

Zoom chat: 2022-04-06 At-Large Consolidated Policy Working Group (CPWG)

15:45:59 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Welcome to At-Large Consolidated Policy Working Group (CPWG) Call taking place on Wednesday, 06 April 2022 at 13:00 UTC.

15:50:38 From Carlos Dionisio Aguirre to Everyone:
hi Yesim, could you call me at +54 9 351 5 526909 and connect me to ES channel. thanks

15:50:53 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Hi Carlos, sure!

15:57:15 From Steinar Grøtterød to Everyone:
Fancy, Lutz!

16:01:24 From Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Welcome, All.

16:04:40 From Yeim Saglam - ICANN Org to Everyone:
RTT Link: <https://www.streamtext.net/player?event=ICANN>

16:07:11 From Heidi Ullrich - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Action Items: <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=184997399>

16:09:13 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
Didn't see the other group statements on the mailing list yet.

16:10:02 From Claudia Ruiz - ICANN Org to Everyone:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1z8JPTXIQHDBGvCIsW_gxQQG_4ZwC5KnLstNBSj66x0/edit

16:10:03 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
CENTR's reaction to the EU DNS Abuse report was a very surprising one.

16:10:25 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Was it though, @JM? Pretty self serving

16:11:03 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
@JZ It really put the boot in (rugby expression) on that report and it was well argued.

16:11:48 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
@JZ Best to think of some of the ccTLDs as more fiefdoms than gTLDs.

16:12:17 From Gopal Tadepalli to Everyone:
Greetings. - Dr. T V Gopal, Professor, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, College of Engineering, Guindy Campus, Anna University , Chennai, INDIA.

16:12:29 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Well, THAT'S true, @JM

16:13:01 From Raymond Mamattah, Ghana to Everyone:
UA Day is a great idea.

16:13:55 From Claire Craig to Everyone:
Agreed

16:15:14 From Amrita Choudhury to Everyone:
Question: Just curious, what has been the response of other SO/AC apart from GAC and ALAC?

16:15:23 From Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond to Everyone:
As long as the day is not 29th of February...

16:16:14 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
UA Day is good idea that will highlight the importance of UA for an inclusive Internet

16:17:07 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
@JZ CENTR also has SIDN as a member and it has a very good research operation. Some of the other ccTLD registries have their own research groups but the research tends to be very localized. The mention of the various legal remedies and approaches available in the EU (part of CENTR's detailed comments) might be a starting point for some of the policy discussions on dealing with DA.

16:23:20 From Amrita Choudhury to Everyone:
Thanks Satish

16:28:02 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
+1 Satish At-Large for sure has a wide outreach

16:28:10 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:
Great initiative @Satish

16:28:36 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
Thank you Satish

16:30:13 From Gopal Tadepalli to Everyone:
@Satish: Suggestion: UA Day topic: Keeping Pace with the Evolving Complexity of Internet Languages. - Dr. T V Gopal, Anna University, Chennai, INDIA

16:30:18 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
Will the enduser survey be broken down by country/language group?

16:30:18 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
@Jonathan you are doing a great job on this

16:30:49 From DANIEL K. NANGHAKA to Everyone:
Great job JZ

16:30:56 From Satish Babu (ALAC, Member) to Everyone:
Thanks everyone!

16:31:03 From Gopal Tadepalli to Everyone:
I am leaving now for a personal in-person commitment. - Dr. T V Gopal, Anna University, Chennai, INDIA

16:31:04 From Satish Babu (ALAC, Member) to Everyone:
Thanks for the suggestion, Dr Gopal

16:41:50 From Amrita Choudhury to Everyone:
Thanks for this succinct presentation JZ, Was very helpful to get the background.

16:42:21 From Mouloud Khelif - ICANN73 Fellow to Everyone:
Thank you for the presentation @JZ

16:43:05 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Here'

16:43:22 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

Here's the board guidance for the discussion: <https://mm.icann.org/pipermail/council/attachments/20220310/afc11d70/FramingPaperforGAC-GNSODialogueonClosedGenerics-0001.pdf>

16:43:34 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

staff, perhaps add the link to the agenda

16:43:37 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

Enlightening presentation. This is an issue that may be more difficult to solve than DA.

16:43:42 From Olivier MJ Crepin-Leblond to Everyone:

it's more like "Registry exclusivity?"

16:47:46 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

There's also a kind of potential enduser avoidance issue where endusers continue to use existing ccTLDs and gTLD and basically ignore these closed generics. The expectations of the 2012 round and the reality of what happened are very different.

16:48:03 From Alan Greenberg to Everyone:

The term "Whac-a-mole" (or "Whack-a-mole") is used colloquially to depict a situation characterized by a series of repetitious and futile tasks, where the successful completion of one just yields another popping up elsewhere. <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Whac-A-Mole>

16:51:52 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

Google kind of did that with .NEW, at \$50k

16:52:55 From Michael Palage to Everyone:

<https://newgtlds.icann.org/sites/default/files/agreements/agreement-approved-31jul17-en.html>

16:54:14 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

There would be multiple competition authorities involved (theoretically) per gTLD.

16:54:28 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

Indeed, @JM

16:55:30 From Greg Shatan to Everyone:

I suggest that ICANN (or ALAC) purchase the object pictured in my current background for ICANN74.

16:57:34 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

My GUESS is that competition authorities would NOT object to closed generics as they do not prevent the use of a term, in the way a trademark does.

16:57:39 From Amrita Choudhury to Everyone:

Agree Alan

16:58:12 From Laura Margolis to Everyone:

+1 @Jonathan

16:58:52 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

There's also the ccTLD angle in that the CAs in various countries might not be overly worried unless a proposed gTLD competes directly with the local ccTLDs.

16:59:27 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:

Ironically, there's no prohibition against "generic" second level domains, such as [perfume.com](https://www.perfume.com)

16:59:36 From Amrita Choudhury to Everyone:

We also have to realise that example of anti trust authorities should not be just US and EU, but other countries of both global north and south. Who may not have that much knowledge on the topic of TLDs

16:59:43 From Michael Palage to Everyone:

Again - the reason that Verisign has price restraints is because of DoJ - NOT some ICANN policy - Competition Authorities can and do their job

17:00:11 From Justine Chew to Everyone:

Going the way of competition authorities is also a curative in nature. Having some criteria to allow for Closed Generics (if allowed) is a bit more preventive in nature, and possibly allows for monitoring / action in terms of non-compliance.

17:01:04 From Avri Doria to Everyone:

Was an interesting discussion. Thanks.

17:01:09 From Greg Shatan to Everyone:

And with that, I need to step away....

17:01:24 From Carlos Dionisio Aguirre to Everyone:

I think we must wait a Board desition on this topic, and them talk about.

17:02:27 From Michael Palage to Everyone:

I think that is worth exploring Justin - when you build a sky scraper which is what the Sub pro is - you need to have flexibility to sway - if it is ridged it wall fall over in strong winds

17:06:45 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

It is not really the same. It is siloed because of the different nature of TLDs and offers. Bulk transfers are often resellers/web devs transferring domain names between registrars.

17:08:24 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

+1 Alan

17:12:04 From Steinar Grøtterød to Everyone:

I will make a summary of the charter questions for the TPR PDP Phase 1A, together with the present recommendations, and distribute this to this group

17:12:36 From Greg Shatan to Everyone:

@John, I thought you had an enlightening email on bulk registrations and domain abuse the other day.

17:13:41 From Justine Chew to Everyone:

@Lianna, stable, not final :)

17:15:24 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

@Steinar I think that the BC made a comment on domain names being transferred after registration and the need to examine it. There is a common phenomenon where a newly regged dom that has been registered for PPC or sales purposes will bounce between PPC/Sales nameservers but it is rare to see them changing registrars. Some of the sales sites are now accredited gTLD registrars.

17:16:00 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

@Greg Thanks. It is a complex problem and a new angle always seems to emerge.

17:17:09 From Justine Chew to Everyone:

GNSO Council is meeting only 14 April :)

17:19:20 From Abdulkarim Oloyede to Everyone:

appologies I have to leave.

17:22:20 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:

apologies. Missed the meeting notification.

17:25:40 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:

A PoC is worrying because it is a small scale attempt to model a large scale problem.

17:29:52 From Roberto Gaetano - NextGen Mentor to Everyone:

Must leave, sorry
17:30:56 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
I shall need to leave now
17:31:22 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
+1 SSAD will not delay the new gTLD round
17:31:44 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
agree it does not matter - no real correlation
17:32:14 From Hadia Elminiawi (ALAC-Participant) to Everyone:
by for now -
17:32:26 From Claire Craig to Everyone:
Unfortunately I need to leave at this time.
17:32:28 From Claire Craig to Everyone:
bye
17:33:09 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
Thanks Justine!
17:33:23 From Greg Shatan to Everyone:
I must also depart. Au revoir, mes chers!
17:33:51 From Amrita Choudhury to Everyone:
Thanks a lot
17:34:20 From Priyatosh Jana to Everyone:
thanks all
17:34:25 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:
Thank you all.
17:34:43 From Herb Wayne Ombuds to Everyone:
Take care everyone, stay safe and be kind.
17:35:12 From Alberto Soto to Everyone:
Thanks,bye bye!!
17:35:24 From Sivasubramanian M to Everyone:
+1 Marita
17:35:53 From Justine Chew to Everyone:
@Staff, please check and update based on <https://www.icann.org/en/public-comment>
17:35:58 From Marita to Everyone:
Okay, thanks Heidi
17:36:21 From Justine Chew to Everyone:
In fact the PC on UDRP is also open, not just the one on RZ-LGR-5
17:36:50 From Satish Babu (ALAC, Member) to Everyone:
Thanks and bye everyone!
17:36:55 From John McCormac - [HosterStats.com](https://www.hosterstats.com) to Everyone:
Thanks and later all.
17:37:03 From Justine Chew to Everyone:
But I think UDRP is already designated as no statement
17:37:08 From Jonathan Zuck to Everyone:
thanks everyone
17:37:31 From Claudia Ruiz - ICANN Org to Everyone:
Thank you all !