

**Jurisdiction Meeting #1 (25 August @ 19:00 UTC)**

# Attendees:

**Sub-group Members:** Agustina Callegari, Alain Bidron, Avri Doria, Barbara Wanner, David McAuley, Erich Schweighofer, Farzaneh Badii, Finn Petersen, Greg Shatan, Griffin Barnett, Jeff Neuman, Jyoti Panday, Kavouss Arasteh, Mary Uduma, Matthew Shears, Mike Silber, Milton Mueller, Paul McGrady, Pedro da Silva, Philip Corwin, Rafael Perez Galindo, Robin Gross, Simon Jansson, Sonigitu Ekpe, Steve Metalitz, Tatiana Tropina, Tom Dale, Vinay Kesari (28)

Observers: Chris Hemmerlein, Iren Borissova (2)

**Staff:** Bernie Turcotte, Berry Cobb, Brenda Brewer, Karen Mulberry, Elizabeth Andrews

## Apologies:

*\*\*Please let Brenda know if your name has been left off the list (attendees or apologies).\*\**

---

## Transcript

- [DOC](#)
- [PDF](#)

## Recording

- The Adobe Connect recording is available here: <https://icann.adobeconnect.com/p53bjgpgjx/>
- audio recording is available here: <http://audio.icann.org/accountability/ccwg-accountability-jurisdiction-25aug16-en.mp3>

## Agenda

- Welcome
- Meeting Time(s)
- Working Methods
- Timeline
- Work Plan and Schedule Overview
- Discussion Items
- Staff Paper
- Subgroup Comments
- Topic Definition and Scope
- Other Inputs (aside from Staff Paper)
- Work Plan, Schedule, Deliverable
- AOB

## Notes

Welcome (Greg Shatan)

Meeting Time

- Greg Shatan:
  - One 1-hour meeting per week
  - Doodle poll results considered, but not dispositive
  - Proposal: Balanced rotation
  - Alternating meetings at 1900 and 1300
  - No objections for the moment – we can revisit at a later date.

Working Methods

- Vinay Kesari: (presentation of the slide)
- Kavous Arasteh: Not happy with 1900UTC slot.
- Milton Mueller: do we really need to meet once per week?
- Greg Shatan: Seems optional.

Timeline

- Greg Shatan: (presentation of slide). We have a complex topic and will not be completed in the short term.

## Work Plan and Schedule Overview

- Greg Shatan: (presentation of slide) – Should be presenting final product to the CCWG in February.
- Vinay Kesari: Hi Jeff, we didn't want to assume everyone was familiar since it's entirely possible there are participants who are new to the process as a whole
- David McAuley (RySG): We need to discuss process - it seems fair when the whole group is together and a good place to start. We have a general guide in WS1 final report.
- Matthew Shears: I see this as a necessary first step - as Vinay says not everyone may have had the "benefit" of participating in the CCWGs etc.
- Milton Mueller: "no plan, no guideline, no vision. perhaps it is planned to do nothing" - join the nihilist caucus!
- Kavouss Arasteh: We are not on the same page. Greg suggesting or submitting his own views without consulting us.

## Discussion Items

- Staff Paper
  - Greg Shatan: will skip given we cannot present it and we started late because of the technical issues.
- Topic Definition and Scope
  - Kavous Arasteh: timing issues
  - David McAuley: We should get suggestions on a workplan for the next month.
  - Paul McGrady: echo DM.
  - Milton Mueller: Cannot understand some people's issues with the staff paper. Can we get some insight here?
  - Greg Shatan: For all those who have not please have a look at the google doc to have discussions on the list. <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1jt6Rb5UjzNwd5WXZ0Bt1W5ryiiQ-IB690vPnMZB7pKc/edit>
- Other Inputs (aside from Staff Paper)
  - (not covered)
- Work Plan, Schedule, Deliverable
  - Greg Shatan: Next call will be September 8<sup>th</sup> 1300UTC.
  - AOB
    - Greg Shatan: Adjourned.

## Documents Presented

- [WS2JurisdictionStaffIssuesPaper.pdf](#)
- [CCWG WS2 - Jurisdiction Meeting 1.pdf](#)

## Chat Transcript

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:hi all

kavouss arasteh:Bernard

kavouss arasteh:Good day

Tatiana Tropina:Hi all

kavouss arasteh:Do we have another meeting at this same time 19,00 UTC

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:All please remember to mute if you are not speaking

Alain Bidron:hello all

kavouss arasteh:Pls advise to dial me up

David McAuley (RySG):Hi Bernie, I am 4154

Tatiana Tropina:is there anything already? The phone bridge is playing music.

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:All Adobe is misbehaving - so we may run a little late

Greg Shatan:No other meetings of this subgroup are scheduled yet. We will discuss scheduling today.

kavouss arasteh:PLS KINDLY DO NOT FORGET TO DIAL ME UP

Tatiana Tropina:the music thing is quite annoying :(

David McAuley (RySG):Can we get Greg on saxophone instead of this music

kavouss arasteh:WHAT MUSIC

Tatiana Tropina:Yes, agree! Greg and saxophone.

kavouss arasteh:i AM NOT CONNECTED

David McAuley (RySG):I am connected Kavouss and we are hearing music at present

Tatiana Tropina:or at least this calling centre shall change their playlist. This one is quite depressing :)

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:on music - yes

Tatiana Tropina:sigh.

Greg Shatan:@Tatiana, it should come with a trigger warning.

Milton Mueller:I can hear someone typing away

Jeff Neuman:I hear typing as well

Milton Mueller:might want to mute your mic

David McAuley (RySG):I cannot hear typing

Tatiana Tropina:Milton, even typing is better than this piece of music.

Farzaneh Badii:it goes well with the music

Milton Mueller:ha ha Tatiana I am not sure

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:All - reminder that Adobe is seriously misbehaving and we are working on it - but cannot start the call this instant

Greg Shatan:Karen, some of us seem to be on hold, listening to bad music.

kavouss arasteh:Grec

Farzaneh Badii:elevator music

Jeff Neuman:The Adobe room is playing the music

Milton Mueller:El Greco

Avri Doria:are we in an elevator together

David McAuley (RySG):ah, hear some talk on adobe but not on phone -

kavouss arasteh:I wish to attend your meeting but not yet connected

Farzaneh Badii:yep and seems like we are not reaching our floor!

Pedro da Silva [GAC Brasil]:Karen or Bernard, I sent an email earlier today asking for a dial out,, is this still going to happen?

kavouss arasteh:I am sorry

kavouss arasteh:What is going on?

kavouss arasteh:I am not yet connected

Tatiana Tropina:oh a new piece of music started after the pause. I was hoping that the pause meant we get connected.

Milton Mueller:you must be connected somewhat, Kavouss, I can see you chat

Farzaneh Badii:Kavouss, you are connected and I can hear you

kavouss arasteh:I am not connected on audio

David McAuley (RySG):wow - now can hear

Tatiana Tropina:oh wonderful

Milton Mueller:sounds like Greg. Greg made the music stop!

Tatiana Tropina:human voices, finally. Feels liberatng.

Milton Mueller:all hail Greg

kavouss arasteh:Karen

Berry Cobb:Hi Tom, please mute your mic. We can hear you type.

kavouss arasteh:Pls advise to call me

Tom Dale (ACIG GAC Secretariat):Sorry

Pedro da Silva [GAC Brasil]:I also need a dial out :-)

Barbara Wanner:Brenda, I am the extension ending 3155. Thanks!

Vinay Kesari:Hi all

David McAuley (RySG):and i am extension 4154

Milton Mueller:hello Vinay

Pedro da Silva [GAC Brasil]:Hi, Vinay

Vinay Kesari:Hi Milton, Pedro :)

David McAuley (RySG):typist please mute

David McAuley (RySG):a balanced rotation seems fair

Pedro da Silva [GAC Brasil]:+1 David

Milton Mueller:I thought we had settled this on the list

Avri Doria:i think all groups should rotate among the 3 times, but i do not really care.

Berry Cobb:Kavouss, please mute your mic.

kavouss arasteh:I am on mute

Jyoti Panday:kavouss is like every indian grandfather ever

Milton Mueller:hahaha

Milton Mueller:grumpy old guy

Farzaneh Badii:I am actually having dinner!

Avri Doria:that is why i think it best to just mechanically rotate among all 3 times.

Farzaneh Badii:a nice salad with shrimps!

Jeff Neuman:I am just havig lunch

Avri Doria:all times are unpleasant for at least some.

kavouss arasteh:I do not understand why after two years of being dialed still the secretariat asking what number i am

matthew shears:unpleasantness should be shared

kavouss arasteh:aVRI

David McAuley (RySG):Fair question Milton

kavouss arasteh:pLS DO NOT RAISE PHYLOSOPHICAL ISSUE

Philip Corwin:What is the Legal Committee's expected turnaround time for considerng requests for outside legal expertise? No more than a week maximum, I would hope.

Milton Mueller:The default, or the fault?

kavouss arasteh:19,00 hours should not be used by every body

kavouss arasteh:We need to distribute the time

Mike Silber:Mathew, it seems some are intent on doing just that

kavouss arasteh:12,00 HOUR IS ANOTHER ALTERNATIVE

Tatiana Tropina:agree with Greg

Farzaneh Badii:no I think we should meet once a week

Milton Mueller:We do have a mail list

Tatiana Tropina:from other DT's work it seems that once per week is optimal

Farzaneh Badii:it's a lot of work

Pedro da Silva [GAC Brasil]:Agree with Greg and Farzaneh...once a week

Avri Doria:some are meeting every other week. really up to the group.

Milton Mueller:For the record, I still do not agree, have not heard any work-based requirement for weekly meetings

Tatiana Tropina:it's a complex topic. I think once a week is optional, hopefully not more

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:please lower your hand if you no longer need to speak

matthew shears:perhaps as we get to the substance we can assess the frequency of the calls

David McAuley (RySG):OK, sounds fair, once a week

Tatiana Tropina:it's a first call this is why we have no plan yet

Tatiana Tropina:but even the email list trafic already shows it might get complex

Tatiana Tropina:if that's not enough as a proof I don't know what is.

Milton Mueller:Matt: that is reasonable. We are talking about subgroups and meeting times without any concrete notion of what we are actually doing

Jyoti Panday:+1 matthew

Milton Mueller:I'd be happy to meet once a week if we have a specific task and deadline that requires it

kavouss arasteh:mILTON + 1

kavouss arasteh:wE DO NOT SEE HAVING ANY PLAN, ANY GUIDELINE

Jeff Neuman:I was hoping a little less process on this call and someone framing the issues we are supposed to be working on. I was not heavily involved in this issue before (WS1)....so I am a newbie on the substance.

Jeff Neuman:But have heard this process speech a number of times :)

kavouss arasteh:Jeff, what speech?

Jeff Neuman:How subgroups work; How Ws2 works, etc

Jeff Neuman:Greg....doing ok so far

kavouss arasteh:I am sorry to say that there seems to be no plan, no guidelione, no vision. perhaps it is planned to do nothing

Vinay Kesari:Hi Jeff, we didn't want to assume everyone was familiar since it's entirely possible there are participants who are new to the process as a whole

David McAuley (RySG):We need to discuss process - it seems fair when the whole group is together and a good place to start. We have a general guide in WS1 final report.

matthew shears:I see this as a necessary first step - as Vinay says not everyone may have had the "benefit" of participatiing in the CCWGs etc.

Milton Mueller:"no plan, no guidelione, no vision. perhaps it is planned to do nothing" - join the nihilist caucus!

kavouss arasteh:We are not on the same page. Grec suggesting or submitting his own views without consulting us

Jeff Neuman:Its my understanding that Greg is just repeating what WS2 leadership has decided in terms of timeframes and deliverables

kavouss arasteh:It seems to me that it is planned to do nothing on jurisdiction

Mike Silber:Milton - is that a Tom Lehrer song?

Jeff Neuman:At this point it is a little abstract because we do not have the issues completely scoped out yet or a work plan

Milton Mueller:no, the lyrics are by Kavouss

Milton Mueller:I agree with you Jeff, this is heavy on process and short on substance.

Mike Silber:I thought it may be a follow on to. the Masochism Tango

Tatiana Tropina:Mike :D :D

Mike Silber:maybe that is the masochism conference call

Milton Mueller:And you are all masochists, which is why you supported weekly meetings

kavouss arasteh:Grec, you need to submit your idea to the CCWG pLENARY,

Tatiana Tropina:well it's moderately masochistic, I remember some "better" calls

kavouss arasteh:wE CAN NOT AGREE WITH WHAT YOU ARE SAYING

Jyoti Panday:get to substance

Avri Doria:not masochists, just obedient puppies

Farzaneh Badii:Jyoti, what substance?

Tatiana Tropina:hm, masochists sound much better, @Avri.

Milton Mueller:Yes, yes skip it

kavouss arasteh:Grec, you may be right or otherwise, the whole groupè must agree with your proposed schedule

Farzaneh Badii:Kavouss, but this is not Grec's proposed schedule.

Jeff Neuman:how about going over what WS1 said about this topic

Jyoti Panday:farzi i meant topics and scope

Farzaneh Badii:oh we are gonna talk about that? I thought that moment would never come.

Jyoti Panday:it is here now

Jyoti Panday:drumroll

Jeff Neuman:Can we review WS1's comments on this topic?

Jeff Neuman:So we have a baseline

Farzaneh Badii:I agree Jeff

Mike Silber:I agree with the non-Grec timeline

matthew shears:I think that the timeline has come from the CCWG - yeah like Greg says

Paul McGrady:I would prefer going over what WS1 had to say about this, rather than engaging in brainstorming which could lead us out of scope.

kavouss arasteh:David+ 1

matthew shears:agree David for so long as those suggestions are within scope

matthew shears:exactly

Tatiana Tropina:David well said +1

Rafael Perez Galindo (GAC\_SPAIN):+1 Paul, that is why we should kick off discussions on the sole basis of the text agreed in WS1 verbatim, which is the one that enjoys consensus. And build upon that.

Farzaneh Badii:+1

Jyoti Panday:+1

Paul McGrady:Can we have the 4 bullet points up?

Jeff Neuman:Can someone insert the link to the google doc here

Tatiana Tropina:[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1UGRQqP5Bs923nmDYekZn5ZL7-DQc\\_QSa0GSnFoj4Pn8/edit#heading=h.q253splulfnfnd](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1UGRQqP5Bs923nmDYekZn5ZL7-DQc_QSa0GSnFoj4Pn8/edit#heading=h.q253splulfnfnd)

Jeff Neuman:thx!

Rafael Perez Galindo (GAC\_SPAIN):Sorry no mike at home

David McAuley (RySG):That was quick Tatiana

Tatiana Tropina:have opened so can react quickly :)

Rafael Perez Galindo (GAC\_SPAIN):I am ok with the first part of the text now that Greg has added the text from WS1 report

Milton Mueller:OK. I have the doc open too

Paul McGrady:I apologize, I don't know exactly what 4 bullet points are being discussed. Can they be posted?

Milton Mueller:Paul

Milton Mueller:clikc on the Google doc link above

Tatiana Tropina:[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1UGRQqP5Bs923nmDYekZn5ZL7-DQc\\_QSa0GSnFoj4Pn8/edit#heading=h.q253splulfnfnd](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1UGRQqP5Bs923nmDYekZn5ZL7-DQc_QSa0GSnFoj4Pn8/edit#heading=h.q253splulfnfnd)

Tatiana Tropina:posting again

Farzaneh Badii:Perhaps, ICANN staff can display it in adobe?

Tatiana Tropina:they have to download it I think and then upload here

Paul McGrady:Thanks MM. I see it now. One of the bullet points was deleted on the Google doc version, so I ignored the deletion to get me to 4 instead of 3. :)

Paul McGrady:Thanks!

Milton Mueller:Repeating what I said on mic, is there anything these points about scope would exclude, or not encompass, that you think we should be talking about

Farzaneh Badii:echo

David McAuley (RySG):bad echo

Avri Doria:it is like i am in a dream gone wrong

Jyoti Panday:ha ha

Milton Mueller:LOL

Rafael Perez Galindo (GAC\_SPAIN)::)

Mary Uduma:Very bad audio

Sonigitu Ekpe:so much echo

Paul McGrady:Keeping in mind that Greg is a volunteer too.

Avri Doria:Grec volunteered. No one twisted his arm?

Paul McGrady:OK. He is a voluntold.

Milton Mueller:I admit it. I twisted his arm

Milton Mueller:but he beegged me to, he's a masochist

Farzaneh Badii:so are we gonna come up with a workplan as well?

Rafael Perez Galindo (GAC\_SPAIN):I would like to know whether this text has been prepared by ICANN legal staff. I am inclined to think so because at least in the last paragpah it contains legal language and legal affirmations, concerns "(however likely or unlikely that outcome might be)" and warnings ("would not.." "would continue"... ) that could preempt discussions, that have not been agreed upon, and that in no way belong in a background text that should only include facts and history... they constitute an input, a contribution, and not a valid basis for discussions.

Mike Silber:beware of Greecs bearing gifts

David McAuley (RySG):what date is thursday

matthew shears:Can a series of pointers be listed at the begining of the google doc as what you would like us to comment on?

kavouss arasteh:why not 12,00 hours

steve metalitz:Thursday or Friday at this time?

matthew shears:and what you would like intputs on?

Paul McGrady:9th is much better than 8th

Milton Mueller:why not 12,0000,000, hours

Avri Doria:12 hours is not one of the WS2 assigned time tracks.

David McAuley (RySG):1300 utc

Farzaneh Badii:Thursday? hmm have to look at SOAC accountability schedule

David McAuley (RySG):This was the dreaded but necessary process-oriented first meeting, IMO, - there will be plenty to discuss in the coming weeks I suspect

Tatiana Tropina:dreaded :)

Paul McGrady:Thanks Greg. Good kickoff call.

Vinay Kesari:Thank you David, I agree :)

Jyoti Panday:thanks Greg and Vinay

Tatiana Tropina:Thanks Greg and Vinay

Avri Doria:i was a wonderful liveley meeting. thank you so very much for the invitation.

Milton Mueller:is that a promise Greg?

David McAuley (RySG):Thank you chairs, staff and all

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support:thanks all, apologies for the technical diff. bye

Tatiana Tropina:bye all!

Farzaneh Badii:thanks . bye

Jyoti Panday:bye

Erich Schweighofer:Thanks, bye.