
CLAUDIA RUIZ: Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the Formation of the Future LACRALO council work group call, on Friday the 17th November, at 23:00 UTC. We do not have anybody on the English channel - on the Spanish channel we have Carlos Raul Gutierrez, Aida Noblia, Carlos Soto, Vanda Scartezini, and on the staff we have Silvia Vivanco, Gisella Gruber, and myself, Claudia Ruiz, doing the call management. The interpreters are Veronica and Marina. I would like to remind everyone that when speaking, to state your name and to please speak slowly, not only for transcription purposes, but also for the interpreters. We also have apologies from Humberto Carrasco, Ricardo Holquist, and Carlos Alvarez. Thank you. I'll turn it over to you, Sylvia.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Thank you very much, Claudia, for the roll-call. I really, apologies, but I have no internet connection at home, so I am connected through my mobile phone, so perhaps I might face some delay or difficulties in my connection, so, I will not be able to share the Adobe Connect screen.

I would like to thank you all for your participation, and I would like to thank the interpreters as well. I know it is late in Brazil, so, thank you very much for your patience, and thank you very much for being patient because, as you know, we had an ICANN meeting in-between, and we should have finished our task at the end of August, and we are now reaching November, and we are now finishing our task.

So, the idea of this meeting is to talk to you, to speak about the comments we have received, the comments that have been posted by

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

many people on the wiki page regarding our final version that was passed on August the 4th. We requested comments by the working group members, so the idea of today's call is to work with these comments that have been received, to make any necessary changes, and to have a new version, a new final version of the document which will be sent to the ICAAN language service department for translation into English. Once we have that final version translated, we will organise a meeting for the whole community, and we, the members of the working group, will explain to the community what we have done so far, and we will present these documents for final comments to LACRALO.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Sylvia, sorry for interrupting you.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: It's okay, go ahead, Vanda.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: I have requested of Silvia and Claudia to put on the screen the part of the document which is in orange - that is the final version that was approved by the working group. We will be working with that version of the document. Is that correct?

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Yes, Vanda, that is correct. So, I don't know if you're seeing that screen - I have a copy on my computer. It is there where we will be working - we have to read that part and analyse the parts that are not clear, the parts

that we need to change, and the parts that we need to modify, because the previous document - the versions that we have been discussing and working with - due to a question of transparency, we have posted all the versions and we have also stated the comments of other member of the community, and we have highlighted the comments and said if members agreed or not. That's why we have this version in orange - this is the final version approved by the members, the participating members of the working group. This was passed on August the 4th of 2017, and this is the final version that we have already translated into English as well.

So, we kindly ask people from the Caribbean region to post their comments on the wiki page, or by email, but unfortunately, we didn't receive any comments, so I imagine that they've already read that document and that they agree with that. In any case, they will have a final opportunity to provide their feedback and comments because there will be a new version that will be posted after the meeting of today.

So, let's start working, and if that is the case, we'll start by analysing the comments that are at the end of the page. This is a comment made by Ricardo Holquist - he's not in the meeting today - this comment was posted on August the 22nd, so, perhaps if you could scroll down, you will see his comment. I will summarise the comment. He had some doubts about the work of the working group itself, so, he asks, for example, if other RALOs have a similar process. He also comments that the reviewers of [UNKNOWN], of items, well, they have rejected the creation of any kind of working group, or emeritus working group.

Then, Ricardo, on that very same day, and Aida replied to him and she made some clarifications - she said that our group does not have exactly the same essence or meaning as set forth by ICANN. So, what I can say, what I can add - and I would like to thank Aida for answering Ricardo's comments so quickly - but, in our case this is an emeritus council, and this is not a traditional group because we have Vanda, for example, and other people who are looking for the meaning of the emeritus council in the internet, and the answers that are obtained do not match the process that we want to create. That's why all comments are really relevant - the comments by Carlos Gutierrez are really relevant, and he says that we need to clarify that this is not an idea by the LACRALO members, but this is a council, which is the result of a request posted by mediators in the meeting that we held in Los Angeles.

Aida also replied to that comment, and she said and suggested a paragraph, so, I would like to ask you to scroll down - at the end of the page there is a comment by Aida, posted on September the 14th, where Aida suggests the addition of a sentence - of a new wording - and I will read that sentence, so I hope you are reading these sentences, but this is just to clarify.

So, in the paragraph which starts by saying "Likewise, the steps proposed are the following - to create a Council of Elders", this is mainly provided in a preliminary way, and Aida said in the compliance mediation report, it is hereby created, the emeritus council. This emeritus council will be governed by the following regulations. So, I believe that this is really important - Carlos Gutierrez's comment is really important - because many people were asking themselves that

question, and we also had to clarify the scope and the extent of this council.

I don't know if there are any questions, or any comments about this? If that is the case, please go ahead.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Sylvia, sorry-

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: It's okay, Vanda, go ahead.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: I am reading the paragraph. I fully agree with Aida's proposal. I read the paragraph in the document. I see, also, another comment with many questions, so, this is a comment that was already discussed, and we have already replied to that comment, right? The comments made by Ricardo?

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Yes, we have already replied to Ricardo, and there were also some doubts by Alejandro Pisanty - he, on July the 28th, commented something about the origin of the function of the council. He was questioning that, and if you listen to the last recording of our last call, we replied to Alejandro, but he didn't make any comment again, so, I believe that he no agrees with our comment and our response. We also replied to Carlos as well.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Alejandro is in Adobe Connect - you're welcome, Alejandro - and we are displaying, on the screen, the wiki page. If you can please un-time it, or un-synchronize it so that anyone can move it at their own pace. We're basically reading the comments, that's what we're doing, just for you to have an idea on what we're working.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE: Thank you, Silvia and Alejandro. Yes, exactly what we're doing now is to read out and comment on the remarks made on the wiki, now we're talking about Carlos Gutierrez's comment, and Aida's reply to add a statement to the initial paragraph. If you scroll down to Aida's comment of September 14th, you will see what Aida suggested and which we, with Vanda, have agreed to adopt in order to prevent misunderstanding and wrong interpretations.

I don't know if Alejandro or anyone else wants to make a comment on this? Are you listening to me?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Yes, we can hear you. I don't know if Alejandro wants to say anything.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: This is Alejandro Pisanty, yes, hello everybody. I was considering that this council should be created as a permanent body, as a standing council, because this body should be convened only occasionally. It should be convened regularly, only once a year, to define, during the

first time, just the regular functions, and afterwards just convene whenever there is a dispute so that it can resolve the dispute. That's my comment, thank you.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE:

Thank you, Alejandro, yes, exactly, that is what we understood the request of the mediators, that it should operate as a stand-in body. There was a comment by Alberto on item two, there were two verbs - in Spanish, 'vigilar' - 'to watch over', and 'velar' - 'to look after', and I went to the source, to the dictionary of The Spanish Language Academy. At the beginning, we used the word 'velar', which is 'to look after', and then we went for 'vigilar', which is 'to watch over'. Apparently, this is not right. The Academy said 'velar' comes from the Latin 'vigilare', apparently, so, they are synonyms.

In items four and seven, from the dictionary of The Academy, it says 'vigilar' is 'to look after something carefully', and 'velar' is 'to look after with special care', so. I agree with what you say, Alejandro, that this council should be 'to watch' from the outside, and check on the performance of the others, but not with policing powers, just observation powers, oversight, because do you remember - you should remember - the requirements to be a member of the council is to be an experienced person with many years in ICANN. So, the intention here is to observe, to give support, to assist LACRALO for it's full operation, and if there is any problem, if there is any issue, the council would be convened on an extraordinary basis, so that they could try to solve any dispute because of their experience.

So, I agree with this idea, that you are proposing for the operation of the council, Alejandro. I don't know what the others believe?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: I agree, I think it also appropriate what we discussed in Los Angeles, and we are still in the same understanding. This is a body that is to be created to provide assistance whenever needed. It is not to be confused with any administrative body.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE: Thank you, Vanda. Anyone else?

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: I'm just using my phone, thank you for connecting me. I think that both issues should be highlighted. One is the reason for it's creation - the reason for the creation of this body is a request of the mediator, whenever it is needed, it is going to look after or watch over, I don't remember which verb is going to be used, but nevertheless, after the couple of statements we've introduced that the purpose if for LACRALO to be fully operational. So, the basic thing here is to acknowledge that what we are intending to find here is effectiveness and integration within the region for LACRALO to operate.

So I fully agree with everything that has been said till now, and whenever the document is posted for comments and publication, I think this should be the message in it. Thank you.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE: Thank you. Anyone else?

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto, but first, Aida.

AIDA NOBLIA: Following up your words, I was rather confused. What you are saying is that the word 'velar' should be used, which is 'to look after'. All the explanations you gave from The Academy dictionary, I associated that with the verb 'velar', and 'vigilar' is 'to watch over', as Alberto was saying, was more active, in the sense of taking action. So, I agree with what you're saying, Sylvia.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE: Well, actually that is why, because the Spanish language is very rich, that's why I went to the Academy dictionary. We started with the word 'velar' - 'look after', but 'vigilar' - 'watch over' is more prevalent in everyday language, so, perhaps we should go back to the word 'velar' - 'look after', which are eventually synonyms.

Alberto, you have the floor.

ALBERTO SOTO: My concern was the following - any of the words we may choose, 'vigilar' - 'watch over', or any other, requires [UNKNOWN] action. I have to specify, then, who is going to take action after they have been watching over. This should not be this council, because this council

should not have governing functions. It may observe, or identify any problem, and it will convey that issue for LACRALO to solve it, but it should have no governing powers. They are just to provide advice and mentoring. That is the main reason why it is to be created. Thank you.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE:

Well, thank you, Alberto. Actually, we're not saying that it will have a governing function, but that they're going to observe, look after, watch over, and convey any concerns to the other members of the council. I guess the council members will discuss the issue, and then they will decide to convey it, to take it to the other governing bodies, but at no point in time will they have any governing function, or impose any sanctions.

Based on what I'm reading here, I cannot see that that function can be inferred - that's maybe why the verb 'vigilar' in Spanish, 'watch over', might be a bit strong, and if it's not 'velar', we should go for another, a third verb. Any comments?

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

I don't see any need for any formal definition. This is a council that can observe and convey to the LACRALO administrators any concerns, or something like that, and I also believe that it could also perform as mentors for new people, new groups, who need something if requested.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE:

Right, good point. We should not restrict ourselves to what what we're writing here, but perhaps also a request to convene the council for

mentoring actions, or any thing new that may arise. We shouldn't forget that before defining the functions of how the members will be elected, we will have the statement, or the paragraph that is at the beginning - if you scroll up on the wiki, where it says 'the scope and the purpose.' These three paragraphs will be inserted, and will add to them the statements drafted by Aida, and that will be the beginning of the document that will describe the reasons for the council, and there is a proper explanation there, it is clear from that portion, from that section - let me look it up. Let me see if I can find the sentence, it talks about implementation. No, it is not there - it is another paragraph which I cannot find. It refers to the mentoring, it goes after the list of the working group members. The fourth paragraph says 'the first purpose recommended for this council is to adopt some kind of mentoring or accompaniment for members of the community,' and it goes on.

Okay, those paragraphs will be moved upwards to the beginning of the document, and I will do some cleaning and summarising of this document, and I will send it to you - in Spanish, of course - for you to approve the changes, and that's before being sent for translation into English.

So, we will organise and make it very clear that there is an idea of mentoring. Any comments.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

I think that is very necessary, because it is not clear.

CARLOS GUTIERREZ: I think that the verbs require further analysis, but the most important thing I've seen until now is the objective, the purpose - that LACALO should be full operational. There are several verbs we can pick from, how to reach that purpose, but the purpose is the most important thing, because that is the reason for the mediation - that it is not a governing body, it is an advisor, it is a mentor, and that it is an entity that looks after, we can make a triangle of functions, but in the centre is the full operation of LACRALO.

SYLVIA HERLIEN LEITE: Thank you. Any other comments?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Silvia, if I may?

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Go ahead, please, Vanda.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: This is Vanda, for the record. I believe that Aida has her hand up on the [UNKNOWN] room, so perhaps we can give the floor to her.

AIDA NOBLIA: Hello, can you hear me?

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Yes, go ahead, Aida.

AIDA NOBLIA:

Well, I do agree with Carlos' comment, because we do need to find the objectives. This is a basic document, that will be read by all decision makers, so, if there is any difference in the criteria between the meaning of 'watch over' and 'over see', well, I think that these will be subject to interpretation based on other documents' definitions.

In my comment, I provided the meaning provided by The Real Academy, so, in my comment, what I wrote at the very end is a kind-of explanation. When it comes to 'watch over', perhaps we can chose, or perhaps we can avoid the word 'velar' or 'vigilar', in Spanish, 'watch over', 'over see', to avoid any issue. This can be taken into account by the competent bodies in issues that are related to operating principles and rules of procedures. For these, they should be addressed to the chair and the secretary of the region, because they will be the ones able to make decisions.

So, in any case, if there is any issue in the interpretation of these two words, which are 'look after', 'watch over', and 'over see', well, we need to take this into account, and if we have some other meaning, the idea would be to have a clear clause, a clear sentence, and to have a clear meaning, and the secretary and the chair of the region should be addressed. All issues related to operation principles and rules of procedures should be addressed to them, and the secretary, or the president, or chair of the region should be informed of issues in relation to operation principles and rules of procedures, because they will be the ones making the decisions and, of course, taking future steps, and

perhaps we can avoid this by using these two words, which have different definitions, or different meanings.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Vanda speaking- [INTERRUPTED]

CARLOS GUTIERREZ: Carlos speaking. Sorry about the background noise. This is Carlos speaking. Well, as long as this is not turned into an incident, I mean, Alberto and Ali expressed they are concerned about this, because this might be something permanent, and I also agree with their concerns - this should not be a complaint stage, I mean, we have these for the community, this is for the LACRALO community, for the ALAC community, if you will. The group will be working and providing recommendations as we stated before, but these should not be a complaint office, or a complaint stage, because otherwise, this would be a step, or a stage for complaining.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Sylvia, I Have my hand up?

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Okay, Vanda, go ahead.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Well, I do agree with Aida. Aida is saying that the difference is really strong, and we need to take this into account. But, the important thing

here is we need to look for an alternative, a clearer alternative, a simpler alternative, for all the documents. That is the idea. So my proposal would be to further develop these paragraphs, so that we can have a clear idea in terms of the wording to see if we can find out other words to be used, because sometimes the choice of words may be difficult.

So, I believe that we need to continue working on this, as Carlos said, and as Aida expressed. We have to find a clear alternative for these items on the document. Thank you.

SILVIA HERLEIN LEITE:

Silvia speaking. Thank you, Vanda. Yes, I do agree, I fully agree with your comments. I believe that we need to keep on working on this paragraph. I will circulate this information via email. I will just send only the paragraph to the working group, so that we can discuss. I also was thinking about the verb 'alert'. This has a strong meaning, but in any case, we should analyse the meaning and the context, and I commit myself to looking for different versions, different alternatives, and perhaps we can put between brackets any comment, or any clarification of the meaning provided by The Real Academy, so that anyone reading the document may have a clear understanding of the ideas, and why we have chosen that word. Of course, we need to further develop this paragraph. Any other comments?

CARLOS GUTIERREZ:

Excellent.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Aida has her hand up in the [UNKNOWN] room.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Aida, go ahead, please.

AIDA NOBLIA: Well, along the lines along we have been discussing, I believe we need to pay attention to the problems. I mean, to be 'on alert' and to, of course, to communicate that to the chair and the secretary of the region. We need to pay attention and to communicate issues. That is the meaning we want to provide. Thank you.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Thank you very much, Aida. I think that we will be able to find, at least, fifteen synonyms of these words. Any other comments? Any other questions? No?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: I believe that - this is Vanda, for the record - these are the items that are not clear for us, the other items we're already agreed upon, so, I don't know if there are other comments, but these are the topics that we need to address. We need to keep working on this item.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Okay, perfect, Vanda. So, I would kindly ask you to set a day - I will circulate this by email - I would kindly ask all of the working group members to reply to these comments, because I don't want to arrange a meeting to address these paragraphs only, so, I will circulate the information via email, and then I will send the final version to the group, and perhaps see if there is any other comments, or any other additions that we would want to make to the paragraph, or to the document. After that, these documents will be sent to the language service department of ICANN for translation into English.

So, is there any other comment, any other question or feedback that you would like to provide? I see Silvia Vivanco wants to take the floor, so please, Silvia, go ahead.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Thank you, Vanda. Yes, I just wanted to mention that next week you will be working on the document, on the changes to the document, and when do you think you will be able to send the final document for translation?

Then, the next step, as far as I understand, you will be presenting that document in Spanish and English to the whole community and will the community be able to comment on that stage? Or will you have another stage for comments?

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Well, I imagine that by Wednesday we will be able to send the information to the group. We will be able to provide some dates for

them to read the document, and I believe that in two weeks time, or three weeks time, we will be sending the document for translation. Then, as you mentioned before, once we have the translated document into the two version, English and Spanish, we will be sending the versions to the LACRALO community, we will provide some time for them to provide feedback, we will be open for comments. The idea of this working group is that all participants, all members provide their feedback on these new tools, so that our region may work 100%, so, if you agree, I believe that we need to open this document for public comment to the community, and that we should provide two weeks time for comments.

Okay. Is there any other comments? Questions? Any other comment that you would like to make on this working group?

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Silvia, just a small comment regarding the presentation to the whole community. Perhaps it would be interesting to send the document not only by email, but if you will, perhaps we can have an ad hoc call for you to present the document orally to the community, to the whole community, so that you can also provide the opportunity for other people to understand the content of the document. So, if you will, we can organise, we can arrange a call for that purpose.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE:

Thank you very much, Silvia.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: I see Alberto with his hand up.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Well, that was the idea - to have a webinar where we can explain the mediation process, where we discuss like in Los Angeles, and to present the document, which is one of the results of that discussion. So, the idea would be to have a kind-of Webinar, if you will.

ALBERTO SOTO: May I interrupt?

SILVIA VIVANCO: Go ahead, Alberto.

ALBERTO SOTO: I fully agree with that, but I would provide two weeks for public comment, and to have the webinar at the end of those two weeks, because there will be people reading the document for the very first time, and if they don't read the document, the webinar will make no sense.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes, I fully agree with that. We will need to provide time for people to read the document before the webinar.

SYLVIA HERLEIN LEITE: Okay, if there are no further comments, I would like to thank you all, and I apologise for my technical issues, but we were able to hold this call. So, in Brazil on Monday, it is a holiday, but on Wednesday, we will be circulating this paragraph via email, and then the final document.

So, thank you very much for your participation, thank you very much to the interpreters, thank you to the staff. Thank you very much and have a good night. Bye bye.

RUIZ: Thank you all, this call is now adjourned. Please, a reminder to disconnect your lines when leaving the [UNKNOWN] room and the bridge. Thank you all for your participation, and have a wonderful rest of your day. Thank you, bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]