be kind. ombudsman@icann.org

19:31:56 From emma.caner to Everyone:

Hello all ;)

19:32:29 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:

Hello Everyone

19:32:30 From Maureen Hilyard to Everyone:

Welcome everyone.

19:32:50 From Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org to Everyone:

Welcome, all.

19:32:53 From Obed SINDY to Everyone:

Hello everyone

19:33:11 From Lilian Deluque to Everyone:

Hello everyone

19:33:11 From Obed SINDY to Everyone:

Thank you Heidi

19:33:11 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Hello Everyone, Greetings from Geneva, Switzerland

19:33:29 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

famous or notorious? ;-)

19:33:59 From Preeti Kamra to Everyone:

Green Greetings from India! Glad to be a part of today's session.

19:37:14 From Pavel Farhan, ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Greetings from to all from Timor Leste!

19:40:40 From Raymond Mamattah to Everyone:

Hi everyone, good evening from Accra, Ghana.

19:45:50 From Raymond Mamattah to Everyone:

Those interested in the Ghana School on Internet Governance (GhanaSIG) fellowship can apply here: <https://bit.ly/GhanaSIG2022>. Application ends on 31st March 2022. We are proud to say that GhanaSIG has produced four (4) fellows for the ongoing ICANN73. GhanaSIG is organised by EGIGFA.

19:46:19 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:

Could it be possible that, when the slide deck is not indispensable, we could switch the view so we can see each others' faces?

19:46:33 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:

Congrats @GhanaSIG @Raymond
19:46:39 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:
Good point @Leon
19:47:09 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
Congratulations @Raymond!
19:47:30 From Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Well done, Raymond!
19:47:44 From Obed SINDY to Everyone:
Congrats Raymond!
19:48:14 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:
Cyberattacks exceeding \$6 trillion in 2021, according to Cyber Security Ventures.<https://cybersecurityventures.com/annual-cybercrime-report-2020/>
19:48:38 From Raymond Mamattah to Everyone:
Thanks everyone
19:51:35 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:
DNA Abuse slideshow from previous session today
19:51:36 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:
<https://online.fliphtml5.com/gnel/kauc/>
19:52:12 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:
Second slideshow <https://online.fliphtml5.com/gnel/rtie/>
19:53:00 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
The challenge with any survey is that the exact phrasing of the question can have an outsized impact on the answers. I hope the professional company we are using has been asked to make sure that we are not having a problem with this.
19:53:13 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:
DNS Abuse resources <https://fliphtml5.com/bookcase/fjasd>
19:54:42 From Glenn McKnight to Everyone:
@Bill surveys can prove anything, note the Sugar Institute in the US and the nutritious value of sugar
19:55:14 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Excellent point @Bill. That is one of the two main reasons to use a professional firm, helping to prevent bias in the questions. The second reason, is a more statistically significant random sample of a population, in this case, the Hindi community.
19:57:33 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:
Rights and interests are fundamentally different things. Thank you Leon
19:57:48 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:
Slave owners had an "interest" in slavery
19:58:04 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:
@Jonathan- However, the random sample could cross with many other local languages and regions. Cant call it the just Hindi community , I guess
20:00:10 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
@Leon Great points
20:00:24 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
@Samik, no survey will ever be perfect but professional survey firms are generally able to ask clarifying questions to help minimize dilution of the sample.
20:00:31 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
Thanks @Rick
20:01:51 From Sarah Wyld (Tucows) to Everyone:
+1 Sarah
20:02:24 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
@Samik, a half dozen languages in South Asia use the Devanagari script. Hindi just happens to be the one that folks outside India are most likely to be aware of.
20:03:33 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:
@Jonathan - I am saying this is a really challenging task even for the professionals to scope on such wide community and narrow it to interests with IDN's. Considering all the factors. I would love to see the outcomes
20:03:45 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
That said, there are more "rights" than are always considered in the ICANN context
20:04:16 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Me too @Samik! We have the remit so we can only do our best.
20:06:04 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
Tanks Hadia and all for listening and for your questions and interaction
20:06:15 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
+1 Milton. Thanks for driving the point home! We might need some more nuanced examples though... ;)
20:06:32 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:
@Bill, A lot of nuances. Although similar, some understand and don't speak. Some don't want to speak. Language is a complicated litmus to embark
20:07:31 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:
you could also look at this: <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/benefits-2013-09-16-en#:~:text=Domain%20Name%20Registrants%20Rights%3A,a%20copy%20for%20your%20records.>
20:07:32 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
@Samik, I'd be happy to discuss this with you further
20:09:05 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:
@Jonathan, Gladly
20:09:38 From Volker Greimann (RRSG) to Everyone:
Fixing the GDPR? GDPR was the fix
20:09:45 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:
+1 Volker
20:11:00 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
@Volker as any legislation, I think of GDPR as perfectible. For example, I would think professional data like your work e-mail could be excepted from the scope of GDPR. That is the case for that kind of information in Mexican law
20:11:55 From DANIEL K. NANGHAKA to Everyone:
I think we should not forget the California Data protection laws to
20:12:15 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
And many other pieces of legislation elsewhere @Daniel
20:12:26 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
@Leon, perhaps merely distinguish between natural persons (people) and legal persons (companies).

20:12:45 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
 @Bill yes, that could be a good start from my view

20:13:29 From Edmon Chung to Everyone:
 what leon mentioned though straddles the two in being a natural person representative of a legal person...

20:13:43 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
 @Leon, Sadly, here in the US our courts have decided that we cannot distinguish. Sigh.

20:13:46 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
 Yes Edmon

20:14:50 From Jane Sexton (ICANN org) to Everyone:
 Registrant information and resources are available at <https://www.icann.org/registrants>

20:15:34 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 The GDPR is a govt action that has impacted the safety and national security of the United States. I keep hearing that if the US enacts legislation to fix the dark whois/gdpr problem that will hinder the multi-stakeholder process. That process was already compromised once the GDPR restricted access to Whois data.

20:15:58 From Chokri Ben Romdhane to Everyone:
 <QUESTION>did registrants consider their rights governed their agreement signed with others actors , or by Icann by law</QUESTION>

20:16:22 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
 Expired domain recovery has been pretty important! If you're not careful, your old domain becomes a pornography portal and the new registrant will extort money out of you to get it back!

20:18:20 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @bill The US courts got it right

20:18:43 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
 @Rick, no, they got it exactly wrong. Companies are not people

20:18:44 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 @Rick - I have a different opinion - GDPR came in "because" the multi-stakeholder process has been unable to meaningfully solve the privacy vs security issue

20:19:15 From Sarah T. Kiden to Everyone:
 Agree with Bill re: companies not being people

20:19:32 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Roberto Did the GDPR impact the multi-stakeholder process as it related to Whois?

20:20:06 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:
 Yes some registrants did not realize that their domains were not registered correctly in their name and as such did not get the emails from the Registrar that they had to renew and their domain was taken over and then nothing could be done

20:20:40 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:
 So education for end users is really important so that they know their rights and know when they are being taken advantaged of

20:21:33 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 @Rick it provided protection of the privacy rights that were compromised by public access to all registrant data , for instance - the refusal to compromise on Whols was the root cause

20:21:36 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
 Agree @Judith. Like in the case of DNS abuse, if end users don't know what they need to keep an eye on, then they are just unable to do so

20:21:41 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 IMHO, of course

20:21:46 From Sarah T. Kiden to Everyone:
 @Judith education is essential. Fully agree

20:22:01 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Bill The US law sees that differently

20:23:40 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
 @Rick, to be precise the US Supreme Court decided to make law on the subject. *They* (a bare majority of them) saw it as you say. Which isn't precisely the same as saying that US law says it.

20:24:06 From Raymond Mamattah to Everyone:
 @Judith, probably the third party contracted to do the domain registrations could be sued so they won't allow their customer's domain registration to expire. Or they could be reported for such an oversight.

20:24:08 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:
 Reminder - When submitting a question or comment that you want me to read out loud on the mic, please start with a <QUESTION> and end with a "</QUESTION>" or <COMMENT> </COMMENT>. Text outside these quotes will be considered as part of "chat" and will not be read out loud on the microphone.

20:24:16 From Sarah T. Kiden to Everyone:
 @Judith, or even that they are a registrant

20:25:11 From Bill Jouris to Everyone:
 @Judith, a part of the problem (a big part IMHO) is that registries bombard registrants with marketing emails. To the point that registrants start simply deleting without reading. And so miss renewal messages.

20:25:12 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Roberto If the GDPR did not impact access to Whois, then why did Goran state that ICANN cannot "fix" the problem? The GDPR is referenced by ICANN on why they cannot "fix" the dark whois problem.

20:26:19 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
 Good summary/framework @Milton

20:26:20 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:
 @leon and @sarah yes I educated a colleague in ghana who had her own website and had paid a company to register it and create hew website but it seemed he registered it under his company name and not hers and so he forgot today the fee even though she had paid it to him. Then when she noticed her site was down ti was too late to recover the domain and she had to move the site to another domain

20:27:09 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:
 I think it is hard to argue that GDPR did not impact access to registrant data - but agree with Roberto that we would be in better shape if the community had been able to reach consensus on the whois issue earlier.

20:27:29 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 @Rick - actually GDPR "did impact" Whols, because public access to all registrant data is prohibited (for European citizens or residents)

20:27:30 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:
 @bil the problem her is that the company who registered her domain did not put it in her name and so she never got any emails

20:27:36 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
 +1 Becky, Roberto

20:27:42 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Bill The US Supreme Court is the final arbiter in interpreting US law. So it is US law

20:28:00 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:
 Of course ICANN's redactions of registrant data impacted access to registrant data - that is exactly what it was supposed to do :-)

20:28:37 From Judith Hellerstein to Everyone:
 She did not know this until I was educating her. She then promptly moved her domain to another more reputable site but the damage was done

20:28:41 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:
 I am confusing "rights" with "entitlements"

20:28:43 From Raymond Mamattah to Everyone:
 @Judith, bad experience for your friend in Ghana. But there are very good companies in Ghana as well who won't let your domain registration to expire.

20:28:56 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Roberto So you agree that a govt action has already impacted Whois. So then it is appropriate for another govt to protect its citizens to do the same.

20:29:06 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 @Rick and it is true that "now" Göran can not (anymore) fix the problem, because the cattle has left the barn

20:30:04 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Roberto Not if the US passes a law requiring accurate and accessible Whois data.

20:30:53 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:
 Well noted points @Becky ++

20:31:09 From Samik Kharel ICANN 73 fellow to Everyone:
 I would like to consider secure internet as a right and stable internet as entitlement.

20:31:22 From Alan Greenberg to Everyone:
 The Expired Registration Recovery Policy (ERRP) that Brian mentioned was a PDP initiated by the ALAC.

20:31:39 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 @Rick I remain convinced that we should have done a better job on Whols - we had plenty of time - I remember the arguments way back to ICANN Tunis - I am not happy about Gvmts chiming in, I hope at least that we have learned the lesson and be more able in the future to provide a multi-stakeholder consensus solution to the problems

20:32:09 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:
 Indeed it was @Alan often overlooked that ability we used to instigate an Issue Report in the GNSO

20:33:58 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Robert The structure of Whois before the GDPR was a multi-stakeholder agreed to process. See the Clinton Administration's Green Paper. An accurate and accessible Whois was fundamental to the creation of NewCo now known as ICANN.

20:34:18 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
 Extremely unrealistic

20:34:28 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:
 Good point Milton!

20:34:34 From Sarah T. Kiden to Everyone:
 Lol @ crazy people :-). But +1 to actively recruiting

20:34:41 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:
 I agree with you on that @Milton

20:35:04 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:
 @CLO - agree that we are all crazy?

20:35:19 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:
 of course we are :-)

20:35:23 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
 Oh THAT we can all agree, @Milton

20:35:57 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:
 but also that the real cost of engagement at a high level is quite an impost

20:36:17 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:
 @Rick so the years we have spent discussing Whols was lost time, everything was carved in stone already? I have a different opinion - maybe we should agree to disagree and drop the point - or pick it up offline (maybe at the bar at the next F2F ICANN meeting)

20:37:30 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Roberto Sounds good!

20:41:05 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:
 I would say that the ability to access accurate and up-to-date registrant data for legitimate purposes was baked into the white paper. The very first Registry and Registrar agreements included prohibitions on use of whois for some purposes (marketing mostly). The structure of whois, however, was inherited.

20:42:31 From Idris Idris -(NCC Nigeria) to Everyone:
 Hello, where can we get the slides please?

20:42:34 From Volker Greimann (RRSG) to Everyone:
 What purpose does this serve? I mean we are dealing with exactly these issues in. PDP right now

20:42:55 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
 the slides are linked to the agenda

20:43:14 From Idris Idris -(NCC Nigeria) to Everyone:
 Ok thanks

20:44:03 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Becky Accessibility of accurate Whois was critical for the business community, including the US Chamber of Commerce, to support the creation and add to the legitimacy of ICANN.

20:44:22 From Michelle DeSmyter - ICANN Org to Everyone:
 @Idris - here is the wiki where the At-Large presentations are located: <https://community.icann.org/x/!AaIcG>

20:44:33 From Reg Levy - Tucows to Everyone:
 @Volker, yes, I think it's helpful to remind the audience that this is currently being examined by a PDP to confirm that the interests of all appropriate parties are being served by a new transfer policy

20:45:12 From Goran Marby to Everyone:
 Rick, we have had this discussion many times. Then GDPR came around and changed things. That is not ICANN "fault".

20:45:14 From Volker Greimann (RRSG) to Everyone:
 true

20:46:54 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:
 @Rick, I think I actually said that.

20:47:16 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
 @Goran Agree. I have said for over four years that ICANN cannot "fix" the problem because it is a regulatory/legislative problem, thus outside of ICANN's

scope. That has been my frustration with this whole process.

20:47:26 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

"that the ability to access accurate and up-to-date registrant data for legitimate purposes was baked into the white paper"

20:47:43 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:

@Becky Yes

20:48:06 From Goran Marby to Everyone:

And that "problem" can only be fixed by the EU, not by ICANN.

20:48:30 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:

@Goran or the US

20:48:35 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:

Thank you Holly this was very clear and indeed highlighted the interests of both registrants and internet users

20:49:10 From Goran Marby to Everyone:

And as you know, that will create an even more splinted WHOIS system.

20:49:25 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:

@Rick I would think that having the US enact legislation that collides with the one in EU could worsen the situation but that's just my hypothesis

20:49:48 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

We cannot have 190 different jurisdictions imposing different rules on the DNS process.

20:49:49 From Sivasubramanian Muthasamy to Everyone:

whois can serve as a base open layer

20:50:16 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:

@Becky - I don't want to go on, but just one comment: it is around what is "legitimate purpose" that we have discussed for years without coming to consensus

20:50:19 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

Access to registrant data for legitimate purposes is not the same as anonymous access by anyone for any reason. We need clarification from regulators that makes applicability of the balancing test easier to apply with more predictable results.

20:50:24 From Volker Greimann (RRSG) to Everyone:

"You have chosen to register the name Would you also want to register these variants?"

20:50:35 From Sivasubramanian Muthasamy to Everyone:

...while what is akin to Thick whois can be subjected to the processes on another layer.

20:50:43 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

The idea that PII about name, address, email should be indiscriminately available to anyone in the world was an idiotic and unnecessary policy from day one

20:51:08 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

@Roberto, exactly. Actionable guidance from EDPB would help to address this question.

20:51:19 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:

+1 becky

20:51:28 From Volker Greimann (RRSG) to Everyone:

It needs not be free. It could be a service

20:51:38 From Goran Marby to Everyone:

And for the record, I agree with Milton about the problem with many different legislations. That is why we have the ICANN model of Governance.

20:51:40 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:

@Becky I cross my fingers

20:52:03 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

The fantasy of "guidance" from EDPB will never be realized. We know what does and does not violate GDPR and basic privacy rights. We conform to that.

We set up a SSAD. Done

20:52:32 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:

@Becky But which "regulators"?

20:52:45 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

@milton, I spend every day all day on privacy related matters and I do not know what does and does not violate GDPR.

20:53:06 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

EDPB will not solve that problem for you

20:53:06 From Roger Carney to Everyone:

Accuracy Scoping Team

20:53:16 From Milton Mueller to Everyone:

anyway, gotta go, ciao all

20:53:28 From Goran Marby to Everyone:

Milton, talk about dreams full-filled. We have received guidance before.

20:53:30 From Brian Gutterman - ICANN org to Everyone:

Thanks Holly and Edmon - good practicable examples

20:53:30 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

@rick - the European data protection authorities who enforce GDPR are the only regulators who can interpret GDPR in a meaningful way.

20:54:10 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:

It is also not the function of the edpb to solve the issue!

20:54:16 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:

@milton

20:54:42 From DANIEL K. NANGHAKA to Everyone:

it would be good to have a presentation from the European Data protection authorities

20:54:57 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

It isn't a regulator's duty to make sure that regulations are clear and applied in a predictable manner?

20:55:04 From Goran Marby to Everyone:

Matthias, actually it is the purpose of the DPB, it is a part of the legislation.

20:55:39 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:

@Becky Until the EU gets in right, we cannot allow US law enforcement to hindered.

20:57:28 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:

@Becky - "The Castle", Franz Kafka - about predictability :-)

20:57:36 From Edmon Chung to Everyone:

what Charles is talking about is TLD hopping

20:57:45 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:

Somehow I don't think creating a global legislative collision is going to help law enforcement

20:57:56 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:
@goran it is always the domestic dpa which is legally responsible for dp violations
20:58:32 From Becky Burr (ICANN Board) to Everyone:
@Matthias, yes, but EDPB can create binding views across the union
20:58:53 From Goran Marby to Everyone:
+1 Becky and we know because we got that.
20:59:03 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:
I know that this is insufficient for icann
20:59:39 From Matthias M. Hudobnik to Everyone:
Because icann acts across jurisdictions
21:00:11 From Rick Lane (Iggy Ventures, LLC) to Everyone:
@Becky It will not make it worse for law enforcement.
21:00:14 From Alan Greenberg to Everyone:
@Charles: That's what ALAC/At-Large is for. At least to the extent that ICANN's remit allows
21:00:34 From Marita Moll (ALAC) to Everyone:
Just what I was thinking @Alan
21:00:52 From Goran Marby to Everyone:
Rick, we get very little complaints from law enforcement of lack of access to data.
21:01:03 From Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Many thanks to all the speakers and participants.
21:01:08 From Michael Graham to Everyone:
Privacy is the curse, and the blessing of the Internet and online communications.
21:01:13 From Cheryl Langdon-Orr to Everyone:
Lots covered Thanks everyone!
21:01:14 From León Felipe Sánchez Ambía to Everyone:
Thanks everyone!
21:01:15 From Sarah T. Kiden to Everyone:
Thank you everyone!
21:01:16 From Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Notes are at: <https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/ALAC+and+At-Large+Action+Items+from+ICANN73>
21:01:17 From Brian Gutterman - ICANN org to Everyone:
Thanks everyone!
21:01:18 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Lots to cover. Good job moderating Hadia!
21:01:21 From DANIEL K. NANGHAKA to Everyone:
Thanks everyone
21:01:23 From Arianna Del Soldato (.it) to Everyone:
thanks
21:01:25 From Raymond Mamattah to Everyone:
Beautiful discussions, Bye
21:01:26 From Alberto soto to Everyone:
Thanks, bye
21:01:26 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
thank you