

Adobe Connect: 69 Members

Abdul Saboor
Adrián Carballo - LACRALO
Alan Greenberg (ALAC)
Alexander Schubert
Alfredo Calderon
Ann-Cathrin Marcussen, ccNSO
Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5
Ashley Heineman (US)
Aslam G Mohamed
Avri Doria
Bonnie Mtengwa ccNSO
Bruna Santos
Carlos Gutierrez
Charles Semapondo
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair)
Chris Casavale - IPC
Darcy Southwell
Delia Belciu
Ejikeme Egbuogu
Erich Schweighofer
Farzaneh Badii
Francis Olivier CUBAHIRO (Burundi GAC)
Greg Shatan

GZ Kabir
Hadia Elminiawi
Harish Chowdhary
Heather Forrest
Jaap Akkerhuis
Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC)
Jeff Neuman
Jessica Hooper
Jim Prendergast
John Rodriguez
Justine Chew
Kaili Kan
Karen Day
Katrin Ohlmer
Kavouss Arasteh
Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry)
Marita Moll
Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Leader
Maureen Hilyard
Michael Flemming
Mzia Gogilashvili
Narine Khachatryan - At-Large
Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG)

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC
Paul McGrady
Peter Van Roste
Philippe Fouquart
Poncelet Ileleji
Rahman Khan
Rahul Gosain
Ricardo Holmquist - ALAC
Robin Gross
Sara Bockey
Sebastien Pensis - EURid (ccNSO)
Sophie Hey (Valideus)
Statton Hammock
Subhash Dhakal (Nepal)
Susan Anthony
Susan Payne
Svitlana Tkachenko
Tatiana Tropina
Thongchai Sangsiri
Timo Vöhmar
Vincent Museminali
Wafa Dahmani
Yrjö Länsipuro

on Audio only: Christopher Wilkerson, Juan Manuel Rojas, Bram Fudzulani

Apologies: Giacomo Mazzone, Sanna Sahlman, Liz Williams, Kris Seeburn, Barrack Otieno

Staff:

Julie Hedlund

Emily Barabas
Berry Cobb
Steve Chan
Terri Agnew

Terri Agnew:Welcome to the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level on Wednesday, 06 December 2017 at 14:00 UTC for 60 minutes.

Terri Agnew:wiki agenda: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_Cw9yB&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBlq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=IHC5MsLwXBOiJfqUjREXHQI1Y51t1qQ4CV-UmHo8N5I&e=

Narine Khachatryan - At-Large:Greetings, all

Kavouss Arasteh:Dear Olga,

Kavouss Arasteh:Good morning to you.

Kavouss Arasteh:Pls kindly advise at the end of this meeting how many out of thjose registered as participants and observer have attended the meeting

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:Dear Kavouss thanks this is a good point

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Good afternoon, everyone

Kavouss Arasteh:Yes Olga,

Kavouss Arasteh:Many have volunteered but less attended.

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):Afternoon from London

Harish Chowdhary:Hello, every one

Kavouss Arasteh:I also believe, some people from the GAC leadership need to attend

Kavouss Arasteh:TOM Dale is also expected to attend

Harish Chowdhary:Hello

Terri Agnew:attendance is sent out after the call and also added to the agenda wik page

Kavouss Arasteh:This is the most vital group in which the Gioverments have full stakes

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):Hello to all.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):hi everyone

Svitlana Tkachenko:Hello!

Sebastien Pensis - EURid (ccNSO):Yes I can hear you very well Annebeth

Tatiana Tropina:Hi all

Thongchai Sangsiri:Hello

Aslam G Mohamed:Good morning everyone.Aslam here. My apologies but I might have to leave at 930 eastern time.

Ricardo Holmquist - ALAC:Good day everyone

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:there are nois in the back please mute your mics

Tatiana Tropina:The sound is quite awful, yes

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Leader:Could we add a link to the google doc to access directly? Difficult to see on a small screen :-)

Emily Barabas:Yes, staff will scroll. This is a screenshare.

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):GoogleDoc link?

Harish Chowdhary:Hi.I am not getting any voice

Rahul Gosain:Hi!

Steve Chan:@Martin, all, here is the link: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1zLvMb-5FHrGrEUZYqqaHTS3x-2Dexllc-5Fdm0-2D3ZC9HuJag_edit-5Bdocs.google.com-5D&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBllq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=yUsGAGQWS9_V-FsFMw9FlwlsMiLzu92cevfOq6oK3cY&e=

Alfredo Calderon:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1zLvMb-5FHrGrEUZYqqaHTS3x-2Dexllc-5Fdm0-](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1zLvMb-5FHrGrEUZYqqaHTS3x-2Dexllc-5Fdm0-2D3ZC9HuJag_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBllq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=cgGI2YGO_n9yo5DJLITe9O3sVkpKHTTpo76BRxmFXVA&e=)

[2D3ZC9HuJag_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBllq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=cgGI2YGO_n9yo5DJLITe9O3sVkpKHTTpo76BRxmFXVA&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__docs.google.com_document_d_1zLvMb-5FHrGrEUZYqqaHTS3x-2D3ZC9HuJag_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBllq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=cgGI2YGO_n9yo5DJLITe9O3sVkpKHTTpo76BRxmFXVA&e=)

Rahul Gosain:Sorry I am a bit late but joining right away

Emily Barabas:Steve has just shared in the chat

Steve Chan:Actually, please use the one Alfredo sent. It looks like the one I sent is broken

Terri Agnew:@Harish, the meeting has started. Please check your plug in's https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A_tinyurl.com_icannactest&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBllq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=oGwLbTEIR3eG9m4a3jWBWSQAbz3k16hHG5bovqJl8tk&e= or try changing browsers. YOu can also let us know if a dial out on the telephone would be needed

Heather Forrest:Could the text in the main screen be made a bit larger please?

Harish Chowdhary:ok

Terri Agnew:you can also enlarge your screen by selecting the four arrows top tool bar

Terri Agnew:to go back to normal screen mode, move your mouse towards top tool bar to go back to normal mode

jaap akkerhuis:The link should be: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_docs.google.com_document_d_1zLvMb-5FHrGrEUZYqqaHTS3x-2Dexllc-5Fdm0-2D3ZC9HuJag_edit&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpClgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBllq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=cgGI2YGO_n9yo5DJLITe9O3sVkpKHTTpo76BRxmFXVA&e= (so withoiut the stff starting with [

Heather Forrest:Perfect, thanks Terri.

Jeff Neuman:All - Agree with Olga - While comments are helpful, suggested word changes are greatly appreciated.

Sara Bockey:Kavouss you are a bit muffled and static-y on my end. Hard to hear you

Jeff Neuman:@Kavouss we are on the Problem Statement right now

Marita Moll:consolidate = combine (a number of things) into a single more effective or coherent whole. Is that what's meant

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:old hand

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Leader:I think Alan's comment is helpful - streamline and consolidate the efforts of previous work

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):How about "consolidate the efforts in multiple parts..."

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):so add that then Martin

Susan Payne:I do think "consolidate" is the right word - so Alan's suggestion works I think

Alfredo Calderon:@Martin, I agree with Alan's recommendation

Katrin Ohlmer:I agree with "consolidate"

Aslam G Mohamed:We have submitted our comments after effort in advance. Kindly see the side of the screen and discuss them one by one before finalizing anything.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):this is a Work Track of a GNSO PDP Kavouss

wafa Dahmani:hello all

wafa Dahmani:attending AFRICAN IGF and trying to follow the discussion @the same time

Sara Bockey:Exactly. Agree with Cheryl.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):<COMMENT> I support @Alan's clarification regarding wording. The text should expressly say "consolidate the efforts" instead of just "consolidate"

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):let's run in order of section and paragraph as your Co-Leads have planned please

Kavouss Arasteh:Jeff

Alfredo Calderon:+1 Agreed.

Julie Hedlund:@Javier -- your comment has been noted.

Sara Bockey:We can hear you Olga

Kavouss Arasteh:I have a comments on that

Terri Agnew:@Olga - yes we can hear you

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):Thanx Jukie

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):yes o

Heather Forrest:Olga's line has clear sound, but there appears to be a delay on Annebeth's

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):julie

wafa Dahmani:yes

Robin Gross:yes we hear

Aslam G Mohamed:The comments submitted and incorporated by Emily to right side of screen is being ignored by the leads. Why?

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):(sorry 4 typos)

Sara Bockey: Agree with Greg. We are all here to work together on equal footing.

Sara Bockey: *here

Alan Greenberg (ALAC): Are we talking about the decision making process now, or not????

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair): Aslam, nothing is I believe being ignored this is an opportunity to discuss and where agreed resolve them...

Greg Shatan: Everyone has the right to express their views.

Aslam G Mohamed: Thanks. I was looking for such confirmation and we cannot ignore GAC reservations and apprehensions.

Jeff Neuman: @Alan - we will bring this back to just the Problem Statement

Katrin Ohlmer: Why don't we discuss along the comments being made in the document?

Greg Shatan: Half of life is just showing up.

Alan Greenberg (ALAC): Good luck!

Alfredo Calderon: + 1 agreed on Alan's suggestion.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair): Alan we are trying not to, the Co-leads plan was for a 1st reading through in paragraph order

Aslam G Mohamed: Agree Katrin.

Maureen Hilyard: Can the Co-Chair please be allowed to continue with the agenda?

Robin Gross: I also agree with Greg and Sara. And note we need to follow ICANN bylaws, specifically annex A on the making of GNSO policy, and the process laid out in Annex A. We can't just make up a new policy development process to please certain groups.

Harish Chowdhary: A nation's cartographic programme (e.g. For India its , Survey of India) is likely the most significant user and already invested a lot in determining geographic names/indicator, name of a country/region. We should also consider that

Darcy Southwell: Agree with Robin.

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC: @Greg: Dear Greg, I asked a question in the email list if you could clarify this sentence about ICANN: "It is not merely a multistakeholder structure -- it is an equally multistakeholder structure." How do you consider it being "equally" considering that in ICANN government representatives only have a limited advisory role to the board, no voting seat in the board like other stakeholders and have only one non voting seat in nomcom for selecting half of the board?

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Leader: Agree with Annebeth - we need to focus on the process of achieving a set of ToR

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC): +1 ALAN

Maureen Hilyard: +1 Alan

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC: +1 to Alan and Annebeth

Alfredo Calderon: Yes, please. Let's conclude this section.

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC): bad sound

Greg Shatan: Olga, I am referring to how stakeholders interact with each other, particularly in GNSO PDP WGs, which is the subject of the discussion.

Marita Moll: I think it provides important context and stay in

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC: @Greg thanks

Terri Agnew:please remember to mute whennot speaking. On telephone press star 6 to mute/unmute. If mic's are active, please mute
Alfredo Calderon:Background audio, please mute.
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):go ahead Greg
Terri Agnew:@Greg, we no longer hear you
Hadia Elminiawi:hello all, I am attending the AFIGF and trying to follow as much as I can
Heather Forrest:I can hear Greg
Sara Bockey:I can hear greg
Susan Payne:I can hear greg
Darcy Southwell:I heard Greg on A/C
Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:me too
Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):<Comment> I support the current language and agree with @Greg that these type of sentences are useful.
Robin Gross:we hear many conversations
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):I can not
Maureen Hilyard:I can't hear Greg
Philippe Fouquart:I can't either
Susan Payne:greg we can hear
Tatiana Tropina:I've heard everything
Tatiana Tropina:(am on adobe connect)
Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:there is echo as well
Alexander Schubert:I am on Adobe connect as well and can hear him fine!
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):seems so Alan
Jeff Neuman:OK - Give us 2 minutes to work out
Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):this sound issue is crazy
Terri Agnew:trouble shooting AC line to audio bridge
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Christopher was clear on the phone bridge
Sara Bockey:People need to stop talking over each other.
Terri Agnew:calling back in AC line to fix the issue
avri doria:some people have terrible lag i think.
Alexander Schubert:It's 2017 - isn't there conference call software that WORKS?
Jeff Neuman:ALL - PLEASE BEAR WITH US WHILE WE ATTEMPT TO FIX CONNECTION
Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:I lost connection too
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):the phone bridge was an issue... Try again now
jaap akkerhuis:Adobe connect is disconnected
Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:lost all sound

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:?

Susan Anthony:Lost sound.

Sara Bockey:I can hear everything

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:sound is back

Kavouss Arasteh:I suggest to put the Poble and scope in Square Bracket

Carlos Gutierrez:maybe it is juut a licence for 50 people concurrently...

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):yes Annebeth

jaap akkerhuis:Sound is and mike is one

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):I myself didn't see any issues with the goals and objectives section. Now that it has been raised, perhaps the issue is with the heading 'Goals and Objectives'. I feel that 'Context and objectives' might be more accurate?

Marita Moll:yes, context and objectives is better

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):I agree with Greg.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):no Carlos this set up should manage all attendees ok

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):Please note my +1 to @Greg's comment on the usefulness of this language contextual language.

Katrin Ohlmer:+1 Greg

Terri Agnew:thank you everyone for your patience while the issue was resolved

Robin Gross:1 and 2 of Goals and Objectives look good to me.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):thank you Greg

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):yes

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):yes Suzanne

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):thanks Suzanne, that can work

Kavouss Arasteh: [Work Track 5 will focus on developing recommendations to be proposed to chartering organizations (ALAC, ccNSO, GAC and GNSO)regarding the treatment of geographic names at the top level, including both in ASCII and IDN form, evaluation criteria, potential grounds for objection (through specific approach) as well as addressing whether such names require consent or non-objection from applicable governmental authorities.

Greg Shatan:The ICANN structure gives different rights, powers and responsibilities to each structure. Different roles don't mean the roles are unequal; comparing bits and pieces loses sight of the overall balance.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Now onto Scope.... note there are several alternative text options now to discuss

Kavouss Arasteh:I have problem with Alternative 1

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):discuss each in order please

Harish Chowdhary:+1 Kavouss

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):Thanks Jeff for that clarification on no need for para 2 if we use Alternative 1 (or Kavouss' Alternative 2)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):agree with Jeff re Chartering Organisation within 2.1

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):correct Nic
Robin Gross:Alternate 1 seems cleanest approach to me.
Harish Chowdhary:Are we also considering subdivisions in ISO 3166-1 list??
Michael Flemming:Gotta drop. Good discussion so far.
Katrin Ohlmer:+1 Robin
Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:agreewith Annebeth
Bruna Santos:+1 Robin too
Greg Shatan:Agree with Annabeth. That is a downstream issue.
Jeff Neuman:Agree with Annebeth - One of the tasks will be to define what is meant by a "geographic name". But that definition is not needed with Alternative 1
Jeff Neuman:in the scop
Jeff Neuman:scope
Carlos Gutierrez:Agree with Alan G (Alac)
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Very good point Annebeth
Greg Shatan:I agree with Alan. Prefer Alt. 1.
Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):yep agreed
Kavouss Arasteh:I insist that Alternative 2.1 be kindly considered
Susan Anthony:Prefer Alt. 1 but could be on board with Alt. 2.1 in spirit of cooperation.
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):yes Paul
Maureen Hilyard:I agree with Alan, that it does allow us to look t other issues rather than being too specific as in 2.1
Harish Chowdhary:I believe definition of a geographic name is imporatant
Alfredo Calderon:Alan's suggestion to use Alternate 1 is more a descriptive approach and as mention allows to coverprocess later on.
Paul McGrady:@Annabeth - thanks! Just wanted to be sure.
Greg Shatan:Annabeth, I think you have a sound lag.
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):small delay from AC
Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):<Comment>: I think that if there will be a specific reference regarding "consent or non objection from applicable governmental authorities" that would open the door to "consent or non-objection" from "linguistic communities, indigenous peoples, distinct ethnic minorities, etc). which I think are relevant here, but to move forward and be inclusive we should be less prescriptive and keep a more general language, to avoid fragmentation and balkanization. General language is better.
Robin Gross:It will be one of the main tasks of this group to define geonames in the coming months.
Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:AC sound is scattered and delayed
Carlos Gutierrez:Connection is 95% reliable from my side
Paul McGrady:@Jeff - much appreciated!
Greg Shatan:I think we need a preference to come out of the first reading.

Rahul Gosain:Alternati(ve) 1 sounds better to me
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):agreed Jeff
Carlos Gutierrez:I'm not paying for a speedier network as per Title I
Rahman Khan:can't we combine Alt 1 and 2.1?
Kavouss Arasteh:I suggest to retain the two Alternative 1 and Alternative 2.1
Sara Bockey:my preference is Alternate 1
Greg Shatan:Is there any preference for 2.1, other than from its proposer?
Julie Hedlund:@Javier: Your comments are noted.
Kavouss Arasteh:Let us not be in rush
Emily Barabas:sorry there is a bit of a delay with the screen share
Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):Carlos if you charter an Ican Net Neutrality WG call me HA!!!
Rahul Gosain:No audio
Rahul Gosain:But Please note my comment in Chat
Kavouss Arasteh:The Work Track could also will take cognizance, if appropriate, of previous work in ICANN regarding geographic terms including those that have taken place previously in the GNSO, the CCWG on the Use of Country and Territory Names, and the previous processes and procedures contained within the final Applicant Guidebook for the 2012 round of New gTLDs. 1 Which may concern the ownership, business model and jurisdiction of the proposed Registry.
Rahul Gosain:I prefer ALternative 1
Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):please type in chat then Raul
Rahul Gosain:Yes,
Rahul Gosain:I prefer Alternative 1
Harish Chowdhary:No Audio
Terri Agnew:@Rahul, please let us know if a dial out on the telephone is needed
Heather Forrest:Should we re-schedule this call for another time, as the audio is severely reducing our effectiveness
Harish Chowdhary:+Rahul Gosain
Rahul Gosain:Would be great
Terri Agnew:@Harish, please let us know if a dial out on the telephone is needed
Justine Chew:Why does para Alternative 1 refer to "rules" in AGB 2012 while para 3 refers "processes and procedures in AGB"?
Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:+ to Christopher Wilikinson about avoiding excluding any category
Ejikeme Egbuogu:no audio
Harish Chowdhary:Hi Terri as there is no audio, kindly use my commnets in chat
Rahul Gosain:Sorry Looks like I fdont have audio
Kristina Rosette (Amazon Registry):In Para 3, can we replace "take cognizance of" with "acknowledge" or "take into account" to simplify the language?

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Rahul - write it in the chat

Terri Agnew:things to try for Adobe Connect audio: Check you plug in's: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A_tinyurl.com_icannactest&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCigmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBIq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=oGwLbTEIR3eG9m4a3jWBWSQAbz3k16hHG5bovqJl8tk&e= , try a different browser

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):<Comment> The best way to avoid exclusion is to remain general.

Sara Bockey:Agree with Kristina - would be helpful to use a different word that cognizance

Katrin Ohlmer:I agree - to simplify the language makes sense - "take cognizance" and exchange with "acknowledge"

Marita Moll:replace take cognizance with 'recognize' perhaps

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Harish audio is open on phone and accessories for me you perhaps need to follow Terri's advice re audio, perhaps use pvt chat with her

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):+1 Kristina

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Leader:@Kristina - I prefer your suggestions, particularly "take into account"

Robin Gross:Also agree with Kristina and Sara. I thought we had meant to do that after our last discussion of this section also. I think an oversight that the change hadn't yet been made.

Heather Forrest:+1 Kristina

Sara Bockey:Yes, agree. I thought it was supposed to have been change after last meeting

Ann-Cathrin Marcussen, ccNSO:+ 1 Kristina

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):happy to change cognizance

Paul McGrady:+1 Kristina

Terri Agnew:reminder to mute when not speaking

Maureen Hilyard - ALAC:@Justine - yes there needs to be some consistency in what is being referred to - "rules" or "processes and procedures" in the AGB

Marita Moll:could have unintended consequences either way - if you take it out or leave it in.

Kavouss Arasteh:We are not at that point yet thus we do not need to mention that

Peter Van Roste:From RFC 1591: "and the two letter country codes from ISO-3166"

Greg Shatan:Agree with Annebeth.

Susan Payne:Agree Annebeth

Alexander Schubert:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.ietf.org_rfc_rfc1591.txt&d=DwIFaQ&c=FmY1u3PjP6wrcrwlI3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCigmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0Algn-H4xR2EBk&m=yPzs6-50Izu-DqYCBaH4bBBIq-La8kd7_lbe7t-r8T8&s=Bmt5bdHbmb8G3IbZ7zof-o78AixZcXu7kBHPk39bbv8&e=

Ashley Heineman (US):Jeff - your verbal explanation of 4. is much more clear than what is written. Perhaps a rewrite and then we consider again later?

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):totally agree with you Annebeth

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):I prefer para3 with cognisance wording as proposed here to changed, ontact clarify here in scope section

Alexander Schubert:There is nothing to discuss: Unless we revoke RFC 1591!

Jeff Neuman:@Ashley - We will take that back and attempt to make more clear

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):sorry about typos

Kavouss Arasteh: could be considered out of scope for this Work Track. at this stage

Marita Moll:I agree that the definition of ccTLD is beyond the bounds of the mission of this exercise

Sara Bockey:Again. Agree with Greg

Darcy Southwell:Agree with Greg's comment. We need to ensure we don't have scope creep in this regard.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):agree with your point Greg

Timo Vöhmar:rfc1591 is revoked long time ago, it sets clear limits on cctlds and gtlds as well and todays situation is already very different.

Greg Shatan:We need to make decisions here. That is what the terms of reference are for. Mushy words won't help; they'll just create loopholes that will turn into rabbit holes.

Greg Shatan:@Timo, I think you mean "invoked" rather than "revoked."

Robin Gross:We are required to follow the process laid out in ICANN's bylaws, to do otherwise would put ICANN in serious jeopardy of violating its bylaws.

Alexander Schubert:If anything other than two-letter based TLDs were to be labeled "ccTLD" then we are completely annihilating the very concept of the "ccTLD": We then could simply go ahead and eliminate the distinction between ccTLD and gTLD altogether and just have "TLDs"! If that is the goal: Good luck in trying. But anyone who wants to keep ccTLDs as a concept: DO NOT TOUCH RFC 1591!

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:Kavouss make a fair point that should be considered

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):minority views are clear managed within the GNSO PDP guidelines

Alan Greenberg (ALAC):What section ARE we on??

Justine Chew:GNSO consensus policy allows for minority view to be stated in the resulting document

Greg Shatan:@Annabeth, Christopher is on audio only.

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Alan, we are on deliverables, but It is not easy to keep it on the right place

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):This gTLD/ ccTLD distinction is important - this is a new gTLD policy process, and recommendations should stick firmly to that remit. Of course when it comes to country names as a gTLD then that's why there's a need for this WT5 because as recognised in AGB2012 there are broader policy concerns which need addressing (unlike with genuine .shop and .web generics)

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):they are trying to be at top of Sec III

Paul McGrady:I need to drop off.

Ann-Cathrin Marcussen, ccNSO:+ 1 Alexander

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):and a good place to stop

Greg Shatan:I will save comments on decision-making for when we get to decision-making.

Greg Shatan:But I do have views. :-)

Paul McGrady:@Jeff, thanks!

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):thanks everyone, we should get a cleaner version now of the sections covered today

Terri Agnew:The next meeting for the New gTLD Subsequent Procedures Sub Team – Track 5 – Geographic Names at the Top Level will take place on Wednesday, 20 December 2017 at 20:00 UTC for 60 minutes.

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):Comments open until the 20th

Paul McGrady:Thanks Annabeth!

Robin Gross:Thanks Annebeth and all, bye!

Kavouss Arasteh:Pls for extention to 90 mints we need approval of all

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:you did great Annebeth!!!

Olga Cavalli - Co-lead WT 5 GAC:bye all

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):thanks everyone

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):<Comment> we must directly address the "equal footing" language in next call.

Alexander Schubert:THANKS ANNABETH!

Alfredo Calderon:Bye to all!

Kaili Kan:Thanks. Bye!

Martin Sutton WT5 Co-Leader:Thank you Annebeth - bye all

Javier Rúa-Jovet (ALAC):bye!

Katrin Ohlmer:Thanks all!

Nick Wenban-Smith, Nominet UK (ccNSO, RYSG):bye

Marita Moll:Thank you

Cheryl Langdon-Orr (CLO - PDP Co-Chair):bye ðŹŹŹŹ for now

Bruna Santos:thank you, Bye

Ann-Cathrin Marcussen, ccNSO:Bye all!

Rahul Gosain:Thank You all, See You, Bye

Peter Van Roste:Thanks Annebeth!

Greg Shatan:Bye all!

Darcy Southwell:Thank you, bye.

Sebastien Pensis - EURid (ccNSO):Thanks all. Goodbye

Yrjö Länsipuro:Mange takk, Annebeth!

Annebeth Lange, co-lead WT5:Thanks to all

jaap akkerhuis:bye all