

Attendance: (39 members)

Alan Greenberg	Justine Chew
Alex Schubert	Kavouss Arasteh
Annebeth Lange	Liz Williams
Cheryl Langdon-Orr	Matthew Johnson
Christopher Wilkinson	Mirjana Tasic
Dave Kissoondoyal	Nick Wenban-Smith
Erich Schweighofer	Phil Marano
Griffin Barnett	Robin Gross
Hadia Elminiawi	Rosalia Morales
Heather Forrest	Susan Anthony
Irene Borissova	Susan Payne
Janvier Ngnoulaye	Svitlana Tkachenko
Javier Rua-Jovet	Taylor Bentley
Jeff Neuman	Thiago Jardim
John Rodriguez	Timo Vohmar
Jorge Cancio	Timothy Asiedu
Juan Manuel Rojas	Vernatius Ezeama
	Yrjo Lansipuro

Audio Only:

Ejikeme Egbougu
Carlos Raul Gutierrez
Bram Fudzulani
Greg Shatan

Apologies:

Ann Cathrin-Marcussen
Carlos Dionisio Aguirre
Maureen Hilyard
Barrack Otieno

Staff:

Steve Chan
Emily Barabas
Berry Cobb
Julie Hedlund
Michelle DeSmyter
Julie Bisland

WebEx chat:

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants: I am in the webex page, but no sound.
Could you call me? +47 95911559

from Terri Agnew to All Participants:Hi Annebeth, yes, I will have an operator dial you momentarily

from Javier Rúa-Jovet to All Participants:ouch

from Christopher Wilkinson to All Participants:Good evening eeryone. Initial Webex logon looks OK. Fingers crossed! CW

from Javier Rúa-Jovet to All Participants:Hello to all that have joined so far.

from Javier Rúa-Jovet to All Participants>Please kindly mute.

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:PLease Remember to MUTE if you are not speaking to the meeting at the time

from Javier Rúa-Jovet to All Participants:Hello to all that have joined so far!; Hola a los que se han unido hasta ahora!

from Juan Manuel Rojas to All Participants:Hello everyone!

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All ParticipantsAnd a reminder to everyone PLEASE ****MUTE**** your phone or microphone unless intending to speak to the meeting

from Svitlana Tkachenko to All Participants:hello!

from Dave Kissoondoyal to All Participants:Hello

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:Hi all!

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:The Background noise is VERY loud please mute

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:The Capture of input document is not quite ready for full group review but will be released shortly, we are as previously stated capturing from Meetingz, chat and email exchanges

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:A ****Reminder**** the slides used in Meetings are mearly aids to presentation and NOT a record of the current thinking or discussions per se

from Terri Agnew to All Participants:@ALL: please be aware of whether your webex connection is muted (mic turns red) or unmuted (is gray).

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Indeed Heather tracking the email exchanges in topic splits as you describe is part of the challenge

from Timothy Asiedu to All Participants:Thanks that today after changing my chrome laptop I have managed to join you successfully.

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:Can we more effectively communicate with the WG wiki, or a Google doc, or some other method?

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:I just hesitated to add a detailed reply to what was already a VERY long email thread

from Liz Williams to All Participants:@Heather...yes please and I, like you, always hesitate to both post things and make interventions in the call. We need to positively capture input and also not criticise enthusiastic/knowledgable/engaged people from participating.

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:Heather. all that is sent on mail will be taken aboard. So if you want to write it in a separate mail.

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Regardless of method Heather there are challenges to effective and efficient data capture unless we run **very prescriptive** processes However as the Capture Document being described will also be open to comment and proposed edits this will also we trust assist...

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:OK thank Javier, Annebeth (and Liz) - I'll send an email to the list after this call

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Emily has her hand up as well as Jorge

from Javier Rúa-Jovet to All Participants:Perfect Heather, please do.

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:I do wish we had a way to get the comments into a single, organised space in the first hand rather than staff having to create a second resource

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:

I understand Heather but that probably requires a high level of prescription in input methodologies...

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:I see your point, Heather, that discussion was very confusing. But when the narrative is finished, it will be easier to add comments

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:Thanks Emily for explaining the staff perspective

from Liz Williams to All Participants:@Emily...could you take another look at my idea of a schematic that shows, like a temperature gauge, about where we might be getting some illustration of consensus...always happy to help.

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:I'm just concerned that email is such a blunt instrument for capturing input in a dynamic way

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Liz we are a good ways off trying to establish any "consensus" but the Co Leads will consider tool options when they are closer to making such determinations

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:The main thing at this point is to capture all views. It is premature to start determine consensus levels.

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:sorry old hand

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:I think it's great that the co-leads are thinking creatively about how to ensure capturing all views, which will be important to underpin any recommendations this group comes to

from Javier Rúa-Jovet to All Participants:please mute

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Music interlude!

from Kavouss Arasteh to All Participants:Where we can find the compilation of comments so far made

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:@Liz - the worm?

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants:I thin we are FAR away from creating "consensus"

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants:thin = think

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:I feel that mapping wherefrom positions and supports come is useful - without going into consensus determination

from Steve Chan to All Participants:@Kavouss, that document is still being prepared and will be shared with the WT as soon as possible

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:This is an old comment, I have good sound now

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:indeed Alexander

from Liz Williams to All Participants thanks Emily...I appreciate the clarification but I think it is definately up to all of us to have that in our mind...otherwise we have endless circles ...

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:the flowcharts are very useful, at least to me :-)

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Excellent Jorge

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants:Liz: It's an iterative process. Any attempt to find chortcuts will backfire.

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:the Co-Leads (especially Martin) have worked hard with staff on producing these

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants:shortcuts - my keyboard is sticky and icky

from Jeff Neuman to All Participants:No hands now

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Your fine Javier

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Carlos is only on the phone

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:mind-maps are also great tool

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All ParticipantsWe considered Mind Maps

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:@Carlos: We will look into that

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:it may have been that this was prepared by ease of access to licenced tools that staff had at the time... We will review

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Of course CHristopher our task is very much to review athe 2012 process and propose any possible modifications

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Hand up

from Liz Williams to All Participants:@ Christopher...I suspect that representing things graphically like this will give us further options to make reviews and changes to, perhaps, represent how things should look in the future...

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:@CW: What we are trying to do in thei WT5, is to see if we find a better way than in 2012, which we can agree on

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Yes it was Martin who literally sent us photos of his scribbling on paper sfrom his desk

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants:I agree with Christopher!

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:But it was Steve making the charts through some program :-)

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants: The 2012 AGB worked somehow for 2012 - but the geoTLD world will DRAMATICALLY change - the AGB has to adapt!

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants: After an idea from Martin, that should be said.

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants: on slide 10: I refer to the comments I made today on list regarding the idea of an advisory panel to help applicants

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants: and after Alexander we have Kavouss

from Susan Payne to All Participants: Absolutely Alexander. Context is absolutely key

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants: Remember this is a snapshot of what happened (we think) exercise

from John Rodriguez to All Participants: Agree with Alexander's comment and Susan P's chat regarding context.

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants: question: are we expected to make normative comments on the slides or only on their accuracy?

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:

Accuracy at this stage Jorge

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants: stage

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants: Kavouss Javier felt your comments more focussed on this slide 12

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants: it would be sth new (normative) :-)

from Heather Forrest to All Participants: The discussion we're having now is a good example of where a better communications tool would be helpful could we put the graphics into a Google doc or find some other means of commenting on them rather than kick off lots of email threads?

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants: I suspect so Heather

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants: Heather: a "Google doc" would be an information sink; lie

from Alexander Schubert to All Participants:literally nobody would read it - there would be no active discussion....

from Christopher Wilkinson to All Participants:The advisory panel needs to get into the act with the initial application. First not last. But the Panel needs to be competent. e.g. See <dpt-scpt>

from Christopher Wilkinson to All ParticipantsSee <dot.scot> which in the wisdom of the 2012 Panel was deemed to be NOT a geo-name!

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:thx Cheryl - I had not seen your reply in time, sorry...

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:NP we need the proposed changes input as well but after we ensure everyone knows agrees that we understand what happened in the last round

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants::-)

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Then after Christopher you have Kavouss again Javier

from John Rodriguez to All Participants:Appreciate the discussion regarding a panel but concerned it is premature since we don't have agreement as to what is considered a "geoname". Nor have agreed that a geo term with use related to the geo location should be subject to any kind of review/process.

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:And then warn that it is only short time left - we will continue next Wednesday.

from Alexander Schubert to All Panelists:I support Christopher!

from Martin Sutton to All Participants:Sorry I have to drop off the call - I have a session to lead at GDD Summit.

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:After Kavouss, then Susan and Greg

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Email will be excellent on any parts of today's presentation slides on the process flow chart

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:+1 Susan re not wanting to intervene too often - I don't feel it's appropriate for one person to make lots of interventions in the limited time of a call

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Of course Susan we were not asking for opinions on these issues in todays call , but thanks for noting your concerns Susan

from John Rodriguez to All Participants:Agree with Susan P.

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:@Heather, when we have AC back, then we will have a timer

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Noted Greg

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants: Looking forward to that Heather

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:Thanks Annebeth but it's not just a timer - if we added together multiple interventions of each person it would far exceed the timer

from Susan Payne to All Participants:apologies, I lost my phone connection so I have missed the last few minutes

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:People we are NOT asking for a discussion on that in todays call CW

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:you views like all others will be noted

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:@Heather: Do you suggest then, that we should restrict participants total speaking time?

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:@Annebeth - I think we need to think creatively about how to get more new voices to speak up in the calls

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:one impediment to that is the small handful of people who intervene multiple times

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Thank you Susan we appreciate your self control

from Susan Anthony to All Participants:A gTLD that corresponds to a geo name/term that is not being used for a purpose related to a geographic location is not, by definition, a geo name/term.

from Annebeth Lange to All Participants:I agree, and there are many people with other language than English as mother tongue that have problems participating. Your view appreciated and noted, Heather.

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:@Susan: I guess that a geoname has that connotation irrespective of its use - especially considering that it is a unique resource

from Heather Forrest to All Participants:Thanks, Annebeth

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Kavouss and Susan We will move onto the next slide now so please drop your hands from the que, and utalise the email list if needs be

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:e.g. "switzerland" is a geoname even if your intended use is e.g. a brand of swiss water

from Susan Payne to All ParticipantsI understand that this isn't the time to talk about the substance, but I would like everyone to follow that rulew rather than having repeated grandstanding which is not being challenged by the many people who disagree because "now isn't the time"

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:We will continue with the review of the existing process in the next call as well of course you are about half way through the process slides at this stage

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Next Meeting details

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All ParticipantsThx Annebeth

from Emily Barabas to All Participants:The next call in Wednesday 23 May at 5:00 UTC

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Thx Emily

from Nick Wenban-Smith to All Participants:Thanks everyone. Nice chairing Javier!

from JORGE CANCIO to All Participants:thx all and bye!

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All ParticipantsCOnTinue on from around slide 16

from Cheryl Langdon-Orr to All Participants:Bye

from Juan Manuel Rojas to All Participants:Bye

from Juan Manuel Rojas to All Participants:thanks to all