

Scenario

Removal from Assigned Category, No New ISO Code Assigned

ccPDP-Ret WG

December 2017

One of the scenarios identified by the group to date which may result in retirement of a ccTLD is the move of a Code Element of ISO 3166-1 from *Assigned* to *Transitionally Reserved*¹.

The model is

Retirement process
End stage/change of category ISO 3166-1 -----> Un-Delegated² ccTLDs

Scenario: End of assignment of Code Element, dissolution of the country included in the list of Country names as defined by the ISO 3166 Standard.

Maybe rewrite the whole introduction?

1 End stages/change of listing ISO 3166-1

To date, following the discussions of the WG and original email discussion, the WG marked the following change as scenario:

The change of the listing category of the two-letter Code Element (country code) of ISO 3166-1 from *Assigned* to *Transitionally Reserved, no new ISO Code assigned*.

In terms of the ISO 3166 Standard, Section 7.3, this is a deletion from the list of country names as included in Article 6 of the standard (and in terms of the Online Browsing Platform: the officially assigned codes). The second part of the description *Moved to the Transitionally Reserved List* is not based on the Standard but refers to a category under *Other Codes* included in the Online Platform.

Examples are:

¹ Note that the term *Transitionally Reserved* is not included in the Standard document, but defined on the ISO 3166 Online Browsing Platform.

² The term *Un-Delegated* is not defined. It is used as an overall, heuristic concept to describe the stage where the delegation has ended.

- 25 SU (Soviet Union) (1990)
- 26 NT Neutral Zone (1993)
- 27 YU Yugoslavia (2003)
- 28 CS Serbia and Montenegro (2006)
- 29 AN Netherlands Antilles (2010)
- 30 The Code Element SU was removed from the list of country names, it was later
31 included in the list of *Exceptionally Reserved* Code Elements as defined in the Standard
32 (section 7.5.4)
- 33 The Code Elements NT, YU and AN were removed from the list of country names and
34 included in the list of *Transitionally Reserved* Code Elements, which is a list published
35 through the Online Browsing Platform, but which is not defined under the Standard
36 itself.

37 2 Removal of Code Elements

38 2.1 Was the change/scenario cause for a retirement process?

39 Based on an initial analysis of the DRDWG and IANA reports, the following changes
40 of Code Elements caused the retirement of the ccTLD:

- 41 • The removal of YU from the list of country names as defined in the Standard
42 resulted in a retirement of the ccTLD .YU. The process for the retirement of .YU
43 was initiated in 2003 (see [6], [5]).
- 44 • The removal from AN from the list of country names as defined in the Standard
45 resulted in a retirement of the ccTLD .AN. The process for AN, Netherlands
46 Antilles, was initiated in 2010 (see [1]).
- 47 • CS was never delegated as a ccTLD, hence the removal from the list of country
48 names had no effect.
- 49 • SU was removed from the list of country names as defined in the Standard.
50 It did not result in a retirement of the ccTLD .SU. SU was added to the list of
51 *Exceptionally Reserved* Code Elements.

Year?

Com-
mence-
ment of
the pro-
cess?

52 **2.2 Who initiated the retirement process?**

53 **2.2.1 YU, Yugoslavia (2003)**

54 After removal of YU (and the expected removal of CS) from the list of country names
55 as defined by the ISO 3166 Standard, the anticipated future ccTLD managers for .ME
56 and .RS respectively, and the IANA Operator developed a transition plan.

57 This plan from .YU to .RS and .ME involved a Memorandum of Understanding between
58 the two entities and would see that .YU assigned to the proposed .RS ccTLD manager,
59 which was effectively the same operator as the .YU ccTLD manager. The .RS ccTLD
60 manager would act as caretaker for .YU for two years to allow for a stable transition.

61 By Board decision 2007, the retirement was initiated by decision of transfer (revoca-
62 tion) of the .YU ccTLD to the Serbian National Registry of Internet Domain Names in
63 a temporary caretaker capacity. At the same time the decision to delegate .RS and
64 .ME was taken (see [12]).

65 **2.2.2 AN, Netherlands Antilles (2010)**

66 In December 2010 AN was removed from the list of the list of country names as
67 defined by the ISO 3166 standard, and CW for Curaçao, SX for Sint Maarten (Dutch
68 part), and BQ for the BES Islands (Bonaire, Saba and Sint Eustatius), were added.

69 In January 2011, the University of the Netherlands Antilles presented its initial
70 application to ICANN for delegation of the .CW ccTLD. Subsequently, over the course
71 of the year the application was expanded and revised.

72 In March 2011, the University and SX Registry SA executed a "grand-father agree-
73 ment".

74 In September 2011, the University entered into a revised agreement with SX Registry
75 SA B.V. in regards to the transitional arrangements concerning the .AN ccTLD,

76 Noting that a transition plan was in place at the time of the decision, which included,
77 inter alia, to move registrations from the .AN ccTLD to the new ccTLDs .CW and .SX,
78 with the University of the Netherlands Antilles continuing to act as manager of the
79 .AN ccTLD until the transition was complete, the ICANN Board decided (following
80 the decision to delegate .AW) that the University of Netherlands Antilles:

- 81 • be instructed to report their progress on decommissioning the .AN ccTLD every
82 six months to ICANN against a relevant set of metrics;
- 83 • work to complete the transition of the .AN ccTLD to the .CW ccTLD, the .SX
84 ccTLD, and any other relevant ccTLD;
- 85 • the .AN ccTLD be removed from the DNS root zone on 31 October 2014, if not
86 requested earlier by the manager of the ccTLD.

87 **2.3 How is retirement initiated?**

88 **Letter from PTI/IFO to ccTLDs? ICANN Board decision? Letter from relevant** 89 **government?**

90 **2.3.1 YU, Yugoslavia (2003)**

91 In 2003, The Federal Republic of Yugoslavia was superseded by a different form of
92 union between the states of Serbia and Montenegro. The successor was to be known
93 as "Serbia and Montenegro", and in recognition of this, the ISO 3166-1 Code Element
94 was changed from "YU" to "CS" (i.e. "Crna Gora and Srbija"). The Secretariat of the ISO
95 3166 Maintenance Agency formally communicated this change to the IANA Operator
96 in July 2003.

97 In the discussions the .YU ccTLD Manager held with the IANA Operator, they con-
98 veyed the opinion that a planned referendum for self-determination to be held by
99 Montenegro had a reasonable prospect of seeing the union between Serbia and Mon-
100 tenegro dissolved, and would result in two separate countries. In light of this, the
101 IANA Operator did not seek an immediate transition from the .YU ccTLD to the .CS
102 ccTLD until the outcome of that process was concluded.

103 In October 2006, the IANA Operator met with the Administrative Contact for the .YU
104 ccTLD. In this meeting she explained that initial discussions were being conducted
105 both within Serbia, and with prospective operators of the .ME ccTLD. The IANA
106 Operator was advised that it was anticipated there would be delegation applications
107 forthcoming from the countries. In those discussions, the importance of a transition
108 plan from the existing .YU ccTLD was stressed.

109 In December 2006, the Government of Montenegro submitted a delegation applica-
110 tion for the .ME ccTLD. This was followed by the applications for the delegations of
111 the .RS ccTLD, and the revocation of the .YU ccTLD, received in February 2007.

112 In the time following the receipt of the initial applications, the IANA Operator sought
113 additional information and clarifications from the applicants to ensure that they met
114 IANA's criteria for delegation. The IANA Operator also asked that the plan for transi-
115 tion from the .YU ccTLD be documented and proposed as part of the applications.

116 **2.3.2 AN, Netherlands Antilles (2010)**

117 In December 2010 AN was removed from the list of the list of country names as
118 defined by the ISO 3166 Standard. CW for Curaçao, SX for Sint Maarten (Dutch part),
119 and BQ for the BES islands, were added. In January 2011, the University of the
120 Netherlands Antilles presented its initial application to ICANN for delegation of the
121 .CW ccTLD. Subsequently, over the course of the year the application was expanded
122 and revised.

123 In March 2011, the University and SX Registry SA executed a "grand-father agree-
124 ment".

125 In September 2011, the University entered into a revised agreement with SX Registry
126 SA B.V. in regards to the transitional arrangements concerning the .AN ccTLD (see
127 [2]),

128 At the time of the decision by the ICANN Board to delegate .CW [11], a transition plan
129 was in place .This included inter alia:

- 130 • to move registrations from the .AN ccTLD to the new ccTLDs .CW and .SX;
- 131 • the University of the Netherlands Antilles to continue acting as ccTLD manager
132 of .AN until the transition was complete.

133 **2.4 What are the consequences once the retirement process is initiated, if** 134 **any and for whom?**

135 **2.4.1 YU, Yugoslavia (2003)**

136 To implement the guidance from the ICANN Board on a reporting mechanism with
137 respect to the retirement of .YU, IANA Staff met with representatives of the .YU ccTLD
138 Manager, RNIDS, to discuss reporting on the timely implementation of retirement of
139 .YU. Goal was to be that any concerns that might result in delaying the retirement
140 could be adequately shared and considered well in advance.

141 Specifically, the regular reports needed to address three issues:

- 142 1. describe the ccTLD Manager's progress in retiring the .YU ccTLD;
- 143 2. describe any problems experienced that might impact the ccTLD Manager's
144 ability to meet the 30 September 2009 deadline.
- 145 3. describe what steps were being undertaken to remedy any issues raised in #2.

146 RNIDS provided updates.

147 According to the IANA report on *Removal of the .YU domain formerly representing Yu-*
148 *goslavia* [7], there were 4,266 .YU domain names still delegated in June 2009. This
149 was down from 32,772. In June 2009, there were 26,294 domain names registered
150 in .RS. IANA staff noted that of the remaining 4,266 domain names (under .YU),
151 approximately 200 did not also have a matching .RS domain name.

152 In September 2009 the ICANN Board extended the date of retirement to 30 March
153 2010 (see [13]).

154 The IANA Operator was informed on 30 March that RNIDS had informed the commu-
155 nity that it had effectively switched off the .YU ccTLD, independent of the removal of
156 .YU from the DNS root zone.

157 On 1 April 2010 the .YU ccTLD was removed from the DNS root zone.

158 In the process of the removal of the .YU ccTLD, RNIDS raised the point with the ICANN
159 Board that for a better guidance in the future on how the process of retiring ccTLDs
160 should be conducted, clear and transparent rules should be available. Based on the
161 reports available it is not clear what is meant.

162 For a more fulsome description on the process of the retirement of .YU, you are
163 deferred to the IANA report (see [7]).

164 **2.4.2 AN, Netherlands Antilles (2010)**

165 After the delegation of .CW to the University of the Netherlands Antilles continued to
166 act as ccTLD manager for .AN until the transition was complete.

167 As part of the arrangement it was agreed to move registrations from the .AN ccTLD
168 to the new ccTLDs .CW and .SX.

169 In 2014 the .AN ccTLD Manager and the Netherlands' Ministry of Economic Affairs
170 have sought a nine month extension of the deadline of retiring .AN by 31 October
171 2014. The request was made to provide additional opportunity for the remaining
172 registrants to conclude their transition away from the .AN ccTLD. According to the
173 letter from the Dutch Ministry the .AN ccTLD Manager and the Dutch government
174 needed more time to find and implement alternative options for the remaining .AN
175 ccTLD in the BES islands.

176 By Decision in October 2014, the ICANN Board extended the deadline for the .AN
177 ccTLD removal from the DNS Root Zone to 31 July 2015 [10].

178 .AN was retired 31 October 2015

179 **3 Additional Material**

- 180 • Discussion Paper on Retiring Country Code Top-Level Domains (see [4])
 - 181 – Public Comments (see [9])
- 182 • Delegation Record for .AN (see [3])
- 183 • Letter from the Dutch Ministry of Economic Affairs on Retirement of .AN (see
184 [15])
 - 185 – Response by the IANA Operator (see [8])
- 186 • Further Letter from the Dutch Ministry of Economic Affairs (see [14])

187 There is no response to this letter on the ICANN correspondence page

189 References

- 190 [1] IANA: *Delegation of the .CW domain representing Curaçao to the University of the*
191 *Netherlands Antilles, and transitional arrangements for the .AN domain representing the*
192 *Netherlands Antilles.* [https://www.iana.org/reports/2011/cw-report-20111003.](https://www.iana.org/reports/2011/cw-report-20111003.html)
193 [html](https://www.iana.org/reports/2011/cw-report-20111003.html), Last Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 194 [2] IANA: *Delegation of the .SX domain representing Sint Maarten (Dutch part) to SXRegistry*
195 *SA B.V.* <https://www.iana.org/reports/2011/sx-report-20111114.html>, Last
196 Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 197 [3] IANA: *Delegation Record for .AN.* [https://www.iana.org/domains/root/db/an.](https://www.iana.org/domains/root/db/an.html)
198 [html](https://www.iana.org/domains/root/db/an.html), Last Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 199 [4] IANA: *Discussion Paper on Retiring Country Code Top-Level Domains.* [https://www.](https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2-2006-12-05-en)
200 [icann.org/news/announcement-2-2006-12-05-en](https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2-2006-12-05-en), Last Accessed: 2017-01-18
- 201 [5] IANA: *IANA Report on Delegation of the .ME Domain.* [https://www.iana.org/](https://www.iana.org/reports/2007/rs-yu-report-11sep2007.html)
202 [reports/2007/rs-yu-report-11sep2007.html](https://www.iana.org/reports/2007/rs-yu-report-11sep2007.html), Last Accessed: 2017-01-18
- 203 [6] IANA: *IANA Report on Delegation of the .RS Domain, and Redelegation of the .YU Domain.*
204 <https://www.iana.org/reports/2007/rs-yu-report-11sep2007.html>, Last Ac-
205 cessed: 2017-01-18
- 206 [7] IANA: *Removal of the .YU domain formerly representing Yugoslavia.* [https://www.iana.](https://www.iana.org/reports/2010/yu-report-01apr2010.html)
207 [org/reports/2010/yu-report-01apr2010.html](https://www.iana.org/reports/2010/yu-report-01apr2010.html), Last Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 208 [8] IANA: *Request to postpone phasing out of the .an domain.* [https://www.icann.org/en/](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/gerich-to-de-haan-03jul15-en.pdf)
209 [system/files/correspondence/gerich-to-de-haan-03jul15-en.pdf](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/gerich-to-de-haan-03jul15-en.pdf), Last Ac-
210 cessed: 2017-01-18
- 211 [9] ICANN: *[cctld-sunset-comments] Chronological Index.* [https://forum.icann.org/](https://forum.icann.org/lists/cctld-sunset-comments/)
212 [lists/cctld-sunset-comments/](https://forum.icann.org/lists/cctld-sunset-comments/), Last Accessed: 2017-01-18
- 213 [10] ICANN BOARD OF DIRECTORS: *Approved Board Resolutions | Regular Meet-*
214 *ing of the ICANN Board.* [https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/](https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2014-10-16-en#1.d)
215 [resolutions-2014-10-16-en#1.d](https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2014-10-16-en#1.d), Last Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 216 [11] ICANN BOARD OF DIRECTORS: *Approved Board Resolutions | Special Meet-*
217 *ing of the ICANN Board.* [https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/](https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2011-10-11-en)
218 [resolutions-2011-10-11-en](https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/resolutions-2011-10-11-en), Last Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 219 [12] ICANN BOARD OF DIRECTORS: *Minutes for Special Meeting of the ICANN Board of Directors.*
220 <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/minutes-2007-09-11-en>,
221 Last Accessed: 2018-01-17

- 222 [13] ICANN BOARD OF DIRECTORS: *Preliminary Report of Special Board Meeting*. <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/prelim-report-2009-09-30-en>,
223 <https://www.icann.org/resources/board-material/prelim-report-2009-09-30-en>,
224 Last Accessed: 2018-01-17
- 225 [14] MINISTER OF ECONOMIC AFFAIRS: *Additional Request to postpone phasing out of*
226 *the .an domain*. [https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/de-haan-to-crocker-10jun15-en.pdf)
227 [de-haan-to-crocker-10jun15-en.pdf](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/de-haan-to-crocker-10jun15-en.pdf), Last Accessed: 2017-01-18
- 228 [15] MINISTER OF ECONOMIC AFFAIRS: *Request to postpone phasing out of the*
229 *.an domain*. [https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/de-haan-to-crocker-09oct14-en.pdf)
230 [de-haan-to-crocker-09oct14-en.pdf](https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/correspondence/de-haan-to-crocker-09oct14-en.pdf), Last Accessed: 2017-01-18

Draft, 2018-01-22