

Attendance: (31 members)

Alan Greenberg (ALAC)	Jon Nevett
Anne Aikman-Scalese	Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry)
Carlton Samuels	Kristine Dorrain
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair)	Liz Williams
Christa Taylor	Małgorzata Pęk
Christopher Niemi	Maxim Alzoba (FAITID)
Christopher Wilkinson	Michael Casadevall
Dietmar Lenden - Valideus Ltd	Michael Flemming
Donna Austin, Neustar & Council Liaison	Robin Gross
Edmon Chung	Rubens Kuhl
Greg Shatan	Sara Bockey
Jamie Baxter dotgay	Sarah Langstone
Jeff Neuman	Sophie Hey
Jess Hooper	Susan Payne
Jim Prendergast	Vanda Scartezini
	Zornitsa Marcheva

Audio Only:

None

Apologies:

Katrin Ohlmer, Kavouss Arasteh, Annebeth Lange

Staff:

Berry Cobb
Emily Barabas
Julie Hedlund
Steve Chan
Andrea Glandon

AC Chat:

Andrea Glandon:Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures PDP call held on Monday, 08 October 2018 at 15:00 UTC.

Andrea Glandon:Wiki Agenda Page: <https://community.icann.org/x/4wirBQ>

Vanda Scartezini:hi everyone.

Vanda Scartezini:hi Andrea, how are you?

Andrea Glandon:Hello Vanda! I'm well, how are you?

Vanda Scartezini:everything ok around here thank you. we had general election yesterday, next round will be end of october... let's see what will happen!! kisses

Andrea Glandon:Ah!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Hi all...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):all good Jeff

Jeff Neuman:I think we can get started despite ICANN's scheduling of a conflicting session;

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes I am in that other call as well

Jim Prendergast:agree

Michael Casadevall:Sorry for being late. I've spent most of the week very sick so I've only now been catching up with my inbox

Steve Chan:@Jeff, confirmed.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Sorry to hear that Michael I trust you are recovering well...

Michael Casadevall:Sorta. I'm at least alive enough to be on the phone :)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair)::-)

Steve Chan:@Jim, I don't remember seeing that email...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Nor do I :-(

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Sorry Jim

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):I see your other recent email responded to by Justine

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):just a little opps

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):easy fixed ;-)

sarah I:Jeff I've got some comments to make - would be good to know the deadline sorry to be tardy

Steve Chan:@Jim, maybe you can talk us through the suggestions when we get to the appropriate section as well?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Hello All

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):p 2 -3

sarah I:mainly related to what I have said

sarah I:phone broken :-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):so refinements... Thanks... Be good to allow for discussion on the Doc over ICANN 63

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Again this text ** should reflect your input** so please confirm...

Jim Prendergast:just resent language for Registrar Support. had wrong address

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thx Jim just saw it flash past on my screen so rec'd but not read

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted Jamie...

edmon 2:do we anticipate change of applied for string as a way for conflict resolution?

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Apologies for joining late. Listened to the first few minutes of the data protection/privacy webinar and decided to move here.

Liz Williams:@Jamie B...and when you come up with language make sure you include an end-point for any negotiations with a "drop dead" external timeline. See other comments I've made elsewhere about flattening the application evaluation process to ensure that different types of applicants are not disadvantaged.

Jamie Baxter | dotgay:thanks Jeff

edmon 2:ok thx jeff

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Agree with Jamie re lack of consideration of special aspects of Community applications - where, for example, several applications for same string qualify for CPE, what happens?

Jon Nevett:I'd love to hear an argument of why private auctions are not ok, but paying other applicants to withdraw are ok. To me, they have to be treated the same, as private auctions are just one mechanism for a buyer to pay other applicants to withdraw

Jon Nevett:the draft seems still stuck on focusing on private auctions

Vanda Scartezini:Jon, guess the general objection is financial. for the auction they pay a fee to ICANN.

Liz Williams:@ Jon ... the question is not why private auctions aren't OK...the question is the reverse. What array of options do applicants have to resolve contention? All options should be on the table.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):As I noted in my written comments, I agree with Jon's views w/r/t private auctions & private resolution and would also like to hear the answer to the question he's posed here.

Michael Casadevall:@Jon: I feel like we need a mechanism where any deviation from the process (aka any private resolution) if we still allow it need approval from ICANN and/or community

Jim Prendergast:To Jeff's point - lots of talk of it in Panama breakouts

Anne Aikman-Scalese:I agree with Jim and others that the document should not go out until the options presented by the WG have been stated in the Supplemental Report. The views of the WG are the views on which we are seeking public comment. It's not that the WG members should be submitting public comment.

Carlton Samuels:@Edmon: Interesting question. I know of a case in the last round where that action was taken as a means to resolve a conflict but it was never accepted

Liz Williams:@jeff...thanks for that and I appreciate the point you've made. This is not about public interest. It is about applicant interest...and we need to do more work about understanding the motivations to resolve contention.

Carlton Samuels:Question on private resolution: Would an action to resolve that did not include a priori transfer of money be acceptable?

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: I would favor an open public discussion of private string resolution at the ICANN meeting - dedicated 30 minute session for that alone.

Liz Williams:Maybe the way to resolve discussion around private auctions and/or last resort ICANN auctions is to really think about auction proceeds...

Michael Casadevall:Anne: +1

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Sarah's option is not there, is it?

Jon Nevett:it's not an enforcement issue Jeff

Michael Casadevall:just a heads up, I'm really feeling kinda ill. I may drop off the call but I'll see if I can soldier on.

Jeff Neuman:Sarah's option is in 1.1 on Auctions in general

Greg Shatan:Favoring a last resort auction where ICANN gets the money would be seen as more troublesome by many.

Jeff Neuman:As it is not just related to Private auctions, but the use of all auctions in general

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Indeed Steve

Jon Nevett:"o Implementation Guidance under discussion: The Applicant Guidebook and program Terms & Conditions should be amended to state that resolution of string contention via private auction is disallowed."

Jon Nevett:draft still needs work

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Sarah said her proposed language is coming in today or tomorrow I think.

sarah I:the icann board, in its comments to the initial report, public auctions might not be reconcilable with ICANN's commitments and core values, we might need to ask ICANN if private resolutions may cause the same concerns

Jeff Neuman:@Jon - That is an option that is under discussion

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes it makes sense to also add as an option (thanks Sarah in advance of your specific text :-)

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):how to distinguish a private resolution from the situation where one of the parties decided to quit under load of new info?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*decided

Carlton Samuels:So the entire discussion on 'private resolution' is predicated on knowledge of the transaction before the fact? Are we sure the community would have sight of this to make any enforcement worthwhile?

Steve Chan:@Jon, see starting at the 3rd bullet under section (e)

Steve Chan:We attempted to note that private auction was only one method of private resolution.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes that was requested last meeting

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair): Jon that would be appreciated (sooner the better ;-)

Donna Austin, Neustar & Council Liaison:The concern is not the mechanism, the concern is applicants profiting from private auctions and applying specifically for that purpose.

Jon Nevett:no one suggesting that we eliminate options

Jeff Neuman:Thanks JON

edmon 2:towards competition, choice and consumer trust? should still be what guide us?...

Carlton Samuels:@Donna: I understand that. My question is if private resolutions are to be embraced, what is the baseline for clarity and fairness without a priori knowledge? And assuming a priori knowledge, can they be classed as "private" thereafter?

Jon Nevett:Donna +1 and addressing the concern that profiting would result in speculative applications

Jeff Neuman:Susan, you are coming in and oyut

Kristine Dorrain:+1 Jon

Donna Austin, Neustar & Council Liaison:Exactly Susan, it's the profiting that folks are concerned about and there is a perception that private auctions are the primary vehicle that enabled that behaviour.

Liz Williams:@ Susan....not such great connectivity...

Susan Payne:ah,sorry if it was me

Jim Prendergast:I agree with Susan that we need to look at that feedback we already received - one of the reasons I think we need to take our time on this.

Carlton Samuels:Interesting. I should think speculation is baked into the idea of gTLD program

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):OK Jeff noted your working with Gremlins (I hears Susan just fine BTW)

Kristine Dorrain:I think we also need to remember that sometimes the cure is worse than the poison. In looking for a way to stop a few speculators, are we just tying our hands for legitimate purposes?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):All good at this time Jeff

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):alleged speculators

Kristine Dorrain:+1 KR

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):applying for .trolls :)?

Liz Williams:I have trouble with the "speculator" thing...how is it speculation if one goes into a process not knowing who would bid for what? It might be "speculation" if one only waited to resolve contention without, in good faith, trying other methods. One always wishes for a contention set of 0.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):So people what is your suggestion(s) for better text in this report to reflect these matters and seek effective public comments We can make these changes with agreed proposed text (or guidelines to text)

Jeff Neuman:Thanks Cheryl....that is the key question

Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT: First Paragraph on Page 10, an application that is changed should be subject to not only ICANN approval, but also to a public comment period.

Andrea Glandon:We can hear you

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Excellent

Liz Williams:Much better quality Jeff!

Dietmar Lenden - Valideus Ltd:Yes

Jim Prendergast:same

Andrea Glandon:I think it was your line, but gone now

Andrea Glandon:Apologies, was not your line. The operator found the line and muted.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):So, even though it's a recommendation, we don't want specific feedback on it?

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):OK, got it.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):May want to be clearer about wanting feedback on recommendations in addition to questions.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We can ask it of course to specifically tease out... OR ensure in preamble that we seek input on Recs as well as the Q's

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):I personally prefer the latter for the record

Andrea Glandon:finding the line

Jeff Neuman:Its not my line as I am muted

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):no it is another ine Jeff

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):rhey are working on it

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):As long as there's a clear statement in the preamble that we want feedback on both the recommendations and the questions, that's good enough for me.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Perfect Kristina :-)

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Thanks for the clarification.

Steve Chan:sure, give me a minute

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We saw tha in your Comment as well... Thanks Anne

Andrea Glandon:Looking for the line with background noise

sarah I:folks just checking the draft says a contended applicant can't jump out of one contention set into another it the applicant is allowed to change the string. we talked about it at the last meeting

Jeff Neuman:@sarah, i know I put that somewhere in the draft...would have to find that

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks Jim

sarah I:thanks @jeff

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Anne is that a new hand re Jom's new text proposal?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Jim Typo sorry)

Steve Chan:@Jim, phew, glad I didn't have to point fingers :)

Jim Prendergast:Been called worse Cheryl

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Just a placeholder that I may want to add comments to 1.5 after Jim's comments are incorporated.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted Kristina

sarah I:I would have hoped they could provide anonymised data to eliminate any confidentiality concerns

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes thanks for joining us ...pity about the clash ;)

Liz Williams:@Jim or beyond auctions just resolution of contention in general. We should keep the questions open at the moment...

Jeff Neuman:@Jim, good point - I will send around the text of the letters.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Remember please that this Document is not the END of process of discussion, the Supplimental Interim Report is a milestone sure, but not a rolled up one...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We had intended to trigger discussion at ICANN 63

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Coughing here Jeff typinf is safer

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Yes now

Anne Aikman-Scalese:Agree with Jim re timing - discussion needed in Barcelona to come to draft Supplemental Report on this important question - favor 30 minute session in Barcelona on this.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Gremlins still ;-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We have noted that Anne

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):SSAC suggestion is to delay for 3 years effectively

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):They are still scoping Maxim

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I meant at least
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Ahh indeed :-)
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):and 3M+ USD
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):But that is what the ALAC has stated in its PC
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):As Co-Chairs we are tasked to ry and keep us all to our stated timelines ...
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):That *is* a large part of our job from the GNSO Council POV
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We are remember servents to others
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):typos sorry
Alan Greenberg (ALAC):Understood! When you were offered the CO-Chair job, you probalby knew it would not be easy! (sorry for intrucing a bit of levity...)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):I did indeed AG fear not ;-)]
Jeff Neuman:I am not complaining :)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Just stating our position and what we are beng told
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):and aiming to do...
Vanda Scartzini:great job anyway, if you are complain... no matter it is done and in a great way
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thx Vanda we are not complaoning just stating the limitations we need to work with
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):The LT also meetins with our GNSO Council Liaisons regularly (often weekly) so we are closely 'managed' but we hear you and other Jim...
Robin Gross:years? (gulp)
Anne Aikman-Scalese:COMMENT; The biggest issue here is that there are no actual preliminary recommendations and the WG needs to arrive at some. Otherwise public comment will be very scattered.
Anne Aikman-Scalese:Sorry I have to drop off Adobe Connet - hopefully someone can read my comment. I'll still be on the phone. Thank you, Anne
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks for attendong Anne
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):ing
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):But we are trying to reflect what we can on this in this Document...
Jim Prendergast:what about carving out auctions from this report and do another supplemental just on auctions?
Jim Prendergast:or contetion resolution
Alan Greenberg (ALAC):Could always move auctions to the Supplemental Supplemental (supplemental-squared?) Report.
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):That timeline can work...
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):dec 14 is 2019 effectively (vacations e.t.c.)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Again we really wanted to trigger discussion at ICANN 63
Jim Prendergast:and ICANN closes for 2 weeks at christmas
Robin Gross:It will challenging if we try to review comments in the last two weeks of December, lots of people take family holidayas then.
Jeff Neuman:....sorry, I meant one week later.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):almost nobody reads things issues while in the flight to the meeting , except for journalists
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):So what is unusual about that Alan
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):our pennance is clear ;-)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Thanks Anne
Jeff Neuman:So, it would close on the 21st

Jeff Neuman:December 21st

Jim Prendergast:and then we look at getting some efficiencies during the comment review to speed up that process

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Obviously ICANN office closures will be added into the calculations

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):dec 21st when 24th is the closure of the business in ICANN office ...

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):usually

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):and a small bit of wriggle room

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Draft *for Discussion* public to ICANN Community

Jim Prendergast:I still think we need to look at the comments from SO/ACs and reflect those in the document. Especially the Board.

Jeff Neuman:@Jim - we will do this this week

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Noted Alan we will consider that

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Well we now know what is on for the 1st session on the Sat ;-)

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):If you look at the ALAC comment to plans for specific reviews, it says that timetables are really important for getting things done, but the leadership team needs to be agile and prepared to make changes to the timetable when needed. You are demonstrating you follow this model!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):And we know it clashes with all day EPDP

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):@Cheryl - yes, and I'll be in EPDP all day (physically and mentally)

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):As am I.

Jim Prendergast:remember when you used to be able to get lunch at an ICANN meeting?....

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We will miss your input on the Day

Steve Chan:Nothing here either

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):safe travels all

Carlton Samuels:Bye all

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):safe flights

Vanda Scartezini:thanks you and see you in Barcelona.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Bye for now

Robin Gross:Thanks all! See you in Barcelona!