

At-Large Definition and Structure Draft Team Sandbox

This workspace has been created for use by the At-Large Definition and Structure Drafting Team (DSDT) to prepare draft text on the revision of the ALAC Rules of Procedure. The expectation is that from this drafting a new Introduction and Section 1 of a set of Rules of Procedure (RoPs) or Operating Principals (OPs) for ALAC will be created, adopted/endorsed and in use from end 2012.

The purpose of this workspace is to offer a space where the revised rules are worked on in pre-consensus mode during and between formal meetings of the Drafting Team.

General Notes on Style

It is expected that text for this section and the full document shall :-

- be written in 'plain language' which is easily and accurately translated into languages other than English.
- be clear and unambiguous text.
- be minimalist in approach using the "less is more" or "Keep it Simple" approach.
- wherever possible use a **short** text introduction / summary / outline to each section and Sub section and for any given (distinct) Principal or Procedure / Rule followed by an example if needed (this could be in a highlight or boxed 'call out' text) and where needed followed by numbered parts or sub-parts to give greater detail and clarity as needed.

Section 1 is envisaged to -

- open with a 'What is the At Large Advisory Committee (ALAC)' outline that links to relevant ICANN By-Law references

that defines

- the purpose of the ALAC (as distinct from At-Large) clearly, this would include tasks such as the accreditation of At-Large Structures (ALSes) and appointment/selection of Voting Delegates to NomCom and to Seat #15 of the ICANN Board.
- as well as its roll in ICANN the organisation/entity and in any wider context with other ICANN elements/ parts including various Actors /Stakeholders;
 - to this end, introductory text should draw from both existing ICANN By-Laws, as well as the intent of existing rules and practices both internal to ALAC and At-Large, as well as with the wider ICANN community.

This section should also outline (at least):

- the expectations upon, and desired characteristics of, a person appointed to the ALAC as well as cross reference to participation requirements (including minimum criteria and metrics) when established.
- the need for the ALAC to act/operate 'by consensus' and define what constitutes a quorum and/or Regional representational balance requirement for decisions and outcomes / work products; etc

and

- that the ALAC jointly and severally is expected to act in the best interests of the At-Large Community'

as well as

- describe and define any Leadership role(s) **note ICANN By-Laws require a Chair of the ALAC to be elected and post ALAC review this term is to be for 2 years serving end ICANN AGM in any given year they are elected for 2 calendar years until the end of the ICANN AGM of the second year ends** ; including an ALAC sub -unit (currently called an Executive Committee) which is Regionally Balanced and functions to facilitate work product and activities of the ALAC between monthly meetings of the whole as well as act in support (administratively and as delegated from time to time) of the ALAC Chair.
- **list describe the role and define any qualities and characteristics of various Representational Roles that are appointed by and act on behalf of the ALAC (and At-Large) in various fora;**
 - Note ICANN By-Laws require a Liaison of the ALAC to be appointed to both the GNSO and the ccNSO; But other Liaisons to ICANN AC/SO's should be addressed, as well as any other Appointments and Representational Roles such as (but not limited to) Independent Review Teams, Sub-Committees and Work Groups/ Drafting Teams internal to ALAC and At-Large as well as to other parts of ICANN (often called liaisons) and to ICANN Cross Community activities.
- Other matters pertaining to the Structure and Function of the ALAC.

[At-Large Definition and Structure Draft Team Sandbox Archived Comments](#)

[Archived Comments](#)

Area for Draft text Mark Up by [Pen Holders](#)

(Please use either version control or simple date and name of editor to track changes in this space)

Skeletal Draft Model 1: Decentralised Approach - DRAFT ONLY

Note: These Headers are meant to guide the discussions and will be revised and amended when finalising the Draft. This is just a working version to facilitate discussions on specific matters concerning our assigned tasks. The numbering are just for the purposes of drafting and will be changed when the document is finalised. This Model is based on comments and feedback from the ALAC listserves, the Wiki etc.

Participants are asked to note comments from the [Report of the At Large Improvements Task Force](#).

Introduction

(Insert Brief Introduction) <CLO> suggest we use something like this from Sala's comment text below ... =>

"

1. The At-Large Advisory Committee ("ALAC") is the primary organizational home within ICANN for individual Internet users and shall consist of:
 - a. two delegates selected by each of the Regional At-Large Organizations ("RALOs") established; and
 - b. five delegates selected by the Nominating Committee (**NomCom appointees**[2]).
 - c. ~~non-voting liaisons selected by XXXXXX that shall be selected according to a proscribed criteria.~~ <CLO> **ALAC is only Members as selected by RALOs and NomCom (at htis stage 15 people)**
2. The ALAC has no legal authority to act for ICANN but shall report findings and recommendations to the ICANN Board[3].

Role of the ALAC

3. Pursuant to the Bylaws, the ALAC shall

1.
 - a. consider and provide advice on the following:-
 - i. activities and policies of ICANN created through ICANN's Supporting Organizations;
 - ii. other issues for which community input and advice is appropriate.
 - b. participate in ICANN's accountability mechanisms;
 - c. coordinate some of ICANN's outreach to individual Internet users;
 - d. work in conjunction with the RALOs to coordinate[4]:-
 - i. Making a selection by the At-Large Community to fill Seat 15 on the Board[5]
 - ii. Keeping the community of individual Internet users informed about the significant news from ICANN;
 - iii. Distributing (through posting or otherwise) an updated agenda, news about ICANN, and information about items in the ICANN policy-development process;
 - iv. Promoting outreach activities in the community of individual Internet users;
 - v. Developing and maintaining on-going information and education programs, regarding ICANN and its work;
 - vi. Establishing an outreach strategy about ICANN issues in each RALO's Region;
 - vii. Participating in the ICANN policy development processes and providing input and advice that accurately reflects the views of individual Internet users;
 - viii. Making public, and analyzing, ICANN's proposed policies and its decisions and their (potential) regional impact and (potential) effect on individuals in the region;
 - ix. Offering Internet-based mechanisms that enable discussions among members of At-Large structures; and
 - x. Establishing mechanisms and processes that enable two-way communication between members of At-Large Structures and those involved in ICANN decision-making, so interested individuals can share their views on pending ICANN issues.

[1] Pursuant to Article XI § 2 §§ 4 of the ICANN Bylaws ("Bylaws")

[2] NomCom Appointees means the five members selected by the Nominating Committee shall include one citizen of a country within each of the five Geographic Regions established according to Article VI §5

[3] Pursuant to Article XI §1 of Bylaws.

[4] Pursuant to Article XI § 2 §§ 4 j of Bylaws

[5] Notification of the At-Large Community's selection shall be given by the ALAC Chair in writing to the ICANN Secretary, consistent with Article VI, § 8§§4 and §12§§1. "

Interpretation[S1]

Note: For now, we have inserted reviews of existing definitions. We expect to add the New Definitions later after receiving feedback from other Drafting Teams of terms or words, Acronyms etc that should be added. Thank you for the contributions that have come in during the Review. Terms which are in Red mean that they have yet to be reviewed by those assigned the terms. In some instances others have given feedback on these terms. All peer review submitted via the wiki have been encapsulated through comments. The Peer Review process will be ongoing.

Assembly means any meeting or conference, or standing constituent body of the ALAC as well as any General Assembly sessions of a Regional At Large Organisation <CLO /agreed and edited from Sergio and Darlene comments> "Assembly means any meeting or conference, or standing constituent body of the ALAC and the General Assembly of Regional At Large Organization" should be divided into: Annual General; Plenary Meeting, Ordinary Special and Extraordinary etc., (all of which need some defining)

Annual General Meeting (AGM) [S1] means the ALAC Annual General Meeting

ICANN Annual General Meeting (IAGM) means the ICANN's Annual General Meeting which is usually held in the third Quarter between October and December of each year as referred to §13 of ICANN's Bylaws which is also referred to as Annual Meeting

At - Large Advisory Committee (ALAC)[S2] means a body that considers and provides advice on the activities of ICANN that relates to the interests of individual Internet users, which includes all ICANN policies and issues requiring community input and advice. <CLO> should reference relevant ICANN By Laws here (as with all other ICANN structures defined => "It is described in article as It [does].....")

At- Large Structure (ALS) [S3] means an ICANN accredited entity/organisation that primarily represents the interests of Internet Users, as a Member of the At-Large community as defined in ICANN bylaws (XI § 2, Part 4i 1 to 8). The ALAC certifies ALSes using an approved process <insert link> on behalf of ICANN.

Country Codes Names Supporting Organisation (ccNSO) means a body within the ICANN structure created for and by ccTLD managers. It is described in article IV, § 1 of the ICANN bylaws as being responsible for (1) developing and recommending to the Board global policies relating to country-code top-level domains; (2) Nurturing consensus across the ccNSO's community, including the name-related activities of ccTLDs; and (3) Coordinating with other ICANN Supporting Organizations, committees, and constituencies under ICANN.

Generic Names Supporting Organisation (gNSO) means Generic Names Supporting Organisation Copy paste from www.icann.org: **The Generic Names Supporting Organization** fashions (and over time, recommends changes to) policies for generic Top-Level Domains (e.g., .com, .org, .gov). The GNSO strives to keep gTLDs operating in a fair, orderly fashion across one global Internet, while promoting innovation and competition.

Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) means the body that coordinates the Domain Name System (DNS), Internet Protocol (IP) addresses, space allocation, protocol identifier assignment, generic (gTLD) and country code (ccTLD) Top-Level Domain name system management, and root server system management functions. These services were originally performed under U.S. Government contract by the Internet Assigned Numbers Authority (IANA) and other entities. ICANN now performs the IANA function.

NOMCOM means ICANN's Nominating Committee

Motion[S4] means a formal proposal made in a deliberative assembly, for example a Motion to adjourn

Delegate[S5] means member of the At Large Advisory Committee 'To Be Removed From Use' as a meaning for Member of the ALAC BUT may be repurposed to define an Appointment of Roll that has REPRESENTATIVE status. <CLO>

Member[S6] means member of the At-Large Advisory Committee

RALO[S7] means Regional At-Large Organization

Rapporteur[S8] - In reference to the following Rules of Procedure and whilst some reporting or collation and preparation of information and notes role may be part of the job description, the following broad definition applies "An independent critical friend; a person acting as a monitor to processes, who is responsible on behalf of the committee to ensure correct process have been carried out. 'To Be Removed From Use' <CLO>

Resolution[S9] means a formal statement of a decision or expression of opinion put before or adopted by an assembly such as ALAC.

Rough Consensus [S10] means a term used in consensus decision-making to indicate the "sense of the group" concerning a particular matter under consideration. It does not require that all participants agree although this is, of course, preferred. In general, the dominant view of the group shall prevail. (However, it must be noted that "dominance" is not to be determined on the basis of volume or persistence, but rather a more general sense of agreement.) Consensus can be determined by electronic mail, online balloting, written balloting, or any other means deemed convenient and accurate by the group. Note that 51% of the group does not qualify as "rough consensus" and 99% is better than rough. It is up to the Chair of the ALAC to determine if rough consensus has been reached. (This definition of "rough consensus" is substantially similar to that found in paragraph 3.3 of RFC 2418). <CLO> we should also look at the agreed usage terms for levels of agreement now adopted for use in GNSO Work Groups and reference it here...

SSAC means the ICANN Stability and Stability Advisory Committee <CLO> should reference relevant ICANN By Laws here (as with all other ICANN structures defined => "It is described in article as It [does].....")

<CLO> Add GAC and ASO also add a link to the Acronym Meaning online look up from ICANN web site

[S1] Yaovi Atohou's comment: suggest that at this stage we keep all the terms that have definitions in the current RoP and we mention in the comment column that it may be removed . This decision will be based on what we have as final content of the new RoP. I agree with the definition (ICANN annual general meeting found in ICANN below in section 8.1.h) . Annual meeting (section 13 in ICANN bylaws) is the term most used in ICANN bylaws. I

I would suggest:

Option 1: in ALAC RoP we use IAGM (ICANN Annual General Meeting) if we think that ALAC as an advisory committee may have also an AGM.

Option 2: We use "ICANN AGM" instead of "AGM" in ALAC RoP

[S2] Rinalia Abdul Rahim's Comment:

The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) is defined in the ICANN Bylaws (Article XI, Section 2, Part 4) as "...the primary organizational home within ICANN for individual Internet users. The role of the ALAC shall be to consider and provide advice on the activities of ICANN, insofar as they relate to the interests of individual Internet users. This includes policies created through ICANN's Supporting Organizations, as well as the many other issues for which community input and advice is appropriate. The ALAC, which plays an important role in ICANN's accountability mechanisms, also coordinates some of ICANN's outreach to individual Internet users."

Comments/Questions:

1. Is there value in being referred to as the "primary organizational home within ICANN for individual Internet users"?
2. Is the purpose of making this distinction to separate the ALAC from entities within the non-commercial stakeholder groups in the GNSO?

Contrast this with the definition of the Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC) as a body that considers and provides advice on the activities of ICANN as they relate to concerns of governments, particularly matters where there may be an interaction between ICANN's policies and various laws and international agreements or where they may affect public policy issues.

A parallel to this GAC definition for the ALAC could be (based on edited extracted wording from the Bylaws):

(Option 1) The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) is a body that considers and provides advice on the activities of ICANN that relates to the interests of individual Internet users.

(Option 2) The At-Large Advisory Committee (ALAC) is a body that considers and provides advice on the activities of ICANN that relates to the interests of individual Internet users, which includes all ICANN policies and issues requiring community input and advice.

Darlene Thompson's Response:

I believe that there is value to this statement. The GAC does not consult with individuals or grass roots organizations. Because they are government, they think that they know what is best for their people without any/much consultation whatsoever. Due to the way that At-Large is structured, we can reach many more individuals and grass roots organizations than government would even try to do. As for your second point, yes, I think that was the purpose when that wording was added quite some time ago. Either way, as this is in the ICANN By-Laws, I believe it is beyond the remit of this group to change.

Rinalia Abdul Rahim's Reply:

Hi, Darlene. Thank you for providing the answer to my second question.

For the Group - An explanation on my posting:

1. The Bylaws' definition is provided as is for the use of the DSDT (I am aware that changing the ICANN bylaws is not in our remit - at least at this point in time 'alt="(smile)" class="emoticon emoticon-smile" data-emoticon-name="smile v:shapes="_x0000_i1025">)
2. The questions/comments are posed so that the answers can help new ALAC members understand the context of why certain things are the way they are or phrased in a particular way.
3. The options in terms of simplified definition of the ALAC, which is consistent with the Bylaws, is provided to fuel thought. There are many ALAC working documents that require a description of the ALAC in brief and simple terms and sometimes the full definition of the ALAC (as per the Bylaws) may not be useful or effective for communication purposes (Yes, not exactly the remit of the definitions work either, but still worth flagging in my opinion for the record).

[S3]Holly's Comment: Suggests the merging of ALS and RALO

[S4]Holly's Comment: Suggests deletion of motion. *Delete definition (if we are to keep this document simple, we do not need a definition. If anything, the only provision that would make sense is to state the obvious rule that anyone who is a member of the ALAC may propose a Motion)*

[S5]Rudi Vansnick's Comment:

I would suggest to make a distinction between Member and Delegate. If I'm not wrong, all ALSes are member of the At-Large Advisory Committee, while the Delegate is an elected member with voting rights in the At-Large Advisory Committee. A member in this case must be seen as an organisation representing a group of people, while an individual from within an organisation will be chosen as a Delegate to the ALAC. This would, I think, help outsiders to better understand the differences and allow them to see how the membership of ALAC is composed.

Holly's Comment: Suggest deletion of Delegate. Member of the At-Large Advisory Committee – *delete definition. We do not need a separate term for individuals who may participate in an ALAC meeting but are not an ALAC Member*

[S6]Holly's Comment: Member of the At-Large Advisory Committee *either selected by a RALO or by the NomCom*

[S7]Holly's Comment: Suggests the merging of ALS and RALO

[S8]Alan Greenberg advised via his review that the term was scrapped by the ALAC.

Holly's Comment: *delete definition*

Sala's Response: We have to submit everything we see within the existing definitions as is. This will be scrapped however. Think about how this affects the Special Rapporteur within the existing RoP. Unless the decision was also to scrap the Special Rapporteur.

[S9]Holly's Comment: Suggests the deletion of the word Resolution

[S10]Alejandro Pisanty's comment:

How close can we get to an IETF "hum" in defining rough consensus? How does it work online and offline?

When is the timestamp applied to a "rough consensus" decision? Face-to-face meeting or electronic - email, forum, etc.?

Holly's Comment: *The definition of rough consensus is both too wordy and unhelpful. Shorten to be 'the dominant view of the group, as determined by the Chair'*

Sandra: I made an "review" on the GNSO, just copy pasted from <http://gns0.icann.org/en/about>, which I think made GNSO very clear. If this finds approval, I propose to do it the same way for other groups.

1. The ALAC

1.1 Role and Responsibilities of the ALAC

1.2 Composition of the ALAC

- **1.2.1 Executive Committee**
- **1.2.1.1 Appointment of Chair**
- **1.2.1.2 Appointment of Vice Chairs**
- **1.2.1.3 Appointment of Special Rapporteur**
- **1.2.2 Limitation of Powers or Scope**

1.3 Sub- Committees

- **1.3.1 ALAC Administration Sub-Committee**[\[S2\]](#)
- **1.3.2 ALAC Meeting Logistics Sub-Committee**[\[S3\]](#)
- **1.3.3 ALAC Elections, Selections & Appointments Sub-Committee**[\[S4\]](#)
- **1.3.4 ALAC Policy Sub-Committee** [\[S5\]](#)
- **1.3.5 ALAC Communications Sub-Committee**
- **1.3.6 ALAC Finance Sub-Committee**[\[S6\]](#)
- **1.3.7 ALAC Community & Outreach Sub-Committee**
- **1.2.8 ALAC Technology Sub-Committee**

1.3. ALAC Meetings

- **1.3.1 Types of Meetings**
- **1.3.2 Conduct of Meetings**

[\[S1\]](#)Definitions

[\[S2\]](#)Responsible for Administration and seeing that things run smoothly

[\[S3\]](#)This can ensure that the Agenda for the Meeting is community driven as well as coordinating with At Large Staff ; ALAC and At Large community

[\[S4\]](#)Selection of Liaisons and engaging open and transparent mechanisms to enable people within the At Large Community to apply

[\[S5\]](#)Responsible for Review and Scheduling. Jean Jacques had suggested this as two separate ones but have merged it for now

[\[S6\]](#)Suggestion by Jean Jacques

--- begin ccNSO (Olivier) 26 Aug 2012 ---

The country code Names Supporting Organisation (ccNSO) is a body within the ICANN structure created for and by ccTLD managers. It is described in article IV, Section 1 of the ICANN bylaws as being responsible for:

1. developing and recommending to the Board global policies relating to country-code top-level domains;
2. Nurturing consensus across the ccNSO's community, including the name-related activities of ccTLDs; and
3. Coordinating with other ICANN Supporting Organizations, committees, and constituencies under ICANN.

OCL: It is my recommendation to agree with this definition.

--- end ---