For Best Audio: Join via Telephone Using Dial-Out

Connecting via the audio bridge is always preferable to the AC audio connection.

Upon logging into Adobe Connect, a pop-up window will appear for the AC to call your phone. This preferred method will assure the best audio for the meeting.

Join Audio Conference

How would you like to join the meeting's audio conference?

- ⦿ Dial-out [Receive a call from the meeting]
  - +1 (USA) ▾   310-111-11111
- ○ Dial-in to the Audio Conference via Phone
- ○ Using Microphone (Computer/Device)

[Join]   [Listen Only]

After 2 background noise occurrences, staff will mute the offending line (either Telephone or Adobe Connect).

After two failed attempts to speak over the audio, participants will be invited to type their comments in the chat or take them to the mailing list.

PLEASE ALWAYS MUTE WHEN NOT SPEAKING!
*6 to mute and *6 to unmute

For any questions, dial out requests, apologies, please email: mssi-secretariat@icann.org

RDS-WHOIS2-RT
Plenary Call #39

20 August 2018

RDS/WHOIS2-RT Plenary Call Agenda

1. Welcome, roll-call, Statement of Interests (2 min)
2. WHOIS1 Recs 5-9 – Data Accuracy (25 min)
   a) ICANN org clarifications – see https://mm.icann.org/pipermail/rds-whois2-rt/2018-August/000860.html
   b) b) Review/refine proposed R5.1
3. WHOIS1 Rec 4 & Objective 6 – Compliance (15 min)
   a) Review Volker's proposed changes to CM.2
4. Suggested Bylaw amendment: OECD (10 min)
5. Subgroup 3 - Law Enforcement Needs (10 min)
6. WHOIS 1 Rec 1 - Strategic Priority (5 min)
7. WHOIS1 Rec 11 - Common Interface (5 min)
8. Executive summary (15 min)
9. Address any objections/edits/comments submitted to the mailing-list to date (25 min)
10. Roadmap reminder (5 min)
11. A.O.B. (1 min)
12. Confirm action items and decisions reached (2 min)

WHOIS1 Recs 5-9 Data Accuracy

Agenda item #2 – 25 min

WHOIS1 Recs 5-9 Data Accuracy

- Discussion with ICANN org following-up on review team's request:

"Why so many ARS-generated tickets are closed with no action (are the records changed, the domains transferred or not renewed, etc)"

ICANN org clarifications – see https://mm.icann.org/pipermail/rds-whois2-rt/2018-August/000860.html

- **Review/refine proposed R5.1**:

ICANN Board should direct WHOIS ARS project team to look into the potentially-anomalous closed tickets because the WHOIS record changed, to analyze who did the updates (registrant or registrar), why the WHOIS data was updated, possible linkage with ARS, etc. Based on the analyzing, WHOIS ARS project team should revise the follow-up.

WHOIS1 Rec 4 & Objective 6 - Compliance

Agenda item #3 – 15 min

WHOIS1 Rec 4 & Objective 6 - Compliance

- **Review Volker's proposed changes to Rec.2**

The ICANN Board should direct ICANN Organization to review grandfathered domain names to determine the percentage of such domains where information is missing from the RDS Registrant field. If more than 15% of all gTLD domain name registrations are found to lack data in the Registrant field that is required under the 2013 RAA but not required under the 2009 RAA, then the ICANN Board should initiate action intended to ensure that all gTLD domain names adhere to the same registration data collection requirements [within 12 months] provided that such action does not unduly impact the rights of registrants in the use of their domain name and does not create an undue burden upon registrars who would have to enforce any such requirement.

Suggested Bylaw Amendment OECD

Agenda item #4 – 25 min

Suggested Bylaw Amendment OECD

Scope of the present RDS-WHOIS2 Review, section 4.6(e)(iii) of the Bylaws was considered:

"The review team for the Directory Service Review ("Directory Service Review Team") will consider the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development ("OECD") Guidelines on the Protection of Privacy and Transborder Flows of Personal Data as defined by the OECD in 1980 and amended in 2013 and as may be amended from time to time."

Alan's suggested recommendation:

- Eliminate the Safeguarding requirement

- Replace the OECD paragraph with a more generic requirement to review privacy and data-transfer issues. I think the reference to
the OECD Guidelines, even with the caveat "as amended from time to time" is appropriate in the Bylaws.

Subgroup 3 – Law Enforcement Needs

Agenda item #5 – 10 min

Subgroup 3 – Law Enforcement Needs

- **LE.1**:

The ICANN Board should resolve that regular data gathering through surveys and studies are to be conducted by ICANN to inform a future assessment of the effectiveness of WHOIS in meeting the needs of law enforcement, as well as future policy development (including the current expedited Policy Development Process and related efforts).

- **LE.2**:

Such surveys and/or studies should also extend to other WHOIS users, such as cybersecurity professionals and related professionals.

WHOIS1 Rec 1 - Strategic Priority

Agenda item #6 – 5 min

WHOIS1 Rec 1 - Strategic Priority

- **Recommendation R1.1**:

The ICANN Board should put into place a forward-looking mechanism to monitor possible impacts on the RDS from legislative and policy developments around the world.

- **Recommendation R1.2**:

To support this mechanism, the ICANN Board should instruct the ICANN Organization to assign responsibility for monitoring legislative and policy development around the world and to provide regular updates to the Board.

- **Recommendation R1.3:**

The ICANN Board should update the Charter of its Board Working Group on RDS to ensure the necessary transparency of the group's work, such as by providing for records of meetings and meeting minutes, to enable future review of its activities.

WHOIS1 Rec 1 - Strategic Priority

Email from Cathrin on 15 August:

"I have also added a sentence to start to address Stephanie's well-founded concern, which I believe deserves more discussion on another call, as we had no time to delve into two points:

- *the issue of how to criticize implementation of recommendations which may have been impossible to measure from the start, and*
- *how we want to deal with the previous RT's recommendations - my recollection from the last F2F was that we would clarify somewhere that they were not superseded by the present report but I may be wrong."*

WHOIS1 Rec11 - Common Interface

Agenda item #7 – 5 min

WHOIS1 Rec11 - Common Interface

- **Recommendation R11.1**:

The ICANN Board should direct the ICANN Organization to define metrics or SLA's to be tracked and evaluated to determine consistency of results of queries and use of any common interface (existing or future) used to provide one-stop access to registration data across all gTLDs and registrars/resellers. Specific metrics that should be tracked for any such common interface include:

- – How often are fields returned blank?
- – How often is data displayed inconsistently (for the same domain name), overall and per gTLD)?
- – How often does the tool not return any results, overall and per gTLD)?
- – What are the causes for the above results?

WHOIS1 Rec11 - Common Interface

- **Recommendation R11.2:**

The ICANN Board should direct the ICANN Organization to continue to maintain the common interface to keep up to date with new policy developments or contractual changes for contracted parties to ensure that the common interface will display all publicly-available WHOIS output for each gTLD domain name registration available from contracted parties, i.e., both the registry and registrar WHOIS output port 43 could be shown in parallel.

Executive Summary

Agenda item #8 – 15 min

Executive Summary

- Review version sent by Alan on 15 August 2018

Address Any Objections/Edits/Comments Submitted To The Mailing-list To Date

Agenda item #9 – 25 min

Subgroup Status Report

#	Subgroup	# of Recs	Report	Accountable	Submitted	Approved Recs./Concls. RT	Section approved by RT
1	Rec #1 - Strategic Priority	3	DOCX	Cathrin	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #2: Single WHOIS Policy	0	DOCX	Carlton	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #3: Outreach	2	DOCX	Alan	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #4: Compliance	2	DOCX	Susan	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #5-9: Data Accuracy	1	DOCX	Lili	✓	✓ (with obj.)	✗
	Rec #10: Privacy/Proxy Services	2	DOCX	Volker	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #11: Common Interface	2	DOCX	Volker	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #12-14: IDNs	1	DOCX	Lili	✓	✓	✗
	Rec #15-16: Plan & Annual Reports	1	DOCX	Alan/Lili	✓	✓	✗
2	Anything New	0	DOCX	Stephanie	✓	✓	✗
3	Law Enforcement Needs	2	DOCX	Cathrin	✓	✓ (with edits)	✗
4	Consumer Trust	0	DOCX	Erika	✓	✓	✗
5	Safeguarding Registrant Data	1	DOCX	Alan	✓	✓	✗
6	Compliance	5	DOCX	Susan	✗	✗ (with obj. on CM.2)	✗
7	Bylaws Amendments	1?		Alan	✓	✗	✗
/	Executive Summary	N/A		Alan/Susan	✓	✗	✗

Roadmap Reminder

Agenda item #10 – 5 min

Roadmap Reminder

- **By 26 August:**
  - **All, read the draft report and send any objections, dissent reports (if any), or suggested edits you may have**

- **27 August**: Plenary Call (120 min) & Final consensus call on draft report
  - All, address comments/edits (if any)
  - All, formal adopt report

- **By 1 September** – Release public comment period

A.O.B.

Agenda item #11 – 1 min

A.O.B.

- **Face-to-Face Meeting #4**: 10-12 December | Brussels

Confirm
Decisions Reached
&
Action Items