

Attendance - 29 Members

Alan Greenberg (ALAC)	Javier Rúa-Jovet WT5 co-Chair (ALAC)
Alberto Soto	Jeff Neuman
Alexander Schubert	Jess Hooper
Alfredo Calderon	John Rodriguez
Carlos Gutierrez G	Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair)	Matthew Johnson
Chris Casavale - IPC	Paul McGrady
Christopher Wilkinson	Robin Gross
Greg Shatan	Sophie Hey
Griffin Barnett	Susan Payne
Hadia Elminiawi	Timothy Asiedu
Heather Forrest	Yrjö Länsipuro
Jaap Akkerhuis	

On audio only: Taylor Bentley, Juan Manuel Rojas, Vernatius Ezeama

Apologies: Kavouss Arasteh, Maureen Hilyard, David McAuley, Jorge Cancio, Annebeth Lange, Marita Moll, Dev Anand Teelucksingh, Ann-Cathrin Marcussen

Staff: Emily Barabas, Julie Hedlund, Berry Cobb, Michael Karakash, Steve Chan, Julie Bisland

AC Chat:

Julie Bisland:Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level on Wednesday, 03 October 2018 at 20:00 UTC

Julie Bisland:Agenda wiki page: <https://community.icann.org/x/DQarBQ>

Christopher Wilkinson:CLO - can you get the cokatoos onto the call?

Javier Rúa-Jovet WT5 co-Chair (ALAC):Hi to all as of now in AC Room !

Christopher Wilkinson:can hear Martin ok.

Emily Barabas:All, it may be helpful to pull up the document we are going through today. Please see the links in the agenda pod (upper right corner)

Emily Barabas:Some of the comments will be difficult to read in Adobe Connect, so you may want to open the document on your desktop

Paul McGrady:Can we just go in order rather than jump around?

Hadia Elminiawi:hello Javier and all

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We can help Javier

Emily Barabas:the document is currently unsynced

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):We all have our own controls

Emily Barabas:i've unsynced it again so everyone can zoom as needed

Hadia Elminiawi:which section are we on

Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead):Good points Emily - this is a time to clarify the wording in the soecific sections, rather than open up wide debates to repeat points of view.

Alberto Soto:Hello Marsha, I have some problem in mi line. Can you call me? 54 11 5368 9029, thanks!

Julie Bisland:please stand by, Alberto

Robin Gross:Agree with Paul regarding talking about the guidebook as written.

Paul McGrady:Same comment - need to make it clear that we are talking about as AGb written not AGB applied.

Alberto Soto:Thanks Julie

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):Sorry to be late.

Alberto Soto:I'm online now

Christopher Wilkinson:My copy of the AGB is dated 18 FebruaRY 2009. Is that it?

jaap akkerhuis:Nowhere is (here) the difference between a letter and a character explained, so one wonders what it is

Susan Payne:to be clear I'm not disputing the recommendation

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):There is the deliberations sec f

Susan Payne:thank you Emily!

Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead):The additional sections will be covered in the deliberations section

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Sorry I was away from the PC when this needed to be typed...

THANKS Emily nicely explained

Susan Payne:yes perfect thanks

Javier Rúa-Jovet WT5 co-Chair (ALAC):Thanks for question @Susan.

Emily Barabas:We can add that. Thanks Greg.

Javier Rúa-Jovet WT5 co-Chair (ALAC):thanks Greg, good flag

Emily Barabas:Staff can add a footnote to that effect.

Alexander.berlin backup:NO!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):I was typing to Julie to sort the noisy line out again and she did befor I hit send ;-) so not for this chat

Christopher Wilkinson:@Greg - there are historical inconsistencies dthat we have to grandfathered (aka mistakes)

Greg Shatan:I don't think .com was a "mistake."

Greg Shatan:But you are certainly entitled to your opinion.

Greg Shatan:I have to step away. BRB

Greg Shatan:BRB = Be right back.

Emily Barabas:Thanks Paul, this is helpful

Susan Payne:agree with Paul - helpful clarity

Alexander.berlin backup:"Policiy as established by the 2012 AGB ..."

Paul McGrady:@Alexander - the AGB contains all kinds of things that aren't Policy.

Emily Barabas:there is history and context in section a and b of the report, which will be shared soon

Alexander.berlin backup:Language right!

Paul McGrady:Same comment about order (AGB/Policy) and "drafted"

Julie Bisland:Reminder to all: please keep microphones muted until you are called on to avoid the feedback/echo

Susan Payne:no comments on this but a suggestion. whilst we are going through these suggest Javier doesn't need to read out the lengthy section nos in 2.2.1.4.1 - we all have the draft, even those who aren't in the Adobe for the call can access the draft now or later.

Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead):thx Susan, point taken.

Alexander.berlin backup:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__en.wikipedia.org_wiki_ISO-5F3166-2D1-5Falpha-2D2-23Exceptional-5Freservations&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QjF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFcjNmBM5XgySw&m=IUq_otpxehFiB9FWeaeF64R-TI2kphY5_NE9So7aLgs&s=FFGqt3c-QsXZAY2D_Tx7vEOelKonb1LDalxCW8hUS14&e=

Alexander.berlin backup:And Akpha-3 https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__en.wikipedia.org_wiki_ISO-5F3166-2D1-5Falpha-2D3-23Exceptional-

[5Preservations&d=DwlFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QIF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFjNmBM5XgySw&m=IUq_otpxehFiB9FWeaeF64R-TI2kphY5_NE9So7aLgs&s=MewpkJiHAytWufraVncF7RV7fsZQbmd38kLs2D1aq24&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_berlin.ccc.de_-7Eandy_ICANN_iso3166-2Dres.pdf&d=DwlFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QIF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFjNmBM5XgySw&m=IUq_otpxehFiB9FWeaeF64R-TI2kphY5_NE9So7aLgs&s=MewpkJiHAytWufraVncF7RV7fsZQbmd38kLs2D1aq24&e=)

Hadia Elminiawi:+1 suzan

Alexander.berlin backup:Maybe not authoritative - but we get an idea, right?

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):This is a 2001 doc, but page 8 of

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_berlin.ccc.de_-7Eandy_ICANN_iso3166-2Dres.pdf&d=DwlFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=QIF-05YzARosRvTYd84AB_UYInlydmFjNmBM5XgySw&m=IUq_otpxehFiB9FWeaeF64R-TI2kphY5_NE9So7aLgs&s=jcu68vPBo7J0ewZ36vww5jwwWtIDfkTixjlduG4ITcg&e= has the list of

exceptionally reserved names.

jaap akkerhuis:Third bullet has the same problem as I mentioned before

Christopher Wilkinson:PS: I recall that there are quite a few cidty names that alre NOT in 3316. e.g. Palu TBC.

Christopher Wilkinson:3166 of course, Typo.

Paul McGrady:I'm having trouble following what Alexander was saying...

Steve Chan:@Christopher, if I recall correctly, city names were not limited to 3166

Alexander.berlin backup:At least we should THINK about the term "primarely".....

Paul McGrady:Previous

Robin Gross:I disagree with Rec #11 as it ignores free expression rights to use words with geographic meaning in lawful ways.

Alexander.berlin backup:Jeff: If you want to avoid the letter of support requirement - then simply state it is NOT "primarely" - and you are fine!

Greg Shatan:Thanks Jeff, this may be one to put out for public comment as is, and see if anyone cares to pursue this.

Greg Shatan:A corollary to the Neuman Rule.

Paul McGrady:PIC

Alexander.berlin backup:There WAS no issue: but people will want to avoid the letter of support requireent: and it can EASILY avoided by just declaring there is NO primarely purpose....

Jeff Neuman:@Alexander - Was there anyone in the last round that did what you were concerned about?

Alexander.berlin backup:The next round will be VERY different: people now understand that city gTLDs are profitable.... this wasn't clear in 2012.

Jeff Neuman:@Alexander - I could take the opposite view that City TLDs are no where near as profitable as many original applicants believed they would be :).

Susan Payne:did we miss 12? hard to be sure, they all look similar :)

Greg Shatan:Yes, we seem to have skipped 12. :-(

Paul McGrady:Ithink we did miss 12

Jeff Neuman:The number 12 often gets the short straw

Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead):Making sure you are all awake :-)

Jeff Neuman:Being 11 years old is cool.....being 13 years old is really great in many cultures.....but 12?

Alexander.berlin backup:Plus: Very often the city demands a revenue share. If one is so fair to engage in a contract with the city - but another applicant just works around the letter requirement: shouldn't then the entity that HAS a letter have priority? And that won't work via "commumnuity priority" - almost impossible to get a CPE through for a city community..

jaap akkerhuis:I dpn't think that currency codes can be considered out of scope for wt5 (it is not geo related)

Jeff Neuman:All, I am still on, but phone only

Susan Payne:Jaap, are you saying they are out of scope or they're not?
jaap akkerhuis:Yes, for this work track this is. A banknote is not a name for a geographic territory
Susan Payne:OK, so you are saying they are out of scope in your view. Good, I just wanted to clarify as your previous post wasn't clear to me. thanks
Susan Payne:and I agree, they aren't geo names
Christopher Wilkinson:@ Susan - Since they are derived from 3166 then they are WT5 competence. Otherwise the PDP will ignore the issue.
Susan Payne:@Christopher. The scope of this wt is not ISO 3166 per se. It is geo names
Greg Shatan:A fair opinion, with which Susan, Japan and I disagree.
Paul McGrady:Let's call it a day
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Break at this point
Greg Shatan:Let's start with 13. I will hold my comments until then.
Susan Payne:It's been raised plenty of times and no-one supports this but Christopher
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):I have noted no support/significant support in the past on this
Paul McGrady:No support for expanding WT5 to monetary terms (or any terms not Geo for that matter).
Robin Gross:There should be no new restrictions under the guise of "geographic" terms.
Greg Shatan:Next time, I would like to clarify what is being linked to in the footnotes in 13.
Martin Sutton (WT5 Co-Lead):Thank you Javier
Hadia Elminiawi:thank you all bye
Susan Payne:thanks all
Robin Gross:Thanks Javier, bye!
Hadia Elminiawi:thank you javier
Greg Shatan:Bye all
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO PDP Co-Chair):Bye for now .. Safe Travels to those coming to Barcelona