

CCWG ACCT Meeting #1 (9 December 2014)

Attendees:

Members: Alan Greenberg, Alice Munyua, Becky Burr, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Eberhard Lisse, Izumi Okutani, Jordan Carter, Julia Wolman, Leon Sanchez, Mathieu Weill, Olga Cavalli, Par Brumark, Robin Gross, Susanne Radell, Sebastien Bachollet, Thomas Rickert, Roelof Meijer, Bruce Tonkin, Tijani Ben Jemaa (19)

Participants: Adam Schlosser, Adrian Carballo, Alain Bidron, Amr Elsadr, Avri Doria, Kavouss Arasteh, Barrack Otieno, Robert Takacs, Camino Manjon-Sierra, David Maher, Evan Leibovitch, Greg Shatan, Griffin Barnett, Guru Acharya, James Baskin, Keith Drazek, Kristina Rosette, Lars Erik Forsberg, Malcolm Huty, Matthew Shears, Michael Benaudis, Olivier Crepin-Leblond, Paul Rosenzweig, Pedro Ivo Silva, Peter Van Roste, Philip Corwin, Rafael Perez Galindo, Sivasubramanian Muthusamy, Stephanie Duchesneau, Isaque Joaquim, Erik Brunner-Williams; Steve Metalitz (32)

Staff: Grace Abuhamad, Marika Konings, Nathalie Peregrine, Samantha Eisner, Adam Peake, Alice Jansen, Bart Boswinkel, Berry Cobb, Jim Trengrove, Theresa Swinehart,

Apologies: Martin Boyle; Jon Nevett; Carlos Raul Gutierrez; Tomohiro Fujisaki; Mark Carvell

Please let Grace know if your name has been left off the list (attendees or apologies).

Proposed Agenda:

1. Welcome, Roll Call & Introductions
2. Update on Membership & Participation
3. Review of CCWG-Accountability Charter
4. Confirm Working Methods
5. Timeline
6. Foundation for Work Plan
7. AOB

Notes & Action Items

1. Welcome, roll call & introductions

- Please remember to mute your microphones when not speaking
- Introduction of co-chairs - Thomas Rickert (GNSO) & Mathieu Weill (ccNSO). Additional co-chairs may be appointed by other chartering organizations.
- Introduction of support staff for the CCWG: Grace Abuhamad, Adam Peake, Bart Boswinkel, Marika Konings, Berry Cobb. Note that Grace and Adam will be the primary points of contact for this effort.
- Roll call will be taken based on the attendance in Adobe Connect, asking those that are only on the phone bridge to identify themselves.
- Everyone is expected to complete a statement of interest - staff will follow up with those that have not provided one yet
- When signing into Adobe Connect, add your affiliation in brackets after your name to facilitate identification of participants
- Please use the Adobe Connect hands raised function to indicate if you want to join the speaking queue. For an introduction to Adobe Connect, please see https://admin.adobe.acrobat.com/_a227210/participatemeeting/.

Action item: Everyone to provide / complete their statement of interest, if not done so yet

2. Update on Membership & Participation

- Participants participate in the same way as chartering organization appointed members
- Chartering organization appointed members have an additional role as they are responsible for reaching out to their respective chartering organizations and ensure that information goes back and forth from CCWG to chartering organization
- No formal votes / consensus calls are planned to be taken as the chairs intend to operate on the basis of consensus of the whole CCWG (any formal consensus call would involve chartering organizations appointed members only).
- No decisions will be taken on the basis of one single call - any decisions / agreements will be circulated on the mailing list at a minimum to allow for participants to provide input before a decision / agreement is considered final.

Action item: Contact Grace if you are interested in volunteering as the ATRT Past Participant (for members/participants that have participated in ATRTI/II)

3. Review of CCWG-Accountability Charter

- Review of presentation (Please see presentation that was circulated together with the agenda)
- Public Experts Group (PEG) Update - announcement will be made shortly concerning 6 advisors which have been selected. 7th advisor still being identified (local law, choice of law, jurisprudence).
- Will there be an expert who can identify what is possible under Californian law/international law? CCWG can reach out to advisors, including their networks, to provide input or aim to address those issues directly.

- The CCWG will be free to identify and request additional advisors, if need be.
- ATRTI/II discussed / researched some of these questions so some of that information may be available in those reports and should be consulted first.
- Mechanism for delivery of work stream 1 deliverable - delivery of WS1 proposal is expected to occur following approval of the ICANN Board. Board liaison is participating in CCWG and may be able to raise any potential issues ahead of time, should there be any. Process by which the Board intends to consider the proposal can be found here: <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2014-10-16-en#2.d> and is also referenced in the charter.
- How will this CCWG liaise / interface with the IANA Stewardship Transition CWG and ICG? There are two individuals serving as the ICG liaison (Keith Drazek and Kavouss Arasteh). In relation to the IANA Stewardship Transition CWG, weekly calls have been scheduled between the chairs of the two CWGs to ensure co-ordination and communication.

Action item: Everyone is expected to be familiar with the charter so please review the charter in detail if you have not done so yet.

4. Confirm Working Methods

- See also slide deck
- Rotation of meetings - initial proposal was 11.00 and 14.00 UTC. Other rotations have been used by other groups which may also be explored.
- No firm decisions are taking into account in one single meeting - any proposed decisions / agreements will be open to review / comment by those that may not have been able to attend a meeting
- Members are expected to communicate the views of the communities that have selected them to the CCWG but also communicate back information and deliberations from the CCWG to their respective communities
- All are expected to be familiar with and remain consistent with the pre-existing documents and documents developed during the course of the work of the CCWG.
- Provide substantive issues ahead of the meeting (ideally 12 hours in advance)
- Where/how to post documents on the wiki space?
- Audio-cast will be available for those interested in following the meetings - please share that link instead of the Adobe Connect link which is intended to be the workspace for members & participants
- Please share documents not only in proprietary format but always include at a minimum a pdf version

Action item: Staff to review current make-up of CCWG and suggest a rotation that takes into account location of members & participants. (to be shared later today or tomorrow)

5. Timeline

- See timeline slides presented - any comments / input encouraged
- Is it the intention that the CCWG finishes its work after Final Report on WS2 or could it continue as a standing CCWG? Charter does not foresee that the CCWG would continue on an indefinite basis - group is expected to close. But CCWG could make a recommendation to that end should it be deemed appropriate?
- Further details will be included in the timeline as the CCWG fleshes out its work

Action item: All to provide feedback on draft timeline

6. Foundation for Work Plan

Suggested committees:

- Area I: Look at existing accountability mechanisms, including ATRTI/II recommendations. Co-ordinator/Rapporteur: David Maher / Samantha Eisner
- Area II: Review input received in response to earlier public comment period on accountability and categorize items in WS1 and WS2 or both, including identifying proposals that have been made. Deliverable: list of items that have been suggested and identify whether these belong in WS1, WS2 or both. Co-ordinator/Rapporteur: Steve DelBianco
- Area III: Review what has been identified by IANA Transition CWG in relation to accountability and whether that is all WS1 related. Co-ordinator /Rapporteur: TBC
- Area IV: Identify contingencies that could be relevant to accountability mechanisms, especially in relation to WS1. Co-ordinator/Rapporteur: Eric Brunner-Williams
- Input received in response to public comment could include broader issues / recommendations than just area II
- Individual mailing list will be set up for these sub-committees to facilitate their work.
- Sub-committees to develop proposed approach / timeline in time for next meeting

Action item: Volunteers to come forward for these sub-teams prior to the meeting next week, especially a co-ordinator / rapporteur for Area III.

7. AOB

- Consider scheduling next meeting for 120 minutes
- Next meeting will be scheduled for Tuesday 16 December at 11.00 UTC.
- Reminders will be sent prior to the meetings but are not sent to the publicly archived mailing list but are sent individually (please whitelist Grace Abuhamad's email address) to avoid these ending up in your spam filter

Transcript

The transcript is available here: [Meeting1_10Dec.pdf](#)

Recording

The Adobe Connect recording is available here: <https://icann.adobeconnect.com/p8whrkqefw/>

MP3 recording: <https://icann.box.com/shared/static/0vmpn1k2r7i60w84a47e.mp3>

Documents Presented

[CCWG_Accountability_Timeline_v0.3.pdf](#)

[CCWG-Accountability Combined Presentation - 8 December.pdf](#)

Chat Transcript

Marika Konings:Welcome to the Enhancing ICANN Accountability CCWG Meeting of 9 December 2014

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:Hi everyone

Thomas Rickert:Hello everyone!

Alan Greenberg:The ALAC selection is official in 6 seconds

Olga Cavalli:hello everyone!

Bruce Tonkin:Hello Thomas

Pär Brumark:Good Evening everyone!

Michael Benaudis:Hello everyone :-)

Bruce Tonkin:Hello Matthieu

Suzanne Radell:Greetings all

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:Thanks Alan, right on time !

Robin Gross:Hello!

Bernie:yes

Robin Gross:nice way to build suspense, Alan. ;-)

Olivier Muron:Hello everyone!

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:good evening bon soir

Michael Benaudis:Bonsoir Lars et Bienvenue:-)

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:merci!

Michael Benaudis:De rien ;-)

Tijani BEN JEMAA:Hi everyone

Matthew Shears CDT:Hello!

el:How do I unhold?

Jordan Carter:Good morning/evening all

el:I have been placed on hold, can someone unhold me, please?!

Alan Greenberg:As of a few minutes ago, the ALAC Members are Tijani Ben Jemaa, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Leon Felipe Sanchez Ambía, Sébastien Bachollet, Alan Greenberg

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:Welcome !

Julia Wolman, Denmark, GAC:Hello all, How do I mute my microphone?

Marika Konings:@Alan - we'll get the wiki updated shortly

Nathalie Peregrine:@ Eberhart, the operator is replying to people individually when they phone in and there is a lot of traffic at this time, apologies for the delay.

Michael Benaudis:Bonjour Mathieu

Nathalie Peregrine:@ Julia, your mic is not activated, so no need to mute it :)

Julia Wolman, Denmark, GAC:Thank you:-)

el:bart you are on mute

Bart Boswinkel:I'm on mute I'm part of the policy team

Bart Boswinkel:as MArika and supporting the ccNSO

Matthew Shears CDT:audio is good

Marika Konings:Note you can also update your name / affiliation by using the drop down menu in this pod

el:can someone post a link to wer the Sol Web form is located

el:where rather

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):You can add affiliation now by using pull-down menu to right of ATTENDEES heading - Edit my info

Olga Cavalli - GAC:thanks Alan, done!

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):thank you for the tip Marika

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):If you use a automatic signon to Adobe Connect, that is the ONLY way to add affiliation.

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:just a little nitpick - if using a tablet device or mobile phone, the options & layout of the screen are different

Avri Doria (NCSG, but not speaking for them):yeah, thanks for the reminder. knew it was somewhere, but could not find it.

Samantha Eisner (ICANN staff):just a test

Bruce Tonkin (ICANN Board Liaison):Thanks for the tip Marika

Amr Elsadr:Hi All. Apologies for being late.

Sivasubramanian M:Gmail is sending many of the mails related to call details, CCWG to the spam folder.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:EXACTLY.

Steve DelBianco:Does anyone know whether the IANA Transition CWG conducted ANY votes or Consensus Calls?

Guru Acharya:@Steve: No votes were conducted

Amr Elsadr:@Steve: No consensus calls have been conducted yet.

Matthew Shears CDT:steve - I don't believe so

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:To my knowledge not as yet (am participant there)

Richard Hill:I did ask for the charter to be amended, but it was not.

Bruce Tonkin (ICANN Board Liaison):Part of dealing with a large number of people is to ensure that longer submissions can be made by email in advance which gives the group a chance to read before each meeting.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):Can we adopt that as an informal rule of process - that people introduce significant points by email preferably at least 12h before the call, and indicate that they wish their points discussed on the call?

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):Not as a rule per se, but just as sensible assistance to effective management?

Matthew Shears CDT:+ 1 Jordan

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):i was so pleased to see Richard on the call, as i thought it meant he had worked out his qualms with the charter.

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:@Jordan, @bruce : let's lkeep that suggestion for item 4 working methods, thanks !

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):OK

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:agree Jordon especially for those of us in the South

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):How can you say absolutely that there will be no votes. Is that copleately up to the chairs? doesn't the charter allow votes if necessary?

Roelof Meijer (ccNSO):I think it is clear that the (members of) the working group cannot by themselves change the charter. Implicitly, by joining the WG / participating, memebbers and participants agree to (or submit themselves to) the charter. Let's not spend too much time on this. The objection to this specific part of the charter is noted, let's proceed with our work

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):BTW< i am a prticipant, a non voter. i am not arguing for my right to vote.

el [.NA]:In the FoI we had the informal rule that anything have to be "read" at least at two calls before accepted, and I think this is helpful.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr:Agree @Roelof the Charter is the Charter

Amr Elsadr:Has anyone considered that there may actually be benefits in restricting the consensus to "members"?

Marika Konings:@Avri - it is at the discretion of the chairs.

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):ok, so he can say absolutley there will be no votes.

Amr Elsadr:Restricting consensus to "members" creates parity amongst the different SOs/ACs in the consensus call. Although I note and agree with Evan's comment.

Keith Drazek:Hi all. Apologies for joining late. Meeting conflict.

Greg Shatan (GNSO/CSG/IPC):Amr raises a good point. The Members list is balanced. The Participants list may be quite skewed.

el [.NA]:CHARTER, CHARTER, CHARTER!

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):@Greg, that is a common occurrence in ICANN WGs. Typically consensus is taken factoring in what group you are associated with (or not).

Richard Hill:The charter was approved by ICANN, not by the global multistakeholder community. Again, there is nothing wrong with that, but it is an ICANN process, not a global multistakeholder process.

el [.NA]:It's an ICANN Wg not a Global Multistakeholder Wg.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):++ @Eberhardt

Richard Hill:Indeed, it is an ICANN WG, but the NTIA asked for the views of the global multistakeholder community, not the views of ICANN

el [.NA]:Not as far as Accountability of ICANN is concerned...

el [.NA]:read the charter.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):@ Richard, that's the requirement of the ICG, not of ccwg-accountability.

el [.NA]:It just came up on the screen as Scope!

el [.NA]:or "in Sopce"

Richard Hill:My understanding is that NTIA asked for a global multistakeholder process for the ICANN accountability related to the IANA transition.

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:+1 Richard -- ICANN can do what it likes, but if it doesn't address the NTIA ask it won't be very useful

Robin Gross (NCSG):I would not want for a consensus poll that did not take into account the stakeholder group, otherwise it is possible to "stack the deck" of deliberations by those with resources to participate.

el [.NA]:No prob, just figure it out in the ICANN bylaws...

Sivasubramanian M:ICG presupposes a separation of IANA from ICANN, whereas it is still open to discuss if IANA could be a part of ICANN almost as a division, in which case, there need not be two separate tracks for accountability. ICANN accountability discussions could in that case embrace IANA accountability

Barrack Otieno:synchronizing of the tasks under the two workstreams will be critical Matthieu

el [.NA]:What resources? They dial you. And I am SIPing in from a developing country.

Steve DelBianco:That NETmundial definition is: as the existence of mechanisms for independent checks and balances as well as for review and redress.

Robin Gross (NCSG):I like the Netmundial definition, Steve.

Amr Elsadr:@Robin: +1

Steve DelBianco:Candidate Stress Tests are availalbe at <http://BizConst.org/StressTests>

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):There are some ATRT folks on this call now.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):SEveral of the ATRT I / II are here

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member): it is in MY SOI

Greg Shatan (GNSO/CSG/IPC):As to resources, in this case it's human resources rather than financial resources. Groups with the largest membership could stack the deck....

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):CLO, Avri, Me....

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):I served in 1

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):and followed II VERY closely

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):I served on ATRT2

Olivier Crepin-Leblond:ATR2 me too

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):i also served on atrt2

Robin Gross (NCSG):We have great ATRT expertise in this group.

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:opac selection of these advisors...and long time due...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Hardly suprising @ Robi :-) but good to see /recognise

Grace Abuhamad:Please send me an email at grace.abuhamad@icann.org if you are interested in volunteering as the ATRT Past Participant

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:on what criteria??

Grace Abuhamad:Having served as on ATRT 1 or ATRT 2

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:sorry I am talking about the selections of advisors...

Grace Abuhamad:please raise your hand in AC room

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:opac late and not clear on what criteria...

Olivier Muron:I served on ATRT1

Steve DelBianco:May any of us recommend experts in California Law?

Keith Drazek:The CCWG will be free to identify our own experts independent of the PEG-selected experts.

Samantha Eisner (ICANN staff):As part of my role as staff participant, I can provide input on some of the questions as well

Keith Drazek:I strongly agree with Alan that the CCWG will need independent subject matter expertise on California not-for-profit law.

Steve DelBianco:+1 to needing expert in CA non-profit law

Robin Gross (NCSG):I agree as well.

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:Are we willing to pay for advice? We can get good Calif advice for a fee ...

Grace Abuhamad:The Advisors will not be compensated I believe

Robin Gross (NCSG):it needs to be independent - not coming through ICANN legal dept.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Indeed we did @James looking to the ATRT work done is important

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):@CLO - yes, the Berkman report comes to mind.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):@Robin in deed it does (and sorry about the earlier typo

Keith Drazek:I think it might be necessary for the CCWG to consider raising funds to hire an independent expert that reports directly to the Co-Chairs of the CCWG.

ARASTEH:I HAVE NOT BEEN CALLED

ARASTEH:weHY

ARASTEH:icg PROCESS WAS QUITE SIMPLE

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):@exactly @James

Grace Abuhamad:Mr. Arasteh -- we have dialed out to you many times today. We will try again now. Please standby.

ARASTEH:HERE NO ONE ANSWERED MY QUESTIONS why?

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:Yes -- that must be in scope

el [.NA]:If all fails you can use the audio facilities of Adobe Connect or use Skype and dial one of the toll free numbers

Marika Konings:Please mute your mics when not speaking

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:there's noise

Olga Cavalli - GAC:noise

Keith Drazek:Mute phones and computers please.

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:thanks

Olga Cavalli - GAC:echo

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:still echo and noise

Keith Drazek:Operator please assist.

Marika Konings:Someone needs to mute the speakers on their computer

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Liune open and speakers on result in that feedback noise

Nathalie Peregrine:we are working on it

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):This is getting tedious.

Nathalie Peregrine:Please MUTE speakers if on the phone

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):should read line

Greg Shatan (GNSO/CSG/IPC):Please go on mute if you are not speaking.

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):I guess this is what happens when we get 70 people on a call.

Evan Leibovitch:Please mute the PRISM listening post.

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):Ug. Mute..please

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):it will be a computer speaker not a phone one

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):so it wasn't one of the AC talking folk

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):LOL @Evan

Bruce Tonkin (ICANN Board Liaison):Yes - you need to set both Adobe connect on mute as well as any phone that you are using.

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):clo, it could have been a speakerphone.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):True @Avri but they tend to be more able to not do that in my experience

Keith Drazek:Yes, the Board passed a resolution in Los Angeles concerning how it will handle any instance where it cannot accept a community recommendation.

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):There are two: Keith and Kavous

Grace Abuhamad:I've re-added the mics -- please mute your adobe mics if you do not use them

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Very important point @malcolm

Barrack Otieno:ok

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):ICANN is accountable to all of its stakeholders

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):who else could it be accountable to?

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:+1 @Avri

Barrack Otieno:correct Avri

Matthew Shears CDT:the WG charter outlines the role of the Board

Steve DelBianco:I am no longer getting audio. Anyone?

el [.NA]:it's fine here

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Audio OK for me @steve

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):I would assume that regardless of "approval" any accountability changes that require ICANN Bylaw changes, staff changes, or process changes can only be effected with the approval of the ICANN Board.

Barrack Otieno:fine hear

Barrack Otieno:here

Keith Drazek:If enhanced accountability mechanisms or reforms are to be incorporated into ICANN's bylaws, the ICANN Board will be responsible for accepting them. The Board is currently the highest authority. Without the Board accepting the recommended reforms, they will not happen.

el [.NA]:CHARTER, CHARTER, CHARTER!

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):If the community is united around accountability proposals, the Board is going to accept them. It isn't going to jeopardise the transition.

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):Disagree, this group is different from ICG. Output should go to the SOs/ACs and the Board.

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):#Keith, great minds think alike.

Keith Drazek:+1 Alan

Evan Leibovitch:agreed. the board may produce an appendix but should not be able to edit the cwg deliverables

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):And here we hit a substantive issue in our first moment. ICANN Board is always in the position to amend any ICANN process, at any time.

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:Agree

Samantha Eisner (ICANN staff):Here are the principles that the Board adopted at ICANN51: <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2014-10-16-en#2.d>

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):Sam, those account for the approval of the outcome, not the continuing commitment to the decisions it makes at that point in time.

Keith Drazek:@Avri, I believe one of the structural reforms we need to implement through this process is a community body that would approve any changes to ICANN's bylaws.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):@ Avri - yes, it can. I don't know about other people on this CWG, but I'm focused on us doing a good job and presenting a workable proposal. The chances of the Board relitigating it are, in my opinion, vanishingly small.

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):Keith, as I said, in the first moment, we hit one of the critical issues.

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):I like that suggestion, Keith.

Keith Drazek:+1 Avri

Izumi Okutani:+ 1 Jordan

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:Evan, was your point on earlier item ?

Evan Leibovitch:is there any mention of deliverables for WT2 before we move on?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):I also believe that @Jordan but it is matter to note/discuss.

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):@Keith: The ATRT 1 discussed the idea of a "policy board" vs. "corporate board".

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Indeed we did @James

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):@ CLO - I agree. Very good to raise and test people's expectations :)

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:deliverables for WS2 are similar in nature to WS1 by the charter

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):Jordan, I agree we should do our best, but I think the issue of relitigation is not null and must be dealt with.

Evan Leibovitch:I was concerned that the work of WT2 was just going to go "into the ether" unless there were explicit expectations set

James Bladel (GNSO/RrSG/GNSO Council):I'm sorry folks, I have to drop this call a bit early.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):the call times are fine my me but I turn up WHENEVER you do calls ;-)

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:ty soon James

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):bye James

Barrack Otieno:Thats ok Grace

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):11:00 and 14:00 UTC are BOTH very early in the morning for California, so don't work for many of us.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):I don't mind awful call times as long as some of that pain is shared - it's if "every" call starts in the middle of the night that it is difficult.

Barrack Otieno:its midnight in Nairobi :-)

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Agreed, Jordan, they are both in the early morning for California also.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Yes indeed @Jordan but we southerners HAVE to turn up regardless ;-)

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:@ Jordan -- you could move to Australia :-)

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):geographical pain sharing is an important consideration

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):CLO: ICANN is globalising. Let's see the reality of that, as the FOI Working Group managed. :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):your welcome of course ! @Paul

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):@ Paul - I don't think so ;-)

el [.NA]:We write a report, it will get commented on, we perhaps re-write, we then violently agree on everything and if the Board doesn't like it they will "enter into a dialogue" and we'll take it from there.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Yes I DO remember @Jordan I was in all those calls

Amr Elsadr:Would a 12hr rotation work? UTC 20:00 and UTC 08:00?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member): Some groups use an 8 hr shift to share the pain @Amr; then 1 in 3 is a "unfriendly" time

Amr Elsadr:Sure. 8hrs work. But certainly not fair to some who have inconvenient times with every call.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):And @el suggested a 6h rotation. I look forward to seeing the proposal that @Grace and all come up with.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):thing is there are ICANN Communities that have found times when 'most' can turn up, grace can check on those.

Grace Abuhamad:Yes -- thank you all for your suggestions

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):it was 1 in 8 @Eberhardt

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):for FOI

Amr Elsadr:What tools will we use for collaborative drafting?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Good point @Steve we need the Wiki Archive to match anything sent to list

el [.NA]:Cheryl, I hated it, but could do most of them :-)-O

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):I believe anyone can post to the wiki just contact Glen for an account.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Tell me about it @Eberhardt ;-)

Evan Leibovitch:The access of who can edit ... or who can just leave comments .. can be configured.

el [.NA]:I am perfectly happy of sending my stuff to staff, ie Grace.

Berry Cobb:@Amr, it has not been decided, but we will likely use Google docs for early stage drafting and/or combination of MS Word for track changes as documents mature.

Grace Abuhamad:I will create a CCWG Documents section for you to upload resources (or you can send them to me-- either way works!)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):thanks Grace

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:Can you hear me??

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:no we can't

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:would you like to ask via chat ?

Sivasubramanian M 2:Work Stream 2 might as well be defined as going beyond the IANA transition timeline.

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:indeed, agree

Amr Elsadr:The gant chart suggests that WS1 ends with submission to the board, but it actually ends with board approval of the recommendations, doesn't it?

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):can these slides please be sent to the CCWG-ACCT email list?

Marika Konings:@Robin - we'll send this out immediately following the call together with the notes of the meeting.

Thomas Rickert:Dear Kavouss, you mentioned that no call to you has been made. We have double-checked and the operator has in fact tried to reach you multiple times.

Philip Corwin:where is the stress testing in the timeline?

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Thanks, Marika.

Steve DelBianco:We recommend using Stress Tests initially, to guide accountability mechanisms. Then use Stress Tests to evaluate accountability mechanisms as they take shape

Matthew Shears CDT:+ 1 Steve - stress testing should not come at the end it should be a part of the process

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):it would need rechartering for new activities

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Yes, standing group - we need to monitor implementation

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):a CWG can always recommend new charter elements to the chartering organizations.

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:Should we be considering Board feedback after submitting the final work? What if the Board doesn't approve the final version as it is sent? Would that submission be subject to amendments?

Amr Elsadr:@Leon: +1

el [.NA]:Read the Board resolution

Matthew Shears CDT:the Board should be involved as the work progresses so there are no surprises

Matthew Shears CDT:through the liaison

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):I think our work includes the entire process, including overseeing implementation.

Matthew Shears CDT:+ 1 Robin

Marika Konings:@Amr, Leon - please review the Board Approval process that outlines the steps for such a scenario.

Amr Elsadr:@Robin: +1

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:Thanks @Marika

Izumi Okutani:I don't think this was considered Malcom - whether follow up multiple reports are possible on WS2

Marika Konings:Regarding closure, the charter says the following: The CCWG-Accountability will consult with their chartering organizations to determine when it can consider its work completed. The CCWG-Accountability and any sub-working groups shall be dissolved upon receipt of the notification of the Chairs of the chartering organizations or their designated representatives.

Amr Elsadr:@Marika: Thanks. I'll do that.

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):joining late.

Paul Rosenzweig:The September 2015 date is not a deadline. Both the ICANN Board, the ICANN CEO and the NTIA have said it is an objective ... we should take the time we need if we need more.

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:CCWG work needs to be over before or soon after IANA transition

Steve DelBianco:I have placed the BC's draft Stress Tests in our wiki. They are also at <http://bizconst.org/StressTests>

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Thanks @Steve

Malcolm Hutty:If this group may remain in existence after delivery of WS2 proposal, it may consider whether the Board has properly understood and acted upon its proposals, and perhaps come up with further proposals to correct. If the group closes on delivery, it will require a new initiative to start a process to review how our WS2 recommendations are implemented

Grace Abuhamad:Thanks @Steve. I will create a better place for your resources (and others) after the call. I hope that is ok.

Matthew Shears CDT:@ Malcolm - I prefer the first option

Malcolm Hutty:For now, I am just asking, not expressing a view.

Amr Elsadr:@Malcolm: +1 to keeping the CCWG along with implementation. This is similar to implementation review teams that assist staff in implementing gTLD policies in the GNSO.

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):ICANN can only be accountable to its stakeholders. it is a simple concept.

el [.NA]:Read the Charter, read the Board Resolution.

Malcolm Hutty:@el, I have. I wouldn't have asked if I thought it was clear

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:Will the timeline slides be circulated?

Thomas Rickert:@Paul - yes

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):steve, the bc's "stress test" item 4 revisits the bc's position on the applicant support activity.

Paul Rosenzweig [Heritage Foundation]:Also, I assume all of this is public record so there is no limit on sharing the slides outside this group?

Marika Konings:@Paul - yes, they will be circulated shortly after this meeting together with the notes

Marika Konings:correct - everything will be posted on a publicly archived mailing list

Malcolm Hutty:In my experience, the best time to ask questions about the rules of procedure is before they become critical to resolve a point of controversy

Evan Leibovitch:Can't do the Friday.

Steve DelBianco:@ebw -- you're right!

Sébastien (At-Large):It will be 13th of Feb

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):What's happening on 13 Feb?

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):A meeting of this WG?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Noted Friday Singapore F2F and in Mid Jan YES it will be important to keep our work going at appropriate level of progress... We need to gwt the dates sorted soon though we all have calenders that fill rapidly

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):@steve, and the final points aren't any closer to "stress", just revisiting the contention/plural rules.

Thomas Rickert:Isaque - please do speak. it is your turn

Sébastien (At-Large):+1 Cheryl

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):a friendly suggestion -- stick to stress, not frills.

Greg Shatan (GNSO/CSG/IPC):Will calls be 90 minutes from now on, or should they be 2 hours.

Lars Erik Forsberg, GAC:would be good to sue Monday for F2F

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):what dates in January should we looking to set aside?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):I think 2 hrs is reasonable @Greg

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member): a LOT to do!!!

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):i awasy plan to leave on the saturday even though i have to pay the extra night of hotel in most cases. there is just so much that happens on that friday, leaving then is leaving too soon.

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):I can do Friday the 13th in Singapore.

el [.NA]:Monday in Singapore, or in any ICANN meeting will interfere with TechDay :-)-O

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Yes the Friday is a real work day for so many of us regardless f the official meeting closure

Isaque:hi everyone

Steve DelBianco:: Anyone receiving ICANN travel support for Singapore could have great difficulty making changes to extend the trip for a F2F.

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):@CLO, yes for a bunch of us...

el [.NA]:I'll leave on Thursday

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Also "GNSO weekend" before ICANN week would work for me (but it would be a problem for those who are gnsoc councilors)

Becky Burr:apologies, i must drop to get on another call at this time.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member): @EL most parts of ICANN COmmunity will lready have full schedules planned for the Mon - Thr if not the previous Fri/Sat -Friday Yes

el [.NA]:We could do it right after TechDay using the same venue?

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):There is no chance of a date that will suit everyone. Maybe we have to take the advice the same as calls - a common agenda for two meetings in the period of the ICANN festival. One early one late. Similar agenda but different reflections in the second.

Isaque:I am new in the group.... joined as participant.... actually I am not an IT expert.... but IT is my area of interest

Malcolm Hutty:We should look at previous public comment, but issues and arguments not raised during previous consultation should still be eligible for consideration if raised now

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:they are Malcolm

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):We perhaps need to doodle for F2F options oin Singapore as well as anything in mid Jan

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):will we be putting these calls for the Sub Teams your speaing og out to the list today?

Matthew Shears CDT:we need another area for other accountability suggestions from the CCWG

Malcolm Hutty:@Mattieu, Thank you, as I expected, but important to have formal confirmation on these types of questions at this stage

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):I like that proposal for a way forward, Thomas. Maybe add another Area of Implementation.

Matthew Shears CDT:not just past suggestions

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):and of course setting them up in wiki sub spaces as well

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccTLD Member):Apologies, I need to duck out. Will statically leave this here. Generally happy with the co-chairs suggestions with the Work Plan.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):opps curse = course

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:@Jordan; thanks

Alain Bidron (GNSO-CSG-ISPCP):+1 @CLO for doodle

Matthew Shears CDT:+ 1 Steve

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):ICANN can only be accountable to its stakeholders. There are currently many stakeholder accountability mechanisms

el [.NA]:This is taking too long

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):I agree @Thomas this is key to our planned work

Amr Elsadr:Does Area II also include ATRT recommendations?

Hillary Jett:@Steve and all -- We have created a file sharing space on the community wiki space under "Resources" for anyone in the group to use. <https://community.icann.org/x/NYIQAaw>

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Thanks @Hillary :-)

Samantha Eisner (ICANN staff):To help facilitate the work of the Area 1, I can quickly pull together background documentation on existing accountability mechanisms

Steve DelBianco:@Hillary -- I posted Stress Tests there just now. Are they visible to you? Did I post them properly?

Steve DelBianco:@Samantha -- please send whatever Staff has done on Area II

Avri Doria (GNSO, NCSG, speaking individually):Amr I would think both phases need to take ATRT considerations into account

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):i'm willing to volunteer

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):don't care which item,

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):area iv

Eric Brunner-Williams (ebw):contingencies

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Thank you, David.

Amr Elsadr:@Avri: Agreed. Just making sure that ATRT recs would be included in the list of inputs received.

Amr Elsadr:In terms of scoping.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):+ @Amr

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Yes to 120 mins for future calls

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Agreed, CLO.

Sivasubramanian M 2:I suggest an additional Area, Area V, that could be Preliminary Work related to Work Stream 2

Evan Leibovitch:Work on that cough after the call, Thomas.

Matthew Shears CDT:good idea on Area V

Thomas Rickert:thanks, Evan! Will do

Thomas Rickert:Let us establish Area V during the next call, it is an excellent suggestion!

Sivasubramanian M 2:@ Mathew In the course of Work stream 1, we will come across several suggestions or topics that would be deferred to work stream 2, at least the Area V could take note, aggregate and do some preparatory work under Area V

Sivasubramanian M 2:Yes, next call Thomas

Matthew Shears CDT:absolutely

Sébastien (At-Large):Not with me :(next call

Keith Drazek:Thanks to the Co-Chairs and to ICANN Staff for all the preparatory work for this call.

Evan Leibovitch:Thanks! I was one of those who did not get the notice for this mtg

Greg Shatan (GNSO/CSG/IPC):If you use gmail, you can set up a filter that marks Grace's email as "never send to spam." This works even when the contact solution doesn't.

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Ouch! to 11:00 UTC mtgs!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (ALAC APRALO WG Member):Thanks all --- Bye for now...

Greg Shatan (GNSO/CSG/IPC):@Robin -- Bad on the East Coast, worse on the West Coast...

Matthew Shears CDT:Thanks all - good call

Suzanne Radell:Thank you to Mathieu, Thomas, ICANN staff and colleagues for the first call.

Sivasubramanian M 2:Thank You

Keith Drazek:Also, FYI, the emails with the call details are coming from the following address: accountability-staff@icann.org

Pär Brumark:THX ALL!

Grace Abuhamad:Thank you Keith

Bart Boswinkel:Bye all

Amr Elsadr:Thanks all. Bye.

Robin Gross (GNSO - NCSG):Thanks all!

Evan Leibovitch:bye all. have a good hot drink, Thomas. Good holidays

Leon Sanchez ALAC LACRALO WG Member:bye everyone

Sivasubramanian M 2:bye

Izumi Okutani:Thanks all, it was constructive call. Thanks to Co-Chairs for preparation

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:Bye everyone !

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair:Thanks Izumi, great to have you onboard

Michael Benaudis:I want to thank Grace, Marika and Nathalie for making a big effort for connecting all the participant in a single place

Michael Benaudis:...and thanks all, it was constructive and positive