

CCWG ACCT WS2 Meeting #2 (12 July 2016 @ 20:00 UTC)

Attendees:

Members: Andreea Todoran, Athina Fragkouli, Becky Burr, Cheryl Langdon-Orr, Finn Petersen, Fiona Asonga, Jordan Carter, Jorge Villa, Julie Hammer, Kavouss Arasteh, Mathieu Weill, Olga Cavalli, Pedro da Silva, Robin Gross, Samantha Eisner, Sebastien Bachollet, Steve Delbianco, Tijani Ben Jemaa (18)

Participants: Aarti Bhavana, Alain Bidron, Alberto Soto, Anne Aikman-Scalese, Avri Doria, Brett Schaefer, Chris LaHatte, Chris Wilson, Daniel Appelman, David Maher, Mavid McAuley, Edward Morris, Farzaneh Badii, Ghislain DeSalins, Greg Shatan, Guru Acharya, Isabel Rutherford, John Curran, Julf Helsingius, Keith Drazek, Klaus Stoll, Lito Ibarra, Matthew Shears, Michael Karnanicolas, Niels ten Oever, Pär Brumark, Phil Buckingham, Philip Corwin, Rudi Daniel, Sabine Meyer, Siva Muthusamy, Sonigitu Ekpe, Stephen Deerhake, Tatiana Tropina, Tom Dale (35)

Legal Counsel: Holly Gregory, Nancy McGlamery, Rosemary Fei (3)

Observers & Guests: Chris Hemmerlein, Elizabeth Andrews, Erin Dorgan, Phil Morano, Ryan Carroll, Taylor RW Bentley

Staff: Bernard Turcotte, Berry Cobb, Brenda Brewer, Grace Abuhamad, Karen Mulberry, Marika Konings, Nigel Hickson, Theresa Swinehart, Trang Nguyen, Yuko Green

Apologies: Lori Schulman, Jimson Olufuye, Leon Sanchez, Thomas Rickert, Vinay Kesari

Please let Brenda know if your name has been left off the list (attendees or apologies).

Transcript

- [DOC](#)
- [PDF](#)

Recording

- [Adobe Connect Replay](#)
- [mp3 Recording](#)

Agenda

1. Welcome, SOI
2. Articles of Incorporation : finalize submission
3. Appointment of rapporteurs for WS2 – next steps
4. Legal Cost Control Mechanism : initial discussion
5. AOB
6. Closing

Notes

Mathieu Weill only co-chair in attendance

AOI

- Review of comments from lawyers on draft comments. FUTURE vs FURTHER - drafting issue and mention is as such. Holly Gregory - this is a typo and should be pointed as such. MW - agree.
- Article 2 MAY vs SHALL on GPI. Holly Gregory - believe MAY is the appropriate word legally. In no way used to suggest anyone else could decide the GPI. Rosemary Fei - agree.
- Brett Schaefer: I thought Greg's suggested text is much clearer: Such global public interest may be determined from time to time. Any determination of such global public interest shall be made by the multistakeholder community through an inclusive bottom-up multistakeholder community process.
- Mathieu Weill - do we really need to make a change - wordsmithing should be left to lawyers?
- Brett Schaefer - although the lawyers agree this text is not only for lawyers but needs to be clear for all readers. Support Greg Shattan's proposed text. Given the debate around this it is not clear - therefore Greg's text would clarify. supported by GS and RG.
- Kavouss Arasteh - both texts are correct but GS text is clearer.
- Sivasubramanian - Question for legal experts - when defining GPI - what is the extent of specificity for this definition that is required?
- Rosemary Fei - can support the GS proposal.
- Mathieu Weill - given both are acceptable but since our community seems more comfortable with the GS version and as such we should recommend that this text be used. This should close the comments from the CCWG.
- [ACTION ITEM - Co-Chairs to submit comment to ICANN public comment on AOI as per above discussion](#)
- Brett Schaefer - can we see the explanation document for the changes.
- [Mathieu Weill - ACTION ITEM - staff to recirculate answers to CCWG questions to the CCWG.](#)

WS2 - presentation of slides

- Rapporteurs - recently added Jordan Carter to help Avri on Staff Accountability as well as Chris Wilson for transparency. Co-chair's recommendation to accept all of these.

- Kavous Arasteh - important that these colleagues must maintain impartiality and neutrality.
- Mathieu Weill - indeed. important part of rapporteur's function which have to facilitate the exchanges with the community and help report on these. WS2 - Next steps - closing the Google doc now and this will be the basis for the pages and the email lists.

Legal Cost Control Mechanisms - presentation of slides.

- Robin Gross - we should re-instate the original CCWG legal committee.
- Kavous Arasteh - if something works well keep it - so did it? Re ICANN legal - should be able to attend all meetings but not at decision.
- Mathieu Weill - current arrangement is only the co-chairs and this may be appropriate for WS1. For WS2 we need a more open process. Seems there is traction for the original legal committee (no objections).
- **Budget Ownership** - Mathieu Weill suggests legal Committee.
- Tijani BenJemaa - do not agree with the legal committee - mgmt of budget should be done by Co-Chairs. Kavous Arasteh - Agree with Tijani this would overload the Legal Comm.
- Mathieu Weill seems to be a clear direction.
- **Allocation of Requests** (slide) –
- Kavous Arasteh - could be a combination of both.
- Sebastien Bachollet - we need to take advantage of the ICANN legal team since we are in a different situation vs WS1 at this point and support option 1 - maybe also ask them for best external resources.
- Mathieu Weill a blended option would seem to be the best way forward.
- Tijani Ben Jemaa - problem with 2 will be the speed of response - best to use option 1.
- Mathieu Weill - understood and could be part of a blended solution.
- Holly Gregory - whose budget is this?
- Mathieu Weill need clarity from ICANN legal on this point.
- Kavous Arasteh - still think a blended solution would be best.
- Mathieu Weill - this is the intention.
- Tijani Ben Jemaa - Holly has a very important point.
- Mathieu Weill - useful discussion to help draft a common solution over the coming days and then we will circulate to the group. If necessary, we can have a special second reading on this.
- **Action Item co-Chairs and PCST is draft an approach and circulate to the list and ICANN legal and external counsel and organise a call if necessary.**
- Holly Gregory - committed to work most efficiently but concerned about option 1 given we will not participate in all calls etc. so it may take longer to get up to speed.
- Sam Eisner - from an ICANN legal POV we are looking forward to get the best legal advice. ICANN legal has a lot of experience as to how to frame questions and manage external experts - we stand ready to help the CCWG in WS2.
- Mathieu Weill - Bylaws drafting demonstrated this.
- Kavous Arasteh - common advice of both externals was useful in the previous arrangements.
- Pedro da Silva - similar to KA it is probable that we will reach out to expertise that is beyond to what we have used so far - so the legal committee needs to be independent to be able to do this.
- Mathieu Weill - noted.
- Tijani Ben Jemaa - main point is the budget restrictions is critical - as such we should be most efficient.
- Mathieu Weill - closing the discussion on this point - a blended option 3 would address most of the points raised at this meeting and we should be able to find a reasonable balance - will be shared on the list and there will be a call if necessary.

AOB

- Kavous Arasteh - meeting before each ICANN meeting?
- Mathieu Weill - we have this agreement - just need to confirm the dates.
- **ACTION ITEM - Staff to confirm the dates for ICANN 57 CCWG WS2 meeting ASAP**
- **ACTION ITEM - Develop process to allocate the travel slots.**
- Kavous Arasteh - The day of the meeting depends on the type of the ICANN meeting depending on A, B, C - need to consider this.
- Tijani Ben Jemaa - Cannot have a CCWG meeting inside the 7 meetings for a C meeting.
- Holly Gregory - description of Sidedly expertise.

Closing Remarks

- Mathieu Weill - We need to gather all the rapporteurs to get things going. We will reach out to the rapporteurs to get a meeting date.

Meeting Adjourned – Mathieu Weill

Action Items

- **ACTION ITEM - Co-Chairs to submit comment to ICANN public comment on AOI as per above discussion**
- **ACTION ITEM - staff to recirculate answers to CCWG questions to the CCWG.**
- **ACTION ITEM - co-Chairs and PCST is draft an approach and circulate to the list and ICANN legal and external counsel and organise a call if necessary.**
- **ACTION ITEM - Staff to confirm the dates for ICANN 57 CCWG WS2 meeting ASAP**
- **ACTION ITEM - Develop process to allocate the travel slots.**

Documents

- [CCWG 12 July Plenary.pdf](#)

AC Chat

Brenda Brewer: (7/12/2016 14:41) Welcome all to the CCWG ACCT WS2 Meeting #2 on 12 July @ 20:00 UTC!

Kavous Arasteh: (14:55) Hi Brenda

Kavouss Arasteh: (14:55) Hi all

FIONA ASONGA (ASO): (14:56) Hallo All

Julf Helsingius: (14:56) Hi

Rudi Daniel: (14:56) Hi to All

Sabine Meyer: (14:57) hello everyone

Becky Burr: (14:57) hello all - just in adobe room but not on audio for a bit

Edward Morris: (14:57) Hi everybody.

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair: (14:58) Hello everyone

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (14:58) Greetings from foggy San Francisco!

Sonigitu Ekpe: (14:58) Good evening everyone from Calabar, Nigeria.

Sabine Meyer: (14:59) Well if Mathieu leaves blue unclaimed...

Pedro da Silva - [GAC Brasil]: (14:59) Hello everyone!

David McAuley (RySG): (14:59) Hello all

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair: (14:59) Blue is yours Sabine

SivasubramanianM: (14:59) Hello All

Rosemary Fei, Alder Colvin: (15:00) Hello, everyone.

Sabine Meyer: (15:00) Merci beacoup Mathieu!

Sabine Meyer: (15:00) *beaucoup

Niels ten Oever: (15:00) Hi all

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:00) hi all

Tatiana Tropina: (15:01) hello everyone!

Tom Dale (ACIG GAC Secretariat): (15:01) Hello everyone

Pedro da Silva - [GAC Brasil]: (15:02) @Mathieu: "Allez les Bleus" :-(

Sabine Meyer: (15:02) Too. Soon.

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:02) ho

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:03) There is high level echo

David McAuley (RySG): (15:03) No echo here Kavouss

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:03) Can echo be removed

Tatiana Tropina: (15:03) No echo for me, the sound is clear.

nigel hickson: (15:03) good afternoon

Athina Fragkouli (ASO): (15:04) hello all!

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:04) Dear all,

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:04) There is a high level of ECHO

jorge villa (aso: (15:05) Hi Athina, hello everyone

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:05) good old Mathieu, thank you for chairing on your own

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:05) hi everyone

Julf Helsingius: (15:05) no echo here

Farzaneh Badii: (15:05) Kavouss it must be your end. we are not getting any.

Tatiana Tropina: (15:05) Now there is echo

Stephen Deerhake (.as): (15:05) Now I'm getting the echo...

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:05) oh wow, just got that echo

Sabine Meyer: (15:05) Jordan, that sounds almost like a Robyn cover

Daniel Appelman: (15:05) I'm attending

Sabine Meyer: (15:05) (not the echo, the "just chairing on my own" bit)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:06) ALAC had previously RE-Confirmed its 5 Members from WS! as Continuing as Members for WS2 Mathieu... That was some time ago though :-)

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:06) Echo was not emanated from my side

Brett Schaefer: (15:09) I thought Greg's suggested text is much clearer: Such global public interest may be determined from time to time. Any determination of such global public interest shall be made by the multistakeholder community through an inclusive bottom-up multistakeholder community process.

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:09) Since the term "from time to time" is used, the term may be the appropriate one

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:09) I agree, Brett.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:10) the meanings are the same

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:10) *same

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:10) I don't mind which text we land with, aside from a general bias towards brevity

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:12) I prefer to be clear about what we mean and not leave room for multiple interpretations, so we need to say any such determination shall be determined by the BUMP

Greg Shatan: (15:12) My bias is toward clarity....

Greg Shatan: (15:13) Then brevity. I think we got too abbreviated, which made things unclear. (See my email about why this was both technically correct and difficult to read).

Greg Shatan: (15:14) I apologize that I am in two meetings and unable to speak in this one.

Avri Doria: (15:16) sorry for the multiple starts, had to reboot. can listen, but cannot speak today. i am also in two meetings (IGF MAG being the other)

Steve DelBianco [GNSO - CSG]: (15:16) Greg's text adds some clarity. But I am okay with the single sentence version

matthew shears: (15:16) I also support Greg's language - it is clearer

Guru Acharya: (15:16) I also support Brett/Greg's text

Tatiana Tropina: (15:16) +1 from me for Greg's text

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:17) go with the longer version

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:17) fine with Greg text

Steve DelBianco [GNSO - CSG]: (15:18) BC support for these Articles of Incorporation relies upon ICANN Legal Department's written statement that "organized under" has the same meaning as "incorporated under".

Steve DelBianco [GNSO - CSG]: (15:23) @Brett -- Sam Eisner's email on AoI is here <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/accountability-cross-community/2016-June/012714.html>

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:23) I fully agree with Holly

Brett Schaefer: (15:24) Thx, Steve.

Steve DelBianco [GNSO - CSG]: (15:25) Chris Wilson

Chris Wilson: (15:25) Yes, me :)

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:26) and me - sorry about being slow to the party, I was trying to work out an area to help that best matches some work I am doing at home, and staff accountability was it

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair: (15:27) Welcome Chris !

Niels ten Oever 2: (15:28) Happy to confirm my commitment and greatly looking forward to work on the human rights Fol with Nigel and Paul

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:29) Confirming my willingness and ability to serve as Rapporteur

Sebastien (ALAC): (15:29) I confirm my availability and commitment

Grace Abuhamad: (15:29) We'll launch the mailing lists now that we have confirmed Rapporteurs! Thanks all

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:29) Pledging so long as it doesn't end up like WP1!!!

FIONA ASONGA (ASO): (15:29) I am happy to confirm my commitment to serve impartially.

Edward Morris: (15:29) As do I with the CEP

Farzaneh Badii: (15:30) confirm my availability

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:30) I may subscribe for more groups than I have announced.

Greg Shatan: (15:30) I am confirming and pledging as well.

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:30) Pls instruct the rapporteur to kindly accept such posterieur announcementz

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:33) such whats?

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:35) We should reinstate the legal committee we had previously set up.

Farzaneh Badii: (15:35) agree with Robin

Edward Morris: (15:36) Agree with Robin. Best functioning group I've experienced at ICANN.

Sabine Meyer: (15:36) the key to this magic might have been the brevity of its existence ;)

Edward Morris: (15:36) :)

Farzaneh Badii: (15:37) Does being as member or observer affect costs?

Grace Abuhamad: (15:37) Yes, the CWG-Stewardship Client Committee consists of the two Chairs (non-lawyers) + Greg Shatan and Maarten Simon (both lawyers)

Grace Abuhamad: (15:37) (My comment was in response to Mathieu, not Farzaneh, for the record)

David McAuley (RySG): (15:38) Agree w Robin

Grace Abuhamad: (15:41) Here you go: <https://community.icann.org/x/VAQdAw>

Greg Shatan: (15:42) Happy to serve again on the CCWG Leagl Committee....

Edward Morris: (15:42) As would I.

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:42) Agree, Mathieu, am happy to join again.

David McAuley (RySG): (15:42) Me too

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:42) Move forward with the previois model, get Members to confirm willingness of course

Greg Shatan: (15:43) *Legal*

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:43) typo sorry cure = course

Pedro da Silva - [GAC Brasil]: (15:45) I also agree with re-establishing the Legal Committe, but we should give the opportunity for new volunteers to join as well

Bernard Turcotte Staff Support: (15:46) loudly

FIONA ASONGA (ASO): (15:46) yes tijani we can hear you

Rudi Daniel: (15:47) I would like to suggest a separate budget committe perhaps as just said...coaches..

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:47) Agree with Tijani

Sonigitu Ekpe: (15:47) +1

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:48) Legal services are only part of the budget, so I don't see the entire budget being within its remit, a separate cmte or co-chairs should manage overall budget

Edward Morris: (15:48) +1 Robin

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:48) exactly Robin/Ed

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:49) I prefer option 2, since the need for independence is a key factor

Sabine Meyer: (15:50) agree

Edward Morris: (15:50) Same here.

Keith Drazek: (15:50) I support using ICANN Legal as a first step, generally speaking. I was more concerned about independence during WS1. ICANN Legal should have some skin in the game in trying to keep costs down, no?

Tatiana Tropina: (15:50) +1 to Robin, option 2

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:51) we have a budget to work within, so we will have to make requests cost efficient, but not lose our right to ask outside council first if we feel it is necessary

Sabine Meyer: (15:51) Option 2 accounts for that, to my understanding.

Tatiana Tropina: (15:51) Keith, but option two actually includes this

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:51) Yes to Opt 2

Greg Shatan: (15:51) I vote for option 2 as well.

Edward Morris: (15:52) Under option 2 questions can certainly be referred to ICANN legal in first instance after consideration of all variables, including costs.

Greg Shatan: (15:52) With all due respect, there's a reason we engaged independent counsel in the first place.

Keith Drazek: (15:52) I didn't suggest we waive our right to seek external/independent advice.

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:53) we have issues like transparency and staff accountability on our plate. of course we need independence as much in WS2 as we did in WS1

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:53) That is how I undersatnd it Edward yes thus my choice

Alberto Soto: (15:53) Hi, Sorry for being late

Greg Shatan: (15:53) Keith, Option 11 gives ICANN legal a right of first refusal on all legal advice.

Keith Drazek: (15:53) I'm just saying it might be more efficient to start with ICANN legal and then escalate as needed.

Guru Acharya: (15:53) I also support Option 2. However, if such discretion is with the legal committee, then the sub head of legal costs should also be owned by the legal committee. The legal committee should be aware of the costs before authorising a request so that they may prioritise when needed.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:53) I think its ablended solution

Edward Morris: (15:53) @Robin. Not to mention CEP which ICANN legal has a direct interest in.

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:53) we should not tie our hands with option 1.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (15:54) it will always be useful to know what ICANN legal thinks, but we always need the capacity to get independent advice where the committee sees value

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:54) Keith I saw that as a part of a well Mx Opt 2 though

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:54) good point, Ed.

Keith Drazek: (15:54) That's not how I read it, Greg.

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:54) This is what I did suggest

Greg Shatan: (15:54) Keith, I think that Option 2 gives the Committee the right to make that determination on a case by case basis. Option 1 is much more directive..

Stephen Deerhake (.as): (15:54) +1 Jordan.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:54) Merger of text may make cleaer though let's see what new text cn be "created"

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:54) We did not come this far to waive our right to independent counsel.

Keith Drazek: (15:55) Ok, that's fine. I did not suggest waiving anything, and that was not my understanding of the options.

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:55) That's how I see it, Greg.

Kavouss Arasteh: (15:55) Mathieu, could we think of a combination of elements of both options and look at that at our next meeting as this is not top urgent

Philip Corwin: (15:56) Prefer option 2. While ICANN legal can always provide their POV, Committee should be free to seek external legal advice when appropriate

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:57) That's an important point. We are billed for Jones Day too.

Keith Drazek: (15:57) Good clarifying question, Holly.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:57) A *good* reason to go with Opt 2 then

Sebastien (ALAC): (15:57) Good point Holly

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (15:57) so observe that issue with any Opt 3

Philip Corwin: (15:58) That means that asking ICANN Legal for an opinion will not avoid cost being incurred if they in turn request JD input

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (15:58) so we get billed for the legal advice we don't get to see....

Sebastien (ALAC): (15:58) With all the comments co-chairs can build an option 3

Farzaneh Badii: (15:59) How about we write out the option to reach out to Jones Day!

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (16:00) ICANN's legal advice should only come out of CCWG budgets if/where it is responding to CCWG needs. This budget should not cover ICANN legal costs related to ICANN responding to the CCWG's work.

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:00) Agreed, Farzi.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (16:00) Is there clarity about what is covered?

Avri Doria: (16:00) makes no sense for this budget to include Jones Day

Brett Schaefer: (16:00) If we ask advice of JD -- who exactly is their client? The CCWG or ICANN?

Greg Shatan: (16:00) Their client is ICANN, Inc.

Avri Doria: (16:01) first foremost and always.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (16:01) But as it does Avri *and I agree it makes me worry* it needs to be closely monitored/mngd make sure any Opt 3 covers proper control issue or we risk JD being a budget bck hole

Greg Shatan: (16:01) The intertwining of direct costs of the CCWG and the overall accountability and IANA transition costs is troublesome.

Kavouss Arasteh: (16:02) A 30 -45 minutes dedicated meeting would suffice if there would be a combined draft

Brett Schaefer: (16:02) If the cost is not really reduced and they are not a CCWG client, then why seek their advice instead of Sidley or Adler?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (16:02) Yes Greg obviously that worries some of us from a transparency POV

Greg Shatan: (16:02) We can't be responsible for ICANN's use of JD to advise ICANN.

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:02) There is no way we can accept option 1. We simply must retain our independence.

Greg Shatan: (16:02) Agree with Robin, Option 1 is a non-starter.

Edward Morris: (16:02) Exactly Brett.

Greg Shatan: (16:03) Information about facts/history can be distinguished from legal advice.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (16:03) Opt 2 with some minor modification re our discussions to make a new Opt 3.. as we agree I believe noting ICANN Legal (INTERNAL) as an early option , and noting Holly's current points of course re time for responses

Greg Shatan: (16:03) Getting the first from ICANN legal is sensible.

Greg Shatan: (16:04) But that still should be left to the Committee's discretion.

matthew shears: (16:04) Agree option 1 is a non starter

Kavouss Arasteh: (16:04) A compromise option should ensure the independency of CCWG TO ANY PARTICULAR ENTITY

Pedro da Silva - [GAC Brasil]: (16:04) Agree with you, Kavouss

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (16:05) Noted and understood Rosemary/Holly and Legal Committee should Mx

Kavouss Arasteh: (16:06) A great amount of expenses is associated with legal costs thus we should be quite carefull

Sabine Meyer: (16:06) thank you for sharing that insight, Rosemary

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (16:08) Hi sorry my connection went down for a while

Steve DelBianco [GNSO - CSG]: (16:09) Apologies but I must move to another call at this time.

Pedro da Silva - [GAC Brasil]: (16:12) @Tijanni: I fully understand your budget concerns, but we also need to think that we may need expertise that cannot be provided by the legal firms that have been supporting us so far

Brett Schaefer: (16:13) I need to go, bye all!

Guru Acharya: (16:13) +1 Pedro

Pedro da Silva - [GAC Brasil]: (16:13) Tijani*

Rudi Daniel: (16:13) +1 also Pedro

Greg Shatan: (16:13) Work Stream 1 was essentially a corporate governance project, which drove the need for extensive legal advice and work. I would expect policy-related WS2 topics to need little legal advice, except if Bylaws are needed to carry out their recommendations.

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (16:14) and legal advice can be obtained in a coherent way and asking the right questions, rather than fact-checking per se

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:14) Right, Greg, we don't have nearly the legal issues to grapple with that we did in WS1 and the corporate model for ICANN.

Keith Drazek: (16:14) Agreed

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (16:15) Early date confirmation highly appreciated

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:16) and ICANN is providing travel support for CCWG Accountability members to Hyderabad?

Anne Aikman-Scalese (IPC): (16:16) @Greg and Robin: Jurisdictional issues will be quite complicated - e.g. issue of CA sole designator - how does that translate to other legal systems?

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:17) how many less travel slots for ccwg members is that?

Rudi Daniel: (16:17) have to leave now...thankyou all

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:17) ok -so about the same, thanks.

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:18) I reckon this means there are no travel slots for rapporteurs?

Farzaneh Badii: (16:18) I agree Anne, the amount of legal advice depends mainly on WS2 topics.

Anne Aikman-Scalese (IPC): (16:19) Human Rights might also be heavy on legal.

Mathieu Weill, ccNSO, co-chair: (16:19) Not guaranteed at this time, we need to discuss as part of the process

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:20) It would be good to understand the expertise of Sidley and Adler, do they have HR lawyers?

Farzaneh Badii: (16:20) That's a good question Niels

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:20) With expertise in intl human rights law?

Greg Shatan: (16:20) Taling with IPC right now -- WS2 volunteers need to be added to the main email list now.

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:21) That would be lovely

Tatiana Tropina: (16:21) +1 to Niels

Anne Aikman-Scalese (IPC): (16:21) All WS2 volunteers also need to be informed of the meeting the day before each ICANN meeting.

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:22) When is the plan for that happening?

Kavouss Arasteh: (16:23) Mathieu, Congradulation on handling the meeting alone

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO): (16:23) Good Meeting all Looking fwd to getting our WS2 activities fully underway ASAP... Talk again soon then Bye for now...

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (16:23) thanks all!

Jordan Carter (.nz, ccNSO): (16:23) ciao!

David McAuley (RySG): (16:23) Thanks Mathieu, staff, and all, bye

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:23) Thanks all!

matthew shears: (16:23) thanks

Farzaneh Badii: (16:23) thanks bye

Niels ten Oever 2: (16:23) bye!

Olga Cavalli - GAC Argentina: (16:23) thanks Mathieu!!

Tatiana Tropina: (16:23) bye all! thanks!

Avri Doria: (16:23) bye, thanks

Robin Gross [GNSO - NCSG]: (16:23) Thanks, all, bye!

Anne Aikman-Scalese (IPC): (16:23) TThank you Matthieu!

nigel hickson: (16:23) thanks

Alberto Soto: (16:23) Thanks!! Bye

Rosemary Fei, Alder Colvin: (16:23) Bye.

Greg Shatan: (16:23) Bye all!

Stephen Deerhake (.as): (16:23) Cheers!

Sonigitu Ekpe: (16:24) thank you and bye

Andreea Todoran: (16:24) Thank you!