

Attendance: 56 Members

Abdul Saboor Malik	Hempal Shrestha	Paul McGrady
Abdullah Alrubaan	Jaap Akkerhuis	Peter Van Roste
Alan Greenberg	Javier Rua-Jovet	Rahman Khan
Alexander Schubert	Jeff Neuman	Rahul Gosain
Ann-Cathrin Marcussen	John Rodriguez	Raymond Mamattah
Annebeth Lange	Jonathan Agmon	Robin Gross
Avri Doria	Justine Chew	Sanna Sahlman
Aziz Hilali	Katrin Ohlmer	Sara Bockey
Barrack Otieno	Kristina Rosette	Sophie Hey
Cheryl Langdon-Orr	Liz Williams	Subhash Dhakal
Christopher Wilkinson	Martin Sutton	Susan Payne
Erich Schweighofer	Maureen Hilyard	Svitlana Tkachenko
Francis Gesora	Michael Flemming	Thiago Jardim
Greg Shatan		Thongchai Sangsiri
		Tom Dale
		Yrjo Lansipuro

Audio Only:	Apologies:	Staff:
Bram Fudzulani	Kan Kaili	Steve Chan
Susan Anthony	Jorge Cancio	Mary Wong
Sala Tamanikaiwaimaro		Emily Barabas
		Michelle DeSmyter
		Julie Bisland

### **AC Chat transcript Work Track 5 17 January 2018**

Michelle DeSmyter: Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level on Wednesday, 17 January 2018 at 05:00 UTC for 90 minutes.

Michelle DeSmyter: Agenda wiki page:

[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_community.icann.org\\_x\\_eh1yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8\\_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=q-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_x_eh1yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwhehFBfjrsjWv9&m=q-)

[NPDSyphiRarmBc3ZF4aB5v8GI0RL5pn8iFObOwFEE&s=BzdLmcxf345AYyNb1OjmSIB7O\\_fQMIMoyDyWLLq4azs&e=](https://npdsyphi.rarmbc3zf4ab5v8gi0rl5pn8ifobowfee&s=BzdLmcxf345AYyNb1OjmSIB7O_fQMIMoyDyWLLq4azs&e=)

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:Hello good morning - evening

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:can i test my audio?

RAHUL GOSAIN:Hello everyone!

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:hello Rahul!!

RAHUL GOSAIN:Hi Olga!

RAHUL GOSAIN:Can I also test my audio please

RAHUL GOSAIN:Yes Please

RAHUL GOSAIN:I can hear you

RAHUL GOSAIN:But Can I be heard? Julie Bisland>Select the TELEPHONE ICON at the top of the AC toolbar and choose

CONNECT MY AUDIO and follow instructions.

RAHUL GOSAIN:Hello!

RAHUL GOSAIN:Yes

RAHUL GOSAIN:So am I audible?

RAHUL GOSAIN:Thank You

Michelle DeSmyter:You are quite welcome

RAHUL GOSAIN:Yes Loud and Clear

RAHUL GOSAIN:Olga

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:thanks!!! for me there is no sound from the ac room

RAHUL GOSAIN:Yes

Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):Good morning all

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:Oh we have a timer for speakers!!!

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Good morning

Julie Bisland:loud and clear, Cheryl

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Great :-)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Yes we instituted that as an option for use last meeting I beleive, Olga

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Yes Annebeth

Julie Bisland:loud and clear Annebeth

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):good eeeaarrllyy morning!

Jeff Neuman:We hear you olga

GZ Kabir:We can hear you

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:I can hear you, Olga

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Yes we can Olga

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:thanks can I test the AC room? I hear nothing from there

Svitlana Tkachenko:Good morning!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):perhaps you speakers are muted (I leave mine muted when I am on a phone bridge

Michelle DeSmyter:Yes

Steve Chan:Hi Olga, we can hear you loud and clear

Alan Greenberg:I can hear you on AC.

jaap akkerhuis:Morning all. Sounds is fine in the Adobe room

Thongchai Sangsiri:Hello everyone

Maureen Hilyard (ALAC):We can hear you clearly Olga in AC

Julie Bisland:Olga, you're coming through loud and clear. If you'd like, though, we can set up a dialout for you?

Peter Van Roste - CENTR:Yes we can.

Michelle DeSmyter:Yes, we can hear you

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:We can hear you

Mzia Gogilashvili:Good morning/good evening everyone

Olga Cavalli - Co-chair GAC:+541148262530

Alexander Schubert:This app is so 2007ish.

Julie Bisland:thank you Olga, an operator will dialout to you

Sanna Sahlman:Good morning everyone! I can hear you Olga in AC very clear. I'm only connected via AC.

Jeff Neuman:All - a few technical glitches we are sorting out Jeff Neuman:sorry for the delay

Jeff Neuman:We will get started shortly

Alexander Schubert:now you have an echo

Katrin Ohlmer:Good morning!

Paul McGrady:Good evening all!

Jeff Neuman:For the record: The call is being recorded. Attendance will be taken off of the Adobe connect.

Jeff Neuman:We will ask later if anyone is just on the call (of course, they cannot see this if they are only on the phone)

Jeff Neuman:No updates on SOI

Justine Chew:Hi sorry I'm a bit late, lost track of the time.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):NP Justine

Jeff Neuman:No one has hand raised

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):we started late anyway due to technical glitches with Olga's sound from AC

Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):Ok with agenda

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:OK with the agenda

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Hi Olga

RAHUL GOSAIN:Ok with the agenda

Jeff Neuman:For those just joining - FYI Olga is leading the call. We can hear her, but she cannot hear us

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):yess RAHUL GOSAIN:Yes

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Yes Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):We can hear you Olga

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):YES

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:I have not seen any further comments to ToR since we last talked Jeff Neuman:To clarify, as the Working Group, we are the ones to approve the Terms of Reference. We can ask for comments, but at end of day we approve the ToR

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Exactly Jeff they are our ToRs

Steve Chan:Would we like the terms of reference displayed in the AC room?

Paul McGrady:@Jeff, thanks. I was concerned when I heard Olga say it was going out to SO & Acs for approval.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):As was I Paul Justine Chew:Uh huh, she also read Jeff's comment as "...we are not the ones to approve..." :-)

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:We are only sending it to our supporting organization for information - as Jeff said

Jeff Neuman:i will repeat my comment with my hand raised.

Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):Thank you Jeff

Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):The ToR have already been out for comment, this is the version to approve by the WT5 members Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):No comments have been received since we revised the TOR following the WT5 input at the last meeting.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):We do not actually require the AC/SO to do more than note them from our polite FYI to them

Jeff Neuman:We cant hear Annebeth either Martin Sutton (WT5 co-leader):We should move ahead to approve these today as there have been no objections or further comments received.

Julie Bisland 2:Annebeth, we cannot hear you Alexander Schubert:Silence

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:I am not. OK,

Sanna Sahlman:Can not hear Annebeth either.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):I like the sound of that proposal Martin

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Just wanted to say the same as Jeff - we have got the mandate to approve - I will only send to ccNSO for information. We have to move on now

Justine Chew:I have read the TOR draft circulated by Steve on 4 Jan and I am happy with it. Let's get to work hereon?

Katrin Ohlmer:Yes, please go ahead.

Michelle DeSmyter:We have an operator dialing her now

Jeff Neuman:If not, I can cover

Alexander Schubert:Annabeth: Log out and go in again. might help.

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:I wait for the call, but I hear nothing

Hadia Elminiawi: Good morning from egypt, apologies for joining a bit late

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Welcome Hadia Raymond Mamattah (Ghana):Is early morning from Ghana. Good morning

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Yes we can :-)

Emily Barabas:we are now on slide 6

Heather Forrest:Thanks you to the staff and co-leads for providing links to the documents and reports on this presentation - it is important to review the documents themselves

Steve Chan:the slides are unsynced

Emily Barabas:The slides are unsynced

Steve Chan:everyone has control of their own slides

Heather Forrest:It is particularly important to have an understanding of the rationales

for the recommendations in these reports Nick Wenban-Smith (Nominet UK, RySG):very clear, thanks Annebeth Jeff Neuman:2 letter ASCII characters being reserved was also recommended in 2017 in the final report by the CCWG on the Use of Country and Territory Names Greg Shatan:What are you defining as "the gap"? Robin Gross:Worth pointing out that the GNSO's "principle G" (which was approved by the GNSO and ICANN board) setting forth the new gtld program stated" The string evaluation process must not infringe the applicant's freedom of expression rights that are protected under internationally recognized principles of law".

Robin Gross:So this principle is still the approved policy

Paul McGrady:@Annabeth, what gap are you indicating you believe exists that you believe we need to close? Apologies for not catching it when you were speaking.

Jeff Neuman:The gap is the differential between the 2007 GNSO Policy vs what was implemented in 2012

Paul McGrady:@Jeff, thanks.

Liz Williams:And these gaps should be what we identify in a simple schematic that helps us all quickly review what we are talking about.

Jeff Neuman:@Liz - yes we will do that ...though nothing is ever a simple schematic :)

Paul McGrady:+1 Liz. We need to know all of the perceived gaps. For example,, Robin's eample above.

Jeff Neuman:To sum it up: All protections given to geographic names in the APplicant Guidebook other than the reservation of 2 letter ASCII strings at the top level is the gap

Liz Williams:This is what I offered to put together, along with anyone else who'd like to help, as we need it now.

Liz Williams:@Jeff...joking about simple...

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):+1 Webinar

Svitlana Tkachenko:webinar +1

Hempal Shrestha-Nepal:+1 Webinar

Jeff Neuman:We have heard the call for a webinar and will try to arrange for that in the next few weeks

Hadia Elminiawi:+1 webinar

Jeff Neuman:Probably 2 of them so that we can have a convenient time for all time zones

Emily Barabas:List of background resources:



[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_docs.google.com\\_document\\_d\\_1JnqiUKHd9-5FaTLFMFQORmft8GRUL7JSvGF7qS2xj7CAw\\_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8\\_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=q-NPDSyphIRarmBc3ZF4aB5v8GI0RL5pn8iFObOwFEE&s=p0CiFm0TO1tf\\_BoiXoV0LUZZTlab6bILwLVzgwOweQE&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1JnqiUKHd9-5FaTLFMFQORmft8GRUL7JSvGF7qS2xj7CAw_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=q-NPDSyphIRarmBc3ZF4aB5v8GI0RL5pn8iFObOwFEE&s=p0CiFm0TO1tf_BoiXoV0LUZZTlab6bILwLVzgwOweQE&e=)

Heather Forrest: Good idea re timezone repeats, Jeff

Hadia Elminiawi: good idea

Liz Williams: I think the webinar could be a Q & A session...any one who wants to participate can submit a question, we can pull all the answers together and then have a discussion. Really so that we can understand where there are "memory lapses".

Liz Williams: @Alan +1 that is where the true gap is...application to evaluation to implementation.

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5: I agree, Alan

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair): yup

Hadia Elminiawi: +1 Alan

Liz Williams: I think the analysis will include board "interference" in evaluation...there was certainly significant input from the BGC on numerous applications that needs examination.

Jeff Neuman: yes,

Emily sent it out earlier

Emily Barabas: We are now on slide 9

Paul McGrady: Slides aren't expressing themselves. Can the AGB definition be put in chat?

Paul McGrady: I logged out and back in to Ac and now I can see the slides.

Jeff Neuman:FYI -- Martin sent out all of this via email a week or so ago

Jeff Neuman:And the comments Olga is going to review are those from e-mails and from those that sent in comments on the google doc

Susan Payne GNSO/IPC:Definitions are very important. We do need to be clear as we define, however, that not all geo names will necessarily be treated in the same way. This was also the case under the AGB (although as a number of people have commented it woul benefit from better and clearer drafting)

Paul McGrady:+1 Susan.

Emily Barabas:The Google Doc with 2012 AGB definition and feedback is available here:

[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_docs.google.com\\_spreadsheets\\_d\\_1ooKmb576MQJvpHyDYOIJE3M2-2DSsnv-2DSSgVfroT3D7Fc\\_edit-3Fusp-3Ddrive-5Fweb&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8\\_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe\\_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=q-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_spreadsheets_d_1ooKmb576MQJvpHyDYOIJE3M2-2DSsnv-2DSSgVfroT3D7Fc_edit-3Fusp-3Ddrive-5Fweb&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSFO4VShFqESGe_5iHWGIBLwwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=q-)