

## RDS AC Chat 29 November 2017

Nathalie Peregrine: Dear all, welcome to the GNSO Next-Gen RDS PDP Working Group teleconference on Wednesday 29 November 2017 at 06:00 UTC

Nathalie Peregrine: Meeting agenda page: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_community.icann.org\\_x\\_LgByB&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgysXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzggG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNO&s=BYRv0i8oN2flUBHM2sS8XKfD5ZBq2KYMhHScF08YpSM&c=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_x_LgByB&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgysXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzggG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNO&s=BYRv0i8oN2flUBHM2sS8XKfD5ZBq2KYMhHScF08YpSM&c=)

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): Hello All

Nathalie Peregrine: Welcome all!

Tomslin Samme-Nlar: thanks and hello all

Lisa Phifer: Call Handout: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_community.icann.org\\_download\\_attachments\\_74580014\\_Handout-2D29Nov-2DRDSWGCall.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgysXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzggG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNO&s=igCSprtk16p1WpgFRsWsafJWTLpGMIp8W68Hw0mN4&c=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_download_attachments_74580014_Handout-2D29Nov-2DRDSWGCall.pdf&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgysXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzggG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNO&s=igCSprtk16p1WpgFRsWsafJWTLpGMIp8W68Hw0mN4&c=)

Tim O'Brien: hello all

Lisa Phifer: We are now on slide 4

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): in cases where domain can not be resolved due to RBL which lists WHOIS servers of a registrar - it will not help

Kal Feher: no audio for jim

James Galvin (Afilias): sorry have to reconnect...

Nathalie Peregrine: Jim, can you please provide your number privately and I can dial out to you

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): i.e. DNS server of a registrar (THIN whois) is not reachable - knowing contact does not help

Kal Feher: agree with marc. the second is derived from the first. we don't really need to elaborate on the same principle

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): +1

GZ Kabir: Agreed

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): I am not sure broadening the scope to unlimited services list will be a good idea

Tim O'Brien: since we are talking with lawyers, we should call both out separate a

GZ Kabir: we are only talking about names and not the services on top of it

Kal Feher: I know a few of us have said this before: once we've agreed on a reason to collect (and maybe publish) data, we don't need to enumerate every possible purpose and trying to do so may result in strange outcomes

James Galvin (Afilias): I confess I don't recall who was advocating for services.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): formally delivering of a plain jokes gifts to a contact named in RDS is a service

Tomslin Samme-Nlar: I think that technical issues related or found to be related to Domain Names are inclusive of services mentioned in the second purpose

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): so I am not sure it goes well with privacy

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): so at least the list of services should be more narrow (potentially described, but not listed)

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): +1 Marc

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): Registrant ID is enough for a technical (non criminal) investigation

Tomslin Samme-Nlar: For technical contact, I think Email address and phone number is needed to resolve technical issues. I don't see the need for a physical address in resolving technical issues.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): and Tech contact

Kal Feher: agree with Jim. both client and server statuses are relevant

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): such as e-mail & phone

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID): Company name/name in tech contact might be needed - to avoid confusion (at least to write/call them politely)

Krishna Seeburn - Kris: i think tech contact should be made available

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:+ 1

Michele Neylon:It's in there

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:Will just point out that there are several ccTLDs that do not even need a tech contact at all

Michele Neylon:"Sponsoring Registrar" etc

Michele Neylon:TBH I tend to use the "host" command to work out where the domain / hostname is pointing and take it from there

Michele Neylon:DNS records => hosting provider

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:In light of GDPR there are ccTLD's limiting the info on tech contact if they want any at all

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:that is already happening in the many EU countries

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Benny, I do not think ccTLDs are going to use RDS in full if at all

Michele Neylon:Expiry dates aren't included in a lot of ccTLDs

Michele Neylon:TBH some ccTLDs don't consider "expiry" to be a valid concept

Kal Feher:@michele, they are certainly useful for technical resolution. I'm of course ignoring the confusion around registrar and registry exp dates

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:@Maxim no I am aware of that but the point was that it's not a NEED to have domains working and resolve problems

James Galvin (Afilias):Just domain status: as shown in the example

Lisa Phifer:See notes pod - doing so now

Kal Feher:statuses are either server or client. client in this context is the registrar and server is the registry. its useful to know who applied what status

Kal Feher:client hold and server hold result in the same thing, but the cause might be very different.

Fabricio Vayra:+1 Susan

Kal Feher:ICANN has a reasonably good website explaining statuses

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:that works

Kal Feher:check out this page for a quick rundown: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_icann.org\\_epp&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0iljYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb9aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=2lgs7IlmRueFEVvhZ5YDfa26rlkPJtoonr4fLjN6pGc&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__icann.org_epp&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0iljYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb9aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=2lgs7IlmRueFEVvhZ5YDfa26rlkPJtoonr4fLjN6pGc&e=)

James Galvin (Afilias):There is also this: [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_www.icann.org\\_resources\\_pages\\_epp-2Dstatus-2Dcodes-2D2014-2D06-2D16-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0iljYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb9aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=yN7n\\_7rcYXZrJxzII4Ug\\_oiwZULq\\_I2ASjkAPDEYj\\_c&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.icann.org_resources_pages_epp-2Dstatus-2Dcodes-2D2014-2D06-2D16-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJP6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEI9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0iljYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb9aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=yN7n_7rcYXZrJxzII4Ug_oiwZULq_I2ASjkAPDEYj_c&e=)

James Galvin (Afilias):Which is the same thing :-)

James Galvin (Afilias):It is not "server status" it is "domain status"

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:shouldbe domain status

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):actually this example is using an old format: after CL&D policy Sponsoring Registrar is Registrar e.t.c.

James Galvin (Afilias):No, not EPP status

Kal Feher:I think domain status might be more intuitive to non industry participants

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it is domain status

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:Domain status

James Galvin (Afilias):@maxim - :-)

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I'd suggested Marc's approach - we need to identify needs , and not to revise the old lists of info bits

Lisa Phifer:@Maxim, what information is needed for a Technical Contact?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I think Tech ID, name , e-mail , phone

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):rarely postal address used (due to more than 2 weeks of letter delivery sometimes = one way)

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:Name?

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:It will be only a role

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:You done really need a name on a person

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):name/company name - to start phone conversation properly (insted of "hey, TechID \_\_\_\_\_ we have an issue"

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:done = only

Tomslin Samme-Nlar:I agree with Benny we don't need a name

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:Sorry to little coffee here, should be, You don't really need a name on a person

Lisa Phifer:@James G, one contact method enabling real-time contact?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Benny, how then to address the person ? and to avoid confusion (in case where similar Tech ID was used by mistake)?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):+1 Jim (postal info rarely needed for tech investigation)

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:yes am also in agreement with jim

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:any technical problem needs a quick access and resolution

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):cicle of letters (sending, having one back) takes a month, which is more than usual time for tech issue resolution

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:@Maxim as of today we already today tell people to use a role as name instead of having outdated info on persons no longer available

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Benny, unfortunately some of them still using it , despite recommendation to use "Domain Tech Support" e.t.c

Benny Samuelsen / Nordreg AB:We need a contact which respond on issues and that doesn't need a persons name

Michele Neylon:Email isn't published for \*any\* .uk domains

Lisa Phifer:WG Agreement #32: At a minimum, one or more e-mail addresses must be collected for every domain name included in the RDS, for contact roles that require an e-mail address for contactability

Susan Kawaguchi:but you can request it

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:the importance is having a workable contact

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):what we have in case of a physical person in Tech contact? I do not think we can avoid name there

Michele Neylon:email address collection does not mean email publication

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):on the other hand, it might be "hello , you are listed as a Tech ID \_\_\_\_ contact for domain \_\_\_\_" , and it might work over time

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):+1 Michele, collection and storage of e-mail

Lisa Phifer:In case it is relevant: WG Agreement #41: In the interest of maximizing contactability, additional contact methods MUST be supported by the RDS as an open-ended list and be optional for Registrants to provide. This does not preclude agreements on requirements to include other contact methods

James Galvin (Afilias):@susan - I think that the efficacy of a particular contact method is a separate discussion.

Lisa Phifer:Also, with respect to roles: WG Agreement #36: Purpose-based contact (PBC) types identified (Admin, Legal, Technical, Abuse, Proxy/Privacy, Business) must be supported by the RDS but optional for registrants to provide.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):people just tend to forget things e.t.c.

James Galvin (Afilias):+1 - michele

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):if they do not usdupdate tech info - the worst thing happens is they loose the domain

James Galvin (Afilias):ensuring that contact methods work is important but as a practical matter you should have TOS that says if it doesn't work then the default action is you simply lose the domain name. :-)

Susan Kawaguchi:+1 Jim

Lisa Phifer:Note that we have a charter question on Data Accuracy which we'll address after we agree on data elements

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):so the warning to have it updated is enough , and we are not going to be a police of tracking changes the people make in their lifes (it is way too far )

Fabricio Vayra:+1 Chuck

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:+ 1 Jim

Lisa Phifer:@Jim, for technical issue resolution, at least one method of real-time contact must be provided for either the Tech Contact, or if no Tech Contact is provide, the registrant?

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:@ It make logical sense

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it might work

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:someone needs to resolve the issue

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:he is in between

Lisa Phifer:WG Agreement #36: Purpose-based contact (PBC) types identified (Admin, Legal, Technical, Abuse, Proxy/Privacy, Business) must be supported by the RDS but optional for registrants to provide.

James Galvin (Afilias):@lisa - yes

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:so implicitly if none provided it pushes the registrant to abide to being responsible

James Galvin (Afilias):@kris - +1

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it could be IANA ID #9998 - the registry

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:@maxim +1

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:+ James

Fabricio Vayra:+1 Michelle

Kal Feher:@maxim in those instances the registry is responsible so they are the people you want to contact. it's still relevant

James Galvin (Afilias):@michele - +1 add the registrar web site link

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):just notice

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):and having a link would be really good idea (not many people know how to google for IANA ID Registrar list)

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:i like that as well

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it is already public

Michele Neylon:Registrar information should be public etc etc

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):old hand

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):sorry

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):URLs could be found using [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_www.icann.org\\_registrar-2Dreports\\_accredited-2Dlist.html&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=34FIL9p-8THGWUJb3sh5kTfRiMVYqhZz-Ev0utPBIV8&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.icann.org_registrar-2Dreports_accredited-2Dlist.html&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=34FIL9p-8THGWUJb3sh5kTfRiMVYqhZz-Ev0utPBIV8&e=) and [https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_www.iana.org\\_assignments\\_registrar-2Dids\\_registrar-2Dids.xhtml&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=wHynkxy-elhrfotFtUSep7ccGMHZ1ARJl0QmqcUECo&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.iana.org_assignments_registrar-2Dids_registrar-2Dids.xhtml&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=wHynkxy-elhrfotFtUSep7ccGMHZ1ARJl0QmqcUECo&e=) combined

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:i think we are closer

Lisa Phifer:The list: Tech Contacts, Registrant contact, nameservers, domain status, expiry date, sponsoring registrar

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:@lisa can we get a sample agreement that goes to the registrar just for more understanding

Lisa Phifer:@Kris, can you please clarify what you are asking for?

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:between ICANN and Registrar what is specifically stipulated.... what data is required etc>

Michele Neylon:That's in the RAA

Kal Feher:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_www.icann.org\\_resources\\_pages\\_approved-2Dwith-2Dspecs-2D2013-2D09-2D17-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xIPlnkeRwmUiXleelL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.icann.org_resources_pages_approved-2Dwith-2Dspecs-2D2013-2D09-2D17-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xIPlnkeRwmUiXleelL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=)

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:ok

Michele Neylon:[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_www.icann.org\\_resources\\_pages\\_approved-2Dwith-2Dspecs-2D2013-2D09-2D17-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xIPlnkeRwmUiXleelL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.icann.org_resources_pages_approved-2Dwith-2Dspecs-2D2013-2D09-2D17-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xIPlnkeRwmUiXleelL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=)

[https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A\\_\\_www.icann.org\\_resources\\_pages\\_approved-2Dwith-2Dspecs-2D2013-2D09-2D17-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd\\_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM\\_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xIPlnkeRwmUiXleelL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__www.icann.org_resources_pages_approved-2Dwith-2Dspecs-2D2013-2D09-2D17-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3Pj6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=PDd_FX3f4MVgkEIi9GHvVoUhbecsvLhgsyXrxgtbL10DTBs0i1jYiBM_uTSDzqG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb19aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xIPlnkeRwmUiXleelL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=)

[ljYiBM\\_uTSDzggG&m=DHPX0nKd-MdnsjkMfGWZqUteWPXb9aTII6XcfESUNQ&s=p-tq9xlPnlkeRwmUiXleeIL3uPyQsuEQaUxBNdqODg0&e=](https://www.linkedin.com/feed/update/urn:li:activity:6678123456789012345?trk=activity-comment)

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:thanks michele

Michele Neylon:Maxim - having to play "hunt the website" is not my idea of fun

Lisa Phifer:The slide in the deck also shows what is required of the registry

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Michele, I agree with that, I meant not many people can play that game and URL is needed

Fabricio Vayra:thanks all!

Sam Lanfranco:Thanks to all

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):bye all

Kal Feher:thanks. alternate times are the best times!

Susan Kawaguchi:Thanks Chuck

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:thanks

Krishna Seeburn - Kris:thanks chuck and all

Daniel K. Nanghaka:Thanks Chuck

Daniel K. Nanghaka:Bye all

Tim OBrien:good day everyone

GZ Kabir:thanks and bye all