

At-Large IDN Variant TLDs – LGR Procedure Implementation – Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1 Workspace

Comment Close Date	Statement Name	Status	Assignee (s) and RALO(s)	Call for Comments	Call for Comments Close	Vote Announcement	Vote Open	Vote Reminder	Vote Close	Date of Submission	Staff Contact and Email
30.04.2014	IDN Variant TLDs – LGR Procedure Implementation – Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1	ADOPTED 13Y, 0N, 0A	Rinalia Abdul Rahim	21.04.2014	25.04.2014 23:59 UTC	28.04.2014 05:00 UTC	28.04.2014 05:00 UTC	01.05.2014	02.05.2014 23:59 UTC	03.05.2014	Naela Sarras naela.sarras@icann.org

For information about this PC, please click here [>>](#)

Comment / Reply Periods (*)

Comment Open Date:
3 March 2014
Comment Close Date:
30 April 2014 - 23:59 UTC
Reply Open Date:
01 May 2014
Reply Close Date:
21 May 2014 - 23:59 UTC

Important Information Links
[Public Comment Announcement](#)
[To Submit Your Comments \(Forum\)](#)
[View Comments Submitted](#)

Brief Overview

Originating Organization:
ICANN
Categories/Tags:

- IDN Variant TLD
- Internationalized Domain Names (IDN)
- New gTLD

Purpose (Brief):

ICANN is releasing for public comment version 1 of the Maximal Starting Repertoire (MSR-1). The MSR is the first deliverable under the "[Procedure to Develop and Maintain Label Generation Rules for the Root Zone With Respect to IDN Labels](#)" [PDF, 772 KB] (the Procedure). Community members and specifically those working on Internationalized Domain Names, including IDN ccTLD and new gTLD applicants, as well as experts working on the development of Label Generation Rules are kindly asked to provide feedback.

Current Status:

To support IDN variants in the root zone, the ICANN community, at the direction of the Board, undertook several projects to study and make recommendations on their viability, sustainability and delegation. One of these projects is the implementation of [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB] allowing for the development of Label Generation Rules (LGR) for the Root Zone. The LGR for the Root Zone is a mechanism for creating and maintaining rules with respect to IDN labels for the DNS root zone. This mechanism will be used to determine which Unicode code points are permitted for use in U-Labels in the root zone, what variants (if any) are deemed allocatable and what variants (if any) are automatically blocked.

Next Steps:

Before any generation panel starts the work, the integration panel established the maximal set of code points for the root zone, that ICANN is currently releasing for public comment. The MSR is the first deliverable from the Integration Panel under [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB] and it will serve as a fixed collection of code points from which Generation Panels will make a selection in constructing the repertoire for their respective LGR proposals. In accordance with [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB], "Generation panels must not include in their proposed repertoires any assigned code point that is not included in the maximal set of code points for the root zone defined by the integration panel."

Staff Contact:
Naela Sarras
[Email Staff Contact](#)

Detailed Information

Section I: Description, Explanation, and Purpose:

As first deliverable under the "[Procedure to Develop and Maintain Label Generation Rules for the Root Zone With Respect to IDN Labels](#)" [PDF, 772 KB] (the Procedure), ICANN is releasing for public comment version 1 of the Maximal Starting Repertoire (MSR-1). The contents of MSR-1 and the detailed rationale behind its development are described in "[Maximal Starting Repertoire – MSR-1-Overview and Rationale](#)" [PDF, 398 KB].

Instructions for Reviewers

The MSR is a subset of IDNA 2008 PVALID code points for Unicode 6.3 (latest version of the Unicode Standard). As stated in the Procedure, the code points included are not restricted for identifiers in Table 1 of UTS#39 and must not be used for writing an excluded script. The MSR was further adjusted by following the prescriptions of [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB] in eliminating code points not eligible for the root zone.

In very general terms, where the Integration Panel was not able to resolve the status of a code point, it has tended to retain it in the MSR, to allow Generation Panels to perform a more thorough review, which might perhaps justify the inclusion of such code points in the LGR.

As a result, the mere presence of a code point in the MSR does not indicate that the Integration Panel considers it acceptable for inclusion in the LGR. In contrast, the absence of a code point affirms that the Integration Panel has determined that the code point is not appropriate for the DNS root, or, in the case of certain scripts, the panel has decided to defer it to a future version of the MSR.

Reviewers of the MSR are encouraged to carefully review the MSR documents listed below, as the MSR-1, once published, will be immutable. Communities that disagree with the choices that the Integration Panel has made in the MSR-1 as presented here are advised to raise any issues during the public comment period, and to provide a rationale for adding or removing specific code points. After the public comment period, the MSR-1 will be frozen for the purposes of developing LGR-1. Updates to the MSR-1 are anticipated only for future versions of the LGR, as described in the next section.

Future Development

The work that will be developed for integration in the first version of the LGR (LGR-1) will be based on MSR-1. If it becomes necessary to stage the release of the LGR, for example because not all Generation Panels are able to submit proposals at the same time, subsequent versions of the LGR may be released.

MSR-1 defers some of the eligible scripts, so as to balance timeliness with comprehensiveness. At some future point in time, another version of the MSR will be developed to include the deferred repertoire. MSR-2 would be the foundation for any LGR versions developed after its release.

All future versions of the MSR and all versions of the LGR must retain full backwards compatibility, such that they preserve the output of any label registration against the old LGR, when applied to an updated LGR or anLGR resulting from a later version of the MSR. Repertoire that has not been used for label registration is not required to be retained in future versions.

It is important to note that, while the expectation is that registrations predating the initial release of an LGR for the respective script will be allowed to remain in place even if they were to conflict, there is no requirement for an initial LGR to be compatible with them or to consider them precedents.

Section II: Background:

To support IDN variants in the root zone, the ICANN community, at the direction of the Board, undertook several projects to study and make recommendations on their viability, sustainability and delegation. One of these projects is the implementation of [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB] allowing for the development of Label Generation Rules (LGR) for the Root Zone. The LGR for the Root Zone is a mechanism for creating and maintaining rules with respect to IDN labels for the root. This mechanism will be used to determine which Unicode code points are permitted for use in U-Labels in the root zone, what variants (if any) are allocatable and what variants (if any) are automatically blocked.

The MSR is the first deliverable from the Integration Panel under [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB] and will serve as a fixed collection of code points from which Generation Panels may make a selection in constructing the repertoire for their respective LGR proposals. In accordance with [the Procedure](#) [PDF, 772 KB], "Generation panels must not include in their proposed repertoires any assigned code point that is not included in the maximal set of code points for the root zone defined by the integration panel."

Section III: Document and Resource Links:

- [Maximal Starting Repertoire – MSR-1-Overview and Rationale.pdf](#) [PDF, 398 KB]
- [MSR-1-Annotated-Han-Tables-20140227.pdf](#) [PDF, 43.7 MB]
- [MSR-1-Annotated-Hangul-Tables-20140227.pdf](#) [PDF, 4.24 MB]
- [MSR-1-Annotated-non-CJK-Tables-20140227.pdf](#) [PDF, 1.86 MB]
- [MSR-1-Repertoire+WLE-Rules-20140225.xml](#) [XML, 123 KB]. Some browsers may behave differently when opening a xml file. If you are unable to view the content, please download the file and try different browsers or tools available for xml file reading.

Section IV: Additional Information:

N/A

(*) Comments submitted after the posted Close Date/Time are not guaranteed to be considered in any final summary, analysis, reporting, or decision-making that takes place once this period lapses.

FINAL VERSION TO BE SUBMITTED IF RATIFIED

Please [click here](#) to download a copy of the pdf below.

FINAL DRAFT VERSION TO BE VOTED UPON BY THE ALAC

ALAC Statement on the IDN Variant TLDs – LGR Procedure Implementation – Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1

The ALAC notes the progress made in the implementation of the Root Zone Label Generation Rules Project, specifically:

- Issuance of the Maximal Starting Repertoire (MSR) Version 1 by the Integration Panel;
- Completion of a standardized XML format to represent Label Generation Rules (LGR) for the Root Zone;
- Responses from Language Communities through efforts to form script Generation Panels.

We recognize that the project is crucial for ensuring that the Root Zone is able to support IDN variants, which are applicable for scripts and languages used by a large proportion of the world's population.

We are greatly encouraged by the success of the Arabic script community in forming a Generation Panel to address a script that is shared by many languages across Africa, North Africa, East Asia, South Asia and the Middle East. We are also heartened by indications of mobilization by the Chinese, Japanese, Korean and Indic communities towards forming their script Generation Panels.

Based on our observations, as well as feedback received from various language communities, we wish to highlight some issues of concern that require urgent attention in moving the project forward.

Meeting Demand for IDN TLD

The Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1 covers 18 scripts requested by new IDN gTLD applicants. The Generation Panels that are already formed and in the process of being formed do not match the demand.

We view the lack of response from the Cyrillic, Greek, Georgian, Hebrew, Lao, Latin and Thai communities as of the ICANN 49 meeting in Singapore to be a matter of concern. We urge ICANN to take action to address the gap.

Our recommendations to the ICANN IDN Variant TLD Program Team are as follows:

- Work together with the ICANN Global Stakeholder Engagement Team and reach out to the target language communities to raise their awareness about the project and encourage Generation Panel formation.
- Provide a briefing to the Governmental Advisory Committee, the Country Code Top Level Domain community and regional associations as well as the At-Large Regional Organizations to seek their support in reaching out to the target communities.
- Work with the ICANN Communications Team to simplify key documents related to the Root Zone Project to aid community understanding and community-initiated outreach.
- Provide concrete examples of how Generation Panels can be formed by sharing/highlighting the successful experience of Generation Panel/s already formed as part of the community briefing kit.
- Facilitate or enable appropriate facilitation to support the collaboration of language communities that share a script to form a Generation Panel or for communities with related scripts to resolve joint issues if a request for facilitation is received.
- Ensure that language communities that share a script are all represented in a script Generation Panel.
- Leverage on the Internet Governance Forum (global and regional) to widen awareness about the project and the need for language community participation.

Feedback on Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1

We commend the Integration Panel for producing a Maximal Starting Repertoire (MSR) in a format that is easy for language communities to understand and use. The MSR clearly outlines three sets of code points: 1) those that are ineligible for the Root Zone, 2) those that should be included, and 3) those that should be excluded based on the rationale provided by the Integration Panel.

We note that the Integration Panel intends to “freeze” the MSR version 1 after this call for public comment. We advise against freezing script segments of the MSR without receiving sufficient input from language communities either via a script Generation Panel or from the script community in general if no Generation Panel has been established.

We request that the Integration Panel provide confirmation to the community that subsequent versions of the MSR may include an expanded set of possible code points based on the review and input received from language communities.

We believe that a version-release timeline should be published for the MSR and LGR (i.e., a designated time period and cycle for releasing updated versions), which can be used by language communities to plan their submissions as well as to expect version updates.

We call on the Integration Panel to ensure that its work does not discriminate against language communities with a smaller number of speakers by limiting letters or characters for inclusion in the Root Zone to only those used by languages spoken by large populations.

FIRST DRAFT SUBMITTED

(Draft prepared by Rinalia Abdul Rahim and submitted on 19 April 2014)

ALAC Statement on IDN Variant TLDs – LGR Procedure Implementation – Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1

The ALAC notes the progress made in the implementation of the Root Zone Label Generation Rules (LGR) Project, specifically:

- Issuance of the Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1 by the Integration Panel;
- Completion of a standardized XML format to represent Label Generation Rules for the Root Zone;
- Responses from Language Communities in forming script Generation Panels.

We recognize that the project is crucial for ensuring that the Root Zone is able to support IDN variants, which are applicable for major languages used by the global population of Internet users.

We are greatly encouraged by the success of the Arabic script community in forming a Generation Panel to address a script that is shared by many languages across Africa, North Africa, East Asia, South Asia and the Middle East. We are also heartened by indications of mobilization by the Chinese, Japanese, Korean and Indic communities towards forming their script Generation Panels.

Based on our observations as well as feedback received from various language communities, we wish to highlight some issues of concern that require urgent attention in moving the project forward.

Meeting Demand for IDN TLD

The Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1 covers 18 scripts requested by new IDN gTLD applicants. The Generation Panels already formed and in the process of being formed do not match the demand.

We view the lack of response from the Cyrillic, Greek, Georgian, Hebrew, Lao, Latin and Thai communities as of the ICANN 49 meeting in Singapore to be a matter of concern. We urge ICANN to take action to address the gap.

Our recommendations to the ICANN IDN Variant TLD Program Team:

- Work together with the ICANN Global Stakeholder Engagement Team and reach out to the target language communities to raise their awareness about the project and encourage Generation Panel formation.
- Provide a briefing to the Governmental Advisory Committee, the Country Code Top Level Domain community and regional associations as well as the At-Large Regional Organizations to seek their support in reaching out to the target communities.
- Work with the ICANN Communications Team to simplify key documents related to the Root Zone Project to aid community understanding and community-initiated outreach.
- As part of the community briefing kit, provide concrete examples of how Generation Panels can be formed by sharing/highlighting the successful experience of Generation Panel/s already formed.
- Facilitate or enable appropriate facilitation to support the collaboration of language communities that share a script to form a Generation Panel or for communities with related scripts to resolve joint issues if a request for facilitation is received.
- Leverage on the Internet Governance Forum (global and regional) to widen awareness about the project and the need for language community participation.

Feedback on Maximal Starting Repertoire Version 1

We commend the Integration Panel for producing a Maximal Starting Repertoire (MSR) in a format that is easy for language communities to understand and manage. The MSR clearly outlines the set of code points that is ineligible for the Root Zone. It also clearly outlines the set of code points that the Integration Panel has defined as possible for inclusion as well as those that should be excluded based on provided rationale.

We note that the MSR will serve as a “fixed collection of code points from which Generation Panels may make a selection in constructing the repertoire for their respective LGR proposals” based on what the Integration Panel has determined to be possible for inclusion. We also note that the Integration Panel intends to “freeze” the MSR version 1 after this call for public comment.

We advise against freezing script segments of the MSR without receiving sufficient input from language communities (i.e., via a script Generation Panel or from the script community in general if no Generation Panel has been established).

For subsequent versions of the MSR and LGR, we support the suggestion that there be a designated release timeline (i.e., a designated time period for release of updated versions where language communities can plan their submissions as well as expect updates to be published).

We also request that the Integration Panel provides confirmation that subsequent versions of the MSR may include a superset or expanded set of possible code points based on the review and input received from language communities.

END