

### **Attendance - 10 Members**

Anne Aikman-Scalese  
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair)  
Christa Taylor  
Donna Austin, Neustar  
Jessica Hooper  
Jim Prendergast  
Kristine Dorrain  
Rubens Kuhl  
Vanda Scartezini

**On audio only:** Juan Manuel Rojas

**Apologies:** Katrin Ohlmer

**Staff:** Emily Barabas, Julie Hedlund, Nanig Mehranian, Michael Karakash, Steve Chan, Julie Bisland

### **AC Chat:**

Julie Bisland:Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures PDP - Sub Group B call on Tuesday, 04 December 2018 at 17:00 UTC

Julie Bisland:Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/ogTuBQ>

Vanda Scartezini:hi all. in a train so will connect to listen only alternative to avoid noise

Donna Austin, Neustar:where is cell 38?

Steve Chan:Google doc is available in the agenda pod, but also here directly:

[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_docs.google.com\\_spreadsheets\\_d\\_133WbhWYB4M4kT6DqSfiCR2-2Dij7jxNkJ5EWZL-2DNA95M\\_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB\\_UYInlydmFjNmBM5XgySw&m=DBviT5-ULURWpCPysCA2MRbKxTIwv1VvzKznW\\_iizVo&s=DOADWshbbNytIzP\\_TnGHPNPbmZdzsUPxVDPS6GfCSVk&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_133WbhWYB4M4kT6DqSfiCR2-2Dij7jxNkJ5EWZL-2DNA95M_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QiF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFjNmBM5XgySw&m=DBviT5-ULURWpCPysCA2MRbKxTIwv1VvzKznW_iizVo&s=DOADWshbbNytIzP_TnGHPNPbmZdzsUPxVDPS6GfCSVk&e=)

Steve Chan:We are on 2.5.1.c.4 now

Donna Austin, Neustar:thanks Steve

Jim Prendergast:hand

Steve Chan:Christa is referencing cells in the Google doc, so probably easier to follow along there rather than on the doc in the AC room

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Agree with Jim P, these two columns would be helpful in all Subgroups - Parking Lot and Suggested Action

Jim Prendergast:cell 47

Steve Chan:That looks to be a mistake, as far as I can tell.

Steve Chan:Or too many hands in the shared Google doc :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):;-)

Jim Prendergast:did we lose audio?

Kristine Dorrain:I'm not hearing anyone?

Steve Chan:@Jim, fixed as you probably saw. Thanks, that caught my eye as well.

Rubens Kuhl:Line 53

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: Although this is a substantive comment, I'll venture to make it anyway. The issue of "warehousing" is going to be very directly related to application fees.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Yes - the new idea of RrSG should be raised with the full group.

Jim Prendergast:christa?

Rubens Kuhl:Is INTA comment an agreement or disagreement ?

Rubens Kuhl:It says the agreement will be referred to WG...

Kristine Dorrain:For 2.5.1.e.2, its not a recommendation, so I think it's hard to agree or disagree. It's merely an open ended question.

Kristine Dorrain:yep, thanks!

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: WG needs to consider how the "Auction Proceeds" solution may address the IPC comment re "advance the public interest" if those funds could be used there.

Kristine Dorrain:@Anne, the Auction Proceeds are a totally different budket

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Yes - thank you.

Kristine Dorrain:bucket

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@Donna - I can go back and ask the IPC about this comment. (I cannot remember who drafted it and so I don't know.)

Donna Austin, Neustar:Thanks Anne--a definition or an indication of what the IPC considers to be in the public interest would be helpful.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):line 63

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@Donna - OK - I'll ask on the full list.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@ Steve chan - there is a link in the IPC comment - maybe it explains a prior position taken on this issue re "public interest". Anne

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):line 67

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):line 71

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@Donna - just as an aside, I doubt anyone but the ICANN Board can actually determine the public interest but I believe it would have to be limited by ICANN's Mission.

Steve Chan:@Anne, I've added a noted in the Suggest Action column to state: Review full comment to determine if public interest might be defined

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Thanks Steve. (Just realized the link is to the full comment.)

Donna Austin, Neustar:@Anne, as the IPC is using the term, they should explain their definition of what it means.

Rubens Kuhl:@Anne, I think ICANN Board punted the public interest question to multiple community efforts, including SubPro (in the case of closed generics)... so I wouldn't take for granted of them raising up to define it.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Yes - Donna - I will ask for a clarification.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):76

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):line 81

Kristine Dorrain:So we're just referring the SSAC comment then?

Kristine Dorrain:Thanks, I agree with that

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):85 and we will fix the cell contents

Anne Aikman-Scalese:@ Staff - THere is aproblem with the document on the screen. It's incomplete

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Yeah a whole tab completed in your run through!!!

Rubens Kuhl:Document looks complete in my AC session... browser is Firefox, AC running with Flash support.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Tab 2.5.2

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):line 3 ( keeping up my job ;-)

Rubens Kuhl:And considering the simplified financial evaluation that seems to be the WG likely path, evaluating a brand or an Open TLD would have the same effort.

Jim Prendergast:Who is Public Interest Community?

Rubens Kuhl:Jim, It is signed:

Rubens Kuhl:"Please find attached the comments of the Public Interest Community on the Initial Report on the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Policy Development Process.-- Mitch StoltzSenior Staff Attorney, EFF"

Jim Prendergast:thx

Rubens Kuhl:"We are free speech advocates, academics, and lawyers with expertise in social structures, global rules,intellectual property, and ethics law and policy."

Rubens Kuhl:"Sincerely yours,Electronic Frontier FoundationSamuelson-Glushko Canadian Internet Policy & Public Interest Clinic (CIPPIC)Public KnowledgeMartin Silva Valent, Esq., Partner @ Silva.legal, Founder @ Datas [www.dat.as], Professor at Universidadde Palermo, GNSO Councilor at ICANN\*Kathryn A. Kleiman, Center for Information Technology Policy, Princeton University\*Leah Chan Grinvald, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law, Suffolk University LawSchool\*Eve J. Brown, Of Counsel at Barton Gilman LLP, Professor at Roger Williams University\*A. Michael Froomkin, Laurie Silvers & Mitchell Rubenstein Distinguished Professor, University of MiamiSchool of Law\*Bryan Bello, Center for Media and Social Impact, American University\* Affiliations provided for identification purposes only"

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Govt of India and BRG comments have to be referred to the full WG

Rubens Kuhl:It was the commenter ID.

Rubens Kuhl:From a comment Jim asked whom made it.

Rubens Kuhl:Nope, don't read that...

Jim Prendergast:not needed - was just answering a question I had

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):line 17

Rubens Kuhl:They are marked "Action Taken: TBD based on full WG discussion"

Rubens Kuhl:So that's a yes on referring.

Rubens Kuhl:It's explicitly stated in those two comments they are being referred.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Thanks Christa!

Rubens Kuhl:Was Line 16 read ?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):I mentioned it was not Rubens ;-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):But it is slated to refer to full WG

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Line 24

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Line 31

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):You can do it CHrista :-)

Jim Prendergast:shes a runner - she'll run through the finish line

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair)::-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):run

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Great work people :-)

Julie Bisland:\*\*The next Sub Group B: Tuesday, 11 December 2018 at 20:00 UTC for 60 minutes.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Thank you Christa, Cheryl, staff et al!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Thx Juliw

Rubens Kuhl:Great work Christa, bye all!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (PDP Co-Chair):Bye for now