

Meeting Notes

2019

15 May 2019

[agenda](#) | [screen recording](#) | [chat](#) | [mp3](#) | [transcript](#) | [attendance](#)

20 Feb 2019

[agenda](#) | [ac chat](#) | [ac recording](#) | [mp3](#) | [transcript](#) | [attendance](#)

2018

ICANN64 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [ac recording](#)

21 September 2018

[agenda](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac recording](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#) | [transcript](#)

31 July 2018: CCWP-HR: Due Diligence and Why it matters

[agenda](#) | [mp3](#) | [mp4](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

01 June 2018

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#)

03 May 2018

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [attendance](#)

06 Feb 2018

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

ICANN 60 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [audio](#)

2017

ICANN60 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [adobe connect streaming](#)

ICANN 58 - CCWP ICANN and Human Rights

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [adobe connect streaming](#) | [ac chat](#)

Community gTLD Applications and Human Rights webinar

[agenda](#) | [presentation](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [attendance](#)

2016

ICANN57: Hyderabad

[agenda & presentation](#) | [adobe connect streaming](#)

21 Oct 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

07 Oct 2016 | CCWP SG 1

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

17 June 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

17 May 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

25 Apr 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

ICANN 55: Marrakech 5 - 10 March

NCSG-CCWP ICANN and Human Rights ([agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [audio stream](#))

NCSG-CCWP ICANNs Corporate and Social Responsibility to Respect Human Rights working session ([agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [audio stream](#) | [virtual room stream](#))

GAC HRIL and CCWP on ICANN's Corporate and Social Responsibility to Respect Human Rights ([transcript](#) | [virtual meeting room](#))

26 Feb 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

10 Feb 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

21 Jan 2016 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

2015

18 Dec 2015 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [ac chat](#) | [attendance](#)

27 Nov 2015 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [transcript](#) | [mp3](#) | [AC chat](#) | [attendance](#)

21 Oct 2015 | ICANN 54 | Morning Session

[agenda & presentation](#) | [transcript](#) | [virtual meeting room stream](#) | [AC chat](#) | [attendance](#)

21 Oct 2015 | ICANN 54 | Working session

[agenda & presentation 1, 2](#) | [transcript](#) | [audio stream](#) | [virtual room stream](#)

21 Sep 2015 | CCWP

[agenda](#) | [mp3](#) | [Transcript](#) | [AC Chat](#) | [Attendees](#)

Date	Agenda	Audio	Transcript	AC Chat	Attendees
17 Aug 2015	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Short evaluation on ICANN 53 BA. 2. Works as agreed. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. 1. chart b. 2. legal c. 3. adm 3. CCWG accountability & human rights 4. Other issues 	mp3	PDF	<p>MaryamBakoshi:Dearall, welcome to the CCWP on ICANN & HR call on Monday, 17th Aug 2015 at 13:00 UTC</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:MeganRichards& Sara Bockey have joined the meeting</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:RafikDammakhasjoined</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:Nielshasjoined</p> <p>matthewshears:hello</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:MatthewSHearsandmariliaMarciel have joined</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:TatianaTropinahasjoined</p> <p>MariliaMaciel:Helloall!</p> <p>Megan Richards, EuropeanCommission:muchbetter !</p> <p>MariliaMaciel:Sure.</p> <p>TatianaTropina:Hieveryone!</p> <p>MariliaMaciel:Yes</p> <p>MariliaMaciel:Maybewecansee the agenda on screen?</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:1. Short evaluation ICANN2. Works as agreed. 1. chart 2. legal 3. administrivia3. CCWG accountability & human rights4. other issues</p> <p>Marilia Maciel:Perfect</p> <p>Marilia Maciel:Lostaudio, Niels</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:wehavelost yourvoiceNiels!</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:Alexandra, Avri Doria, Stephanie Perrin & Farzaneh have joined</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:Nileswillrejoin soon</p> <p>matthew shears:seemtohave audio issues</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:Wearecalling him now</p> <p>Marilia Maciel:Ok, thanks, Maryam</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:Weareworking to get Niels back on the line</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:yyou lost me?</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:Yes</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:aii</p> <p>MariliaMaciel:Yes,noaudio</p> <p>MaryamBakoshi:Theoperatorhasbeen trying to call you</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:canyou call me again?</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:ljusthung up now</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:plscallme again</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:wheredidy you lose me?</p> <p>matthew shears:lamhere (I think)</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:atthebeginning !!</p> <p>TatianaTropina:canyouhear me?</p> <p>Niels ten Oeвер - Article19:Nowe cannot hear you</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:No</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:toobad</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:Tatianado you have a number we can sial out to</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:dial</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:+4917635423791</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:AmrElsadr has joined</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:@Tatiana - calling you now</p> <p>Marilia Maciel:Vacationfor you guys, in Europe I think :)</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:YesTatiana is on the line</p> <p>Marilia Maciel:Avri? Matt? :)</p> <p>matthew shears:Ithink that the accountability proposal is also asking for input from commenters on the issue of human rights in the bylaws in parallel</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:thisis what the report seems to say but perhaps this is evolving: • Work plan for Work Stream 2 to: o Enhance diversity and the culture of transparency within ICANNo Further address concerns about community accountability. The 2nd Draft Report includes a recommendation for regular structural reviews of SOs and ACs to assess their accountability towards their participants as well as towards the stakeholders they are designed to represent.o Elaborate on a Commitment to human rights in the ICANN Bylaws.* Details on an implementation plan for Work Stream 1, including a Bylaws drafting process.</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:sorry- wrong cut and paste !! apologies</p> <p>matthew shears:interms of strategy it will be important for a number of diverse entities to input on this inthepubloconsultation- thecommentwirewprocesdoes not weight the inputs so more inputs on issuesofconcernsuchasHR is important</p> <p>Avri Doria:iplanto put in my own comment on the issue.</p> <p>Avri Doria:bothHRrelated and other.</p> <p>matthewshears:+ 1</p> <p>matthewshears:Ithinkwe have to leave a lot of this to WS2. If we start to get into the detail the bylaw may get very long and cumbersome</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:Ithinkit is better to avoid detailing bylaws in order to avoid long legal debates which can get us to nowhere and delay the changes we want</p> <p>matthew shears:yep</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:again I don't know how far this discussion went before, may be I am just repeating what has already been discussed many times</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:perhaphsita problem with the mike - inanutshellagree withmarilia'scomment</p> <p>Maryam Bakoshi:HilMegan, please could you provide your number for dial out</p> <p>Amr Elsadr:@Matt: RE: HRs in WS2, that sounds logical to me, so +1. For now, some form of commitment from the CCWG to include HR issues in WS2 wouldn't be such a bad thing though.</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:Mynumberis +322 2962443 butmarilia'said exactly what I was going to say -</p> <p>Avri Doria:The Corporation shall operate for the benefit of the Internet community as a whole, carrying out its activities in conformity with relevant principles of international law and applicable international conventions and local law and, to the extent appropriate and consistent with these Articles and its Bylaws, through open and transparent processes that enable competition and open entry in Internet-related markets. To this effect, the Corporation shall cooperate as appropriate with relevant international organizations</p> <p>matthew shears:shamewecan't just asterisk the bylaw above after the word conventions and add if need be UDHR and ICCPR</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:@Matthew, it's articles of incorporation I think :)</p> <p>matthew shears:thanks</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:thearticlesof incorporation cover all</p> <p>Avri Doria:... cover all that are relevant ... applicable ... and to the extent apprrproprte consistent with the bylaws.</p> <p>TatianaTropina:Yes, in a general way</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:theArticles take precedence over the bylaws - the bylaws can limit the application or clarify the specific provisions</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:+1 to Megan. I see any changes made to bylaws as clarification of this general commitment</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:ICANNhasagreed to apply the applicable and relevant provisions by virtue of the provisions of its ARticles of incorporation - public international law and its application is a separate issue and not what we should be discussing here</p> <p>matthewshears:agreewithsimple phrasing for bylaws</p> <p>Avri Doria:thosearenot my concerns, as much as the concerns of others. isupportthe most general language.</p> <p>Tatiana Tropina:lactuallydon't see any way to make otherthansimplewordingof bylaws</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:amrespondingin the chat then</p> <p>Megan Richards, European Commission:weshouldensure that the work is not duplicating that done in GAC HRwgand other fora</p> <p>matthew shears:goodpoint- have the GAC discussions evolved since the meeting in BA?</p>	

				<p>Megan Richards, European Commission: not yet but would be a pity if the various groups were to either duplicate or heavens forbid contradict that of each other Avri Doria: Isn't the GAC having similar definitional issues as the WP4 is having Megan Richards, European Commission: thanks and apologies for no voice :-) matthew shears: thanks Niels, all Tatiana Tropina: thanks! Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Thanks all! Maryam Bakoshi: Thank you all</p>	
29 May 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -- - - Introductions - - Report - - Comments? - Issue on behalf of who? - Approval procedure - - Sessions in BA - - Update on other community activities 	mp3	PDF	<p>Maryam Bakoshi: Dear all, welcome to the ICANN and HR call on Friday 29th May 2015 Maryam Bakoshi: Rafik Dammak and Niels Ten Oever have joined the meeting Maryam Bakoshi: Welcome Marilia Maciel: Hello all! Maryam Bakoshi: Welcome Marilia rafik: non Maryam Bakoshi: Monika has joined rafik: maybeshe is shy :) Monika Zalnierute: xxxxxxxxxxxxxxx Monika Zalnierute: lalsonright it here :) Monika Zalnierute: haha, I read that I am shy here :) Monika Zalnierute: ok, I wait for the call then! Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Monika, can you pick up? Monika Zalnierute: I still didn't get a call rafik: who joined? Maryam Bakoshi: Pranesh Prakash Monika Zalnierute: but I can hear you though, Maryam Bakoshi: Vipul Karbhanda Maryam Bakoshi: have both joined Monika Zalnierute: maybe someone know, what I should click to make my mic work? Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Click on the mic Alexandra: hi! Maryam Bakoshi: Alexandra please could you state your full name for record purposes. Thank you Alexandra: Maryam, it's Alexandra Kulikova Marilia Maciel: Please start the recording Monika Zalnierute: yes, I can, Marilia Maciel: Please, can we let the ppl on the phone introduce themselves? Alexandra: I'm not sure I won't be able to speak though unfortunately Marilia Maciel: Please, mute your mics rafik: niels should disable the mic for his adobe connect :) Marianne F: Hi all, there is feedback so we are hearing Niels twice Marianne F: You're welcome Monika, apologies for the lengthy email nonetheless! :) Marilia Maciel: What is the deadline to comment? Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Depends if we want to print it nicely Niels ten Oever - Article 19: If we want it to be gone via editor, design and print, we will need to have it done by Monday rafik: @Niels it is a working document for CCWP to continue the discussion, expecting the CCWP to produce its first deliverable Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Indeed, so we need to agree on approval procedure (point 1.3 :)) rafik: would see it as an "issue report" not necessarily needing an approval, it is more research work to give input Niels ten Oever - Article 19: let's discuss this under the next point Pranesh Prakash: If we don't make a strong defence of HR, who will? :-) Having said that I don't think there's a need to establish a duty to protect on ICANN's part. Marianne F: Of course, they do have this responsibility just we need to proceed step by step. So if the point is made in a note then it is there on the record to be used and referred to later if need be (just reiterating verbal point in writing) Niels ten Oever - Article 19: +1 Pranesh Prakash: +1 Maryam Bakoshi: Nigell Hicks has joined Marilia Maciel: Audio issues here. Will have to go out and enter again, sorry Marianne F: +1 from me for leaving it in as an example; just to edit and tighten up for now and indicate there option of more detailed analysis later Pranesh Prakash: +1 to Marianne Monika Zalnierute: Guys, I agree to have it as an example: would you like to have it a shorter part though for now? Monika Zalnierute: in this particular report? Monika Zalnierute: + Lee; it might be too much stuff. Monika Zalnierute: All at once. Marianne F: Hi, if the feeling is to keep it in then perhaps as a note? But Lee is pointing out the timing issue so I would defer to those who know ICANN better than I do Marianne F: Please mute mics when typing! :) Marianne F: If in doubt leave it out Alexandra: Agree that the UDRP part might draw attention from the substantial issues in the first part in the shape it is now Alexandra: I might have missed it - could someone remind again how GAC is going to be engaged? Pranesh Prakash: Apologies, I have to leave now. But would just like to reiterate that we must (strategically) bear the burden of being the people who take positions on sensitive commercial issues. If we don't, no one else will. We can build bridges after we have some rough position. Marianne F: +1 from me Pranesh: point well taken, cheerio! rafik: @Alexandra we have some GAC members in the CCWP, it has its own working group and Lee is basically doing the liaison. maybe Lee can elaborate here Marilia Maciel: Maybe we could move to the session in BA? Monika Zalnierute: Sol would like to get the idea what do we do?: please type in here, so I could briefly have an idea who is for LEAVING the UDRP and who is for TAKING OUT Niels ten Oever - Article 19: The consensus seems to be that it could be mentioned as a short example, but we leave our longer expose. Alexandra: sorry Marilia Maciel: Yes, that is my feeling too Alexandra: I'll type rafik: @monika in few words more coming work for you :) Monika Zalnierute: Ok, how long - and how detailed - simply a page or so or approx how long? Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Shorter Marianne F: Mention it, keep it short as a concrete example vs. a full expose. Monika Zalnierute: yes, yes, so simply as a single reference, You mean - that's it? Monika Zalnierute: shorter than a page, You mean? Niels ten Oever - Article 19: Yes Monika Zalnierute: simply like an example mentioned in a sentence? :) Alexandra: guys, just a quick comment/observation: an elaborated description of this one case study now will definitely attract criticism from Russian GAC representatives - as at the Singapore meeting they were very vocal on the Crimean domains issue from the HR perspective. It's a very debatable issue in terms of how exactly that relates to the ICANN remit, but if the HR talk starts with UDRP in detail I can expect the reaction :) what I mean is that there seems to be a strong link for them between ICANN and that incident in the HR context. I can expect there will be efforts to stick it in Marianne F: I see your point but won't there be this sort of push back anyway? If this example really could become a red herring (forgive the pun) then leave it out for now. We can always put it back in... Alexandra: yeah I guess you're right. But it would be good to at least formulate some stance on the issue from the group? or have a longer least of potential case studies for future Alexandra: list</p>	

rafik:therewillbe pish back for many topics, that is why we have to work on consensus and "educate"

Marilia Maciel:Yes, open to collaboration/endorsements

rafik:weneedto get CCWP to have ownershipitwowndeliverable

Marianne F:Iagree; send the final version of the report to the CCWP for comments. People comment best when there is something concrete to comment on.

rafik:thepublicsession is not clashing with important sessions

rafik:kathy is not coming to BA

Marilia Maciel:Iwouldgobifurtherand ask them for theiraseesment

Marilia Maciel:somesortof responsibility to speak

Marilia Maciel:great

Marilia Maciel:Perfect

Alexandra:thanksNiels

Marianne F:ThanksNiels, thanks all for a great meeting

Marilia Maciel:Thanksall

Marilia Maciel:Byeall!

Alexandra:thankseveryoneandbye!

<p>30 Mar 2015</p>	<p>mp3</p>	<p>Word, PDF</p>	<p>Maryam Bakoshi:Dearall, welcome to the ICANN and Human Rights Call on Monday, 30th March 2015 Benjamin Akinmoyeje:HelloMaryam Maryam Bakoshi:Dearall, please kindly state your name and organization in the chat window for record purposes Maryam Bakoshi:"window Niels ten Oever - Article19:Tentativeagenda is here: Niels ten Oever - Article19:1. Introductions Niels ten Oever - Article19:2. Discussion or objective and scope of the CCWP Niels ten Oever - Article19:3. Discussion of potential research topics Niels ten Oever - Article19:4. Update on related work in other constituencies and workstreams Niels ten Oever - Article19:5. Outreach jorge cancio GAC-Switzerland:Hiall, I'm Jorge Cancio, GAC-Rep for Switzerland Chris LaHatte:goodmorning/evening nigel hickson:Goodafternoon from Geneva HR:goodafternoon from Brussels - I willunfortunatelyhave to leave about 14:15 - apologies Niels ten Oever - Article19:Justto make sure everyone has the text of the CCWP draft charter: http://etherpad.mozilla.org/icannhrdraft rafik:hi rafik:howis HR? matthew shears:hello Marilia Maciel:hereuntil the window of the plane closes Marilia Maciel:nosound though HR:Iam also here - Megan Richards (European Commission) - my name comes up as HR - I guesss the signin rather than name Amr Elsadr:HiMegan..., if you like, you can edit your info using the menu at the top-right of the AC window. jorge cancio GAC-Switzerland:thecontent of the chat just disappeared... Niels ten Oever - Article19: https://etherpad.mozilla.org/icannhrdraft jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:thanks rafik:HiMegan, you are welcome :) Niels ten Oever - Article19: https://etherpad.mozilla.org/icannhrdraft Amr Elsadr:Archivesofthe email list are here: http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/cc-humanrights/ Alexandra:Hieveryone, inlisteningonlymodeunfortunately Amr Elsadr:ThisACroom is audio enabled, so you can use it to speak without dialling into the conference. matthew shears:IsthereaICANNWP template? matthew shears:whenwewere doing the Charter for the CCWGAccountbailitythere was a template - granted it is a WGnotWP but just wondered Amr Elsadr:Great. Thanks. Amr Elsadr:Bringingin/recruiting the expertise would be fantastic. jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:Asinformationunder 4: GAC agreed in Singapore to form a working group on human rights and international law jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:Itisnow being constituted, with a large number of interested GAC members, and with the work being lead by Peru Amr Elsadr:@Jorge: That's wonderful. Looking fwd to seeing what this WG comes up with. Thanks. matthew shears:ithinkit will be important to ensure linkagesbetwenthe WP and the WG - maybe it should be written into the charter Amr Elsadr:Iseeithis now in the text on theetherpad, which answers my earlier question: To propose procedures and mechanisms with the aim ofproducingassessmentson if and how policies and procedures underdevelopedand/or being implemented may impact on human rights. MonikaZalnierute:Iamhere, I can hear everything, but I am not sure I can speak. MonikaZalnierute:DoYouhearame? Amr Elsadr:@Monika: Click on the phone icon on the top left of the screen. matthew shears:Ilikeethe idea of looking at HR in the broader framing of CSR - it might be easier for the SOs and ACs to understand (and be open to) Maryam Bakoshi:@Monika, please give me your number and I will dial out to you Monika Zalnierute:Ok, I have turned my mic, it should work, Monika Zalnierute:aha, ok, my phone no xxxxxxxxxxxx Maryam Bakoshi:Diallingoutto you now Maryam Bakoshi:Yeswecan Niels ten Oever - Article19:Yeswecan Niels ten Oever - Article19:goahead Monika Zalnierute:Ok, so do I speak now? Niels ten Oever - Article19:Yes, pls go ahead Niels ten Oever - Article19:Westilldon't hearyouMonika MonikaZalnierute:Cool, I hear everything, and I think I agree with Niels matthew shears:areeNiels - we should focus where we add value and focus -forforexampleon CSR Monika Zalnierute:Iseeits pretty much clear that we should focus most of our attention on CSR, Alexandra:Itmightbe useful to look at the Global Network Initiative experienceinHRAudit Amr Elsadr:@Monika: I'm not entirely convinced that CSR should be the focus. The real needofHR consideration in ICANN is on how the policies affect domain name holders. This is done using the governance mechanisms via the contracts between ICANN and the registries and registrars, as well as the contracts between the registrars and the registrants. AmrElsadr:I'mnotsayinthat CSR should be excluded, but it shouldn't dominate the focus of the group. Avri Doria:apologiesforbeinglate. ithoughtit was later. matthew shears:businessresponsibilityto respect HR: http://www.ihrb.org/pdf/state-of-play/State-of-Play-Full-Report.pdf nigelhickson:AssumeLeecantalkonCOEwork? matthew shears:@ Amr - understand your point re CSR - but I guess my feeling is that using that approach as an umbrella may make the issue for palatable Amr Elsadr:@Matt: Looks interesting. Will have to put a couple of hours aside to go through it. :) matthew shears:hasthisbeen circulated more broadlyLee? jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:willaashort summary of this call be circulated? matthew shears:ithinkit will be very important going forward that this WP has the fullest visibility of what is going on vis-a-vis ICANN and HRbpothiside andoutsidetheICANN Amr Elsadr:Thanksall. Bye. matthew shears:thanksNiels all Chris LaHatte:thanks Maryam Bakoshi:Thankyouall jorgecancioGAC-Switzerland:thanks AnrivdSpuy:Thanks.</p>	<p>Niel Ten Oever, Rafik Dammak, Amr Elsadr, Marilia Marciel, Benjamin Akinmoyeje, Jorge Cancio, Concettina Cassa, Chris Lahatte, Nigel Hickson, Alexandra, Lee Hibbard, Matthew Shears, Monika Zalnierute, Megan Richards, Jean-Jacques Sahel, Stephanía Milan, Avri Doria</p>
--------------------	------------	------------------	--	---