Next-Generation gTLD Registration Directory Service (RDS) to replace WHOIS PDP WG

Handout for Working Group Call
Wednesday 21 February 2018 at 06:00 UTC

I C A N N

Proposed Agenda

1. Roll Call/SOI Updates

2. Address suggestions discussed on mailing list

3. Complete deliberation on Domain Name (DN) Certification
   a. Resolution of this week's poll results on DN Certification as a purpose
   b. Deliberate on data needs associated with DN Certification

4. Start deliberation on DN Purchase/Sale as a purpose and associated data needs

5. Confirm agreements for polling & next steps

6. Confirm next meeting: Tuesday 27 February at 17:00 UTC

Meeting Materials:
https://community.icann.org/x/ngu8B

3) Complete deliberation on DN Certification

- Results of this week's poll on criteria can be found here:
  https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/79432606/AnnotatedResults-Poll-from-13FebruaryCall.pdf

- In summary:

  Q2) 72% supported DN Cert as a purpose for PROCESSING

  Q3) Roughly 62% either agreed or could live with DN Cert as an opt-in purpose for COLLECTION

- Opposition to Q2 centered around three concerns:

  a) Can consensus policy for gTLD registration data specify purposes that are in the legitimate interest of third parties (in this case, CAs)

  b) Does being a legitimate purpose for processing data also imply that data is collected for that purpose?

  c) There is a need for greater clarity around collection of data for this purpose

Next step: Data needs associated with DN Cert

- To get greater clarity around data collected (or not) for this purpose, let's look at the data processed for this purpose:

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Domain Name Certification	Information to enable contact between the registrant, or a technical or administrative representative of the registrant, to assist in verifying that the identity of the certificate applicant is the same as the entity that controls the domain name.

- Starting with data proposed by DT3, let's consider:
  - What registration data is necessary for this purpose?
  - Is that data already collected for another (compatible) purpose?
  - If not, should it be (optionally) collected for this purpose?

- To enable deliberation, make a working assumption (to be confirmed):
  - Already-agreed purposes for collection – Technical Issue Resolution & DN Management – are compatible with DN Certification
  - There may also be additional purposes for collection not yet agreed

Deliberate on data processed for DN Certification

⊙ The drafting team proposed this registration data for DN Certification:

Registration Data Needed For Domain Name	Technical Issue Resolution[1]	Domain Name Management[2]	Domain Name Certification
Domain Name	X	X	X
Nameservers	X	X	
Domain Status	X	X	
Expiry Date and Time	X	X	
Creation Date		X	
Updated Date		X	
Sponsoring Registrar	X	X	
Registrant Contact(s)[3]	If no Tech Contact is provided	X	X
- Registrant Name[4]	X	X	
- Registrant Organization[4]	X	X	
- Registrant Email[5]	X	X	X
- Registrant Phone[6]	?		X
- Registrant Postal Address[7]	?		X
- Registrant Country[8]	X		X
Technical Contact(s)[9]	X		
Administrative Contact[9]		X	
Domain Names for specified Registrant			

Note: Shaded items already agreed to be included in Minimum Public Data Set

"?" indicates more granular data elements not fully specified by existing WG agreements

Confirm any possible WG agreements with poll

Related WG Agreements (footnoted on previous slide)

[1] 47. The following information is to be collected for the purpose of Technical Issue Resolution associated with Domain Name Resolution: Technical Contact(s) or (if no Technical Contact is provided) Registrant Contact(s), Nameservers, Domain Status, Expiry Date and Time, Sponsoring Registrar.

[2] 49. The following registration data is needed for the purpose of Domain Name Management: Domain Name, Registrant Name, Registrant Organization, Registrant Email, Registrar Name, Creation Date, Updated Date, Expiration Date, Nameservers, Domain Status, Administrative Contact.

[3] 31. Data enabling at least one way to contact the registrant must be collected and included in the RDS.

[4] 30. At least one element identifying the domain name registrant (i.e., registered name holder) must be collected and included in the RDS.

[5] 32. At a minimum, one or more e-mail addresses must be collected for every domain name included in the RDS, for contact roles that require an e-mail address for contactability.

[6] 43. The RDS must support Registrant Phone + Registrant Phone Ext (extension) data elements.

[7] 42. The RDS must support Registrant Postal Address data elements: Registrant Street Address, City, State/Province, and Postal Code.

[8] 28. Registrant Country must be included in RDS data elements; it must be mandatory to collect for every domain name registration.

[9] 36. Purpose-based contact (PBC) types identified (Admin, Legal, Technical, Abuse, Proxy/Privacy, Business) must be supported by the RDS but optional for registrants to provide.

Source: https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/56986791/ListOfWGAgreements-9January.pdf

3c) Discuss DN Purchase/Sale as a purpose for processing and associated data needs

- ◎ Refer to drafting team's output as a starting point: https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/74580010/DraftingTeam4-DNPurchaseSale-Purpose-v9-clean.pdf

- ◎ Introduction by drafting team members

- ◎ Any clarifying questions before deliberating on whether this is a legitimate purpose for processing registration data?

- ◎ **Proposed WG Agreement (starting point for deliberation):**
  Domain Name Purchase/Sale is a legitimate purpose for processing registration data, based on this definition:

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Domain Name Purchase/Sale	Information to enable contact between the registrant and third-party buyer to assist registrant in proving and exercising property interest in the domain name and third-party buyer in confirming the registrant's property interest and related merchantability.

Deliberate on data processed for DN Purchase/Sale

⊙ The drafting team proposed this registration data for DN Purchase/Sale:

Registration Data Needed For Domain Name	Technical Issue Resolution[1]	Domain Name Management[2]	Domain Name Purchase/Sale
Domain Name	X	X	X
Nameservers	X	X	
Domain Status	X	X	
Expiry Date and Time	X	X	
Creation Date		X	X
Updated Date		X	
Sponsoring Registrar	X	X	
Registrant Contact(s)[3]	If no Tech Contact is provided	X	X
- Registrant Name[4]	X	X	X
- Registrant Organization[4]	X	X	X
- Registrant Email[5]	X	X	
- Registrant Phone[6]	?		
- Registrant Postal Address[7]	?		
- Registrant Country[8]	X		X
Technical Contact(s)[9]	X		
Administrative Contact[9]		X	
Domain Names for specified Registrant			X

Note: Shaded items already agreed to be included in Minimum Public Data Set

"?" indicates more granular data elements not fully specified by existing WG agreements

Confirm any possible WG agreements with poll

Confirm action items and decision points

21 February WG Call Meeting Materials:
https://community.icann.org/x/ngu8B
Next call: Tuesday 27 February, 2018 at **17:00 UTC**

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Technical Issue Resolution for issues associated with Domain Name Resolution	Information collected to enable contact of the relevant contacts to facilitate tracing, identification and resolution of incidents related to issues associated with domain name resolution by persons who are affected by such issues, or persons tasked (directly or indirectly) with the resolution of such issues on their behalf.
Academic or Public Interest Research	Information collected to enable use of registration data elements by researchers and other similar persons, as a source for academic or other public interest studies or research, relating either solely or in part to the use of the DNS.
Domain Name Management	Information collected to create a domain name registration, enabling management of the domain name registration, and ensuring that the domain registration records are under the control of the authorized party and that no unauthorized changes or transfers are made in the record.
Individual Internet Use	Collecting the required information of the registrant or relevant contact in the record to allow the internet user to contact or determine reputation of the domain name registration.

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Domain Name Certification	Information collected by a certificate authority to enable contact between the registrant, or a technical or administrative representative of the registrant, to assist in verifying that the identity of the certificate applicant is the same as the entity that controls the domain name.
Domain Name Purchase/Sale	Information to enable contact between the registrant and third-party buyer to assist registrant in proving and exercising property interest in the domain name and third-party buyer in confirming the registrant's property interest and related merchantability.
ICANN Contractual Enforcement	Information accessed to enable ICANN Compliance to monitor and enforce contracted parties' agreements with ICANN.
Regulatory Enforcement	Information accessed by regulatory entities to enable contact with the registrant to ensure compliance with applicable laws.

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Legal Actions	Includes assisting certain parties (or their legal representatives, agents or service providers) to investigate and enforce civil and criminal laws, protect recognized legal rights, address online abuse or contractual compliance matters, or to assist parties defending against these kinds of activities, in each case with respect to all stages associated with such activities, including investigative stages; communications with registrants, registration authorities or hosting providers, or administrative or technical personnel relevant to the domain at issue; arbitrations; administrative proceedings; civil litigations (private or public); and criminal prosecutions.
Criminal Activity/ DNS Abuse – Investigation	Information to be made available to regulatory authorities, law enforcement, cybersecurity professionals, IT administrators, automated protection systems and other incident responders for the purpose of enabling identification of the nature of the registration and operation of a domain name linked to abuse and/or criminal activities to facilitate the eventual mitigation and resolution of the abuse identified: Domain metadata (registrar, registration date, nameservers, etc.), Registrant contact information, Registrar contact Information, DNS contact, etc..

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Criminal Activity/ DNS Abuse – Notification	Information collected and made available for the purpose of enabling notification by regulatory authorities, law enforcement, cybersecurity professionals, IT administrators, automated protection systems and other incident responders of the appropriate party (registrant, providers of associated services, registrar, etc), of abuse linked to a certain domain name registration to facilitate the mitigation and resolution of the abuse identified: Registrant contact information, Registrar contact Information, DNS contact, etc..
Criminal Activity/ DNS Abuse – Reputation	Information made available to organizations running automated protection systems for the purpose of enabling the establishment of reputation for a domain name to facilitate the provision of services and acceptance of communications from the domain name examined: Domain metadata (registrar, registration date, nameservers, etc.), Registrant contact information, Registrar contact Information, DNS contact, etc..

ICANN's Mission (As amended 1 October 2016)

Section 1.1. MISSION

(a) The mission of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers ("ICANN") is to ensure the stable and secure operation of the Internet's unique identifier systems as described in this Section 1.1(a) (the "Mission"). Specifically, ICANN:

(i) Coordinates the allocation and assignment of names in the root zone of the Domain Name System ("DNS") and coordinates the development and implementation of policies concerning the registration of second-level domain names in generic top-level domains ("gTLDs"). In this role, ICANN's scope is to coordinate the development and implementation of policies:

- For which uniform or coordinated resolution is reasonably necessary to facilitate the openness, interoperability, resilience, security and/or stability of the DNS including, with respect to gTLD registrars and registries, policies in the areas described in Annex G-1 and Annex G-2; and

- That are developed through a bottom-up consensus-based multistakeholder process and designed to ensure the stable and secure operation of the Internet's unique names systems.

- The issues, policies, procedures, and principles addressed in Annex G-1 and Annex G-2 with respect to gTLD registrars and registries shall be deemed to be within ICANN's Mission.

(…....)

See https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/governance/bylaws-en/#article1 for further details

Annex G-1 of the ICANN Bylaws (As amended 1 October 2016)

ANNEX G-1

The topics, issues, policies, procedures and principles referenced in Section 1.1(a)(i) with respect to gTLD registrars are:
- issues for which uniform or coordinated resolution is reasonably necessary to facilitate interoperability, security and/or stability of the Internet, registrar services, registry services, or the DNS;
- functional and performance specifications for the provision of registrar services;
- registrar policies reasonably necessary to implement Consensus Policies relating to a gTLD registry;
- resolution of disputes regarding the registration of domain names (as opposed to the use of such domain names, but including where such policies take into account use of the domain names); or
- restrictions on cross-ownership of registry operators and registrars or resellers and regulations and restrictions with respect to registrar and registry operations and the use of registry and registrar data in the event that a registry operator and a registrar or reseller are affiliated.

Examples of the above include, without limitation:
- principles for allocation of registered names in a TLD (e.g., first-come/first-served, timely renewal, holding period after expiration);
- prohibitions on warehousing of or speculation in domain names by registries or registrars;
- reservation of registered names in a TLD that may not be registered initially or that may not be renewed due to reasons reasonably related to (i) avoidance of confusion among or misleading of users, (ii) intellectual property, or (iii) the technical management of the DNS or the Internet (e.g., establishment of reservations of names from registration);
- maintenance of and access to accurate and up-to-date information concerning registered names and name servers;
- procedures to avoid disruptions of domain name registrations due to suspension or termination of operations by a registry operator or a registrar, including procedures for allocation of responsibility among continuing registrars of the registered names sponsored in a TLD by a registrar losing accreditation; and
- the transfer of registration data upon a change in registrar sponsoring one or more registered names.

Annex G-2 of the ICANN Bylaws (As amended 1 October 2016)

ANNEX G-2

The topics, issues, policies, procedures and principles referenced in Section 1.1(a)(i) with respect to gTLD registries are:

- issues for which uniform or coordinated resolution is reasonably necessary to facilitate interoperability, security and/or stability of the Internet or DNS;
- functional and performance specifications for the provision of registry services;
- security and stability of the registry database for a TLD;
- registry policies reasonably necessary to implement Consensus Policies relating to registry operations or registrars;
- resolution of disputes regarding the registration of domain names (as opposed to the use of such domain names); or
- restrictions on cross-ownership of registry operators and registrars or registrar resellers and regulations and restrictions with respect to registry operations and the use of registry and registrar data in the event that a registry operator and a registrar or registrar reseller are affiliated.

Examples of the above include, without limitation:

- principles for allocation of registered names in a TLD (e.g., first-come/first-served, timely renewal, holding period after expiration);
- prohibitions on warehousing of or speculation in domain names by registries or registrars;
- reservation of registered names in the TLD that may not be registered initially or that may not be renewed due to reasons reasonably related to (i) avoidance of confusion among or misleading of users, (ii) intellectual property, or (iii) the technical management of the DNS or the Internet (e.g., establishment of reservations of names from registration);
- maintenance of and access to accurate and up-to-date information concerning domain name registrations; and
- procedures to avoid disruptions of domain name registrations due to suspension or termination of operations by a registry operator or a registrar, including procedures for allocation of responsibility for serving registered domain names in a TLD affected by such a suspension or termination.

Example WHOIS Record
From Registry Agreement

Domain Name: EXAMPLE.TLD
Domain ID: D1234567-TLD
WHOIS Server: whois.example.tld
Referral URL: http://www.example.tld
Updated Date: 2009-05-29T20:13:00Z
Creation Date: 2000-10-08T00:45:00Z
Registry Expiry Date: 2010-10-08T00:44:59Z
Sponsoring Registrar: EXAMPLE REGISTRAR LLC
Sponsoring Registrar IANA ID: 5555555
Domain Status: clientDeleteProhibited
Domain Status: clientRenewProhibited
Domain Status: clientTransferProhibited
Domain Status: serverUpdateProhibited

Registrant ID: 5372808-ERL
Registrant Name: EXAMPLE REGISTRANT
Registrant Organization: EXAMPLE ORGANIZATION
Registrant Street: 123 EXAMPLE STREET
Registrant City: ANYTOWN
Registrant State/Province: AP
Registrant Postal Code: A1A1A1
Registrant Country: EX
Registrant Phone: +1.5555551212
Registrant Phone Ext: 1234
Registrant Fax: +1.5555551213
Registrant Fax Ext: 4321
Registrant Email: EMAIL@EXAMPLE.TLD

Admin ID: 5372809-ERL
Admin Name: EXAMPLE REGISTRANT ADMINISTRATIVE
Admin Organization: EXAMPLE REGISTRANT ORGANIZATION
Admin Street: 123 EXAMPLE STREET
Admin City: ANYTOWN
Admin State/Province: AP
Admin Postal Code: A1A1A1
Admin Country: EX
Admin Phone: +1.5555551212
Admin Phone Ext: 1234
Admin Fax: +1.5555551213
Admin Fax Ext:
Admin Email: EMAIL@EXAMPLE.TLD

Tech ID: 5372811-ERL
Tech Name: EXAMPLE REGISTRAR TECHNICAL
Tech Organization: EXAMPLE REGISTRAR LLC
Tech Street: 123 EXAMPLE STREET
Tech City: ANYTOWN
Tech State/Province: AP
Tech Postal Code: A1A1A1
Tech Country: EX
Tech Phone: +1.1235551234
Tech Phone Ext: 1234
Tech Fax: +1.5555551213
Tech Fax Ext: 93
Tech Email: EMAIL@EXAMPLE.TLD

Name Server: NS01.EXAMPLEREGISTRAR.TLD
Name Server: NS02.EXAMPLEREGISTRAR.TLD
DNSSEC: signedDelegation
DNSSEC: unsigned
>>> Last update of WHOIS database: 2009-05-29T20:15:00Z <<<