

### **Attendance - 13 Members**

Anne Aikman-Scalese  
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair)  
Crystal Ondo  
Donna Austin, Neustar  
Jamie Baxter | dotgay  
Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair)  
Jessica Hooper  
Jim Prendergast  
Kathy Kleiman  
Martin Sutton  
Matthew Crossman  
Michael Casadevall  
Robin Gross

**Apologies:** Katrin Ohlmer

**Staff:** Emily Barabas, Julie Hedlund, Steve Chan, Julie Bisland

### **AC Chat:**

Julie Bisland: Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Group A call on Thursday, 06 December 2018 at 20:00 UTC

Julie Bisland: Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/1AXuBQ>

Robin Gross: We've got a quorum of participants.

Jim Prendergast: makes sense - the question did ask for new ideas and we got them.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair): YES it depends on the idea and if it is in our scope

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair): the Full WG will then decide what does or does NOT make it into the Final Report

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair): which is subject to PC

Kathy Kleiman: Tx Robin and Jeff and Cheryl!

Anne Aikman-Scalese: Could staff paste a link to this doc since it's hard to see it and monitor chat at the same time.? I'd like to put the doc on my second monitor.

Steve Chan: Sure Anne, here: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_docs.google.com\\_spreadsheets\\_d15zDdzlBwLCz5m2sNXui6N6pporbUq-2DIDFEwfh4rKi4A\\_edit-23gid-3D110404450&d=DwlCaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=0LHt-3OsQ4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=H5NeoKK2PSbT0poChhxFygkilXzrt5De3RXD76z1-tE&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d15zDdzlBwLCz5m2sNXui6N6pporbUq-2DIDFEwfh4rKi4A_edit-23gid-3D110404450&d=DwlCaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=0LHt-3OsQ4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=H5NeoKK2PSbT0poChhxFygkilXzrt5De3RXD76z1-tE&e=)

Donna Austin, Neustar: I think there is a distinction between the full WG and the full community. The members of the WG has signed up to participate and will ultimately discuss ideas to see if we can reach consensus and then provide recommendations to the community for consideration. I don't believe it is the full community that needs to discuss new ideas.'

Steve Chan: @Jeff, as well as to determine if the comments are categorized (Concerns, New Idea, etc.) properly as well.

Kathy Kleiman: Line 29?

Anne Aikman-Scalese: I agree with Donna but it's possible there is a new idea that is so revolutionary that we think it deserves public comment.

Martin Sutton:Kathy - pg 8, you can scroll through

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):It seems like there are a couple of things that seem to be jumping out. (i) Case by Case basis, (ii) use existing mechanisms to the extent possible (iii) looking at urgency/impact

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):i will call in

Anne Aikman-Scalese:I would just note that under existing policy and procedure, any Council member can invoke a process to bring a policy implementation issue before the GNSO. new ideas have to be considered in light of this framework that was already adopted by the Board.

Kathy Kleiman:There is deep disagreement on the Standing IRT

Kathy Kleiman:What I was hoping is that some of the "new ideas" might provide a roadmap to comprise.

Kathy Kleiman:But right now, one SG and EFF and Public Knowledge have objected (among others)

Kathy Kleiman:I seem to recall that

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):It seemed to me that the biggest worry was that this standing IRT would talke on a policy role. The initial report did not state that the standing IRT would make policy

Kathy Kleiman:Anne said in Barcelona that one person's implementation is another person's policy. Do I recall correctly?

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@kathy - that is why we need an Standing IRT to consider the issue. If you read the Policy and IMplementation Working group Final Report, there is a full discussion of this issue and a full analysis of how various issues came up in the 2012 round. This is how the existing mechanisms such as GNSO INput, GNSO Guidance, and GNSO EPDP came into existence.

Michael Casadevall:Agreement with Kathy here

Kathy Kleiman:what line?

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@Kathy - nothing will be dismissed; but if people in the group believe tht the comments raised mischaracterize what was in the report, then (i) we should make sure the group clarifies what it meant, (ii) we go back to the objector and explain what was intended; (iii) find out from the objector if there is any room for compromise.

Kathy Kleiman:Can we ask ALAC for more details?

Kathy Kleiman::-)

Michael Casadevall:@Jeff: it's concerning that when we see objection across the board, and we just move right along; there was a lack of support at all for that, and that comment is again repeated in a bunch of other sections.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Agree there is support for STanding IRT

Michael Casadevall:I wasn't referring to the IRT in general, but "one more round" specifcally which was solid red. I'll get off this for now

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@michael - you mean on having additional TLDs in general?

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):sorry, just trying to clarify

Michael Casadevall:2.2.3.d.4/6 is what I was referring to. One positive comment, bunch of negative.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: I think we may need to ask the ALAC liaison to clarify this comment.  
COMMENT

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@michael - ah...we havent gotten there yet...we are still on 2.2.2

Michael Casadevall:did I skip ahead? I'm running on all of two hours of sleep :(

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@michael - yep

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@Kathy - which line again

Steve Chan:@Kathy, to the extent you can help us identify which sections belong where, that's extremely helpful to us.

Kathy Kleiman:Hi Jeff, I thnk we are in line 35... ?

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@Kathy - right, which line from the NCSG did you want put into this section as well :)

Steve Chan:And @Kathy, the comments from Public Interest Community as well, that might make sense for 2.2.2.e.5?

Kathy Kleiman:@Steve and Jeff -- Too much multitasking -- after call? :-)

Steve Chan:Yes, of course!

Jim Prendergast: id say this is a little L liasion situation for the RysG comment

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):yep

Kathy Kleiman:possible not to use acronyms -- for full WG, e.g., GIP

Steve Chan:@Jeff, I added the word "applicant" to what you just commented to? Is that sufficient?

Jim Prendergast:and from now on - Im using (III) for the little L liasion

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):Thanks jim, we will go with III (but that looks like 111 or III)

Steve Chan:String confusion!

Jim Prendergast:convene a string confusion panel?

Jim Prendergast:bring back the SWORD algorithm

Kathy Kleiman:deferring to after Anne's comment

Jim Prendergast:ill let Kathy go ahead of me as mine is not directly related ot this

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):Way to kick the can @jim

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@Kathy - I think the concerns about GNSO Policy Development of the GNSO may be deeper than with IRTs ;) [That was a joke by the way]

Anne Aikman-Scalese:I did not draft this comment. I was trying to clarify, as an active member of the Policy & IMplementation WG that any Council member can raise concerns re IRT action when it is being considered. If people don't know that, then it needs to be advertised.

Martin Sutton:agree with Jeff

Donna Austin, Neustar:Is it in the wrong spot?

Kathy Kleiman:@ Anne, in that case, I think the IPC runs with the ALAC comment -- flagging decisions that may be borderline policy/implementation to make it easy for the public/Council to see -- and object to.

Steve Chan:The comments are literally identical I believe.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Indeed Donna they are distinct entities

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):The wording was identical

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):But the same points re proposals are to be noted as "same"

Donna Austin, Neustar:@Jeff, I understand the wording is identical, but the comments were submitted by three separate entities.

Donna Austin, Neustar:It's a judgement call by the WG for sure, but we need to be careful of how we characterise them.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:The IRT can certain flag and recommend. The GNSO Council can also identify issues and any Council member can initiate. Important to note that there were changes to ICANN's ByLaws to accomplish these processes. GNSO Input process here:

[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_gnso.icann.org\\_sites\\_default\\_files\\_file\\_field-2Dfile-2Dattach\\_annex-2D3-2Dinput-2Dprocess-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=4npFleiKlsvpb7I56K1chAxaq6jAPFVq0yoiVExZQkg&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_gnso.icann.org_sites_default_files_file_field-2Dfile-2Dattach_annex-2D3-2Dinput-2Dprocess-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=4npFleiKlsvpb7I56K1chAxaq6jAPFVq0yoiVExZQkg&e=)

GNSO Guidance here: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_gnso.icann.org\\_sites\\_default\\_files\\_file\\_field-2Dfile-2Dattach\\_annex-2D5-2Dggp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=di5beLIABZfQg56J8gxkFtDnoIUNuukKRCIEfPOqu9w&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_gnso.icann.org_sites_default_files_file_field-2Dfile-2Dattach_annex-2D5-2Dggp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=di5beLIABZfQg56J8gxkFtDnoIUNuukKRCIEfPOqu9w&e=)

GnsO Expedited PDP : [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_gnso.icann.org\\_sites\\_default\\_files\\_file\\_field-2Dfile-2Dattach\\_annex-2D5-2Dggp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=di5beLIABZfQg56J8gxkFtDnoIUNuukKRCIEfPOqu9w&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_gnso.icann.org_sites_default_files_file_field-2Dfile-2Dattach_annex-2D5-2Dggp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=di5beLIABZfQg56J8gxkFtDnoIUNuukKRCIEfPOqu9w&e=)

GnsO Expedited PDP : [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_gnso.icann.org\\_sites\\_default\\_files\\_file\\_field-2Dfile-2Dattach\\_annex-2D5-2Dggp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=di5beLIABZfQg56J8gxkFtDnoIUNuukKRCIEfPOqu9w&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_gnso.icann.org_sites_default_files_file_field-2Dfile-2Dattach_annex-2D5-2Dggp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3Osq4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydxmSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=di5beLIABZfQg56J8gxkFtDnoIUNuukKRCIEfPOqu9w&e=)

[3A\\_gnso.icann.org\\_sites\\_default\\_files\\_file\\_field-2Dfile-2Dattach\\_annex-2D4-2Depdp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QIF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3OsQ4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydymSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=ZiYLBv9dWZG8xgs9zTsrHBuEia203sQuiHoNcbgBvNM&e=](https://www.gnso.icann.org/sites/default/files/field-2Dfile-2Dattach_annex-2D4-2Depdp-2Dmanual-2D18jun18-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QIF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=OLHt-3OsQ4VzxHsx6u1AgeT5wmcydymSkdsc2FUGhgE&s=ZiYLBv9dWZG8xgs9zTsrHBuEia203sQuiHoNcbgBvNM&e=)

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):I agree @Donna, we will be careful in both ways - namely, not give overweight or underweight on these

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):@Anne - But there are limits to the scope of the GNSO IRT process you have up there

Jim Prendergast:is that an IP address?

Steve Chan:@Jeff, correct

Steve Chan:Identical

Kathy Kleiman:Back to multitasking (and still in Predictability Framework). To Steve's earlier question: Re: request for additions to 2.2.2.e.5, I think we can copy over lines 14 and 21 (NCSG and public interest) into comments after 35 and flag as disagreement. (Not erasing their current lines, but revisiting them for these new and relevant sections?) That should be pretty accurate.

Kathy Kleiman:Tx!

Kathy Kleiman:multitasking

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):modification /proposal ot contingent to agreement it seems

Emily Barabas:yes, these categories are a bit of a blunt tool

Emily Barabas:it's more of an additional consideration than a worry

Kathy Kleiman:Have to leave a little early -- bye all!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):indeed Emily as we found in some other Sub Groups as well ;-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Bye Kathy

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Thanks everyone pretty good progress today... Bye for now...

Robin Gross:Thanks all, bye!

Julie Bisland:\*\*The next Sub Group A: Thursday, 13 December 2018 at 15:00 UTC for 90 minutes.

Martin Sutton:thx Robin et al

Anne Aikman-Scalese:THanks all.