

**Attendance: (39 Members)**

Alan Greenberg	Juan Manuel Rojas
Alexander Schubert	Justine Chew
Alfredo Calderon	Karen Day
Cheryl Langdon-Orr	Kathy Kleiman
Christopher Niemi	Kristina Rosette
Christopher Wilkinson	Martin Sutton
Dietmar Lenden	Matthew Crossman
Donna Austin	Maxim Alzoba
Elsa Saade	Michael Flemming
Gg Levine	Peter LaMantia
Harold Arcos	Robin Gross
Heath Dixon	Roger Carney
Jamie Baxter	Samantha Demetriou
Jason Schaeffer	Sara Bockey
Jeff Neuman	Sarah Langstone
Jessica Hooper	Sophie Hey
Jim Prendergast	Susan Payne
Jonathan Robinson	Vanda Scartezini
Jose Alberto Barrueto Rodriguez	Zornitsa Marcheva
Audio only:	Staff:
Kristine Dorrain	Steve Chan
	Emily Barabas
Apologies:	Julie Hedlund
Kavouss Arasteh	Michelle DeSmyter

**AC chat:**

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear all, welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Working Group call on Monday, 12 November 2018 at 15:00 UTC.

Michelle DeSmyter:Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/UwDVBO>

Dietmar Lenden - Valideus Ltd:We can hear you clearly

Christopher Wilkinson:can hear you ok, jeff.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks for confirming

Maxim Alzoba:Hello All, I will not be able to use mic, will use chat window

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted @Maxim thanks

Elsa Saade:Right on Jeff

Elsa Saade::)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Welcome indeed :-)

Elsa Saade:Thank you Jeff! Looking forward to working with you all.

Maxim Alzoba>Note: I am participating today as a .moscow Registry representative (not is Council member capacity)

Steve Chan:@Jeff, he is serving in an interim basis and seeking a replacement

Steve Chan:Keith that is

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted @Maxim

Vanda Scartezini:hi everyone.

Michael Flemming:

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Rubens

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):and Christa

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):RA

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair)::-)

Steve Chan:Adobe Connect Recordings are available

sara bockey:FYI - I will need to drop at the top of the hour.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted @Sara

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Excellent progress in WT5 in BCN... Thanks to all who contributed

Emily Barabas:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_docs.google.com\\_spreadsheets\\_d\\_1QLmUjQZB7x2ez74td4m5GC1q1pHe05ke2ePpiy3gdG8\\_edit-3Fusp-3Ddrive-5Fweb-26oid-3D106805308696604600710&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8\\_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwwehFBfjrsj](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1QLmUjQZB7x2ez74td4m5GC1q1pHe05ke2ePpiy3gdG8_edit-3Fusp-3Ddrive-5Fweb-26oid-3D106805308696604600710&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwill3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwwehFBfjrsj)

[Wv9&m=0EvRCd8I4LXHhVxSLFrqPl15FDkhH3nqGaZC7Pi2Zg0&s=PUtugEsbobOoYQdxYHnjrHokPkBCZaUwau3iRebJmhk&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_15zDdzlBwLCz5m2sNXui6N6pporbUq-)

Emily Barabas:Note that the schedule for December is still being finalized. Invites have not yet gone out for these.

Vanda Scartezini:group A will meet when? B i guess will be tomorrow

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair): B is at 1500 UTC on Tue 13, A is 0300 UTX Wed

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):C is 200 UTC on Thur

Emily Barabas:A is actually on Thursday at 3:00 UTC

Emily Barabas:C is on Thursday at 20:00 UTC

Harold Arcos:Hi all, apologies for late connection.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):I missed a zero ( sorry good catch Emily

Emily Barabas:no problem!

Elsa Saade:What about the comments that don't necessarily comply by the format provided by the working group Jeff?

Elsa Saade:like the overarching comments

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):We have a Gebneral catagory for each SG

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair): and indeed some of the Gen Comments can also be redirected after analysis

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Sorry typos abound when I type in the dark at 0230

Emily Barabas:@Elsa, key takeaway is that all comments will be taken into account, regardless of the format they followed

Elsa Saade:Thanks Jeff and Emily, it's a good reminder!

Steve Chan:We have the CCT-RT analysis and the General comments available

Jim Prendergast:yeah - will need that link

Emily Barabas:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_docs.google.com\\_spreadsheets\\_d\\_15zDdzlBwLCz5m2sNXui6N6pporbUq-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_15zDdzlBwLCz5m2sNXui6N6pporbUq-)

[2DIDFEwfh4rKi4A edit-23gid-3D1010084621&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pjp6wrcrwl13mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwwebFBfjrsjWv9&m=0EvRCd8I4LXHhVxSLFrqPl15FDkhH3nqGaZC7Pi2Zg0&s=kMQIXPH34a9FpEIpotL8\\_28jn8OIF6DCnEbzxKNnGpQ&e=](https://www.ietf.org/mail-archive/web/pdp/201301/msg00000.html)

Emily Barabas:Second tab: "General"

Emily Barabas:The document in AC is unsynced, so you can also zoom into the text

Steve Chan:To Jeff's point, the "General Comments" were all placed into Sub Group A's sheet, so for the most part, it will likely be Sub Group A referencing topics to the full WG.

Maxim Alzoba:Policy coming out of the PDP can not regulate pricing for Registries/Registrars, this idea is called Picket Fence and is in RAA 2013, RA

Steve Chan:@Jeff, comment #9 should be covered here as well.

Jim Prendergast:ok - at first glance I think so but doing this on the fly is a bit challenging

Kathy Kleiman:I'm still reading the comment, but in general, this is a good time to refer Sunrise questions/comments to RPM WG.

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENTS - ICANN org should refer such questions to the Implementaion Review Team COMMENT

Jamie Baxter | dotgay:+1 .. I'm with Jim

Anne Aikman-Scalese:+1 with Jim and Jamie - refer questions to IRT - new standing IRT was recommended

Steve Chan:@all, this is the most relevant aspect of the comment discussed by Jeff here: Although the Initial Report is quite substantial, ICANN org recognizes that due to the large number of program processes, procedures, and issues, it may not be possible for the PDP Working Group to cover all topics in its discussions. ICANN org assumes that if the PDP Working Group does not discuss a topic that it would not preclude ICANN org from suggesting implementation improvements during the policy implementation phase. It would be helpful if the PDP Working Group could confirm this assumption.

Steve Chan:And to be clear, we are on comment #9

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: It is well-established historically that one person's implementation is another person's policy. GDD staff should not be making that determination. Refer any questions not discussed by the PDP WG to the Standing IRT.

Jim Prendergast:This is a perfect example of why we need to see these before the call starts - lots of different angles to think through here.

Steve Chan:It seems that the comment from ICANN Org is referencing the IRT phase.

Maxim Alzoba:QUESTION: are we on the assumption that the next round RA is the same as 2012 ? (if yes, then RA can be changed only via the methods described in the current RA)

Jim Prendergast:At Maxim - was an example - Im sure there are others like PICs where came out of now where

Maxim Alzoba:@Jim, Temp Specs too ...

Christopher Wilkinson:lost sound

Martin Sutton:lost sound

Maxim Alzoba:same

Gg Levine (NABP):My audio went dead. Anyone else's?

Robin Gross:I don't hear anyone

Jamie Baxter | dotgay:can no longer hear Steve

juan Manuel Rojas:No sound

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):audio dropped

sara bockey:audio dropped

Elsa Saade:same here

Maxim Alzoba:we need it

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: It is ESPECIALLY important to refer to IRT if a topic is not discussed by the PDP WG. So what Steve is saying should be codified. Certainly not clear from the GDD comment. that this is subject to IRT review. COMMENT

Susan Payne:audio is still working on phone bridge

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Staff please advise

Steve Chan:Alan speaking now and I can hear him (I am on phone)

Steve Chan:And now Jeff

Maxim Alzoba:bridge got disconnected from Adobe?

Jim Prendergast:phone workign for me

Donna Austin, Neustar:Agree with Alan, there's a balance to be struck here.

Michelle DeSmyter:I am checking into this now

Heath Dixon (Amazon):I lost audio on AC

Vanda Scartezini:I lsot either

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):We have paused a minute to see what is going on

Susan Payne:@Heath - Michelle is trying to fix the Adobe audio

Jeff Neuman (Overall Co-chair):Everyone get up and stretch.....take a drink.....what kind of drink depends on you

Elsa Saade:works now!

Elsa Saade:for a bit

Maxim Alzoba:I head snoring

Jim Prendergast:haha

Maxim Alzoba:audio works

Elsa Saade:works

Vanda Scartezini:guess we agreed with Alan in general

sara bockey:hmm... still no audio here

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):That was my husband as my mic reconnected it \*is\* 0248 here in AU!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):you need to reconnect ypur audio

Vanda Scartezini:CLO..kkkkk

sara bockey:working now

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):if using AC

Vanda Scartezini:working well now

Jim Prendergast:I think closed generics would get caught in this as well

Maxim Alzoba:when the next round comes (hopefully), how new gTLD are going to be called - not-so-legacy or not-so-new?

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: I was advised in Work Track 4 that our charter does not permit us to make policy applicable to the 2012 round unless specifically stated in our Charter So if we did do that, the Charter would need to be revised. COMMENT

Anne Aikman-Scalese:that type of Charter change would also require public comment - there is an issue because there would then be a need for a new Initial Report and the process would be prolonged to get to Final Report

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):7

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):have to drop for another call.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks for joining @Kristina

Jim Prendergast:103

Jim Prendergast:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_www.icann.org\\_en\\_system\\_files\\_files\\_sac-2D103-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl13mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8\\_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=0EvRCd8I4LXHhVxSLFrqPl15FDkhH3nqGaZC7Pi2Zg0&s=Iu5YNtj29kG9TLbe6QoCBljAja10fHtY1Lfx12MBEwo&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_www.icann.org_en_system_files_files_sac-2D103-2Den.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl13mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=0EvRCd8I4LXHhVxSLFrqPl15FDkhH3nqGaZC7Pi2Zg0&s=Iu5YNtj29kG9TLbe6QoCBljAja10fHtY1Lfx12MBEwo&e=)

Maxim Alzoba:NOTE: We can not comment on actions or inactions of SSAC

Maxim Alzoba:the last words in their comment was about their plans

Maxim Alzoba:and I am not sure we need to comment on that

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Will SSAC 103 be discussed in a future meeting of the entire WG?

Maxim Alzoba:We might need to refer to the methods of communications with the Board (for SSAC)

Jim Prendergast:one SSAC procedural issue I have is - does a comment from the SSAC to a comment period like this also constitute SSAC advice to the ICANN Board and therefore triggers that Advice process by the Board?

Donna Austin, Neustar:@Jim, I don't see how it could.

Jim Prendergast:Do we have an SSAC "little L" liaison?

Emily Barabas:Jeff, correct

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):I don't think so

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):snap Emily

Jim Prendergast:I think it would be good to get more feedback from the SSAC on this one because the comment is pretty pointed to the work of this group.

Jim Prendergast:so is the recommendation that ICANN prohibit the incorporation of registries in certain countries?

Robin Gross:The community needs to agree to work on an issue for it to be in scope. Not everything will be in scope. This issue is not in scope.

Maxim Alzoba:NOTE: I believe that restrictions on jurisdictions is something ICANN should not do

Jim Prendergast:Do we have WTs to refer to? I thought we disbanded them

Jim Prendergast:ahh ok

Donna Austin, Neustar:I don't see how policy could be made in this regard. Where an entity establishes their business is up to them and not within the control of ICANN or the ICANN community through a policy process.

Anne Aikman-Scalese 2:CoMMENT: To be more specific, GNSO Council approved Charter determines what is in scope for this PDP Working Group. CoMMENT

Maxim Alzoba:I am sure this idea will enrage GAC instantly

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):We can note (by use of a Parking Lot document perhaps) that such issue has been raised, noted out of scope for our WG, but note it to the GNSO Council or somewhere

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):A parking lot can indeed be analysed to see if there are any trends in these orphan issues

Maxim Alzoba:#31 will be a violation of privacy laws (including GDPR)

Maxim Alzoba:publicize parties - for persons ... are parties names

Donna Austin, Neustar:I don't understand why is this a recommendation for this group to



consider? it seems this is something that could be done outside of this effort.

Kristine Dorrain (Amazon Registry):#31 is a reference to resellers.

Kristine Dorrain (Amazon Registry):CCT-RT wants to know who all has touched a domain name sale.

Maxim Alzoba:@Kristine, I think it is not clear enough

Justine Chew:Yes, context of comment is important

Elsa Saade:Is it not dependent on how EPDP goes forward?

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):2nd level domain as opposed to the TLD itself?

Phil Buckingham: Agreed Donna . This is being handled by / though the gTLD Marketplace Indicator report .

Steve Chan:To Jeff's point, this particular recommendation was directed at this PDP, amongst a number of other groups.

Kristine Dorrain (Amazon Registry):@Maxim, I think the CCT-RT rec has a lot of problems (including its brevity).

Jim Prendergast:i realize its no entirely avoidable but we can do as much as we can

Anne Aikman-Scalese 2:Effect of CCT-RT may end up being a question of which recommendations are adopted by the Board. We would do well to consider these carefully since conflicting recommendations from this PDP and the CCT-RT will cause delay.

Michelle DeSmyter:18th

Cheryl Langdon-Orr ( CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks everyone, bye for now... "see" many of you in the SG calls :- ) and WT5...

Justine Chew:Would SubGroups raising items for full WG attention come by way of email to list hereon?

Maxim Alzoba:bye all

Elsa Saade:thanks, bye all

Steve Chan:@Justine, I think that's a good approach

juan Manuel Rojas:thanks all bye

