
EVIN ERDOGDU:

Good morning, good afternoon and good evening everyone and welcome to the At-Large Regional Leadership call on Tuesday 6th of February 2018, from 18:00 to 19:30 UTC.

Today on the call we have with us Olivier Crepin-Leblond, Wale Bakare, Ali Almeshal, Mohamed El Bashir, Eduardo Diaz, Fatimata Seye Sylla and Glenn McKnight. On the Spanish channel we have with us Humberto Carrasco and we have listed apologies from Satish Babu. On staff we have with us Heidi Ulrich, Silvia Vicanco, Siranush Vardanyan and myself, Evin Erdogan. I will also be doing call management.

Our Spanish Interpreters are Paula and Veronica and French Interpreters are Claire and Isabelle. And with that, I would like to remind everyone to please state your name for the record for transcription purposes and for the record. With that, I'll turn it over to you, Eduardo, please begin.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Evin, this is Eduardo. Thank you everyone for attending this call today. As I hope you had a chance to look at the agenda for this meeting, I made a few changes to it and the reason I did this is the multi rate, we need to do this because I look at past meetings about these meetings and really was hard for me to follow some of the things that were in the agenda and I wasn't sure what we were trying to do or what we are trying to in this call.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

So I took the liberty of changing the agenda and I want to make this meeting more effective, in the sense that I want to get something out of it and if we get something out of it that we can follow up through the year and somehow find out what was being said before so when we come back three, four months from now, we know what we talked about and we can follow through this conversations and bring new ones in and so forth.

That's what motivated me in doing this agenda the way it is. So at three minutes in the call I'm in the discussion order and I want to know if there are any objections to follow through this agenda?

Not hearing anyone, we move to agenda item three. I was saying that in this meeting, I need my glasses here because I have some notes, one of the things that I was thinking about this meeting is that we need to talk about what the purpose of this meeting is, what is it, why is it essential in getting together here? Because I see this as an opportunity for all of us and when I'm saying all of us, all the RALO's, to make sure that we talk about things that are common, what things are working, what things are not working, how we can be more effective in our RALO's, learning from each other.

So I want to talk about purpose, what is the purpose of this meeting? I want to hear your expectation on what your interpretation on the purpose of this meeting is. I think we should use these types of meetings to somehow standardize the way we do our business. For example, I believe now all the elections for leadership in our RALO's they happen in the same period of time as everyone else.

I want to talk to you about what we're doing in NARALO with webinars and the ideas that I have there, I want to hear your comments and if you like the idea you're welcome to [inaudible] too.

When I look at the WIKI page where the information for this meeting is located, I found that I was confused with the terminology, so I want to talk about that too because some people call these meetings Secretariat meetings; when you go to the meetings, it says leadership meetings, cross RALO meetings, and we need to find out what is correct, so we can make sure that future generations of leaderships understand what this is all about.

If we move to item four -- I'm not reading the chat, so if you have a question for me and I'm not answering, please alert me to it so I can focus on any question you may have. What I have done here in this agenda is that every item that we discuss is a specific item, so that's why you have items, numbers. For each item what I have done is I have put who is leading that conversation, when was the first time it was open and what is this question about, a small description what is it about.

And then, if you look at the -- I'm talking about item number one now, Meeting Repurposing, you see the time of the date, the date that we're having this meeting which is today, and one of the things that I'm starting using is and that's why I'm asking for a clock that I haven't seen but I'm using mine, when we say my name and so forth, and we talk about item XX, we put the starting, the recording time when we start talking about this discussion and the reason for doing that is that sometimes I find myself hearing a recording and it's very hard for me and I assume for many of you, to find out where that discussion

happened in the recording. This is just to make sure that we put a sense in the recording how many minutes you have to move forward to get to that point, so that's what the Recording XX is all about.

Then on the discussion side what I wanted to do is I want to put a one-line item that covers what was discussed in the item and if you want to hear more details on what was discussed, you can go into the recording to that recording time.

And then as a group, we can decide if we can carry forward to the next meeting, if there is an action item and so forth. That's how I configured this agenda and then that will help in the future if someone has a question about a specific discussion, it's very easy to say, it's item XXX in the meeting that I want you to talk about.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Eduardo, this is Heidi. Glenn has his hand up.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Glenn, please.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I just wanted to go back, and perhaps someone else has a better memory or staff has a better memory, why was this group constituted? What was its original design and purpose? Before we get to the next item and Eduardo suggesting these changes. Just providing context for us possibly.

HEIDI ULLRICH: This is Heidi, if I may.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Heidi, before you go ahead, let's move on to item number four, so we can talk about this. That's part of the things that I wanted to talk about it. Go ahead, Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Talking about the history of this group, way back my understanding, this over about nine years ago, this group was a very informal group that met primarily face to face at ICANN meetings over lunch. Then when I joined, the meetings were a little bit more formal, we held face to face meetings at ICANN meetings with fuller agendas, as well as had teleconferences.

We then changed it I would say about five years ago or so, and this was I believe because people, regional leaders were saying, "Well, why is called the regional secretariat call or meeting when there are actually all the leaders, including chairs, vice chairs and secretaries?"

Then informally we have changed it to regional leadership meetings and we'll do that for the face to face, that will be the title of the meetings but for historical purposes, the workspace of cross secretariat workspace remained, so that is why at some point this AC room was also called the secretariat meeting, and that's why.

Now, if you wanted to change that to regional leadership which encompasses all the positions within the leaderships position within a RALO, then we could possibly change the workspace etc., and we can also change the title of the AC room. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Okay Glenn, did you want to follow up on that?

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

I'm just trying to think, as a person who had been involved with this a number of time, I'm just looking from a logistical point of view, what we were doing and did we achieve what we intended to achieve? I'll give you my impression, what I expected out of it is, I was looking at best practice, I was looking at what other RALO's are doing, sharing what we're doing, not to say it's right but just to share with other RALO's saying what we're doing.

For example, and it's Eduardo that started the newsletter and I've taken it over since he has become chair, and I see APRALO is now starting their own newsletter as well. As an example of doing stuff that we share what best practices were used and I'm sure there's half a dozen ideas we've taken, such as MOUs and stuff from other RALO's.

So I thought it was an opportunity to maybe brag about what you're doing right and take criticism but also to learn from other RALO's. That's my final comment.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Glenn. What about other RALO's, what can you add? I really want to hear your perspective, what's your opinion about this meeting. Please, I want to hear from all RALO's. Part of the thing is I think it's important that we discuss. Ali please, go ahead.

ALI ALMESHAL: Thanks, Eduardo. Yes, almost I share with Glenn the same. My expectation out of this group is to see what other RALO's are doing and share knowledge and learn from what they are doing, so if there is something that we can take from them or they learn from us. That is my expectation and some updates that we know what activities they are doing there. Simply this was my major understanding about the update within the support coming. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you. Is that clock like right in the middle? Thank you.

EVIN ERDOGDU: Hi Eduardo, this is Evin. Mario is installing the clock, because it was [inaudible], so sorry about that interruption.

EDUARDO DIAZ: That's okay. The clock might have worked in the beginning but not now. Anyhow, he can keep it there, no problem. Fatimata please, can you share with us your thoughts?

I cannot hear you, Fatimata. We cannot hear you. You need to get closer to the microphone.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Can you hear me?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Too far away.

HEIDI ULLRICH: It's getting better, Fatimata. If you could maybe speak up a little bit, it's getting better.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: I just wanted to say that I agree with my other colleagues and also, I think it will be interesting to use this opportunity to [inaudible] us when we have issues concerning all of us and we can't reach a quick agreement on something.

I don't know what, but for example to discuss something about [inaudible] within a RALO and maybe the RALO can talk about this issue and listen to the other [inaudible]. But I think this will be a good opportunity for us to find solutions to problems [inaudible].

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. I saw Humberto, you have your hand up, do you want to say something? Okay, anyone else want to say something about this?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: I would like to know whether you can hear me?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, we can.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you. I have been participating in this meeting for three or four years now. Glenn was here before me, so he and other persons know about the origin of this group. I also believe that these meetings should have the name changed because it is a leadership meeting, we are not only looking for sharing experiences, also to assign tasks.

The purpose is to go beyond what we do and convey this to the ALAC because there may be some differences amongst RALO's but there are also some similarities. So I think that we can do some work, some tasks together. This is my opinion and I think that it is essential to maintain these meetings in order to ensure success and growth of the RALO's and At-Large in general. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Humberto. Olivier, please.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Eduardo. I agree with the points that Humberto has made and that others are also making. I've been on these calls for as long as I can remember because I was ALAC chair before that. I was

on this with the RALO's as an observer, not always sided but I've been following these. It's great to be able to coordinate across the RALO's. It's great to be able to also make decisions and for the RALO's together speak to the ALAC.

I think that it's important that we maintain that link and that coordination between our regions because often the ALAC is more concerned with policy than with what's actually happening as far as capacity building is concerned, the local challenges, the regional balance, things like this, which are more seen as RALO things.

Unfortunately, I don't think enough of the ALAC members attend the RALO regional leadership meetings as an observer to listen and find out what's going on because that's really where the work is supposed to take place. There's a lot that we can learn from each other, and in fact I certainly throughout the years have learnt a lot from other regions and have also wanted to share some of the things that we've done in our region. Some of the things have been the surveys that we've done together etc., so this is really important. That's all, thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Olivier. From what I've heard in these conversations -- and I agree with this, I think these meetings are a good thing to have because we have all you RALO's in one place talking about things that we are all doing, sharing. One of the things that I'm hearing is that the purpose of this meeting is really to learn from each other and share what things are happening in the RALO's.

And the other thing is, I do not understand and maybe with an example, Olivier or Humberto, what do you mean when we say to talk to ALAC? Do you mean this group as a whole to talk to ALAC or each RALO in talking to ALAC? I'm not sure what that means. If Olivier or Humberto, you can explain what does that mean, that we talk to ALAC? I don't understand that. Olivier.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much, Eduardo. You will notice that on this call it's all regional leaders, you don't have any ALAC members or anybody from the ALAC executive committee or what you call it leadership team.

There are some things that sometimes need action by the ALAC, if RALO's -- we're working [inaudible] here and if the RALO chairs and RALO leaders feel that something needs to be done about, I don't know, just take an example about the sugar in the tea, this is a stupid example but I'm not saying we're talking about the sugar in the tea, but the sugar in the tea, then we need to be able to let the ALAC know and the ALAC has to push it forward.

I've got another call, if you can just excuse me, I'll come back to you in a second. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. That's one good example. Now, these meetings, they happen two months before the actual ICANN public meetings and there is another meeting like this during the ICANN public meeting. When you follow up we meet nine times, we have this call nine times a year, so I

think that is enough and we can do things offline. If an issue comes up that needs to be passed to ALAC, I think It's a good forum to discuss it and compile it then as a group. Glenn, please.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

I just want to point out that the last meeting we were on the agenda the last day. I think too much was on the agenda but we didn't get a chance to do any -- we were on the agenda the last day and we didn't get a chance to speak at all. Yes, we do have meetings but our issues and our discussion was not given any time.

We actually have more time on this type of call and way more time then we had face to face. I just want to bring that up as an issue because it's sort of pointless for us to go -- that we sit through the process, we're waiting for us to speak and other people babble on and there's no time management and as a result, we didn't get a chance to talk at all. It's a) disrespectful to us, and bad time management. I don't know if you recall that but that's my observation.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Glenn, thank you for your comment. You know, that's very interesting because that's one of the questions I had. Yesterday I was chatting to Silvia through Skype and I said, "What is that meeting that we had at the end of the Abu Dhabi, that Friday morning, which was called a RALO Development Meeting? Was that a leadership meeting or was that for development, or what was that?"

If you look at it, it was for development, you know, development of whatever, and to me, it was this meeting. I get confused, this is the first time I'm chairing this meeting and I got confused, what was that meeting about and this meeting.

So I hear you, Glenn, and it has to do with time management and quantity of things to do in the call. I tried to do that here, I put timeframes on the right side so I can keep track of where we are. To end this discussion on item number four, I will say that that we all agree that --

HEIDI ULLRICH: We have Olivier with his hand raised, and I'm in the queue as well.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Go ahead, Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Sorry, I'm on mute. In reference to the meeting on the last day of the AGM, that is the RALO Development, RALO Leadership Development Session and that is for incoming and continuing RALO leaders; that is chairs, vice chairs and secretaries who attend that. It is sort of a team building session, it is going to be switching with your permission into a bit of training session as well for new people, what some of the rules and procedures for leadership are, but that is the -- it is not really the regional leadership meeting.

During every ICANN meeting, there is a regional leadership meeting that we set the agenda. In fact we should be setting the agenda on the call in the next week or so, next couple of weeks for that face to face. That is what this group does, that's what they do. The face to face agenda is set about a month or so prior to the face to face. Since we're not doing that today, we can do that in the next two weeks or so.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Heidi, for that clarification. So that development meeting happens only at the end of the AGM, that's important to know. It makes sense to have all the new people together and have some kind of training. I remember some of that. But I hear what Glenn's saying because it happened. Olivier, please. Is that a new hand?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

Yes, Eduardo, thank you. I was just going to add, there used to be the RALO leadership meeting during the ICANN meetings and there was only one, historically, RALO call in between. I would be interested in seeing if we can have more than that. I think we have more than that, now we might have two. There was a discussion at some point, a few years ago, whether we should have one per month and I don't know whether that is still on the cards or whether thoughts have changed.

At the time we said no, once per month is a bit too much but once every couple of months might be a good thing, or at least a couple of times between ICANN meetings. I don't know if people would be interested in more calls. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Olivier, let's do something; let's take that offline as an action item and I will make sure that an email will go out to see what people think about that. To me, having another monthly call is kind of stress, it would be one more. There's things that we can do offline. We should know what we're doing if we're doing this online. There is always -- if there is something urgent that we should discuss as a group, we can call the call and discuss the matter at hand, we can always do that I believe.

Let's move on to the next item in the agenda which I think we already talked about, that's item five. We are 28 minutes in the recording call. I believe everybody agrees that we should change the WIKI pages and anything related to these calls in the WIKIs from the secretariats Cross-RALO meetings to a leadership Cross-RALO meeting, is that correct? I don't hear any objection to that it. It is an action item for Staff to make that change in the title. Thank you.

The next item in the agenda is an At-Large Review and update. I have seen many mails around about the review coming back to us and doing this and doing that. I thought it was important for all of us to hear from Staff what the latest on the review and if Staff can tell us if we can tell what are the next steps and how long this is going to be, how long are we going to be dealing with this review? Anyone on the Staff that is ready to talk about this? Hello?

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Could you please repeat the question?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay, we are on item six and basically what I would like for all to know is if you can give us an update on the At-Large review, where are we now? Reason for this is because I have seen emails going back and forth about the review coming back to ALAC for further discussion or further changes and I'm not sure -- well I just want to make everybody aware of this and to know what the latest is on it, and basically, that's it.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Item six is actually update on individuals, but I see now that item three is At-Large review and update. The latest on that is --

EDUARDO DIAZ: I'm sorry, I'm using the order number on the agenda but that's three, that's correct. Okay, I'm sorry

HEIDI ULLRICH: Okay, bear with me. Item 003 At-Large Review and Update, the latest was that in December the board organizational effectiveness committee sent a mapping exercise that the Staff who runs reviews had produced on request by the organizational effectiveness committee. They sent that to Alan, who looked at it and did several comments on that. He worked with the At-Large review leadership team, that is Holly and Cheryl, they all agreed on those comments.

Then just last week he sent this document, this mapping exercise with the comments to the At-Large review working party and there have

been discussions ongoing on that and I believe that the agreement is that there is going to be a very simple document produced that would in a way take over or replace this mapping exercise.

Olivier, you might have some additional comments on that but that's where we are. I believe that the plan is the ALAC will be meeting with members of the board organizational effectiveness committee in Puerto Rico to likely have that final discussion before the OEC votes; most likely they will be voting on this in April. That's the plan, and after that it will shift into the ALAC improvement work. Thank you very much.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Heidi. Olivier, can you add to this?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

Thanks Eduardo, and thanks Heidi. Alan has provided some sample responses and some points of view. There's a discussion among the team that is working on the At-Large review. I must admit that there's also a bit of irritation from some as to this not being particularly constructive and wasting volunteer time. The questions being sometimes, I wouldn't call them rhetorical as such but saying, "Oh, please provide us more detail on this, provide us more detail on that," and we're not quite sure how that helps with the At-Large review moving forward.

That said, I'm advocating for keeping good relations with the organizational committee and with also the staff that are in charge of this. Hopefully, we'll get some kind of brief responses provided for the

questions that are asked. As to the format of the response, I'm hoping that we can just add another column to the document which was supplied to us and just add those responses there.

I don't know, Heidi, whether you're planning to do this or Staff will provide this document or how will that work, but writing a big, new document from scratch and so on, is definitely out of the question. We need to be swift and then I think the majority of the discussion should really just take place in Puerto Rico when we meet in San Juan, and from there we'll just clear out of any of the problems or questions that the organizational committee still has. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Olivier. I have a question. These meetings are going to happen in Puerto Rico regarding the review; these are open to anyone, right?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

I believe that they are, I don't know.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Yes, so the plan is that within an ALAC and regional leadership meeting, one of the combined meetings, it will be a session that will focus on the next steps. It will likely be that either the chair, which is Khaled, a member of the board or just Leon, who is also on the organizational effectiveness committee will come and speak with everyone, and yes, it will be open.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you. Any other questions about this or comments? If not, we're going to move to the next order item in the agenda, which is ICANN 61 and it's been discussed in item four at 36 minutes into the call. So ICANN 61 Puerto Rico, why I'm bringing this up; most of us will be here in Puerto Rico and I just wanted to make sure that we all know what each RALO is going to do here and there are things that are going to happen that I want to talk to you about.

If other RALO's want to jump in, I will also like to know from each RALO, which public meetings are important that we should be aware of, that you think are important for your region so we all know and the reason why.

First, I'm going to start with the extracurricular events. Here in Puerto Rico we are doing the first North American School of Internet Governance, which is going to happen March 7, 8 and 9; that's three days before the start of the ICANN meeting. These three days is a full day and we're trying to model this school by the European Summer School of Internet governance and other ones that are being performed around the world. That's going to happen three days before.

There is going to be a closing event for that school and that closing event everyone is invited, everyone that wants to go; it's going to start around 7:00pm Friday, March 9 and it's going to happen at the venue. On the second floor, there is a huge terrace that is open, it's covered so you don't get water if it rains but it's open to the outside. There will be some finger food and drinks and a little bit of music.

The idea is this is a networking event, so you will have a chance to meet some of the faculty members that are in this school and the students. The last day in the school is going to be about engagement. In fact, Siranush is coming to talk about the fellowship program and give sort of a pep talk about why you should engage with this organization, not only ICANN but any of the other organizations. That is going to happen March 9 at 7:00, so if you are close to the venue you can walk there and do some network.

There is the gala, it's going to happen Monday night and it's going to be in this place about 10 minutes from the venue by car, and it's a huge place and they will have all kinds of food and music and it's another great way of networking. I think the place is called Bahia Urbana.

Tuesday there is a major sponsored event that I guess it will be announced there, it's going to happen between 6:30 and 12 midnight and it's going to happen in the old city, and again, it will be another place for drinks, food and very great music. They're bringing in a musician that is very famous in Puerto Rico, it's mostly salsa music, if you go there to dance.

Wednesday, we have the [inaudible], which we haven't decided where is going to be but this is the global equal move stakeholder band that replaced music night that one time. So it's going to happen Wednesday, it's going to start about 8:00pm and it goes all the way to 12 midnight.

Also, people are asking me what they can do? I keep receiving emails on how they can help in the relief of Puerto Rico and things like that. I am thinking about going to a school and do something but the details I

don't have them yet. The other thing that I say is that the best thing to help Puerto Rico at this moment is bring your family, do some touring before or after the meeting and spend your dollars and that will help the economy, and if the economy is being helped, everybody will be helped, that's the best thing that can happen.

What I want to hear now is about -- oh yes, Glenn I forgot about that, yes. We're going to celebrate the NARALO's 10th anniversary, so it's not going to be a showcase, it's going to be a celebration of the foundation of NARALO which it happened in 2017 -- I mean 2007, so the anniversary was last year but anyhow we're going to celebrate it this year. It was founded here in Puerto Rico during 2007.

We're going to have a 10-anniversary celebration, this time we're going to do it out of the box, we're going to do it at noon, somewhere in the event. We haven't decided how or where it's going to be, but it's going to be at noon. We're going to have 2-3 people talking about how great NARALO has been. We're going to try to put together some kind of presentation of the major achievements that we have done during the past 10 years, and then I have street music, which we call planaros and I think they're going to play three songs, which I'm going to explain what they are and happily we're going to have most probably this celebration at the end, singing happy birthday to you in Spanish at a different rhythm. That's what we have planned for the celebration of the NARALO showcase.

What I want to hear now very briefly from the other RALO leaders, what other meetings are you attending to or you're suggesting other RALO's to attend to and why, so we are all aware of it? Who wants to go first?

Nobody wants to go first. Okay, if there are not important meetings that we should know about from other RALO's, we can move on to the next item on the agenda.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Humberto just raised the point of the LACRALO mediation phase two, this is going to be taking place on Wednesday and Thursday in Puerto Rico. There will be approximately 15 members of At-Large, some of them will be flying in just for this event, most of them will be there for the ICANN meeting.

This will be the second assembly that is working towards their roadmap for bridging the challenging that they've had in their region as well as developing new governance documents. We will be having one of the mediators that we've worked with before. He'll be facilitating this two-day session, which will have a lot of breakout sessions etc., so that will be taking place again Wednesday and Thursday during Puerto Rico. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

I do have a question for you, Heidi. Is this a full day type of meetings or this is just one or...?

HEIDI ULLRICH:

I didn't hear the question, Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Is it a full day meeting for this mediation?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yes. It will be full day Wednesday and Thursday. They are aware, they will be using the same breaks as everyone. They will be moving from one room to the patio section for their breakout so you might see them, but just to let you know that they are going to be working quite hard during these two days. Thank you very much.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Heidi. I assume these are just for LACRALO members, right? It's not open for anyone.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yes, correct. It's going to be a closed meeting, you will not see it on the public schedule. Again, many of the people that are the current leadership, they'll be moving to that session, away from the actual regularly scheduled At-Large meetings, and then there will be a handful of other LACRALO members who are flying in just for that session. Again, it is a closed meeting. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you. Glenn, you want to talk about our NARALO booth at the ICANN meeting?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: We're going to have a banner, but literature as well. We're working out what kind of little flag we can provide but we're looking for volunteers, it will have literature across the board, not just NARALO literature. Please let me know if you can volunteer. It is not the entire time, it's just the morning before things start, the breaks and the lunches. If you have some time to spare it's great, it's a great place to meet and chat to people.

But we're going to do it slightly different than we did at the IGF, I'll have a laptop and any persons who show up and they express interest, we'll make sure their information is accurately put into a spreadsheet and I may even create a Google form for it, but we'll make sure we have the right information for leads to go back to each of your RALO's for follow up. That's it.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Glenn. I also wanted to add, sometimes you feel like you don't belong, you walk around, you don't know where to go; please come to our booth, NARALO booth is for all RALO's and all members to meet there and talk. I think that's a great place to meet if you don't have anything to do during the break or something like that. Let's move to the next --

HEIDI ULLRICH: Mario has his hand raised.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Mario, go ahead.

MARIO ALEMAN: Hello everyone, do you hear me okay?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, too loud.

MARIO ALEMAN: Great, thank you. I'll be coordinating the work with the booth as well and with the ALS relations through the ICANN 61 meetings. We have actually already started to plan in organizing the table, the computer screen and also some print outs.

I would like to know, Glenn, I don't know if you'll be working on some particular materials like an electronic book or something like, that you'd likely be to display on the monitor screen. Also, we have pretty much something similar to what we had in APRALO last time in Abu Dhabi.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Mario, I'll be working offline on some logistics. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ: With that in mind, the next one is Secretariat Reports, and this is happening at 49 minutes in the recording call. I brought this issue here for all to see because there are different reports I call the secretariat reports, which again, it's made mostly by the leadership. Heidi, can you give us some history about these reports, how they came out, how they came about, what are they used for?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Again, about nine or ten years ago when I joined and I was in Silvia's position, we would just ask the secretary, this was not the chair but the secretary to write reports. They did so with infrequent consistency, shall we say.

It wasn't very consistent shall we say, and we would follow up on that, and I think what the aim is to have a monthly, very brief report on what the RALO activities have been. It would just mean like a paragraph that the secretariat would write and post on a monthly basis. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay, that is why these reports are used for. Who reads them? What are they used for? Are they necessary at all?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Again, all chairs and leads of working groups, in the past, they have been asked on a monthly basis to submit a very short report. Liaisons do this very well, some working group chairs do, and again, this just goes down to the RALO leadership again. It's been traditionally the role of the secretary to do that.

Who reads them would be members of their region, if they were aware of them. Perhaps being more consistent would help, and if they were promoted that would help. I think for NARALO and APRALO, now that they have newsletters, that would probably take the place of these, but that's up for all of you to decide.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

That's why I brought it here because this is one more thing to do and it looks like it's not consistent; in fact there are ones that have one report here, one report there and some of them are very thorough, some of them just one, two, three lines. And really I don't know who reads this and why we are doing it except that it's a report.

I remember when I was working in this company many, many years ago and I had this person working this weekly report that it took her a whole day to produce. And I ask her, let's do an experiment here, let's not do it any longer and see what happens. Up to today I haven't heard anyone's comment on the fact that we didn't do this anymore.

I think like what you said, Heidi, about doing the newsletter, it's a good way of reporting what the RALO's are doing, and I think it's more effective than writing this report. First, they're really hard to get to, I don't know where they are located if I look for it somewhere; in fact I put the links down at the end of agenda and you can see that there are RALO's that have zipo, nothing there.

And I'm saying this because getting there, write something there takes time. For some people may be more difficult, for some people can be less, especially if you're not an English speaker you have to write something in there and put it in [inaudible]. So my question to all is -- I'm sorry, Olivier, please go ahead.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much, Eduardo. I see where you're coming to and you're thinking, "Well, rather than having RALO reports, why don't we have RALO newsletters." And I think that they serve two very different things, very different reasons.

The RALO newsletter, which is nicely written and has got pictures and stuff like that, provides information about the social life of the RALO; I think there's a lot of it that is down to who did what, what meetings they had, who was there, it's got this part to it which is expanded from what a RALO report is.

The RALO report should contain all of the pertinent issues of what the RALO has been working in and working on. When you have a new ALS that joins, the first question that they ask is, okay, I've got ALAC on the one side, what is the ALAC doing? And it's already bloody hard to tell them what the ALAC is doing because the information is all over the place and what I usually do is to send them over to the policy page and say, "Well that's the policy we're doing."

Then they say, what does the RALO do, what happens with the RALO? And then I just send them over to our RALO reports and I say, "Well this is what we've been discussing in the past year, past two years," they can see in our RALO reports what we've been doing.

What also the RALO reports are helpful for if they're actually drafted, and this is not the case for all the regions and I'm not going to comment on that, is to be able to refer back to when we last had a discussion about a specific topic. It's a lot easier to search one page with that than to go through each one of our calls separate pages and say, "God, I can't

remember what call we were discussing this in but we'd already reach a consensus and now somebody is reopening the discussion trail."

It really is an organizing instrument that is to be used both by the leadership, not only when they're leading but when they're also transferring leadership to the next people. I certainly know that when Wale came onboard, and perhaps Wale can say a few words on this, but I thought it was helpful for him to read through our RALO reports from the last couple of years, so he'd see where we've been coming from and what issues have come up and things like that.

It is also really helpful for the ALSes and it should be something that we push a lot more to our At-Large structures, so that if they don't have the time to be on our monthly call, they could just read those 10, 15, 20 lines, maybe three, four paragraphs, telling them what the RALO has been up to, so that at least there's some kind of connection and they don't have to go through all the fluff and things, they just have simple facts that are there. That's the way that I would hope RALO reports are used. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Okay. Glenn, please.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

You mentioned earlier about metrics, and just to put in context, I don't recall ever doing these reports, that anyone has ever come back to me asking me a question on that or a clarification, but on the other hand on the newsletter -- and I've only done four of them and I think the stats

are similar to when Eduardo did it, it's roughly between 39% and 40%, so about 40 people open up the newsletter, I can get an idea which articles they found interesting, how long they were on.

So I have metrics coming back, some constant contact on disseminating information to community. I have no idea on these monthly reports. Like you said, who knows who's reading it. I'm still consistent, I'm still going to put it down, and I think it's important to put it down what you've done, and actually when you start to put it down you realize how much you've done.

But I do find that there's a number of people, their reports are way out of date. Hopefully, if we can have consistency, that perhaps people have to buck up. It's a good time to have a new year's resolution. Back to you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

I would like to hear from other RALO's what do you think about these reports? Do you have the same idea as Olivier mentioned, that they're used for new people and to find out things and keep track of the many things in one place? Ali, please.

ALI ALMESHAL:

Thanks, Eduardo. Back to Olivier's comment, that's exactly and absolutely right, but are we all doing what we supposed to do? If that's what we are doing, then [inaudible] 100% perfect, but I'm not so sure that all RALO's are doing that.

On the other side, who's reading it? We don't have a track on that as Glenn mentioned. Maybe going with the eBook or the newsletter is much more effective than having such type of report on the WIKI page, and maybe straight to the point and highlighting the main and major discussed issues related to that RALO could help in passing the information to the leader of that monthly report.

In conclusion, the monthly report is good, I think we should continue having it, but maybe the way we are presenting it needs to be a little bit adjusted. Back to you Eduardo, thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Ali. Humberto, please.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO:

Thank you. I was secretary and when I was in that position I think that most of the reports were drafted, and in the last few months I was in a difficult personal situation, my son was sick so I was not able to do them all.

I understand that Maritza has not fully complied with reporting from the secretariat. In LACRALO the only person who reviews whether these reports are up to date or not is Humberto Soto. I don't know if some other person does that, only Humberto Soto. Perhaps with a newsletter we may be more effective. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you. Mohamed, please.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Eduardo. I'd like just to also share our experience. I think the same concern about continuity of issuing the reports is not consistent from our side. The leadership are involved on it and I'm not sure really how you useful it is.

For me, tracking the conference call action items and trying to ensure those action items are implemented and documenting that in the WIKI is important as a reference more than the drafted reports. Although it's useful but I think as a reference, I think the follow-up on the calls and the action items, documenting that, I think that's important.

I'll be happy to have a standard template that the secretariat could use it, but I think if we add more burden in terms of the report needs to be descriptive about the discussions and what happened, I think we'll end up having a requirement but not everyone doing it, or at least they just do the bare minimum. I can understand that some RALO's are good in doing that, that's great, but I don't think every RALO, I don't think they will be in the same level.

So it might be useful to utilize the secretariat energy in something that is more useful to the RALO. My proposal, have a template first and then at least get still an information about who's reading those outside the RALO's and how useful are those reports. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you. Wale, please.

WALE BAKARE:

Thank you so much. My own comment, I wouldn't want to go into [inaudible] for either the monthly report or a newsletter. What I would try to bring to [inaudible] is about the difference between the two. If we're talking about the monthly report, I think we are referring to some activities that have taken place or that have happened in each region within a particular set of time, for instance from the first of February to the 28th of February, so that means we are trying to bring out a documentation of activities that have taken place within that particular RALO.

With regard to a newsletter; a newsletter is about futuristic events. Events that are yet to be taken place, that is what I think the newsletter is all about. The newsletter is a kind of snapshot, this is going to happen on the 28th of November, this is going to happen on the 4th of March. That is what a newsletter is all about.

If we want to decide to have both side by side, it's for each RALO to say, "Okay, we'll have a newsletter and also we'll have our monthly report alongside." So a monthly report is just a different thing, it's a past thing, not the event that we think will happen in the next few days or in the next month, but in which the newsletter is capable of doing. That is my submission, thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Thank you, Wale, for your comment. I want to close this discussion, but before I do that, what I'm hearing is that for some RALO's it is very important to keep these reports up to date; for other ones, it's not. We don't know if that gets read, but again, if we take Olivier's case that he

uses for a purpose that is very valid, it's like a central repository of information.

I for one feel like I don't want to go in there and write three lines, every month I have to remember this, because I don't see the purpose of doing it if I'm using a different channel to inform about things that are happening in the RALO.

I want to call Olivier on your comment that I'm doing this because of the newsletter or you implied, it doesn't have anything to do with that. The reason I tried this item here was because we're doing many things for ICANN and At-Large and the RALO's, and this is one more thing to do that really I don't see any effect in doing it if it's not required, if people are not reading, but now, if it's effective for some of you, then you can keep on doing it.

What I'm trying to do is do things that make our life a lot easier; remember, we are volunteers here and I want to make things that are effective and efficient, that's the real purpose behind this. I guess, Olivier, I will let you talk when I finish. What I'm saying is and what I'm hearing is, is that we should keep it, some people will use it, some people will not use it. If I'm incorrect in this assumption, please let me know. Olivier, please.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND:

Thanks very much, Eduardo. I would suggest then that as the RALO reports are a thing that you find centrally -- and by the way, I just had trouble finding the page that points to all of the of the RALO reports; I don't know whether there is one page that points to all of the RALO

reports, but if we had something like this, then in NARALO for example, where you feel that RALO reports are [inaudible] but newsletters are the way to go, then the RALO reports could just have a pointer to each one of the newsletters, the achieved newsletters and then that serves the same purpose as other RALO's where there would just be text as a RALO report.

What I'm trying to avoid is that we end up with nothing and we have someone that turns up in a RALO and that says, "Oh, so what's going on?" And we have nothing to point them to; not only that, if we get asked by the GNSO council or by the board, what has the RALO done this past year and we don't have something written down, we're in trouble. We're in trouble because all it looks like is that our RALO is just having fun, we're just out there to go to ICANN meetings and do nothing.

So I really think there is a whole thing about legitimacy of a RALO where something has to be there and it's either a RALO report or it's a newsletter, but it's got to inform our members in a formal way of what we're doing. If it's pointing to the -- so doing a summary of the calls, which is what we've done in EURALO actually, summary of what's been happening in the calls, summary of the discussions that have taken place on the mailing list, we also have a couple of working groups, so a summary of what's been happening in the working groups, that's the minimum thing, it doesn't take more than a half an hour, 45 minutes to update it.

If a RALO secretary cannot spend 45 minutes to draft a RALO report, then I'm sorry, they're just not meant to be a secretary, I don't know why they're there for. Thanks.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Olivier.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: By the way, a RALO report or a newsletter, whichever, something like that. When I'm saying a RALO report, of course I also mean or newsletter, it's the same thing. Sorry.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay, we heard that. Thank you, Olivier, for your comments. Let's move on to the next item, Individual Members. Here what I want to know is, you know, as part of the At-Large Review one of the major recommendations was they wanted to have RALO's to be all membership based, and some of the RALO's have allowed or have individual members participate in the things of each RALO.

So far Europe, and Olivier you can talk about it, they have created an ALS of individual members, which I think is a great idea. In NARALO, we have individual members but they are not as organized as in Europe and the way we do it and, in the end, it has to do with how many votes these people have. Well, they have one vote, they select one rep between themselves and that person has one vote in the consensus calls or if there is a call for a vote.

I'm bringing in this here because I want to hear -- I think there is one RALO that still doesn't allow individual members, and correct me if I'm wrong, the idea here is I want to go around and see what things you are doing with individual members. I want to start with like RALO, just know why or are they working on getting individual members? What are the issues there that we should know about, so we know and learn from you guys? Mohamed, please go ahead.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much. AFRALO introduced individual membership, we have received applications for individual members. I think it's useful because it will help us to bring new blood, active members who are hopefully to be known to be positively contributing and active in the internet community in Africa who are not associated with an ALS.

I think our issue was the first batch of applicants, most of them were associated with an ALS and we had to do a due diligence process as well to check that, and that has led us to one, try to make sure that the requirements and the details are very clear in the applications in terms of they should not be a member associated with an ALS; also, being from the AFRALO region.

And we did request the Staff to have the application form being online in an editable format so people could send applications online instead of downloading in a PDF format and also trying to automate that process, and hopefully Staff could help us on that and we are already working with them on that. That could make the process easier for us

to approve it online and review it online. Overall, I think it's a positive step for us. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Mohamed, I have a question for you. Do individual members have a way of voting in your processes, in your calls, or are just observers?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: They have a voting right but they are considered to be individual members of AFRALO.

EDUARDO DIAZ: If you have 10 members, all 10 can only have one vote, not each one of them, right?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: No, individual members are non-voting for us.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay, so they basically participate in the calls but they don't have any say into the final call.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: They participate in the calls, they engage in activities, could be members in working groups, but when there is a formal let's say voting in terms of making decisions as AFRALO, that will be sent to the focal of the ALSes. That's what we are implementing now.

We want to attract active members, get them involved in the process as well, and they can contribute but currently they don't have a voting right. It will be interesting as well to hear from others, specifically the experience of EURALO in terms of grouping all individual members in an ALS.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Well, we have Olivier next, please.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Eduardo. In EURALO the way that we accept individual users is through a pseudo ALS, which is an organization that we've created, that EURALO has created from scratch, and basically as a result it provides the framework for which a vote can be cast on behalf of individual users.

The advantage of having a pseudo ALS also provides the ability to have a website that is a home for individual users, that is more homely if you want than the forest of WIKI pages that we have or then the At-Large website itself, and it's a home that can then evolve in its own way, that can provide for its own discussions.

As you know, the individual users could want to do discussions between each other and so on, so there's a mailing list for them etc., which extends further than I think the facilities that are offered to individual users in the other RALO's.

These are the advantages, and one further advantage being that there is therefore also a board for these individual users and that provides a

level of recognition for individual users that just an individual taking part in At-Large processes might not receive in the same way.

The disadvantage from this is that having a board, having a website, having its own calls and its own mailing lists and so on, requires some more resources than having individual users being involved directly and there is a bit of a discussion going on at the moment as to what kind of support should this individual users constituency, movement, structure get, because at the end of the day, it is a virtual At-Large structure and as you know, ICANN doesn't support At-Large structures.

So we're in a bit of a gray area at the moment. I've had discussions with Alan Greenberg about this; he thinks the better view, the better way of getting individual users involved is directly with the RALO and maybe a subsection of the RALO, a bit like what NARALO is doing. I'm not entirely convinced because of the fact that the growth -- because we've got this separate organization if you want, a semi separate organization, the growth in individual users in EURALO has been very fast, astronomically fast should I say, and so we have I think in excess of 30, 40 users, maybe more now and I can certainly see there is good discussion going on their mailing lists and involvement of these individual users at quite a level, to the extent that in our last elections we ended up having the majority of our candidates being individual users rather than people coming from ALSes. That certainly raised some eyebrows elsewhere.

Maybe at some point we need to have a discussion as to how we want to have individual users come to us. The At-Large review has asked for some harmonizing between the RALO's, and I think we need to

negotiate this as to what's the just middle ground and the one that will provide the most recognition and similar to end users, to individual users to do something and be involved in our RALO's. Thank you.

EDUAEDO DIAZ:

Olivier, I do have a question for you. Does individual users as a group, do they have one vote in Europe, in the European RALO?

OLIVIER CREPI-LEBLOND:

Yes, that's correct, they do. I can show you the website, that's the website that they have. As far as votes are concerned, they're just treated like one vote, one ALS. It makes it very clean to have it in this way, with this pseudo ALS. What's not clean is the level of support that they're meant to receive.

When they have an election for example, obviously they're just individual users, they're not an organization that is independent of ICANN. At-Large staff is very kind in supporting them for this but we need to be very careful in the way we word this and this is structured because the last thing we want is for other At-Large structures to come over and say, "Hey, wait a minute, individual users are getting this whole support for their election process, why don't we get this too?"

I think the concept is well understood within EURALO, we haven't had that trouble, but it's still a case. The good thing is then you see we can see as the RALO leader, I can certainly see and I have full view over the process that takes place in the individual users association, for a selection to be make.

When there is a vote that takes place, I can see the discussions taking place in the individual users group and then I can see how the vote is cast based on the vote that has taken amongst the individual users. All the individual users can do an internal vote and the chair of the association provides the vote into the RALO process. Is that helpful?

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Yes, Olivier. We are almost to the end of that call. Humberto, please tell us a little bit about your thing with individual members. What I'm going to suggest is once Humberto -- oh Humberto is gone.

This is what I'm purposing since we are at the end of the call. We're going to have another meeting during ICANN 61, similar to this one. What I can do is we can start at that meeting with this item again and then going down these other two items that we're not able to cover this time. Mohamed, is that a new hand or is that an old hand?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO:

May I have the floor, please?

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Yes, please. Go ahead.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO:

I just wanted to say that in LACRALO we have been actively discussing the individual users issue in the mediation process and we will present

all the information in our mediation meeting that will held in Puerto Rico.

We have been discussing and we have reached consensus to allow the participation of these individual users, but that will be presented after the mediation meeting. That's all my comment and I want to say goodbye because I have to go another meweting. Thank you.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Okay, with that, I'm going to end this meeting. I want to thank everyone for attending. It is my hope that the conversation that we have had today has more sense and has helped all of us in understanding what we're doing in respect of these items that I have here.

What I am going to do is for the agenda in ICANN 61 I'm going to start with individual members to end off with this discussion and then we're going to CROP and MOUs with the RALO's. If you have any other items that you think are important to discuss in this meeting, please send me a note or send a note to staff and we will add it to the agenda.

Please, if you want to talk about something specific, make sure you add a description of what is that you want to discuss so when we get into the meeting we know more or less the things that are going to happen, and also put some timeframe as to how much you're going to need to discuss that item. Thank you so much and I will see you soon. Thank you. Bye.

EVIN ERDOGDU:

Thank you very much for your participation, please do not forget to disconnect your line from the AC room and the bridge. I thank you all very much and have a wonderful rest of your day.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]