

**Attendance - 21 Members**

Alan Greenberg

Alberto Soto

Carolina Caeiro

Ching Chiao

Erika Mann

Hadia Elminiawi

Johan (Julf) Helsingius

Jon Nevett

Jonathan Robinson

Judith Hellerstein

Marie-Noemie Marques

Marilyn S Cade

Mary Uduma

Maureen Hilyard

Mei Lin Fung

Nadira AL-Araj

Sebastien Bachollet

Stephen Deerhake

Sylvia Cadena

Tony Harris

Vanda Scartezini

**Apologies:** Kavouss Arasteh, Vanda Scartezini, Elliot Noss, Sally Costerton, Maarten Botterman, Becky Burr, John Levine, Joke Braeken (staff), Emily Barabas (staff)

**Staff:** Sam Eisner, Marika Konings, Lauren Allison, Julie Bisland

May 10, 2018 8:43:57 AM from George Kirikos to everyone: Hi Terri. Was just testing the interface (ISP's spam blocking blocked the invite, when I tried sending it to my email).

May 10, 2018 8:44:15 AM from George Kirikos to everyone: I'll be back later, for the IGO call at noon Eastern time. ttyl

May 10, 2018 8:52:22 AM from Terri Agnew to everyone: Hello Mary, welcome

May 10, 2018 9:01:01 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: HI All

May 10, 2018 9:01:51 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: Seems webex broke the web im

May 10, 2018 9:02:05 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: Also the hand raising is next to your name now

May 10, 2018 9:02:09 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: interface

May 10, 2018 9:02:29 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Hi everyone - we will start soon!

May 10, 2018 9:02:45 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: I think we are using a different type of room today so the layout is slightly different. Hopefully Adobe Connect will be back soon ;-)

May 10, 2018 9:03:11 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: have Toby participate from tiny phone

May 10, 2018 9:03:14 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: Please note that the documents that we will be reviewing during today's meeting were also circulated by email just prior to this meeting to facilitate review.

May 10, 2018 9:03:49 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: The staff is still working to solve the security problems

May 10, 2018 9:04:06 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: was trying to type "to"

May 10, 2018 9:05:02 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: What holiday is today?

May 10, 2018 9:05:27 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: so webex doesnt work for me at aol from pc

May 10, 2018 9:06:06 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: I think it is Ascension Day in many European Countries

May 10, 2018 9:08:05 AM from Alberto Soto to everyone: Sorry, I do not have audio on my computer. I do not have audio on the phone either. I will try to call myself via Adigo

May 10, 2018 9:08:29 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Agree. Important to get more comments and input from the CCWG. I appreciate the support from the Leadership to continue the work on the preamble.

May 10, 2018 9:08:58 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: I support having one more week on the comments on the Preamble. My changes were brief.

May 10, 2018 9:09:00 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: Yes, more time

May 10, 2018 9:09:30 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: Yes

May 10, 2018 9:09:45 AM from Maureen Hilyard to everyone: Agree more time

May 10, 2018 9:09:47 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: can we also know who the two dial in participants are?

May 10, 2018 9:09:56 AM from Hadia Elminiawi to everyone: + for more time

May 10, 2018 9:10:34 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Can someone switch to the doc about the examples

May 10, 2018 9:11:17 AM from Alberto Soto to everyone: Sorry, I did not solve anything. unfortunately I must leave the meeting. Thanks!!

May 10, 2018 9:11:49 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Agree. The consolidated version will be helpful to finalize the list.

May 10, 2018 9:13:18 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: That was quick!

May 10, 2018 9:13:39 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: +1

May 10, 2018 9:13:55 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: While I generally agree, I have a comment.

May 10, 2018 9:14:56 AM from Nadira Al-Araj to everyone: Thanks to Sylvia and Marilyn who reviewed it and will be good to have more time to review the edited draft by the us

May 10, 2018 9:15:09 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Agree. I also did the same on my comments.

May 10, 2018 9:15:21 AM from Mei Lin Fung to everyone: Agree with Marilyn that we should be neutral and not name entities in the examples

May 10, 2018 9:15:35 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: +1 Marilyn

May 10, 2018 9:16:02 AM from Maureen Hilyard to everyone: +1 Marilyn and Mei Lin

May 10, 2018 9:18:12 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: Yes I agree and sylvia and I tried to change the wording on many of these

May 10, 2018 9:20:07 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: Frankly, and I am rather shocked -- the "members" who are chosen and are supposed to be in touch with their sending organizations have a very low response rate, and I'd like to know if they actually reached out to their sending organizations. I am also very disappointed by the participants response rate. This can't be treated as a validated response.

May 10, 2018 9:20:37 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: In Alac we had a very active discussion on this survey

May 10, 2018 9:21:09 AM from Mei Lin Fung to everyone: I think we have enough to narrow it to 3

May 10, 2018 9:21:26 AM from Mei Lin Fung to everyone: I mean 3 options

May 10, 2018 9:21:47 AM from Jon Nevett to everyone: Could we see the chart based on members vs. participants responses as well? Would be interesting to see if the results are consistent.

May 10, 2018 9:22:19 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: I think we have to ask the "members" if they consulted with their sending organizations, or if they are speaking as an individual. Still, being appointed as a full member, which I believe has funding for travel for the face to face ICANN meetings, seems to be a low rate of response.

May 10, 2018 9:23:24 AM from stephanie.perrin@mail.utoronto.ca to everyone: apologies for being late.

May 10, 2018 9:24:41 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: Correct, there is no travel funding available for members or participants of the CCWG

May 10, 2018 9:25:06 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Hi Stephanie!

May 10, 2018 9:27:10 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: I confirmed members / participants - there was only one person who had identified themselves as a member while being a participant

May 10, 2018 9:28:55 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: Marika. Good. Thanks.

May 10, 2018 9:29:37 AM from stephanie.perrin@mail.utoronto.ca to everyone: I responded on the deadline, and I see it was not tabulated, so I guess I got cut off and lost the results. If I may comment generally, I had two observations: 1) it is very hard to estimate how effective the administrative arrangements/models would be, without getting into the details... There is simply too much scope to consider.

May 10, 2018 9:30:21 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: I agree with Stephanie

May 10, 2018 9:31:20 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: This group does not have that since the beginning.

May 10, 2018 9:31:39 AM from stephanie.perrin@mail.utoronto.ca to everyone: 2) this poll was looking at administrative/cost factors alone. It seems to me that the ethics and soundness of the evaluation of proposals is going to be a critical factor, and this was not evaluated. I understand that perhaps those considerations were considered out of scope, but in this case cost and independence will make a big difference to the soundness of decision making...which ought to be the focus in my view.

May 10, 2018 9:31:42 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: Only travel funding IF there was a dedicated day prior to ICANN meeting.

May 10, 2018 9:31:49 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: That is indicated on one of the first letters from the board available on the wiki

May 10, 2018 9:32:29 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: thanks, Marika, helpful to know that CCWGs do not provide funding for members/none provided for participants, but is important to

know, at that means many challenges to undertake the face to face work. Just noting and thanks for the clarification.

May 10, 2018 9:32:33 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: Exactly Marilyn, I agree which is the reason I only subscribed as a participant and not a member since not sure I could make 100% of the meetings

May 10, 2018 9:33:33 AM from Jon Nevett to everyone: Marika: did you see a material difference in the responses based on the two cohorts?

May 10, 2018 9:36:12 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: @Jon - I would need to do the calculations again. Happy to do so.

May 10, 2018 9:36:34 AM from Jon Nevett to everyone: Thanks!

May 10, 2018 9:37:34 AM from Hadia Elminiawi to everyone: would it be possible to open the survey again for a couple of days -

May 10, 2018 9:39:43 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Certainly Hadia ... I will make a proposal soon!

May 10, 2018 9:39:49 AM from Hadia Elminiawi to everyone: Thanks

May 10, 2018 9:39:55 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: I have a conflict and will be leaving at the one hour point.

May 10, 2018 9:40:01 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: Alan, Marilyn, are those new hands or old hands?

May 10, 2018 9:40:36 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Understood Alan ... I will have your points covered in a proposal I will make a bit later.

May 10, 2018 9:46:52 AM from Sebastien Bachollet to everyone: Re-open yes but not change it to do it ASAP

May 10, 2018 9:46:54 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: Do we take it again if we took it the first time

May 10, 2018 9:47:30 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: I assume no

May 10, 2018 9:47:45 AM from Terri Agnew to everyone: @ALL: reminder when chatting, watch the SEND TO: and make sure it says EVERYONE. :)

May 10, 2018 9:47:55 AM from Jonathan Robinson to everyone: I had thought about re-opening it and that may get greater response. But ... bear in mind that knowing the current outcomes MAY influence how people answer.

May 10, 2018 9:48:19 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Fine with me. Re-open but without change. Maybe be possible to send reminders to members/participants that have not responded?

May 10, 2018 9:48:53 AM from Nadira Al-Araj to everyone: Would be good to have a consultant expert perspective.

May 10, 2018 9:49:10 AM from Sebastien Bachollet to everyone: Yes Jonathan but as the 4 options are very close I don't know how it can influence someone

May 10, 2018 9:49:35 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: Note that those have responded to the survey do not need to take it again, unless you want to modify your responses in which case you need to let me know so I can delete your previous response.

May 10, 2018 9:49:42 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: I think it's a good idea, but I would suggest we wait until we have the updated results of the survey

May 10, 2018 9:50:05 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: @Carolina - you mean the members only scoring?

May 10, 2018 9:50:32 AM from Maureen Hilyard to everyone: A comment - With regards to making our choices, if one looked at the questions and checked which option was the best for each of the criteria, my responses wavered from one mechanism to the other depending on the practical application of that criteria against the different options even though my choice for the criteria meant that I chose my least favoured option because realistically, it was the best for that particular criteria.

May 10, 2018 9:51:02 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: @maureen, that is exactly my issues as well

May 10, 2018 9:53:19 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: In addition to how the Members voted, please post their attendance record.

May 10, 2018 9:53:32 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: My hand is up

May 10, 2018 9:53:33 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Sorry, left over hand.

May 10, 2018 9:54:03 AM from Terri Agnew to everyone: Mary Uduma has hand raised

May 10, 2018 9:54:31 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: Attendance records are already posted on the wiki: see <https://community.icann.org/x/GJjDAw>

May 10, 2018 9:54:47 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: @Marika, my comment was in reference to Erika's proposal to have some of the mechanism fleshed out.

May 10, 2018 9:55:35 AM from Nadira Al-Araj to everyone: Thank you, and up to another meeting

May 10, 2018 9:55:49 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: @Carolina - Ah, ok, apologies for associating it with the wrong comment

May 10, 2018 9:55:57 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: no problem

May 10, 2018 9:57:39 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: FOundation often has significant tax benefits if it is a for-profit company.

May 10, 2018 9:57:53 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: profit..

May 10, 2018 9:58:29 AM from ALan Greenberg to everyone: Have to leave now.

May 10, 2018 9:58:45 AM from Sebastien Bachollet to everyone: In the country where the foundation is setup!!!

May 10, 2018 9:59:16 AM from Hadia Elminiawi to everyone: yes Sebastian

May 10, 2018 9:59:23 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Is possible for staff to send reminders to those that have not answer? or add a bit of urgency on the subject line / call for action type of wording?

May 10, 2018 9:59:44 AM from Jon Nevett to everyone: i need to hop to another ICANN meeting -- apologies

May 10, 2018 10:00:49 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Thanks Joh!

May 10, 2018 10:00:59 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: Can the new poll explain what the Chair and Alan said regarding Foundation?

May 10, 2018 10:03:33 AM from Sebastien Bachollet to everyone: I will not be able to participate to the next week meeting as I am giving a talk at AFNCI Forum about ICANN diversity ;)

May 10, 2018 10:03:56 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Thank you Sebastien!

May 10, 2018 10:05:43 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: We really should try to use more the mailing list to move the discussion forward. Participation for me is very hard, as my Friday

mornings start at 5 am. Finishing a conference call at 1:30 am is a really big effort. Is hard to think at this late hour.

May 10, 2018 10:06:13 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: I don't think conference calls should be were "everything" happens.

May 10, 2018 10:06:20 AM from Maureen Hilyard to everyone: Thank you Marika, that will be helpful for us to distribute, and we are all singing the same tune

May 10, 2018 10:07:08 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Totally agree Sylvia ... let's do this as much as we can.

May 10, 2018 10:07:29 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Thanks Erika.

May 10, 2018 10:16:19 AM from Antonio Harris to everyone: Apologies for late join (Doctor appointment)

May 10, 2018 10:17:09 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: @Sylvia - that's an awful slot you have ... few times in a month I have a similar slot, finishing calls at 1 AM in the morning. And, like you, I have to get up the next day at 5 AM ... hate this.

May 10, 2018 10:18:25 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: Good that we have the High Interest Topic slot, as we really need to have a community update, even if we are not final on many issues.

May 10, 2018 10:18:48 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: I hope there would be provision for remote participation at ICANN62

May 10, 2018 10:18:49 AM from Marilyn Cade to everyone: Can you perhaps do a Doodle for who will be in attendance in person?

May 10, 2018 10:19:13 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: @Marilyn - yes, staff can do so

May 10, 2018 10:19:14 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: I just lost Erika's audio

May 10, 2018 10:20:08 AM from Antonio Harris to everyone: I am OK with this

May 10, 2018 10:20:20 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: what was the question that was asked

May 10, 2018 10:21:16 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: thanks everyone

May 10, 2018 10:21:19 AM from Sylvia Cadena to everyone: Thank you everyone

May 10, 2018 10:21:20 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: Thank you everyone and bye



May 10, 2018 10:21:29 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Thanks!