

**Adobe Connect: 45 Members**

Alan Greenberg

Alexander Schubert

Alfredo Calderon

Ann-Cathrin Marcussen, ccNSO

Ashley Heineman (US)

Aziz HILALI

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO)

Carlos Dionisio Aguirre

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair)

Christa Taylor

Christopher Wilkinson (Co-leader At Large)

Darcy Southwell

Delia Belciu

Greg Shatan

Griffin Barnett

Hadia Elminiawi

Jaap Akkerhuis

Janvier NGNOULAYE

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC)

Jeff Neuman

John Rodriguez

Juan Manuel Rojas (NPOC)

Justine Chew

Karen Day

Katrin Ohlmer

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry)

Liz Williams

Marita Moll

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead

Nick Wenban-Smith (Nominet,

RySG)

Pascal Bekono

Paul McGrady

Peter Van Roste - CENTR

Rahul Gosain

Raymond Mamattah (Ghana)

Ricardo Holmquist ALAC

Robin Gross

Rosalía Morales

Sara Bockey

Statton Hammock

Susan Payne -GNSO

Svitlana Tkachenko, .UA

Tom Dale (ACIG GAC

Secretariat)

Wafa Dahmani

Yrjö Länsipuro

**On Audio only:** Susan Anthony

**Apologies:** Jim Prendergast, GZ Kabir, Jorge Cancio, Annebeth Lange, Kavouss Arasteh, Sebastien Pensis, Dave Kissoondoyal, Paul Rosenzweig, Luca Barbero, Aslam Mohamed, Kris Seeburn, Maureen Hilyard, Sanna Sahlman, Dessalegn Yehuala, Sala Tamanikaiwaimaro, Mzia Gogilashvili, Julie Hedlund (staff)

**Staff:**

Emily Barabas  
Nanig Mehranian  
Trang Nguyen  
Steve Chan  
Terri Agnew

Terri Agnew: Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level on Wednesday, 20 December 2017 at 20:00 UTC for 90 minutes.

Terri Agnew: agenda wiki page: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_community.icann.org\\_x\\_Dw9yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=OqIZqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj\\_n02dpOqg\\_k9A457S9w&s=KKKv6jq1pXMWbGlhsZUn3jS1tECgYHVCaMusrxAELo8&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_Dw9yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=OqIZqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj_n02dpOqg_k9A457S9w&s=KKKv6jq1pXMWbGlhsZUn3jS1tECgYHVCaMusrxAELo8&e=)

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO): Greetings Terri

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO): many thanks

Alfredo Calderon: Me too! Terri.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair): Hi All

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO): Hi Cheryl, very clear

Svitlana Tkachenko, .UA: Good evening!

Jeff Neuman: Do we have Christopher on?

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead: Loud and clear

Rahul Gosain: Good Evening (by Chat only)

Katrin Ohlmer: Good Evening!

Robin Gross: Good afternoon!

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC): hi all

Aziz HILALI: Hello evryone

Alfredo Calderon: Buenas tardes desde Puerto Rico. Good afternoon from Puerto Rico.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair): The ccNSO "format Christopher refers to is of course the recent **\*\*Joint\*\*** SO process between the GNSO & the ccNSO

Hadia Elminiawi: hello all

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair): perhaps his earlier reference to GNSO Process was a reference to **\*PRE\*** Applicant Guidebook years

Susan Payne -GNSO: @ Christopher "sensitivity" yes. "ownership" - depends who you are saying owns them. "Claims to ownership" - certainly

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO):I am ok

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Apologies for being late.

Steve Chan:Correct

Svitlana Tkachenko, .UA:yes

Steve Chan:We are scheduled for 90 minutes, if needed

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):yes

Sara Bockey:Yes, please go ahead

Rosalía Morales:yes

Alan Greenberg:Let's proceed!

Liz Williams:@Christopher...I would like to add an element to AOB which says that there could be an option of taking small elements of non-agreed things could be handled by email during the break between now and the next call.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):A Future Meeting time slot will allow for you all to get work done more easily (In my View)

Liz Williams:See the question in the chat...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Good point Liz

Steve Chan:The discussion of 90 minutes calls in the future can, and probably should, also be a question posed to the email list

Justine Chew:@Chris, I would like to raise an administrative item under AOB -- Could WT5 members be asked to convey replies which solely relates to apologies for meetings to the GSNO secretariat? To include this request in meeting reminders and circulation of proposed agendas by WT Co-Leaders. Thanks..

Emily Barabas:@Justine, thanks for this comment. Staff will send a reminder to the mailing list following this call.

Liz Williams:Thanks Martin...I am challenged with Internet connection where I am and the audio is difficult...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Thanks for raising this Justine I assume it will only need a review of the AI in AOB then...

Emily Barabas:For those who use Google Docs, the current document is available here: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_docs.google.com\\_document\\_d\\_1J8iuUrfqCaVKdzeRN01vRhZAJb8KABRp-5FNwdDwkQzVg\\_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIGN-H4xR2EBk&m=OqIzqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj\\_n02dpOqg\\_k9A457S9w&s=6Y5bHMSDQIfUzd6kYLy0HK\\_0mgbBl\\_JMRvzNCvL0IkM&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1J8iuUrfqCaVKdzeRN01vRhZAJb8KABRp-5FNwdDwkQzVg_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIGN-H4xR2EBk&m=OqIzqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj_n02dpOqg_k9A457S9w&s=6Y5bHMSDQIfUzd6kYLy0HK_0mgbBl_JMRvzNCvL0IkM&e=)

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:@Liz - no problem. Useful point raised, thank you.

Liz Williams:I would really urge us to be inclusive of all elements that people want to discuss. We all know full well that Terms of Reference do not limit issues being raised again and again if people feel they don't get what they want. I would focus on developing ways to a)remember that everyone acts in their personal capacity b) that the work of the group will go through many iterations and c) there are lots of opportunity for modification outside of this process before it gets to the board.

Alan Greenberg:Let us please proceed with the substance of the call.

Liz Williams:@Kristina...you are absolutely right. We must not start with objections. We must start with positives and a very open funnel and work downwards to dealing with objections which may be a very very long way in the future.

Steve Chan:@Christopher, I'll defer to Jeff

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):this is of course a long way from the early draft but yes Jeff (and Avri at the early stages) sketched the original out, \*\*much\*\* has changed in it since of course :-)

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:Bad echo!

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):@martin: from me?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Can you suggest some brief text Kristina?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):here in Chat I mean ;-)

Robin Gross:What Kristina recommends makes sense. Better to start with defining geonames and then drilling down into the objection process for them.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):+1 CLO

Sara Bockey:Agree with Robin and Kristina

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):@Cheryl. Working on it

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):bless you :-)

wafa Dahmani (AtLarge-ccNSO):+1 kristina

Jeff Neuman:These comments will NOT appear as part of the final terms of reference. They are only here for this call

Justine Chew:@Jeff, thanks, I would have thought that would be obvious ;-)

Liz Williams:@Martin...what I was saying was that we should be focusing on broader elements in this context as we know full well that Terms of Reference limitations we see issues raised time and time again outside of the PDP if people perceive their points are not heard.

Liz Williams:And we need to reassure end users that we are thinking about their rights/opportunities/future innovation as our first priority not that we want to close things down at this early stage.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Thx @Liz, yes the debate needs to happen but not in the ToR that facilitates of course but \*in my view\* is best kept at 'high level'

Katrin Ohlmer:@CLO: Agree - ToR should be kept on high-level

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:Liz - thanks for clarifying. We've got it in the notes.

Marita Moll:Can we get a link to this. Easier to read in a different window

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):@Marita I am sure staff will put this in chat

Jeff Neuman:It was a really long quote that we cut down

Jeff Neuman:for purposes of this draft

Justine Chew:18 Dec version sent by Emily: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_docs.google.com\\_document\\_d\\_1J8iuUrfqCaVKdzeRN01vRhZAJb8KABRp-5FNwdDwkQzVg\\_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwlFaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSfPcIgmKXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIGN-H4xR2EBk&m=OqLZqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj\\_n02dpOqg\\_k9A457S9w&s=IhKk97ayKiVIVZFsQr09Ik3hD9m0bFHKhAYN3UWqNo&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1J8iuUrfqCaVKdzeRN01vRhZAJb8KABRp-5FNwdDwkQzVg_edit-3Fusp-3Dsharing&d=DwlFaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSfPcIgmKXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIGN-H4xR2EBk&m=OqLZqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj_n02dpOqg_k9A457S9w&s=IhKk97ayKiVIVZFsQr09Ik3hD9m0bFHKhAYN3UWqNo&e=)

Marita Moll:thank you!!

Justine Chew:Sorry, it's a living document so now it shows all the edits on my screen

Steve Chan:The clean copy can be found on the Wiki here: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_community.icann.org\\_x\\_Dw9yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSfPcIgmKXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=OqIzqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj\\_n02dpOqg\\_k9A457S9w&s=KKKv6jqlpXMWbGlhsZUn3jS1tECgYHVCaMusrxAELo8&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_Dw9yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSfPcIgmKXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=OqIzqt7WBnF6msOpLQH2eOCj_n02dpOqg_k9A457S9w&s=KKKv6jqlpXMWbGlhsZUn3jS1tECgYHVCaMusrxAELo8&e=)

Jeff Neuman:There is a footnote to the full section

Jeff Neuman:in the draft

Steve Chan:Underneath Background Documents

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Thanks Steve

Marita Moll:Much easier to follow this way.

Paul McGrady:The GNSO Council Policy stands until it is replaced with new Policy. Intervening implementation that ignores Policy doesn't make the Policy go away.

Robin Gross:Completely agree, Paul.

Katrin Ohlmer:+1 Paul

Alan Greenberg:I thought the basis, unless we explicitly change or revert to the original policy, is the Applicant Guidebook

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):That is my understanding @Alan Yes

Liz Williams:@Paul & Robyn yes I agree however, we know that implementation substantially changed the way policy was actually used in the process. That is what we need to clean up; make more objective; ensure that all applicants know what they are doing; all evaluators are clear; ensure, particularly, when and how the Board and GAC get involved in any application evaluation. It is a grave error to repeat the confusion where the board becomes the evaluation panel.

Liz Williams:It is double trouble that the GAC, in the context of the discussion here, becomes a quasi evaluation panel, even though we all know governments may have legitimate public policy interests

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Here's a proposed revision of Para. 1 (Scope) that addresses my concern. Explanatory note will follow: Work Track 5 will focus on developing proposed recommendations regarding geographic names at the top level, including both ASCII and IDN form. WT5 will (i) consider what constitutes a geographic name in the specific context of the New gTLD Program; (ii) analyze relevant rules contained in the 2012 Applicant Guidebook, such as the Geographic Names Review procedure, Geographic Names Extended Evaluation, and Objection Procedures; and (iii) take into account previous work related to geographic names that the community may have completed.

Alan Greenberg:Can we have a ruling from the PDP Co-Chairs, we have to irreconcilable positions being proposed here as to what the default it.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Explanatory note: : I intentionally used Geographic Names Review because it is the umbrella section within the AGB (2.2.1.4) within which a number of more specific sections – such as Geographic Names Requiring Government Support (2.2.1.4.2) and the Review Procedure for Geographic Names (2.2.1.4.4.). To address my concern about the previous “Potential Grounds for Objection,” I intentionally used Objection Procedures, which is the title of the AGB module that covers objections.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):+1Alan

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):You can from Me @Alan

Liz Williams:@Kristina...nice work. Tight language and allows for inevitable broader discussion.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):@Liz: Thanks.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Thanks Kristina that helps us capture your point and post a possible solution

Robin Gross:Avri was pretty clear in Abu Dhabi at our WT5 kick-off meeting that existing gtld policy stands unless and until this WT comes to consensus to change it.

Steve Chan:@Hadia, as noted by Greg, the language in quotes is direct text from the overall PDP WG's charter.

Greg Shatan:Once again, this is the Charter you are objecting to.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Absolutely @Robyn

Jeff Neuman:Can I respond to this point

Paul McGrady:+1 Kristina. I like the proposed language.

Justine Chew:@Kristina, good writing.

Robin Gross:I think Kristina's language proposal is a good way forward also.

Peter Van Roste - CENTR:+1 @Nick's comment. How have the other WTs defined their scope?

Liz Williams:Can we ask the question, through the chair, if we can proceed with Kristina's language? Constant revisiting of the preparatory work is not getting us to where we need to be.

Greg Shatan:We have to abide by the Charter whether or not it's quoted in this document.

Liz Williams:@Greg...good point but the charter is also like a map that we keep at our left hand whilst we make progress...

Greg Shatan:Kristina's language needs to be amended to include reference to the 2007 Policy.

Marita Moll:That (such a matrix) sure would help those of us who have not seen the various versions

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):@Greg: I didn't intentionally exclude the charter language. I was working from the current scope para 1.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):+1

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):(to Alan)

Jeff Neuman:Liz, the charter is not supposed to be a map. That will be the work plan The charter is the umbrella under which a work plan will be created to act as that map

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):+ 1 Alan

Yrjö Länsipuro:+1 to Alan

Jeff Neuman:Lets please try to make some progress on the language itself as opposed to trying to introduce a new philosophy about charters.

Thanks :)

Greg Shatan:Disagree with Alan.

Greg Shatan:Agree with our Charter, which should be dispositive.

Liz Williams:@ Jeff...you know what I mean Jeff...we need to move forward...

Nick Wenban-Smith (Nominet, RySG):happy with that scope wording which Martin just read out

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:Thank you Kristina - very helpful

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Chat comments re @Kristina's draft text were by my reading all supportive

Liz Williams:@ Nick W-S...agree with you which means we have some helpful scope and Kristina's language

Paul McGrady:Disagree with Alan as well. While we should evaluate the Applicant Guidebook, it needs to be evaluated against the standing GNSO Policy and in light of the geo names issues that arose in Round 1.

Katrin Ohlmer:+1 Paul

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):good point Greg

Liz Williams:@Chris...we know full well that the AGB procedures were not right, at the time and in hindsight. We only have to look at the length of time it has taken for the resolution of some applications to know that is the case. We must aim to do better in any subsequent rounds...for the sake of applicants, their supporters and ICANN as an organisation.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):We can include reference to the 2007 GNSO Policy recommendations in scope para 1 by changing my original (ii) to: (ii) analyze (a) 2007 GNSO Policy Recommendations on the Introduction of New Generic Top-Level Domains; and (b) relevant rules contained in the 2012 Applicant Guidebook, such as the Geographic Names Review procedure, Geographic Names Extended Evaluation, and Objection Procedures;

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:@Greg - we can look at referencing the policy principles for 2007 in Kristina's proposed text

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:@Kristina....and there we have it :-)

Justine Chew:+1 Kristina

Katrin Ohlmer:+1 Kristina

Paul McGrady:+1 Kristina

Alan Greenberg:I didn't say we should not re-evaluate. I said if we do not make any change, the new "applicant guidebook" we keep the language of the old one.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):showing what is \*out\* of "scope" for our work

Peter Van Roste - CENTR:Fully support Jeff's clarification of this paragraph on 'jurisdiction'.. It should remain in for further reference.

Susan Payne -GNSO:how about we say "remit" instead of "jurisdiction"

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Noted @Peter , but do we need to explain more clearly in the text then or not?

Alfredo Calderon:@Susan, I agree with 'remit' to replace jurisdiction.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):okayyyy

Greg Shatan:Must be that nasty American language.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):@Susan "remit" could well work

Griffin Barnett:@Greg, yep not English, but rather "American" ha

Jeff Neuman:Its my New York language.....wow I am taking a hit for trying to draft a skelaton

Emily Barabas:We can get everything we need from the call recordings

Greg Shatan:New Yawk Tawk!

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):in my Spanglish lead means....

Alan Greenberg:I think that we can safely change LEADS to LEADERS without major debate.

Justine Chew:The Work Track Co-Leaders -- what was agreed to in structuring this WT5?

Justine Chew:I ask because even in the Agenda pod the term "Co-Leads" is used.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC): I object! I like "leads"!!! ;)

Jeff Neuman:[This is Christopher's PERSONAL opinion]

Steve Chan:@Justine, we have consistently used the term co-leads for the other four work tracks. I think using co-leads for WT5 was just considered a natural extension of that practice.

Justine Chew:@Steve, thanks for reply on precedent.

Janvier NGNOULAYE:But the WT5 can give its content to the word "co-lead" based on the scope we want to cover

Paul McGrady:My only comment is that this is, in fact, a PDP.

Alan Greenberg:I'm a bit confused. This was billed as a second reading. What happens to the comments that were added to the GoogleDoc in the last day or two?

Darcy Southwell:This WT is part of a PDP. I don't understand Christopher's comments on that.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Indeed that is \*my\* understanding @Darcy

Robin Gross:We are required to follow the GNSO PDP process, or ICANN is in violation of it's bylaws, so while we can be sympathetic to desire to change the process, it isn't a practical reality that we can do. We have to follow the process laid out in GNSO PDP process.

Darcy Southwell:+1 Robin Gross

Griffin Barnett:+1

Susan Payne -GNSO:All PDPs are open to all participants. This one is different only insofar as significant extra effort was made to encourage wider participation. It's a PDP and has to follow the PDP process as set down

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):+1 RobinGross

Sara Bockey:Agree, this is a GNSO PDP and we will be following that process

Paul McGrady:+1 Robin. +1 Susan.

Justine Chew:I understood that Christopher commented that there are some members who asked about the decision-making process of this WT5., not that he questioned it himself.

Robin Gross:As I recall from the development of the GNSO policy in 2007, GAC was heavily involved in the GNSO PDP process at the time. It is the reason why the Rec on "morality and public order" was created in GNSO process: because GAC wanted it and created it via the GNSO process.

Karen Day:+1 Greg, Susan, Sara, & Robin

Liz Williams:Referring to rules of engagement...I would like us to focus on "speaking in a personal capacity"...we mustn't fall into the trap of "believing" that when someone says something that is the position of the group they would normally participate in. We need to focus on getting the best advice and input from participants. When the chance comes for public comments and other "consensus" voting, that is when we should be hearing submissions from named groups...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Correct @Martin we have made additional and proactive efforts for this topic, reflecting its importance to so many

Greg Shatan:Alan, every PDP faces the same issue.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):The strength of the process is extremely important on this topic yes @Alan



Alexander Schubert backup:GAC has to be consulted and OK with our results....

Liz Williams:@Robin...actually that wasn't quite what happened in 2007. We struggled consistently with getting early and cohesive inputs from the GAC which is why we ended up with the "morality and public order" language to try to capture public policy concerns. We didn't do as well as we perhaps could have...but we did the best we could at the time. Fortunately in this case, all ACs and SOs are involved from the beginning.

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:Let's summarise where we are with the ToR

Alan Greenberg:@Greg, yes, every pdp faces this, but we are entering this with a very well know point of contention. AND i for one would like to think that we may come out of it in a better place.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):@Liz and @Alan to that end then the strength, inclusiveness and trasparency of the WT5 processes is extreemly important

Justine Chew:Yes Martin. How will the proposed new edits to the googledocs be managed?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):I **\*\*strongly\*\*** suggest a specific date for all final imput into the ToR's for a very soon date

Robin Gross:Agree, CLO

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):we need to "start" the 2018 years work in WT5 **\*with\*** the ToRs in place

Alfredo Calderon:For the third draft reading I suggest a closing date, so we may discuss a document we have all read.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Exactly @ Alfredo

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):List work is perfectly good to utalise at this stage

Alan Greenberg:Only my concern with comments made on wiki

Janvier NGNOULAYE:+1 @ Alfredo

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Exactly @Jeff

Greg Shatan:Agree with Jeff. This can't be a merry-go-round.

Justine Chew:@Jeff, thank you, so long as there is adequate explanation on how they have been considered and dealt with so we don't have further questions.

Alfredo Calderon:+1 @Jeff recommendation to have a final draft.

Robin Gross:+1 Jeff

Alan Greenberg:ok, I hadn't actually read te comments on GoogleDoc. Just concerned with the number of them.

Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):Have to drop to get to another building for a meeting that starts in 15 minutes. Happy 2018 everyone!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):A clean version by end of week to get List input on

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):is what I heard Jeff suggest

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):+1 Alfredo

Justine Chew:+1 Martin

Jeff Neuman:Correct

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Thought my caffination level was OK, thanks @Jeff

Katrin Ohlmer:A final draft would be great to move forward in January.

Liz Williams:We must not have minority views now...that is for the end of the process not the beginning.

Greg Shatan:Go back to the PDP Regs — we have to live by that regarding non-consensus views.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):if the WT changes the term, the PDP itself will not as we follow the GNSO PDP Guidelines

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Exactly @Greg

Alan Greenberg:Minority View is the defined term in the PDP WG Guidelines. We cannot change it.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Yup @Alan indeed

Greg Shatan:Aren't co-leads supposed to operate neutrally?

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):we have discussed this at length in the Leadership Team calls

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Yes @Greg I am sure they all do their best to do so

Robin Gross:I'm not sure it is appropriate for one group to be told to back down by the neutral co-chair

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):<Comment> can Alan's statement that beyond The undisputed fact that we must follow GNSO PDP Rules here, we must also all bind ourselves to "endeavor to also work as if we were a CCWG" in order to justly gauge views at all ACs & SOs so as to avoid future friction?

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):view of all (typo)

Jeff Neuman:The GAC did

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):GAC only I believe

Alan Greenberg:The GAC set a lot of requirements that are not being met. We will hopefully survive that.

Robin Gross:Completely agree with Greg. GTLD policy is the GNSO's raison d'etre.

Jeff Neuman:All - Lets stick to the Terms of Reference please

Sara Bockey:Again, agree with Greg.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Good progress on the ToR though \*Thank You All\* for that effort

Liz Williams:Rules and Risks can be put together as a document for discussion. @Martin...happy to help with that if you would like.

Terri Agnew:The next meeting for the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level will take place on Wednesday, 17 January 2018 at 05:00 UTC for 90 minutes.

Javier NGNOULAYE:Yes @Jeff, the ToR are the basics of the work of WT

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO):Good effort on the TOR, no AOB from me, we are making good progress IMHO

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Seasons Greetings to you all, if you travel please do so safely, let's continue our work on list and start strong \*with\* ToR's settled early in Jan 2018... Bye for now and special thanks to Staff the Co-Leads of the WT and all who participated at this time of year...

Hadia Elminiawi:thank you all

Rahul Gosain:Seasons Greetings to all of you.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):bye to all and happy holidays

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:Thank you all and best wishes for the New Year

Alfredo Calderon:Til next meeting! Happy Holidays!

Rahul Gosain:Wish you all a Very Happy Christmas and a very Happy new Year!

Katrin Ohlmer:Merry Christmas and best wishes for the New Year!

Alexander Schubert backup:Happy Christmas!

Yrjö Länsipuro:Happy holidays to all, best wishes for 2018

Robin Gross:Thanks, all, happy holidays!

Alan Greenberg:Thank you all. Safe travels and enjoy the time off if you have any.

Emily Barabas:The next meeting for the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level will take place on Wednesday, 17 January 2018 at 05:00 UTC for 90 minutes.

Greg Shatan:Christoper, we really shouldn't even know what you think, unless you take the chair hat off.

Barrack Otieno AFTLD (ccNSO):Merry Christmas and prosperous 2018 colleagues

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Lead:Thx Steve

Rahul Gosain:Till 17th January,2018 then!'

Janvier NGNOULAYE:Thanks, all, happy happy !!

Rahul Gosain:Bye Everybody

Greg Shatan:That you used more measured language here is not relevant,.

Svitlana Tkachenko, .UA:thank you all!

Hadia Elminiawi:bye

Janvier NGNOULAYE:Bye

Nick Wenban-Smith (Nominet, RySG):bye

Svitlana Tkachenko, .UA:Bye!

wafa Dahmani (AtLarge-ccNSO):bye