

1

# STRAWMAN PROPOSAL

2

Allan MacGillivray

3

2018-10-23

4 ~~Stage I— Unilateral Removal within an Initial Period~~

5 ~~Within “a~~

6 **1 Component 1**

7 **1.1 Informing ccTLD Manger of the Removal of the TLD from the Root within**  
8 **an Initial Period**

9 Within “a<sup>1</sup>” days of PTI becoming aware of the removal of a two letter code from the  
10 ISO 3166 list, it will send the related ccTLD manager a TLD Removal Notice Letter  
11 ~~;~~ notifying them that the TLD will be removed from the root ~~““b<sup>2</sup>”~~ years from the  
12 date of the letter (the ~~‘removal date’~~), and “removal date”)

13 **2 Component 2**

14 **2.1 PTI Requesting Transition Steps**

15 PTI’s letter to the ccTLD manger could go further by requesting that the manager  
16 undertake the a number of following retirement transition steps designed to ensure  
17 the orderly wind down of the ccTLD:

- 18 • cease to accept new or renewed registrations beyond the removal date  
19 • inform their registrars and registrants of the impending removal of the ccTLD  
20 from the root and the date on which this will occur

---

<sup>1</sup>All of the time periods in this Strawman Proposal ~~would obviously be~~ are subject to discussion. This initial period by which PTI would have to inform the ccTLD manager would be relatively short, 30 days for example.

<sup>2</sup>This initial period would be short, 3 years perhaps.

- 21 • inform “significant interested parties”<sup>3</sup> in their community of the impending  
22 removal date
- 23 • provide PTI with status report on the TLD’s zone file as of the date of the  
24 first communication from PTI and thereafter every “e”<sup>3</sup> months until the  
25 removal date
- 26 • ~~(there may be other steps or some of these may not be found not to be suitable)~~  
27
- 28 • ~~informing the ccTLD manager that an additional period of “d”<sup>4</sup> years is available  
29 on the condition that the ccTLD manager enters into a Retirement Transition  
30 Agreement with PTI.~~

### 31 ~~Stage II—Retirement Transition Agreement~~

32 ~~Where the ccTLD manager seeks to enter into a Retirement Transition Agreement,  
33 that PTI be authorized to enter into such an agreement one element of which will  
34 be the extension of the removal date by “d” years, but under the condition that the  
35 ccTLD manager agrees to be bound to carry out all of the retirement transition steps  
36 requested in the TLD Removal Notice Letter and on the understanding that should  
37 the manager fail to respect any aspect of the agreement, the agreement would be  
38 voided and the original removal date again becomes effective.~~

## 39 **3 Component 3**

### 40 ~~Stage III—Extended Period for Retirement~~

#### 41 **3.1 Extension of Period for Retirement**

- 42 • Where the ccTLD manager believes that **exceptional** circumstances exist which  
43 may merit a longer transition period, they may seek an extended time period  
44 from PTI.
- 45 • Where PTI believes that the ccTLD manager has satisfactorily demonstrated  
46 the need an extended retirement period, it is authorized to :-
- 47 • ~~enter into a Retirement Extended Transition Agreement with a removal date~~  
48 ~~up to “allow an additional period of transition of up to “e”<sup>4</sup>”~~ years from the

<sup>3</sup>The objective **here** is for the ccTLD manager to provide PTI with regular reports on the winding down of the ccTLD. The choice of reporting period needs to be reviewed, but ~~this likely would need to be for frequent than annually—every~~ 6 months is envisaged.

<sup>4</sup>2 years is suggested

<sup>4</sup>For example, where the initial period for unilateral removal is 3 years, the additional time period would be up to 6 years for an overall time limit of 9 years. ~~Where the initial period is 3 years and another 2 years is extended in exchange for entering into the Retirement Transition Agreement, then in this example, the further time available would be 4 years.~~

49 date of the TLD Removal Notice Letter to the ccTLD manager. This additional  
50 time CAN be subsequently extended provided that the overall limit established  
51 in the policy is not exceeded.

## 52 **4 Component 4**

### 53 **4.1 Retirement Transition Agreement**

- 54 • Where the ccTLD manager has sought an extension of the retirement period,  
55 this could be made conditional on that manager entering into an agreement,  
56 a (“Retirement Transition Agreement”), that could include
  - 57 – Some or all of the transition steps set out in component 2,
  - 58 – ~~and include therein such~~ Such other conditions or milestones to be re-  
59 spected as PTI and the ccTLD manager might agree.
  - 60 – Acknowledgement that a failure to respect any of the conditions of the  
61 agreement, including any special conditions used to justify the extended  
62 period, would void the agreement and result in the original removal date  
63 again becoming effective.
- 64 • Once a PTI/Manager ~~TLD Removal Notice~~ Retirement Transition Agreement  
65 has been entered into, the manager may at a subsequent date, seek to amend  
66 the agreement, provided that PTI agrees and the overall time limit, for example  
67 9 years, is respected.

68 ~~Oversight~~

## 69 **5 Component 5**

70 ~~I believe that there will be a need some form of oversight for this process but I have~~  
71 ~~not devoted too much thought to this as yet. However, two possibilities initially~~  
72 ~~come to mind:-~~

### 73 **5.1 Oversight**

- 74 • ~~Where PTI believes that~~ Where a ccTLD manager has sought an extension of  
75 the time period for retirement and has been denied this by PTI, then the ccTLD  
76 manager would be permitted to appeal this decision to the PTI Board and the  
77 ICANN Board, in that order.

- 78 • ~~Where a ccTLD manager has failed to respect the terms of the Retirement~~  
79 ~~Transition Agreement, or a Retirement Extended Transition Agreement, and~~  
80 ~~entered into a Retirement Transition Agreement and PTI believes that it has~~  
81 ~~failed to respect its terms and~~ is seeking to invalidate it and return to the orig-  
82 inal removal date, then the PTI Board will be required to agree with PTI's  
83 assessment.
- 84 • ~~Where a ccTLD manager has sought a Retirement Extended Transition Agreement~~  
85 ~~and PTI has denied this on the basis that the arguments were not found to be~~  
86 ~~sufficiently convincing, then the ccTLD manager would be permitted to appeal~~  
87 ~~this decision to either the PTI Board, or the ICANN Board or maybe both e. g.~~  
88 ~~PTI Board first and the ICANN Board second. If the PTI Board agrees, and the~~  
89 ~~manager still wishes to challenge the decision, it could appeal to the ICANN~~  
90 ~~Board.~~

Draft, 2018-11-27