

Attendance - 21 Members

Alan Greenberg
Becky Burr
Beran Gillen
Carolina Caeiro
Ching Chiao
Daniel Dardailler
Elliot Noss
Erika Mann
Johan (Julf) Helsingius
Jon Nevett
Jonathan Robinson
Judith Hellerstein
Maarten Botterman
Marilyn Cade
Mary Uduma
Maureen Hilyard
Stephen Deerhake
Sylvia Cadena
Tony Harris
Vanda Scartezini
Yeseul Kim

Apologies: John Levine, Kavouss Arasteh

Staff: Emily Barabas, Joke Braeken, Marika Konings, Sam Eisner, Lauren Allison, Xavier Calvez, Julie Bisland

Webex Chat:

04/26/2018 16:01:32 PM from Judith Hellerstein to Everyone: The Technology Task Force will be having a discussion of the alternative conferencing tools at our next meeting on May 7 at 1400 UTC. All are invited. We will have the meetings team and IT people on our call

04/26/2018 16:02:04 PM from Julf Helsingius to Everyone: Thanks, Judith!

04/26/2018 16:02:17 PM from Stephen Deerhake to Everyone: Someone is typing and not muted...

04/26/2018 16:02:26 PM from Marika Konings to Everyone: From 3 May, Adobe Connect will be back for a trial, so hopefully we won't have to struggle with Webex for much longer (at least for a while ;-)

04/26/2018 16:02:48 PM from Judith Hellerstein to Everyone: to joint the TTF, email At large staff at staff@atlarge.icann.org and request to be put on our list

04/26/2018 16:06:32 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: In the External Expert table, I can't find the input from e.g. Jose Manuel Alonso, although I know he has sent replies, is that normal ?

04/26/2018 16:06:59 PM from Joke Braeken to Everyone: wiki space:
[https://community.icann.org/x/BSW8B\[community.icann.org\]](https://community.icann.org/x/BSW8B[community.icann.org])

04/26/2018 16:07:22 PM from Joke Braeken to Everyone: summary table in google sheet, including potential gaps:
[https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1fPc9XJr4dCys8CAUUC6c7O3J6P6HYDu7Z7ZeDfzP_A/edit?usp=sharing\[docs.google.com\]](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1fPc9XJr4dCys8CAUUC6c7O3J6P6HYDu7Z7ZeDfzP_A/edit?usp=sharing[docs.google.com]) Highlighted in yellow are the questions that have received no answers.

04/26/2018 16:07:54 PM from Marika Konings to Everyone: @Daniel - you can find his input under the 'general questions' tab

04/26/2018 16:08:03 PM from Vanda Scartezini to Everyone: my audio is not working will try to connect myself again

04/26/2018 16:08:21 PM from Marika Konings to Everyone: Note that there are different work sheets (you can see the different tabs at the bottom)

04/26/2018 16:08:51 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: ah ok, found them

04/26/2018 16:08:55 PM from Alberto Soto to Everyone: my audio does not work either

04/26/2018 16:09:12 PM from YS to Everyone: My audio is not working either. Seems like there's a problem for everyone?

04/26/2018 16:09:27 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: audio ok for me, I can hear erika very well

04/26/2018 16:09:29 PM from Jonathan Robinson to Everyone: My audio fine via PC

04/26/2018 16:09:41 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: using webex audio pc

04/26/2018 16:09:47 PM from Jonathan Robinson to Everyone: You can accidentally diable it when you first set up

04/26/2018 16:10:02 PM from Jonathan Robinson to Everyone: Need to go back to Audio menu at top of screen

04/26/2018 16:10:21 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: these feel like straw poll questions rather than loudest comments (and I say that in a self-effacing fashion)

04/26/2018 16:10:36 PM from Terri Agnew to Everyone: to connect audio via webex, click Audio in the upper left side of screen and have webex call you, or connect via your computer.

04/26/2018 16:11:35 PM from Marika Konings to Everyone: The objective is to identify what issues, if any, need to be clarified or addressed before a determination can be made with regards to preferred mechanism, but if some of these do not need to be addressed from that perspective, they could be deferred to a later stage.

04/26/2018 16:11:48 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: ONE-OFF! :-)

04/26/2018 16:12:29 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: I recommend going for our preferred option in details and give a second best

04/26/2018 16:13:02 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: +1 daniel

04/26/2018 16:13:04 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: I gave my rationales for my choice (#1) in the past

04/26/2018 16:13:31 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone: Daniel is right.

04/26/2018 16:13:49 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone:
<https://mm.icann.org/pipermail/ccwg-auctionproceeds/2018-March/000843.html>

04/26/2018 16:13:49 PM from Joke Braeken to Everyone: May I kindly invite you to please mute your lines when not speaking? Thank you!

04/26/2018 16:14:13 PM from Alberto Soto to Everyone: Sorry, I can not activate the audio and I have a lot of noise on my phone. I can not continue in the meeting. I'll see the transcripts later.
Regards

04/26/2018 16:16:44 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone: willd epend on the way you manage this amount of fund

04/26/2018 16:16:57 PM from Jonathan Robinson to Everyone: Hand

04/26/2018 16:16:57 PM from Erika Mann to Everyone: Jonathan, you're next!

04/26/2018 16:17:13 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: Elliot: I don't know the exact in-house mechanism that ICANN has already been using, but the board liaisons told us ICANN knew how to do a separate branch, accountability speaking

04/26/2018 16:17:31 PM from Marika Konings to Everyone: Do note that a preliminary CCWG agreement based on previous deliberations is: The CCWG's focus is on the funds that are currently available without any assumption that additional funds will become available. The CCWG will focus on developing recommendations that will enable the disbursement of the funds in an effective and judicious manner without creating a perpetual mechanism (i.e. not being focused on preservation of capital).

04/26/2018 16:17:42 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: (repeating as erica did not share) these issues are more amenable to a straw poll than further debate. we have been talking about these issues for a LONG time now

04/26/2018 16:17:50 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone: we can spend % for the firs year to test the model and spread this money for 5-10 years

04/26/2018 16:18:35 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: a straw poll will at least allow us to take the temperature of the group and not have it based upon frequency of comments

04/26/2018 16:18:44 PM from Judith Hellerstein to Everyone: I keep losing audio

04/26/2018 16:19:06 PM from Judith Hellerstein to Everyone: it is back

04/26/2018 16:19:16 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone: judith I have reconnect and now is working well

04/26/2018 16:19:16 PM from Erika Mann to Everyone: We will do this later Elliot but we have to do a survey, not everyone is present today

04/26/2018 16:19:24 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: +1 to having governance done by community, isn't that the way ICANN works anyway ?

04/26/2018 16:19:48 PM from Ching Chiao to Everyone: +1 Jonathan +1 Daniel

04/26/2018 16:19:51 PM from Erika Mann to Everyone: I've seen it Judith!

04/26/2018 16:20:01 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone:agree with community governance

04/26/2018 16:20:03 PM from Terri Agnew to Everyone: to all having audio issues: you can call into the audio bridge as an option. please see your invite for the appropriate phone number based on your location. When asked, the passcode is AUCTION

04/26/2018 16:20:42 PM from Maureen Hilyard to Everyone: Good point Jonathan - about the reserve fund

04/26/2018 16:21:06 PM from Joke Braeken to Everyone: Erika, I have Alan, Elliott and Marilyn

04/26/2018 16:21:32 PM from Jonathan Robinson to Everyone: @All. A key question asked of ICANN on Reserve Fund replenishment was the appropriateness or not of utilising a portion of Auction Funds

04/26/2018 16:23:25 PM from Julf Helsingius to Everyone: I seem to have gotten webex to work on Firefox on Linux - annoyingly enough it only works with 32-bit libraries, not 64-bit

04/26/2018 16:23:55 PM from Judith Hellerstein to Everyone: @johathan. Yes but I wanted to go back to our early poll and people voted that the preference was not to use it. Some said 5% but others wanted up to 20%. I do not think it should be used

04/26/2018 16:25:09 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone: whatever the alternative, the overseen by community in my view shall be in place.

04/26/2018 16:26:16 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: let's take a straw poll on whether we are missing facts ;-)

04/26/2018 16:26:26 PM from VAnda Scartezini to Everyone: liabilities is indeed a good point to raise Marilyn

04/26/2018 16:26:39 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: jonathan is an old hand

04/26/2018 16:27:03 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone:I think the liability (toward disbursing fund consistent or in service of the mission) is already there for the board and the staff

04/26/2018 16:28:59 PM from daniel dardailler to Everyone: +1 to Alan, the evaluations will have to be independent, no matter what mechanisms

04/26/2018 16:34:04 PM from Xavier Calvez to Everyone: Has the group defined what "independent" means in the context of this evaluation work?

04/26/2018 16:35:06 PM from Jonathan Robinson to Everyone: Hand

04/26/2018 16:35:14 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: I understand (I was away getting my hips replaced so apologies :-))

04/26/2018 16:37:05 PM from Maarten Botterman to Everyone: Independent, and *very* transparent to ensure accountability on the independence and correct use

04/26/2018 16:37:15 PM from elliot noss to Everyone: my hand is not up

April 26, 2018 9:38:20 AM from Joke Braeken to everyone: @Elliot: I only see Jonathan's hand up.

April 26, 2018 9:41:49 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: if was under roman legal framework it will be more liability for the board, but I believe in US will be none but I am not an expert on US legal framework

April 26, 2018 9:44:44 AM from elliot noss to everyone: I note that cira has the same size and type fund as nominet and has always insourced. community members do the heavy lifting with some staff support

April 26, 2018 9:45:02 AM from elliot noss to everyone: nominet ended up where cira is

April 26, 2018 9:45:16 AM from elliot noss to everyone: (I have served on the cira committee since its inception)

April 26, 2018 9:45:50 AM from elliot noss to everyone: (LOOK ABOVE! that is only the end of the point)

April 26, 2018 9:47:11 AM from elliot noss to everyone: (something has just come up. I must drop off. apologies. thanks all)

April 26, 2018 9:48:52 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Marilyn, I saw you!

April 26, 2018 9:50:34 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: Normally polls are for members and participants

April 26, 2018 9:50:48 AM from Jonathan Robinson to everyone: @Marika. If I understood you correctly, that's a really good idea i.e. re-circulate the headlines of any preliminary conclusions and test how much the Group is still in support of these.

April 26, 2018 9:50:57 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: with respondents requested to identify whether they are CO appointed members or participants.

April 26, 2018 9:54:43 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: We might wait until we have Adobe Connect back

April 26, 2018 9:54:48 AM from Jon Nevett to everyone: Missing adobe!

April 26, 2018 9:54:50 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: we can do by survey

April 26, 2018 9:54:54 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: I agree with Marika

April 26, 2018 9:55:07 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: more clear question to avoid misunderstanding

April 26, 2018 9:55:23 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: Chair, if you think the attendance today is low, why not use survey monkey instead.

April 26, 2018 9:55:29 AM from Maureen Hilyard to everyone: I agree with doing a straw poll to get an understanding of what people are accepting so far

April 26, 2018 9:56:14 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: a quick response I expect

April 26, 2018 9:56:37 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: marika can write thee question easily i believe

April 26, 2018 9:57:06 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: will be great MArika

April 26, 2018 9:58:02 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Alan, notified!

April 26, 2018 9:58:09 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: ... noticed

April 26, 2018 9:58:31 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: I am in favor of th ranking approach

April 26, 2018 9:58:58 AM from Antonio Harris to everyone: This sounds OK for me

April 26, 2018 9:59:05 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: Mary - yes, we weill do this

April 26, 2018 9:59:23 AM from Ching Chiao to everyone: For decision making purpose at this stage, I'd recommend a ranking approach

April 26, 2018 9:59:25 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: @Jon, agree

April 26, 2018 9:59:46 AM from Erika Mann to everyone: @Ching - I come to you

April 26, 2018 10:06:34 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: yes, it makes sense to skip

April 26, 2018 10:06:36 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: yes

April 26, 2018 10:06:39 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: yes

April 26, 2018 10:06:41 AM from Ching Chiao to everyone: yes skipe makes sense

April 26, 2018 10:06:44 AM from Judith Hellerstein to everyone: yes

April 26, 2018 10:06:54 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: Yes for skipping next week.

April 26, 2018 10:06:54 AM from Alan Greenberg to everyone: Skip

April 26, 2018 10:07:02 AM from Marika Konings to everyone: 10 May at 14.00 UTC

April 26, 2018 10:07:36 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: thanks everyone!

April 26, 2018 10:07:42 AM from Ching Chiao to everyone: thank you everyone!

April 26, 2018 10:07:44 AM from Ching Chiao to everyone: Labor Day

April 26, 2018 10:07:46 AM from Carolina Caeiro to everyone: labor day

April 26, 2018 10:07:49 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: no thank you !! work day

April 26, 2018 10:07:50 AM from Mary Uduma to everyone: Thanks and bye all.

April 26, 2018 10:07:57 AM from Julf Helsingius to everyone: Thanks!

April 26, 2018 10:07:57 AM from Maureen Hilyard to everyone: Thank you Erica

April 26, 2018 10:08:07 AM from VAnda Scartezini to everyone: thank you specilly to Marika
to make things quite clear to all

April 26, 2018 10:08:11 AM from Joke Braeken to everyone: bye all. thank you