

---

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Good morning, good afternoon and good evening, everyone. Welcome to the LACRALO monthly teleconference call on Monday the 17th of December 2018 at 23:00 UTC. On the call today we have Sergio Salinas Porto, Harold Arcos, Alexis Anteliz, Maritza Aguero, Hamzah Haji, Diolia Graziano, Eliecer Acevedo, Javier Chandia, Sharon Emptage, Vrikson Acosta, Reina Granados, Carlos Leal, Ricardo Holmquist, Aida Noblia, Marcelo Tellez, León Sanchez, Lilian Ivette De Luque, Vanda Scartizini, and Sylvia Herelein.

On the English channel, we have Maureen Hilyard and Dev Anand Teelucksingh. We have received apologies from Lito Ibarra, and also have Mark Datysgeld and Sávyo Morais on Spanish. From the staff, we have Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, Daniel Fink, and myself, Claudia Ruiz on call management. Our interpreters are Veronica and David, Bettina and Esperanza. I would like to remind everyone to please state your name before speaking for transcription purposes and also so the interpreters can identify you on the other language channels. And with this, I turn it over to you, Sergio. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you, Claudia. Good morning, good afternoon, good evening. Thank you for your time and participation in this call. This is the last meeting of this year. This is a special meeting for that reason, and because we have many topics to deal with during this meeting. There are many topics that we need to address today.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

We have a short period of time, so we will start with the first item on the agenda. This is the approval of the agenda, so I will ask Harold to read the agenda in order for the agenda to be approved. So, Harold, please go ahead. Thank you.

HAROLD ARCOS:

Thank you very much, Sergio. We are now sharing the agenda on the screen for you to be able to read it. We have the welcome, the roll call, then we have the presentation of the new working groups in LACRALO. Then we have a notice on the document of the operating principles. Sorry, I can hear someone speaking Spanish. Then we have the ALAC member report by Ricardo Holmquist, then we will have the presentation by León Sanchez. He will be speaking about the EPDP report.

Then we have Any Other Business, so in that case if there is anyone interested in mentioning any other item, that is the part of the agenda where you can add your item, and then we will have a webinar. In this case, we will be discussing the universal acceptance. This will be delivered by Mark and Sávyo. So with this, we'll finish with the agenda, and we therefore approve this agenda. Sergio, please go ahead.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you, Harold, for your comments. And if everybody agrees, we will begin with item number four, and this is the introduction of the new working groups in LACARLO. As you may know, in our previous meeting, together with Harold, we stated a new process within LACRALO, and

---

focus will be now based on the active participation, specifically on policies being discussed within ICANN.

So within this framework – as you know, this is a very important framework – and taking into account this situation or this framework, we created or we presented some working groups in order to address all the policy items for all the ALSes that are involved in our regions to be able to participate. And these ALSes need to be involved in at least one working group. This working group will work through mailing list, and every two months, there would be one teleconference. So this means that during the development of these activities, we will have to participate in ALAC working group.

These working groups were deeply considered by the members of the community. We decided to have a different strategy based on different meetings with different people and members from the region so as to consult with them and see the best way to work on this working group.

As you can see on the screen, these are the working groups that were created. The first one – I'm going to mention the names of these working groups. As you can see on the screen, we have domain names and their relationship with users. This working group is related to the GNSO. We believe that the leader of this working group should be Vanda Scartezini.

Then we have WHOIS and GDPR. This is a hot topic within ICANN, as you all know, so we have proposed Carlton Samuels as the leader of this working group. Then we have multilingualism and the IDN topic. This is really important for many of us who are here today, not only because of

---

the addition of certain characters such as the ñe or other particular traits of language, but we also need to take into account the African region, because they have many languages, many aboriginal languages, and they have a high impact on the Internet.

Then we have communication, and when it comes to IDNs, we also need to take into account that this is closely related to Guarani language, and the work that we do with these indigenous peoples. When it comes to the communication working group, this is a very important working group, because we need to inform about the advancements of the regions, but also, we need to inform about the activities of our organizations within the region. So this needs to be included, because it has a great impact on the Internet, but also, it has an impact on the activities that we do, and it has an impact on the strategy of our region. This is closely related to social media. We have an active member from the ALAC working on the Social Media Working Group, and we believe she might be the leader. She's [Lilian de Luque,] so we have asked her to be the leader, the chair of this working group.

Then we have the training working group. [Marcelo Telez] volunteered to be the leader of this work, because we know his history in terms of training. [Adrian] from his organization, he works on this topic, and when it comes to governance, the governance working group, as of today, we will start taking the opportunity to express our views based on consensus data. At the same time, we have to make a decision and we need to move forward in relation to other topic which is very important, and these are the rules of procedures. These operating principles need the rules of procedures for them to be applied. So we need the expertise of people from a legal background for them to be

---

---

part of this working group so that we can finish and we can move forward with our efforts in terms of having rules of procedures that needs to be related to the operating principles, and this should be passed before the end of this year.

So, I will keep on chairing this group, however, we need to have a different point of view. And although we will have six chairs or leaders, we will have to choose within each of these working groups, we need to choose or to elect the co-leaders or co-chairs of these working groups. And I would like to mention this because in the case of the government working group, we will share the task with Vanda, Vanda volunteered herself to do this, but we have also worked with her during the [inaudible] of the development of the rules of procedure. So I believe we can work together during this new stage.

Now I would like to give the floor to each of these leaders, the elected leaders, to take the floor for them to explain about these working groups, and then we can continue with the rest of the items of the agenda. So, the first working group is domain names and their relationships with users. This is related to the GNSO, so I would like to give the floor to Vanda Scartezini for Vanda to explain. So, Vanda, please go ahead. You can take the floor now. Thank you.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Thank you very much for this opportunity. We have already discussed this item or this topic. I have been involved with this issue of domain names and the relationship of domain names in the region for a long time now. We are now working to create a proposal. We are working to

---

present a proposal and a list of actions, and we're also discussing the time that we need to take into account for applicants to be part of this working group. So the idea of this working group is to share with all of you and with all the stakeholders the different activities, and of course, this group is also related to the rules of procedure working group and some other working groups.

So this working group is somehow separated from other working groups as well. Sorry, is my connection so bad? Can you please confirm that you can hear me?

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Vanda, sorry for interrupting you. You sound quite loud. Can you please lower your volume?

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

So as I was telling you before, there are many things to do. We expect to have different working groups, and the idea is to create this group so as to work – the idea is, as I said before, to share the information, and of course, to see the relationship and the way in which people interact in this working group, which is somehow quite complex.

There is plenty of information, but the idea is to share this information to provide detailed information, because the idea is to keep people informed about these topics for them to be able to directly participate from the region, because this is the only way in which people from our region can actively participate in ICANN. Thank you very much, Sergio,

---

for your words and for your interest in this working group. Thank you, everyone.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you, Vanda. I don't know if Carlton is on the call. Otherwise, I would like to give the floor to Marcelo Telez. Can you please confirm that Carlton is online?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Carlton is not on the line yet.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: I would like to give the floor to Marcelo Telez, but before that, I would like to reply to Alexis. Alexis, we have approved the rules of procedures. We had an amendment of the rules of procedures for individual members to participate in our region. So it would be a pleasure for us to have individual members on our working group even though they do not represent or belong to any ALS. So they are more than welcome to participate in this working group. This way of participation within the region is relatively new, but as we know, in the history of LACRALO, many individuals participating in the discussion of LACRALO, and they do not belong to any organization. So we have to continue with our act I've participation, and now that we have this opportunity, because they're not being considered by our current and future rules of procedures, the idea is to have individual users participating actively in our region. Can you please translate what Dev is typing so that I can

---

reply to him? I mean for those Spanish speakers before giving the floor to Marcello.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Well, I can read Dev's comment. The comment reads, "I repeat my objection as on the last call. We have five separate internal working groups, doesn't make sense when a lot of the work of these five working groups will be done in the standing ALAC groups. We have the Consolidated Policy Working Group, the outreach and Engagement Working Group, Social Media Working Group, and the Technology Taskforce. LACRALO members can be fully involved in these groups and share information with the wider LACRALO, the list and on the monthly call. The LACRALO Governance Working Group is the only internal working group that is necessary. Having internal parallel working groups is not practical." So that is Dev's comment. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you very much, Silvia. Thank you, Dev, for your input on the working group. Let me now give the group to Marcelo. Marcelo, are you there? We cannot hear you. Hello? Okay, it seems Marcelo has been disconnected. There was someone who was in the [detail meeting,] I don't know if that person is participating now of this call, Mr. Carballo. I don't see him on the list. Adrian Carballo, are you online? I don't really know if Olga can take the floor, because it's Adrian who has to speak, actually. Otherwise, we can just give the floor to Lilian. Lilian, can you speak?



---

LILIAN IVETTE DE LUQUE: Hello, how are you? I hope you can hear me. With regards the working group, I think it is more of a community work. It has to be a work done in coordination with the Social Media Working Group. I am the LACRALO volunteer, and my work is focused on activating social network and social media as a channel, not only for ICANN but for the end users, and to just keep them informed.

The social media are a very effective channel. This is a good channel for the newcomers and for those who want to get involved, not only with LACRALO work but also with the work in the other RALOs. I think we should also work on strategies to get more involved in events and calls and with ALS representatives to increase participation. There are many people who do not participate in anything, and we don't even know them.

So this is a coordinated work. If we work together with the other working groups, there will be no duplication of our efforts. We want the information to flow in the regions and we just don't want things to be repeated. We need to encourage the work in the region so that everybody knows about them. We have to be a more rationalized region and to have different [inaudible] of work, but we always need to respect the At-Large working group and to work together with them to avoid duplication. This is just what I wanted to say, and thank you very much for thinking about me, Sergio. I'm at your disposal for everything you may need.

---

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Lilian. I think Marcelo Telez is on the line. He was requesting a call. If he's on the line, I would like him to take the floor, and otherwise, I'm going to give the floor to Harold who had raised his hand. Harold, please go ahead.

HAROLD ARCOS: I hope you can hear me.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Whoever is speaking is speaking in a very low voice. Please speak up.

HAROLD ARCOS: Can you hear me now?

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Please go ahead, Harold.

HAROLD ARCOS: I just want to say that these working groups that we have discussed have had several calls in 2018 and in previous years, and they are not a duplication of other areas for participation. These are the necessary spaces within the region for the dynamic of the region that will encourage participation of new ALSes, new members, and these have to contribute to monitor the new initiatives for the community and for the ALAC.

---

In any case, there is no duplication of effort and there's no duplication of the targets of the group. Actually, it supplements them and it helps us to provide new statements on different issues. As Sergio was saying, these groups are flexible, and this is the first experience in a very long time that are materializing important issues. And we have always said these issues need to be dealt with in the region, so they are all welcome to get more involved in each of them, and I'd like to thank those who have shown their interest in getting actively involved in each of those issues. Sergio, you now have the floor.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you, Harold. I think we do now have Marcelo Telez on the line. Marcelo, are you there? Marcelo, we cannot hear you. It seems he's not on the line.

INTERPRETER: The interpreters apologize, we are having very serious sound issues.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: It seems there is someone with the phone and the microphone both on.

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: Hello. Good evening.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Ricardo, you have raised your hand, so you now have the floor. Hello, who is this?

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: This is Ricardo Holmquist.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Please go ahead, Ricardo.

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: I wanted to ask what Dev asked. And secondly, in the governance meeting we had, it was said that the people who are being named [as directors,] out of six of them, three are Argentinean, and so the [inaudible] one of them is Brazilian, there's one from the Caribbean, one from the [inaudible] regions, zero people from Central America. So I think the balance is not very good, and we're not even mentioning gender issues here. At least it's four to two.

I'm concerned that there is no diversity in the region and there is a significant representation of Argentina. Not only Argentina, but your ALS as well, because I understand you are in the governance working group together with Mr. Telez, and there's another ALS representing multilingualism. So I think there is too much concentration. And I repeat, I acknowledge the merit of everybody there, your merit, Marcelo's merit, Vanda's, Lilian's, and I recognize everybody's merits, but I think we should make an effort -or you should make an effort – to choose people who more properly represent the region.

And finally, I would love to know who chose these directors, who are the leaders who chose these chairs. I wanted to be part of those chairs, and I wasn't even called once, even though I was contacted on several

---

occasions. But there was zero communication for this issue in particular. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you for your comment. You are right when referring to the regional diversity, and actually, we didn't pay sufficient attention to that. Secondly, the leadership in the region is held by the chair and secretary, and there are also the ALAC members, but the leadership is held by the chair and secretary.

I think we can try and see if we can find the solution to this. You know very well that this will rotate, this has a beginning and an end, and each of these working groups will have a rotation. So if there is no parity with the rest of the regions in the first round, there will definitely be such parity in the second round.

I am no longer member of Internauta, and I'm now the chair of the region. So having such a limited outlook and saying that there are two members of Internauta, well, this is my situation right now. I'm not interested in having X organization or Y organization involved. I am trying to have a very comprehensive view, and I apologize to the region. I didn't realize there were three Argentinians there.

We have considered these members in the region based on their expertise and their skills. [Perhaps] I could not manage to put the necessary people there. I see Vanda has raised her hand, so Vanda, you now have the floor. I'm going to ask that you go away from your microphone so that we can hear you better.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: If they want to be a part of the cross-community working group, they can take it. I am here just saying that there was a conversation with Sergio that I am open to get involved there. Thank you very much.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you, Vanda. There's something else to be added there. The elections of these chairs needs to be confirmed in each of the groups. If there is a group that believes that one of the members should not be there, or if they believe that there are other people who should be held in these positions, then they can suggest them. We believe that these are people who are very experienced, they can have a power of action when we need them in the region.

And then another thing is we need to think there will be co-chairs, and those co-chairs will probably have a look at the regional diversity. So there will be sort of a double play there which will be interesting to see how this diversity of organizations and this diversity of people will work in our region.

I thought I would not say this, but I think I will. The working group, they are having teleconferences every week, because they're being involved in the ALAC group. And I think the [region] needs to have the individuals thinking of a person that is involved and a person that can have a comprehensive view of the region in order to be able to be a part of the debate and the decisions made within the ALAC.

---

So I think it's very good to have working groups in our region and to have an active region. Vanda, I think you've raised your hand again. Or have you forgotten to put it down? But I see also Carlos Leal and Maritza. Carlos, you have raised your hand. Please go ahead.

CARLOS LEAL:

Good afternoon and good evening. There still is room for co-chairs. I don't know if they want to be nominated, but it probably wasn't clear before that I want to propose the possibility of having proposals for co-chairs and give people the opportunity to participate and collaborate. This is our idea. I think this is the first part of the experience, because the process of saying, "I disagree," implies that there is some movement, there is democracy, and we can just work closer. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you very much, Carlos. Thank you for your words. I think Maritza wanted to take the floor. Maritza, you now have the floor

MARITZA AGUERO:

Thank you, Sergio. Harold has already replied to this. There was no call on – no announcement in the mailing list to be able to determine the working groups and the people who will head those groups. Harold has said, according to what I have read, that irrespective of what has been said, everything we wanted to announce in the previous leadership, we always published it to have the input of the community, [but] we need to be able to [drive this initiative] and to start the working group. That's all. Thank you very much.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Maritza. It's a pleasure to listen to you. Let's go to item number five, which is the call for voting for the document on the operating principles. We have undergone a review process of the document, the inputs, those inputs were taken into account, they were included as a part of the document that was voted on, and – so what we want now is that when people give their input on the operating principles, people can just be part of the debate. There has been a lot of debate. The work, according to everybody, was very good work. So we are now trying to get consensus on the document. We prioritized consensus over voting, and so we believe this will be very good progress for our region.

Hopefully, if they haven't received it, they will receive an e-mail that will be sent soon with this first document so that it is approved by consensus. So in that case, there will be no voting, and there will be a consensus and it will be approved that way. It is at your disposal. There is a Wiki. The last two documents with this correction have been posted on the Wiki. They include the input of the community, and so for us, it is an honor to be able to present this document. Many people have worked on it, there have been significant debates, there's the contribution and the input of many people who are now on the call and others who are not, but who have given their significant input. [inaudible], Carlton Samuels, Ricardo Holmquist, Alberto Soto, Vanda Scartezini. I don't want to forget anyone, but each of them has given their input. There's also Humberto Carrasco, Maritza, but what's important is we have it.



---

So all of this is a mix of experience, debate, etc., but it now materialized in two meetings, one of them in Los Angeles and then in San Juan, in Puerto Rico. [inaudible] was included there, and we managed to somehow put those ideas in order. I believe it is important that we take the time to read this, to read the document, and that we can give our support and provide consensus for this work. This is extremely important. There has to be some support from the whole region. This will be very important.

I'm sure today, you will receive the e-mails. there is an invitation for consensus approval, and we will call the governance working group, we will try to call all of the members who want to get involved in the group to finish their rules of procedure. So now, we're going to give the floor to Ricardo. Ricardo has an ALAC report. He's an ALAC member elected by NomCom. So Ricardo, you now have the floor, and you have 10 to 15 minutes to complete it. Thank you.

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: Hello. Can you hear me?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes, Ricardo. Please go ahead.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes. Go ahead, Ricardo, please.

---

RICARDO HOLMQUIST:

I know that you have the presentation on the screen. This is divided into two parts. On one hand, we have the ALAC work on the issue, and the other part of the presentation is about the policies and the advice requested to ALAC. And this is the ALAC advice to the different policies being developed.

So the first item, the At-Large review implementation working group, has finished its function. This was done two weeks ago. This review implementation has now been sent to the board for approval. There are some items, some topics that are related to the budget that need to be considered, so they are actively working on those items. An [important budget] was not requested, so some of these items were discussed before the formal implementation of this review. So they had been working on this issue for some time now, and there are some changes and modifications that will be available soon.

One of the changes affecting LACRALO was requesting LACRALO the fact of amending its bylaws to accept individual members. So we had been discussing this material in the working group.

The second item that we need to address is the Consolidated Policy Working Group. This was mentioned three months ago in one of the meetings, and within ALAC, this group is in charge of dealing with the policies and the advice, and the working group is working on the different replies. So it is really important for the people from the region to be involved in this working group.

Then when we see the chart, we will see that one individual member from Asia Pacific is the one replying to all the comments, but I don't see

---

why we cannot do exactly the same in Latin America. So I believe that we need to get more involved in these issues. And this is the right working group to do it.

Then we have the Expedited Policy Development Process on the temporary specification for the gTLD registration data. I know León Sanchez has prepared a presentation. We have the report by this working group, so it is very important for you to read this draft report on the working group, because at the end of the day, we will all be impacted by the work of this working group.

In Sergio's presentation, we had a WHOIS on the GDPR issue. So for Latin American people, when we see the word GDPR, we think about Europe, but we need to take into account that this is affecting us because we have a data protection regulation that is closely related to the WHOIS, and this is related to the GDPR. At the end of the day, for example, we will have a judge, for example, passing a sentence on the data protection issue, so we need to be on alert about these issues.

When it comes to other polices and when it comes to open public comments and advice, the first one is related to the use of the Red Cross and the Red Crescent names in all generic top-level domains, and all the names related to that sign as we know it. We know the Red Cross in Latin America. So as we know it today. And the working group is analyzing the way in which these names will be protected, the generic top-level domains. The contracted parties was closed yesterday, so this is a topic to take int account.

---

Then there is another public comment open, and this is the subsequent procedures policy development process, and the initial report. This has to do with working groups or work areas one to four. We need to be very careful about this, because this report covers the gTLDs and the different procedures [on auctions] that will be taken into account in the future. And of course, I'm going to mention this in the future.

Then we have the initial report of the expedited policy development process, or EPDP. I have already mentioned this. León will be delivering a presentation soon about this topic. I know that he's ready to start. The closing period for this public comment is December the 21st.

Then we have the transfer of domain names between registries and registrars. This is the status report, so there is nothing to comment. Then we have some other topics. These are not of vital importance, but this has to do with the dispute resolution system for domain names dispute resolutions. In this case, this topic is related to an issue raised in Canada.

And finally, we have the geo names working group or the work track number five. And this is a kind of supplement to the initial report. We know one of the co-chairs. This working group had very heated debate. This working group deals with geo names, so [inaudible] is working on this working group. So this is my report, and thank you very much for your time and your attention.

HAROLD ARCOS:

Thank you, Ricardo. Sergio dropped, so we are trying to reconnect him to the call. Now, we will be able to take questions from the audience.

---

Ricardo mentioned some important comments, and we need participation. So if you want to make any comment or any question, this is the right time for you to make your comment or question.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Harold, I am already connected to the call.

HAROLD ARCOS: Okay, Sergio. Welcome back. We are now in the Q&A session for Ricardo's presentation. But if there are no questions, we can continue with the agenda.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: I see there are no hands up or there are no comment for interaction within the chat regarding Ricardo's presentation. This presentation will be available for all the members in the region. Probably, it will be posted on the Wiki page. So now, we'll continue with item number seven of the agenda. We have our friend and colleague and member of the board, León Sanchez. He will be talking about the EPDP. So León, if you're ready, you have the floor, and you can continue.

LEÓN SANCHEZ: Thank you very much. Thank you, Sergio, and thank you, everyone, for inviting me to be part of this call. It is always good to be back home, and it's a pleasure for me to be part of these meetings. Can you hear me okay?

HAROLD ARCOS: Yes, we can hear you okay. Please go ahead.

LEÓN SANCHEZ: Okay. Let me speak about the draft report of this group known as the EPDP working group. The objective of this EPDP working group is to revise the temporary specification in relation to the gTLD registration data. As you know, this specification was issued in May this year, it was issued by the board, and the idea was to align the existing agreement of registries and registrars and ICANN so that they can comply with the General Data Protection Regulation known as the GDPR.

If it is possible, can you please upload the draft report? I know there is a version in Spanish. Or we can also upload the English version if you agree to do so. Any of the versions are available, so I would kindly ask you to upload any of the versions.

The idea is not to review every single aspect of this draft report, because as you know, this is a 100-page report, but at least we can have an overview of the main topics covered by the report. And let me remind you all that this is opened for public comments up to December the 21st. So this means that it will be open to comments up until Friday. So if LACRALO is willing to make any comment, it will be really important for you to take into account, this deadline, which is Friday, December 21st.

It is important to mention that comments will be provided in a new way. They are not going to follow the traditional format of comments. The

---

idea is this will be done through a Google doc, and some questions need to be replied so that the working group may be able to move forward with their deliberations and to fine tune all the recommendations that will be done to the board and to the GNSO in terms of these temporary specifications.

In a nutshell, this report includes 22 draft or preliminary recommendations, and this is important to mention, these are preliminary recommendations. This means that there is no consensus on the recommendations by the members of the working group. These are recommendations that were created with this report, so they have many footnotes, because there are some working groups that might not agree with the recommendations or that might not be in full support of the recommendations. So that's why it is important to take into account, and it is also important to take into account these [marginal notes] just to see the different opinions from the different members of other working groups.

Of course, you can read the attachments of this document where you will find further information on the document. You will find information about the [supporters] of the document, and apart from these 22 recommendations, there are eight questions being asked for the general public, and this is the part in which LACRALO or any other RALO may be able to provide feedback. You can provide your feedback by replying these questions.

So the first recommendation – let's scroll down – has to do with the purpose of the treatment of data. So these seven purposes that are detailed in the recommendation are related to the way in which data

are collected and processed by ICANN and by the different agents or actors within the ICANN ecosystem, and these are the registries, registrars and third parties that are related to data escrow.

So you can see in this case the different purposes, and the recommendation by the EPDP team is that they need to establish the rights of the domain name holder, and this should be done in a record so that the domain name holder may exercise the different rights based on the domain name and in order to be able to activate and to assign the domain name.

The second purpose is to maintain the security, stability and resiliency of the domain name system. This is in accordance with the ICANN's mission. And of course, these apply to third parties with a legitimate interest on the data elements, and in this case, after the EPDP process, they will have to control nonpublic data.

The third purpose is to enable communication with the domain name holder and/or with a delegate, and to allow any notification. The fourth purpose is to provide mechanisms to safeguard the name holder registration data in the event of a business or technical failure or other unavailability by registrar or registry operators. This means we have seen cases of registries or registry operators having some technical failure or experiencing some business failure. This means that you can continue with the operations of a [registrar – of registry operators.] So this is one of the purposes ,to have a kind of backup allowing to safeguard the information in case of an emergency. Of course, it has to be done in line with the purposes above mentioned.

---



---

The following purpose has to do with the handling of contractual compliance and monitoring requests, perform audits, submit complaints and some other uses within the Internet users' remit, for example for academic research or for the benefit of the stability and security of the Internet and for researchers in order to provide further stability and resiliency.

Then there is another purpose, and this is to coordinate and facilitate policies for dispute resolution in relation to the registration of domain names. We have an example, the UDRP or the URS. So this is another purpose that was identified as legitimate or justified purpose to collect data from domain name holders. Then, we have the validation process. This is to ensure that a domain name holder complies with the gTLD policies adopted by the registry operator.

As you can see, the main objective of this working group is to work on this expedited policy, and the idea is to specify the purposes for data treatment and collection identified in case of assigning or allotting top-level domain names. So the question for the community, the question by the working group and for the community, is whether these purposes are detailed or specific enough, and if it is not the case, if they are not specific enough, the question is, what is the proposal of the community to modify these purposes, and in case there is a proposal for modification, you need to provide justification. And this has to be in line with the GDPR.

And the other question is if there is any other purpose that needs to be added to this list. This is a list which is not limited to the purposes that were listed before. And perhaps from the comment posted or the

---

feedback provided by the community, there might be another purpose that might be added to this list, which has to be aligned with the GDPR. We need to take into account that any result being produced by this working group needs to be aligned with the GDPR or the General Data Protection Regulation.

Then we have other recommendations. As I said before, there are 22 recommendations. The second recommendation is really important. This recommendation is related to the questions that need to be replied by the group itself to determine whether the deliverable they're going to deliver is adequate or if there is any modification being required. So in this case, we have four questions. These are the gating questions or the preliminary questions to be address.

These are, what are the legitimate purposes? As you know, today WHOIS and before GDPR WHOIS worked in a way in which we were able to access a great deal of information by registrants, and data were exposed publicly. This is not the case today, but one of the questions that the group needs to reply is, what are the legitimate purposes that may give rise to a third party to be able to access this information? The question is, what are the eligibility purposes to access this nonpublic registration data?

Access to nonpublic data by investigation or security or policy agencies or law enforcement or intellectual property agency is mentioned, and as I said before, information provided to agencies investigating upon domain names, or perhaps [agents] investigating issues relating to domain names. So the question is, what are the eligibility criteria? How these criteria are established? And these are the questions that need to

be addressed ,and that's why comments by people, by the community are really important for the EPDP working group to be able to finish with its work and to comply with the GDPR. The other question is, who are the applicants? We may have different groups or parties that might need to have access but they are not recognized, so that information is also required.

The other important thing is to take into account the interested parties. Once we identify the different working groups, what is the [universal] nonpublic data where access is required? Of course, we need to identify users with a legitimate interest, and it's not the same as providing, for example, this information to law enforcement agency, or it is not the same, for example, the kind of information that a private researcher or an academic research will require. So this is another question to take into account.

I [might] go into the 22 recommendations. This is not the best way, and this is not something that we can do here, but I would like to give you the floor to ask any question or comment in case you have questions or comments. This is a new process. this is the first time this process is being carried out at ICANN, because it derives from new regulations.

The conception of this process is really flexible, and we need to be very cautious, because we're diving into unknown waters. And of course, we have to take into account different situations and precedents that we might set, or any other action. And of course, we need to take into account that we need a final policy within the set framework. As you know, this is something that we need to take into account, because there is a temporary specification that was required, and this temporary

---

---

specification might be ratified for a period of 12 months, but once this temporary specification is due, then the contracted parties will no longer be bound to follow that process, and then this might give rise to different consequences and situations.

So I believe it is really important that you read all the recommendations, that you pay attention to the questions. There are 11 questions to take into account, and of course, we have a limited period of time. The deadline is Friday. So, Sergio, now I would like to give you the floor in case there are questions or comments. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Thank you very much, León. It's a pleasure, as always, to have you here. I see Alejandro is proposing the creation of a consolidated working group to work on this. I know this is great. we have not much time, as you know, but I suggest that you provide León with questions via chat. We now have the webinar. We're now going to have a webinar on universal acceptance. I'm going to give the floor to Sávyo Vinícius de Morais, and then Mark Datysgeld. So I would like to give them the floor right now. But before that, I would like to thank you for your time and your participation and your support for the region, and of course, all your work for the ICANN community. As I said before, for us, it's a great pleasure to have you in our meeting.

LEÓN SANCHEZ:

Thank you all, and I'm sorry if I took more than I should, but thank you for giving me the opportunity to provide this presentation.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: My pleasure. So now we have a webinar. We will be dealing with the universal acceptance. We'll have two speakers. I'm going to give the floor to them for them to introduce themselves. So I give the floor to the speakers, and I thank them for being here. Please go ahead.

MARK DATYSGELD: Hello. Can you hear me?

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes, we can hear you loud and clear.

MARK DATYSGELD: Sorry. I'm going to speak in Portuguese because of the difficulty of this issue. However, I was going to speak in Portuguese, but I'm going to speak in Spanish. Let's talk about universal acceptance. What is universal acceptance? This is something that is not new, and this is something very important, because it's a well-known topic for all of us. And this is a project that is being extended to Latin America as well.

We are doing this in association with other associations, and we are also working with [Paolo] [inaudible]. He's the VP of [inaudible]. He has a commercial overview for Latin American companies. And of course, we need to take into account domain names. Domain names need to be accepted and validated in e-mails, because up until 2012, it was necessary to work with this issue. Many websites and many services were not ready to work with universal acceptance.

---

As you can see in this slide, you are seeing here the distribution of ccTLDs around the world. These are IDN ccTLDs. For example, in Russia, they are very important. We also have IDN ccTLDs in China, in India, in South Korea. They're really important in these regions. This is something to take into account, because these are non-ASCII characters, and they are converted through a formula.

These are converted by using Punycode, and this is a kind of translation of characters into a way that it can be understood by the different servers or computers. This is a very technical issue. I'm going to speak about Cyrillic characters.

In this case, we have the Cyrillic name for the Russian Federation, but the first character resembles a P in the Latin language. However, that is not the letter. This is a specific character and a specific Russian character. So, how can we solve this kind of conflict so as to avoid any issue with integrity of the DNS?

So we have the domain name of the Russian Federation, which has more than one million domain names, such as the Russian Domestic Affairs Ministry. We also have the civil society sector. These are the most important IDNs. But of course, they're not the only ones. We also have the Indian IDNs. As you can see on the screen, we have characters in Devanagari. This is the script being used in India. These are characters being used in India. They are really different from characters being used in other parts of the world. This is also being developed in India, and the adoption is really strong.

What we do in association with Daniel Fink – and I know Daniel is in Argentina, so thank you very much for your help – is we are carrying out a research, and this is the relationship between Brazil and the rest of the world, and surprisingly – and Sergio, we would like to share this with you and we would like to have your support from the Latin American community as well.

I believe that we need to discuss this, because it would be very interesting to do this kind of research. We might need to invest in research. This is something quite simple to do because we have the know-how and we can work together. You can speak with me, with Daniel, with [Paolo]. So we do have the know-how. So I would like to invite you all to participate in this research.

We also have some issues or problems, and in this case, I'm going to speak about the most important issue, at least from my point of view. One of these issues is that JavaScript codes, or the old JavaScript code, these are old scripts being used since the inception of the website. They have an alphanumeric identification from A to Z and from zero to nine, but this cannot be used in other languages. For example, we cannot use these codes in the Devanagari script.

And many stakeholders, such as NGOs or businesses, would like to use their own languages and scripts in their own languages. So that is why this is really important. We also have libraries which do not have, for example, support within IDNs. And of course, they do not support universal acceptance. We also have other important platforms to take into account, so I would highly recommend to start using this type of platform.

---

---

Then we have another issue, and that has to do with security. There is a website which is really popular among kids, and this is [Epic.com,] but it was said that there is a bug in Firefox and Chrome browsers, and if we use the Punycode version, this is the way in which [Epic.com] is shown in Punycode.

So this is an ongoing concern for the community, that is to say, how to develop these websites in a safe or in a secure way. And sorry for speaking too fast, but I'm conscious of time. Just to finish, I would like to tell you that we're asking the community to participate. The idea is that if you're interested in participating with us, you can talk to Vanda or to Daniel, or you can talk to me or Sávyo. We are really interested in developing this project for the region, because this will give us the opportunity to be more flexible and this will give us business opportunities as well. So, thank you very much for your time and attention.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Mark. Thank you for your presentation. It was really good. I would like to thank you, because I know you had a problem [inaudible]. So, thank you very much for your effort. I believe that now, Sávyo is taking the floor, right? Sávyo, are you on the call? Can you hear me?

SÁVYO VINÍCIUS DE MORAIS: Yes. I can hear you.



---

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay. Sávyo, you have the floor. You can start with your presentation. Thank you.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Sávyo, sorry for interrupting you, but you are speaking in the wrong channel. You're speaking in Portuguese in the English channel.

HAROLD ARCOS: While we reconnect Sávyo, please let me remind you all that you can type your question on the chat so that we can ask questions to the presenters. So this is a reminder for the participants.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Harold. And since we are running out of time, I would like to ask staff if there is a possibility of having some spare minutes so that we can continue with the webinar, because we have already run out of time.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, Sergio, interpreters can stay for ten minutes only.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay. Thank you. Please let's inform Sávyo about this so that he can adjust his presentation to this new period of time. Thank you.

SÁVYO VINÍCIUS DE MORAIS: Can you hear me now? Hello?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Yes, we can hear you.

DANIEL FINK: Hello, Sergio. While we [solve] this issue, can I take the floor for some seconds?

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes, go ahead, please, Daniel.

DANIEL FINK: Thank you, Sergio. Hello, everyone. Mark, thank you for the presentation. Let me tell you that this project has really strong participation by [inaudible] Brazil, so that's why we'd like to take this to the community, because we would like to take this to the community involved in universal acceptance. As you know, this is really important for us, and it has to be ready for all domain names.

The easiest part has to do with systems, [what] mail or webforms. So this is something that involves a great part of the community, and many companies. So for the members of [inaudible] [Paolo,] Vanda, we have now the opportunity to be in touch with them. This might be a good opportunity to continue with this effort in other parts of the region.

As you know, our region does have IDNs. For example, in Portuguese, we have the different accents or signs, or we have different letters, so this is not only applied to the Indian or the Russian scripts, this is also

---

used in our region. That's why it is really important, and this will give us the opportunity to participate in new markets. That's why we have the support of NICBR. And of course, there is an increasing demand by the community. So if you're interested in this issue, I believe it is really important, and the same thing applies to Spanish-speaking countries. This is a great effort, but of course, we are at your disposal, so thank you, and now, I would like to give the floor to the speakers. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Daniel. Thank you for your comments and thank you for your support. I believe that Sávyo is online, so please, Sávyo, go ahead.

MARCELO TELEZ: Sergio, can you hear me?

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Yes, I can hear you, but we are waiting for Sávyo.

MARCELO TELEZ: Yes. I was only informing you that I am on the call already.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay. Thank you.

---

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sávyo, please go ahead. Claudia, do we have the presenter already online?

SÁVYO VINÍCIUS DE MORAIS: So all this is based on this [HTML5] that validates e-mail that we will include in the form. And we realized through different [inaudible] methods that [after studying] or testing [30% of the] websites, we realized that 30% of them [inaudible] e-mail, and we perceive that there are some situations in which this does not match the current context. We have top-level domains [lack UA] and also IDNs [inaudible] and also with Chinese characters [inaudible] and then when we moved to e-mails with non-ASCII characters, we realized that this did no longer support the validation.

And also, in the [part of script] that is written from right to the left, this is the mark of the HTML, document of HTML5 [inaudible] and official documents mention that the definition of a valid e-mail comes from this list, RFC 5322, [section A, B and F.] And on this same website, they suggest regular expressions for the validation of the data to be included, but there is a disclaimer also which is mentioned that it does no longer agree with the new definition, and the [tests of the regular expression,] they do not agree with them, and the results were very inconsistent. So we needed to create a new regular expression.

So then we started testing HTML 5.3, which already takes into account the compliance of universal acceptance, and we have definitions in these two RFCs on the screen. One on the extension of mailboxes, and the second one on the definition of IDN. But it does not suggest any

---

validation codes, so [with this thing,] we would force the forms of the website to accept new IDNs or new domain names, considering all the specifications I mentioned before. But this could bring about some issues after the update in the case of platforms and backends, for example, that are not prepared to receive these domain names with characters that do not match the implementation. And so what certain parties have done is [conserve] the domain names and e-mail addresses, and that should be an SMTP [inaudible] so that there would be some kind of consistency or matching. In some cases, this would work well, in others, not. So with this conversion and non-conversion and going back with the conversation, we can have some errors.

Besides,, something that is essential is implementations that did not consider this in the platform and which will not be able to recognize these e-mails. And [that's another case] with email service [which is protocol SMTP,] already forces in the new platform, already forces for the new implementation to use instead of [inaudible] using SMTP UTF-8. But for all [buttons] to be able to work, we would need to take into account the specifications, and even so, there would be errors.

The ideal thing to do is I think we should read and find out which are the servers that work well with this, and the main platforms that may be used with this. This is for us to be able to include other communities, so what we could do is take open source [units] so that with a very slight change, we could have an impact on the maximum number of platforms possible. so in case of doubt, [don't hesitate to ask.] Here I have posted some links for you to understand this matter further on.

---

So thank you very much, here's my e-mail, and please contact me, contact Mark. We are very interested in developing this project in Latin America, and it will be a great pleasure helping the community.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Sávyo. We are reaching the end of this call. We are now going to have an evaluation survey, so we will now upload the survey on the screen for us to finish this meeting.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, everyone. The first question is, how was the timing of this webinar? Please submit your answers. The next question is, how is the technology used for these webinars? Please submit your answers. The next question is, did the speakers demonstrate mastery of a topic? Please submit your answers. The next question, are you satisfied with the webinar? What region do you live in at the moment? The next question, how many years of experience do you have in the ICANN community? And the final question is, what topics would you like us to cover for future webinars? Thank you all for participating, the survey is now complete. Thank you all for joining the call. This meeting is now adjourned. Please remember to disconnect your lines. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**