Next-Generation gTLD Registration Directory Service (RDS) to replace WHOIS PDP WG

Handout for Working Group Call
Tuesday 5 December 2017 at 17:00 UTC

ICANN

Proposed Agenda

1. Roll Call/SOI Updates

2. Complete deliberation on Technical Issue Resolution as a legitimate purpose
   a. Review [poll results](#) for Technical Issues associated with DN Resolution
   b. Finish deliberation on Data Elements needed for Technical Issue Resolution
   Note: Deliberate later on data access and users for Technical Issue Resolution

3. Start deliberation on Domain Name Management as a legitimate purpose
   a. Intro by DT2 and opportunity for clarifying questions
   b. Deliberate on Domain Name Management as a legitimate purpose
      for collecting some registration data
   c. Time permitting, deliberate on data needed for that purpose

4. Confirm action items and proposed decision points

5. Confirm next WG meeting: Tuesday, 12 December at 17:00 UTC

2) Complete deliberation on Technical Issue Resolution

⊙ Over the past 2 weeks, we reached rough consensus on WG Agreement:

  ⊙ *Technical Issue Resolution for issues associated with Domain Name Resolution is a legitimate purpose, based on the following definition: Information collected to enable contact of the relevant contacts to facilitate tracing, identification and resolution of incidents related to issues associated with domain name resolution by persons who are affected by such issues, or persons tasked (directly or indirectly) with the resolution of such issues on their behalf.*

⊙ Based on that, last week we polled on this Possible WG Agreement:

  ⊙ *The following information is to be collected for the purpose of Technical Issue Resolution associated with Domain Name Resolution:*
    ⊙ *Technical Contact(s) or*
       (if no Technical Contact is provided) Registrant Contact(s),
    ⊙ *Nameservers,*
    ⊙ *Domain Status,*
    ⊙ *Expiry Date and Time,*
    ⊙ *Sponsoring Registrar.*

2a) Poll Results

- Rough consensus on this WG Agreement, with a few comments (see next slide)

- Annotated Poll Results: https://community.icann.org/download/attachments/74580016/AnnotatedResults-Poll-from-29NovemberCall.pdf

ANSWER CHOICES	RESPONSES	
Technical Contact(s) (optionally provided by the registrant, to include at least one method for real-time contact, excluding postal address)	95.83%	23
Registrant Contact(s) (only if no Technical Contact is provided, to include at least one method for real-time contact, excluding postal address)	87.50%	21
Nameservers	100.00%	24
Domain Status (as defined by EPP)	100.00%	24
Expiry Date and Time	95.83%	23
Sponsoring Registrar (IANA ID, Name, and website URL)	100.00%	24
Total Respondents: 24		

Rationale/Alternatives given in Comments

#	IF YOU DISAGREE, PLEASE PROVIDE YOUR RATIONALE AND A PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE STATEMENT	DATE
1	NOTE - I don't understand why postal address is excluded. While I am not an expert in this area, I would think that having postal address would be helpful in investigating the technical issue as well. In addition, I don't understand why only the registrant contact information is provided if there is no technical contact. I would think that knowing the registrant organization is helpful to resolve the technical issue, and that the registrant organization may not be listed as part of the technical contact. ALSO, I would ask the security experts if other information is needed/useful as well. I note that in the technical issues purpose statement, it calls for "all fields really" under the data elements needed, and that isn't reflected in this survey.	12/1/2017 8:49 AM Sheckler
2	I disagree with the contention that the Registrant Contact is needed and should be collected "only if no Technical Contact is provided." There may be a variety of circumstances where both the Technical Contact and the Registrant Contacts will be used or useful in resolving technical contacts. Treating the Registrant Contact info as de facto optional would be a mistake.	11/30/2017 10:35 PM Shatan
3	The registrar will have the contact details for their customers; they can forward legitimate requests on to their customer if need be.	11/30/2017 8:40 AM Férdeline
4	As I and others said on the call, a contact provided in the context of a technical resolution _is_ the technical contact. The registrant may choose to have the same details or not. We should focus on roles rather than current RDS labels, so I think it is appropriate to exclude Registrant from this list at this time.	11/29/2017 8:23 PM Feher
5	The following information should also be collected for the purpose of Technical Issue Resolution associated with Domain Name Resolution: Registrant Contact.	11/29/2017 1:38 PM Aaron
6	I don't disagree with the above but would include updated date and created date as well. Both of these fields can be useful in troubleshooting technical problems. Neither of these two fields contain anything that would be considered PI, so that shouldn't be an issue.	11/29/2017 12:15 PM Hammer

Note: We will deliberate later on data access and users for Technical Issue Resolution

3) Start deliberation on Domain Name Management

- ⊙ Reminder: Our plan for answering "Purpose" charter question

- ⊙ Take building-block approach, deliberating on each purpose one-by-one
    1. First, agree whether this specific purpose should be considered legitimate for collecting some registration data and why
    2. Next, identify data elements required to support this specific purpose
        a) Which data may already be collected for another purpose?
        b) Which data may need to be collected for this purpose?
    3. Add any data elements identified to the set of registration data elements potentially made accessible through the RDS
        - For now, defer discussion of collection conditions or access controls which might be applied to each data element

- ⊙ Note that any agreement on legitimacy of one purpose does not preclude additional purposes being agreed as legitimate for the same or other data

Domain Name Management – Intro by DT2

Purpose Name: **Domain Name Management**

Definition: Information collected to create a new domain name registration and ensuring that the domain registration records are under the control of the authorized party and that no unauthorized changes, transfers are made in the record.

Tasks:

1. Create registrant id; create domain name; add DNS data for domain name
2. Monitor domain name registration record for changes & correlate with activities
3. Manage set of domain names to keep them under the same administrative control
4. Transfer of domain name registration from one registrar to another or from registrant to new registrant.
5. Check registration database for status/existence of name when DNS does not work
6. Check contact information for ICANN policy compliance

Domain Name Management – Intro by DT2

Users:

These include:

- Registrant, gaining and losing registrar, registry, ISP & other operational contacts
- Domain name operational contacts, potential other users, UDRP, URS, WIPO, ICANN, court proceedings and enforcement actions
- Reseller and registrant affiliates
- New or gaining registrant
- Anyone attempting to interact with domain name for legal actions
- ICANN staff
- Local law enforcement , GAC public safety working group

Domain Name Management – Intro by DT2

Data:

Data Element	Purpose
Domain Name	Confirm domain name is registered.
Registrant Name	Identify registrant and determine if registrant is an organization or natural person
Registrant Organization	Identify registrant and determine if registrant is an organization or natural person
Registrant Postal Address (street address, city, state/province, postal code, country)	Monitor for any unauthorized changes to this data
Registrant Phone	One means of contacting the registrant for operational issues
Registrant Email	Contact the registrant for operational issues or verification of requests made to registrar to transfer or modify the domain name registration.
Registrar Name	Identify the domain name registrar to contact if registrant is not contactable

Domain Name Management – Intro by DT2

Registrar Abuse Contact	See above.
Original Registration Date	Ensure that the record associated with the domain name is maintained correctly
Creation Date	Ensure that the record associated with the domain name is maintained correctly
Updated Date	Monitor for changes to the registration data
Registrar Expiration Date	Monitor to ensure the domain name is renewed
Name Servers	Monitor to ensure the Nameservers have not been modified without authorization.
Technical Contact Name / Organization / Email / Phone	Contact with any operational issues
Administrative Contact Name / Organization / Email / Phone	Contact with any operational issues. Monitor for possible modifications in domain name management.
Registry and Registrar domain status	Monitor to ensure that the correct statuses are maintained for a domain name registration

Are there any clarifications necessary to understand this purpose before we can begin deliberating on this purpose?

Is Domain Name Management a legitimate purpose?

- Recall criteria: What makes a purpose legitimate? For example:
  - Does it support ICANN's mission?
  - Is it specific?
  - Is it explained in a way that registrants can understand?
  - Does it explain to registrants what their data will be used for?
  - Is it necessary for the fulfilment of a contract?
  - Other?

- Test Domain Name Management (as drafted by DT2) against criteria
  - *Information collected to create a new domain name registration and ensuring that the domain registration records are under the control of the authorized party and that no unauthorized changes, transfers are made in the record.*

- Reach agreement(s) on legitimacy of Domain Name Management as a purpose for collecting some registration data

Data needed to support this purpose?

⊙ Review data identified by DT2 as necessary for this purpose

- Domain Name
- Registrant Name
- Registrant Organization
- Registrant Postal Address
  (street address, city, state/province,
  postal code, country)
- Registrant Phone
- Registrant Email
- Registrar Name
- Registrar Abuse Contact

- Original Registration Date
- Creation Date
- Updated Date
- Registrar Expiration Date
- Name Servers
- Technical Contact
  (Name / Organization / Email / Phone)
- Administrative Contact
  (Name / Organization / Email / Phone)
- Registry and Registrar domain status

⊙ Identify criteria: What makes data collection legitimate? For example:
- Why is each data element necessary?
- What are the consequences of not collecting each data element?
- Is the use proportional? Does it strike a fair balance between all interests concerned and the data subject's rights and freedoms?

⊙ Test Domain Name Management data needs against criteria

⊙ Reach agreement(s) on data required for Domain Name Management

Example WHOIS Record From Registry Agreement

Domain Name: EXAMPLE.TLD
Domain ID: D1234567-TLD
WHOIS Server: whois.example.tld
Referral URL: http://www.example.tld
Updated Date: 2009-05-29T20:13:00Z
Creation Date: 2000-10-08T00:45:00Z
Registry Expiry Date: 2010-10-08T00:44:59Z
Sponsoring Registrar: EXAMPLE REGISTRAR LLC
Sponsoring Registrar IANA ID: 5555555
Domain Status: clientDeleteProhibited
Domain Status: clientRenewProhibited
Domain Status: clientTransferProhibited
Domain Status: serverUpdateProhibited

Registrant ID: 5372808-ERL
Registrant Name: EXAMPLE REGISTRANT
Registrant Organization: EXAMPLE ORGANIZATION
Registrant Street: 123 EXAMPLE STREET
Registrant City: ANYTOWN
Registrant State/Province: AP
Registrant Postal Code: A1A1A1
Registrant Country: EX
Registrant Phone: +1.5555551212
Registrant Phone Ext: 1234
Registrant Fax: +1.5555551213
Registrant Fax Ext: 4321
Registrant Email: EMAIL@EXAMPLE.TLD

Admin ID: 5372809-ERL
Admin Name: EXAMPLE REGISTRANT ADMINISTRATIVE
Admin Organization: EXAMPLE REGISTRANT ORGANIZATION
Admin Street: 123 EXAMPLE STREET
Admin City: ANYTOWN
Admin State/Province: AP
Admin Postal Code: A1A1A1
Admin Country: EX
Admin Phone: +1.5555551212
Admin Phone Ext: 1234
Admin Fax: +1.5555551213
Admin Fax Ext:
Admin Email: EMAIL@EXAMPLE.TLD

Tech ID: 5372811-ERL
Tech Name: EXAMPLE REGISTRAR TECHNICAL
Tech Organization: EXAMPLE REGISTRAR LLC
Tech Street: 123 EXAMPLE STREET
Tech City: ANYTOWN
Tech State/Province: AP
Tech Postal Code: A1A1A1
Tech Country: EX
Tech Phone: +1.1235551234
Tech Phone Ext: 1234
Tech Fax: +1.5555551213
Tech Fax Ext: 93
Tech Email: EMAIL@EXAMPLE.TLD

Name Server: NS01.EXAMPLEREGISTRAR.TLD
Name Server: NS02.EXAMPLEREGISTRAR.TLD
DNSSEC: signedDelegation
DNSSEC: unsigned
>>> Last update of WHOIS database: 2009-05-29T20:15:00Z <<<

Confirm action items and decision points

5 December WG Call Meeting Materials:
https://community.icann.org/x/MAByB

Next call: Tuesday, 12 December 2017 at **17:00 UTC**

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Technical Issue Resolution	Information collected to enable contact of the relevant contacts to facilitate tracing, identification and resolution of incidents related to services associated with the domain name by persons who are affected by such issues, or persons tasked (directly or indirectly) with the resolution of such issues on their behalf.
Academic or Public Interest Research	Information collected to enable use of registration data elements by researchers and other similar persons, as a source for academic or other public interest studies or research, relating either solely or in part to the use of the DNS.
Domain Name Management	Information collected to create a new domain name registration and ensuring that the domain registration records are under the control of the authorized party and that no unauthorized changes, transfers are made in the record.
Individual Internet Use	Collecting the required information of the registrant or relevant contact in the record to allow the internet user to contact or determine reputation of the domain name registration.

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Domain Name Certification	Information collected by a certificate authority to enable contact between the registrant, or a technical or administrative representative of the registrant, to assist in verifying that the identity of the certificate applicant is the same as the entity that controls the domain name.
Domain Name Purchase/Sale	Information to enable contact between the registrant and third-party buyer to assist registrant in proving and exercising property interest in the domain name and third-party buyer in confirming the registrant's property interest and related merchantability.
ICANN Contractual Enforcement	Information accessed to enable ICANN Compliance to monitor and enforce contracted parties' agreements with ICANN.
Regulatory Enforcement	Information accessed by regulatory entities to enable contact with the registrant to ensure compliance with applicable laws.

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Legal Actions	Includes assisting certain parties (or their legal representatives, agents or service providers) to investigate and enforce civil and criminal laws, protect recognized legal rights, address online abuse or contractual compliance matters, or to assist parties defending against these kinds of activities, in each case with respect to all stages associated with such activities, including investigative stages; communications with registrants, registration authorities or hosting providers, or administrative or technical personnel relevant to the domain at issue; arbitrations; administrative proceedings; civil litigations (private or public); and criminal prosecutions.
Criminal Activity/ DNS Abuse – Investigation	Information to be made available to regulatory authorities, law enforcement, cybersecurity professionals, IT administrators, automated protection systems and other incident responders for the purpose of enabling identification of the nature of the registration and operation of a domain name linked to abuse and/or criminal activities to facilitate the eventual mitigation and resolution of the abuse identified: Domain metadata (registrar, registration date, nameservers, etc.), Registrant contact information, Registrar contact Information, DNS contact, etc..

DT definitions for each possible purpose

Name	Single-Sentence Definition
Criminal Activity/ DNS Abuse – Notification	Information collected and made available for the purpose of enabling notification by regulatory authorities, law enforcement, cybersecurity professionals, IT administrators, automated protection systems and other incident responders of the appropriate party (registrant, providers of associated services, registrar, etc), of abuse linked to a certain domain name registration to facilitate the mitigation and resolution of the abuse identified: Registrant contact information, Registrar contact Information, DNS contact, etc..
Criminal Activity/ DNS Abuse – Reputation	Information made available to organizations running automated protection systems for the purpose of enabling the establishment of reputation for a domain name to facilitate the provision of services and acceptance of communications from the domain name examined: Domain metadata (registrar, registration date, nameservers, etc.), Registrant contact information, Registrar contact Information, DNS contact, etc..

ICANN's Mission (As amended 1 October 2016)

Section 1.1. MISSION

(a) The mission of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers ("ICANN") is to ensure the stable and secure operation of the Internet's unique identifier systems as described in this Section 1.1(a) (the "Mission"). Specifically, ICANN:

(i) Coordinates the allocation and assignment of names in the root zone of the Domain Name System ("DNS") and coordinates the development and implementation of policies concerning the registration of second-level domain names in generic top-level domains ("gTLDs"). In this role, ICANN's scope is to coordinate the development and implementation of policies:

- For which uniform or coordinated resolution is reasonably necessary to facilitate the openness, interoperability, resilience, security and/or stability of the DNS including, with respect to gTLD registrars and registries, policies in the areas described in Annex G-1 and Annex G-2; and

- That are developed through a bottom-up consensus-based multistakeholder process and designed to ensure the stable and secure operation of the Internet's unique names systems.

- The issues, policies, procedures, and principles addressed in Annex G-1 and Annex G-2 with respect to gTLD registrars and registries shall be deemed to be within ICANN's Mission.
.

ICANN's Mission (As amended 1 October 2016)

ANNEX G-1

The topics, issues, policies, procedures and principles referenced in Section 1.1(a)(i) with respect to gTLD registrars are:
- issues for which uniform or coordinated resolution is reasonably necessary to facilitate interoperability, security and/or stability of the Internet, registrar services, registry services, or the DNS;
- functional and performance specifications for the provision of registrar services;
- registrar policies reasonably necessary to implement Consensus Policies relating to a gTLD registry;
- resolution of disputes regarding the registration of domain names (as opposed to the use of such domain names, but including where such policies take into account use of the domain names); or
- restrictions on cross-ownership of registry operators and registrars or resellers and regulations and restrictions with respect to registrar and registry operations and the use of registry and registrar data in the event that a registry operator and a registrar or reseller are affiliated.

Examples of the above include, without limitation:
- principles for allocation of registered names in a TLD (e.g., first-come/first-served, timely renewal, holding period after expiration);
- prohibitions on warehousing of or speculation in domain names by registries or registrars;
- reservation of registered names in a TLD that may not be registered initially or that may not be renewed due to reasons reasonably related to (i) avoidance of confusion among or misleading of users, (ii) intellectual property, or (iii) the technical management of the DNS or the Internet (e.g., establishment of reservations of names from registration);
- maintenance of and access to accurate and up-to-date information concerning registered names and name servers;
- procedures to avoid disruptions of domain name registrations due to suspension or termination of operations by a registry operator or a registrar, including procedures for allocation of responsibility among continuing registrars of the registered names sponsored in a TLD by a registrar losing accreditation; and
- the transfer of registration data upon a change in registrar sponsoring one or more registered names.

ICANN's Mission (As amended 1 October 2016)

ANNEX G-2

The topics, issues, policies, procedures and principles referenced in Section 1.1(a)(i) with respect to gTLD registries are:
- issues for which uniform or coordinated resolution is reasonably necessary to facilitate interoperability, security and/or stability of the Internet or DNS;
- functional and performance specifications for the provision of registry services;
- security and stability of the registry database for a TLD;
- registry policies reasonably necessary to implement Consensus Policies relating to registry operations or registrars;
- resolution of disputes regarding the registration of domain names (as opposed to the use of such domain names); or
- restrictions on cross-ownership of registry operators and registrars or registrar resellers and regulations and restrictions with respect to registry operations and the use of registry and registrar data in the event that a registry operator and a registrar or registrar reseller are affiliated.

Examples of the above include, without limitation:
- principles for allocation of registered names in a TLD (e.g., first-come/first-served, timely renewal, holding period after expiration);
- prohibitions on warehousing of or speculation in domain names by registries or registrars;
- reservation of registered names in the TLD that may not be registered initially or that may not be renewed due to reasons reasonably related to (i) avoidance of confusion among or misleading of users, (ii) intellectual property, or (iii) the technical management of the DNS or the Internet (e.g., establishment of reservations of names from registration);
- maintenance of and access to accurate and up-to-date information concerning domain name registrations; and
- procedures to avoid disruptions of domain name registrations due to suspension or termination of operations by a registry operator or a registrar, including procedures for allocation of responsibility for serving registered domain names in a TLD affected by such a suspension or termination.