Terri Agnew:Welcome to the Review of all Rights Protection Mechanisms (RPMs) in all gTLDs PDP Working Group on Wednesday, 11 October 2017 at 17:00 UTC for 90 minute duration.

Terri Agnew:agneda wiki page: https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__community.icann.org_x_7IpEB&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCIgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIgn-H4xR2EBk&m=EQX2oP_h3dneSn5OhOUbr2L2gIRoGfHS_URDf2n8iWU&s=RtXnZB1mnV_CG37AgoFMSzu4maUqP_W22OP-mMRhGDM&e=

George Kirikos:Hi folks.

Cyntia King:Hello, George!

Poncelet Ileleji:Hello All

George Kirikos:Hi Cyntia and Poncelet.

Poncelet Ileleji:Hello George

J. Scott Evans:Good morning, Good Afternoon, Good Evening all.

Marie Pattullo:Bon soir!

Cyntia King:Hey, J Scott!

Philip Corwin:Welcome RPMers!

Michael R Graham:Morning

Ariel Liang:Hello everyone!

Julie Hedlund:Hello everyone and glad to help!

Scott Austin:Good afternoon.

Cyntia King:Welcome Ariel & Julie! Hello Mary & Teri!

Lori Schulman:Hi guys

Lori Schulman:Can't wait to hear what I will voluntell for this week. :)

George Kirikos:Doc is at: http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/gnso-rpm-wg/attachments/20171010/fc173bd9/Staffcompilationreport-Sunrisedata-3Oct2017-0001.pdf if folks want to load it in a separate window.

Kurt Pritz:Thank you George

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Hello All

Terri Agnew:all can scroll themselves

Mary Wong:Yes

David McAuley:yes

J. Scott Evans:yes

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):notebook keeps reloading , trying a smartphone

Mary Wong:As Berry is saying, we are using the word "generic" in the IANA sense, not as the word may be viewed in trademark law parlance.

George Kirikos:(would be nice to add page numbers to a future PDF, in one of the corners)

Mary Wong:Thanks, George, we will note this

Mary Wong:We have added links to the definitiional documents for what is a Start Date and End Date Sunrise.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):one of the versions - auctions and the other - first comes first served

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):m name collisions was another story

Mary Wong:We don't have the information available to know why some gTLDs don't have launch date information (as Berry said); note that Chart 1 listed them by date of delegation into the root zone.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):start date sunrsies = first comes first served, end date has auction as a method of resolution for situation, where two or more registrants wanted the same name

George Kirikos:Some might have been cancelled, e.g. .doosan (which ICANN is using in its EBERO test).

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Spec13 sunrise info has no meaning, so I support Susan to excude this info

Jonathan Frost (.CLUB):Agree

J. Scott Evans:I agree with Susan.

Susan Payne:thanks Berry

Griffin Barnett:Spec 13 TLDs don;t need to run any Sunrise, so I agree - no reason to include

Kathy Kleiman:@Barry, is the end date sunrise largely one registry owner?

George Kirikos:.chloe was just cancelled recently, too, among others.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Kathy, end date for those who needed auctions instead of fast customers

George Kirikos:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=http-3A__domainincite.com_21767-2Drichemont-2Dkills-2Doff-2Dtwo-2Dmore-2Ddot-2Dbrands&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCIgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIgn-H4xR2EBk&m=EQX2oP_h3dneSn5OhOUbr2L2gIRoGfHS_URDf2n8iWU&s=Uz8hAX0J_OLPOErEdogp0uA45cep3W_28CtTwjkqVa4&e= (.chloe and .montblanc terminations)

Jonathan Frost (.CLUB):From a registry perspective, the reason to use an end date is to provide an allocation mechanism when more than one rights holder attempts to register the domain.

Jonathan Frost (.CLUB):Rather than a race to register

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):end date sunrise and two TM owners in TMCH ... highest bidder wins , and in start-dte -fstest one

George Kirikos:One would want to cross-reference this with the numbers from THe Analysis Group, e.g. perhaps one type leads to more sunrise registrations than the other, all else being equal.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):in both 60 days is the requirement for the period (30+30 or 60)

Susan Payne:@George, the AG data is fairly old because of the time at which they did their work. so I think it would be difficult to do the cross-ref you suggest wouldn't it?

Jon Nevett:all

George Kirikos:@Susan: right, one would need to update it using the ICANN monthly reports.

George Kirikos:(i.e. the monthly registry reports)

Kathy Kleiman:Tx Barry

Mary Wong:Registry operators had the discretion to decide which type of Sunrise to do. The End Date Sunrise is a mechanism that is more familiar to many, so while we do not have the data as to why registry operators chose one over the other, that may be another reason.

Susan Payne:@Kathy, Donuts don't have 385 registries so plenty of other registries would also have done end date

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):only registries might answer questions about why start-date vs. end-date. other parties do not have info

Kathy Kleiman:@Jon Nevett - rather than talking around you, can we ask how many Sunrises had End Date Sunrises?

Kathy Kleiman:All interesting!

George Kirikos:Do we know how many TMCH strings have multiple owners? (ie, that's where it would make a difference, if there were multiple potential sunrise registrants)

Mary Wong:@Maxim, yes, exactly. We don't have the information to do more than suggest a number of reasons at the moment.

Jon Nevett:we launched 195 I think

George Kirikos:If each TMCH string had only 1 registrant, it wouldn't make a difference.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):It was business decision of a registry - not anything esle

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@George it would lead to TMCH auctions:)

George Kirikos:@Maxim: right, presumably fanciful marks like "Google", "Exxon" or "Verizon" wouldn't face that issue, though.

Kathy Kleiman:@Jon: tx1

George Kirikos:@Jon: with the Rightside acquisition, "we" is a little bit larger now. :-)

George Kirikos:238 for Donots (with Rightside) according to:
https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-
3A__ntldstats.com_registry_group&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r
=DRa2dXAvSFpCIgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIgn-
H4xR2EBk&m=EQX2oP_h3dneSn5OhOUbr2L2gIRoGfHS_URDf2n8iWU&s=g-
BMcy2s8f1aLvbhe5353hfIAYzDfr1r0bj7lkFQMv4&e=
  Jon Nevett:@ george donuts didn't launch the RS names
  George Kirikos:@Jon: right, but now Donuts is inclusive of Rightside, part of the same group.
  George Kirikos:i.e. the "new Donuts" = "the old Donuts" + "Rightside"
  Jon Nevett:I'm aware George, but the question was how many sunrises we did
  Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Delay = Digital archery + TMCH+Name collisons+Glitches ...
  Kurt Pritz:Thanks Berry - When redesigning: Chart 5 might be better as a scatter diagram - or identifying
mean and median
  Berry Cobb:@Kurt - yes, good idea
  George Kirikos:I don't really think Amazon/Google's delays can be explained away that way, e.g.
https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__ntldstats.com_registry_Charleston-2DRoad-
2DRegistry-
2DInc&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCIgmkXhFzL7a
r9Qfqa0AIgn-
H4xR2EBk&m=EQX2oP_h3dneSn5OhOUbr2L2gIRoGfHS_URDf2n8iWU&s=8KuED27OqWpznzS8NThhdTg
PTfx5hBuHfozzwKbXmYQ&e= (Google)
  George Kirikos:https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-
3A__ntldstats.com_registry_group_Amazon-2DRegistry-2DServices-
2DInc&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCIgmkXhFzL7a
r9Qfqa0AIgn-H4xR2EBk&m=EQX2oP_h3dneSn5OhOUbr2L2gIRoGfHS_URDf2n8iWU&s=LLU9Xk0QU-
wMV5FiUzaQLpFGvkNPp5d-F2-i6OPrsaQ&e= (Amazon's strings)
  Susan Payne:@George, what's your point? of relevance to a review of the RPMs
  Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):if we decide to have question about this chart - add "was the delay intentional
?"
  Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*chart 5
  Jonathan Frost (.CLUB):+1 to Maxim. The Working Group is behind its charter schedule. I think we
have a duty not to delay at this point.
  George Kirikos:Once those 100+ TLDs actually launch, the numbers might change, perhaps markedly.
  Mary Wong:All, to the extent there is agreement to include a question about "time to sunrise launch
(from delegation date)" to the registry operator survey, it will be really helpful to relate it to the specific
Charter question(s) the group is going to be discussing.
  Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):lots of .CORE GEO domains had almost year of waiting due to ALP not working
... it was delivered to WG during the previous F2F by Abril
  George Kirikos:@Susan: my point was that the data is still a work in progress.
  George Kirikos:And so that could change the numbers.
  Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):.MADRID too
  Susan Payne:@George all data is a WIP where you have a moving marketplace
  Susan Payne:@Berry just to be clear my comment wasn't a criticism of your work, which is really
useful. I just didn't want you to spend a great deal of time drilling deeper if it doesn't really advance the
consideration of the RPM requirements
  Berry Cobb:@Susan - << wasn't taken that way. I enjoy all feedback
  Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):also some delays were due to 120 days of name collisions (minimal)
  George Kirikos:+1 Mary. It'll eventually have more columns to that spreadsheet.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):sorry, old hand
George Kirikos:Number of registrars could be obtained from the ICANN monthly reports.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):number of registrars could be 0 to max number of registrars in IANA
George Kirikos:How did they delegate nic.shabaka ? :-)
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):there is no obligation to have a contract with the third party
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@George - Registries have to delegate nic.TLD under RA
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):with 9998 or 9999 as IANA ID number in WHOIS
Griffin Barnett:ie self-allocation
George Kirikos:@Maxim: right, just wondering if they did that without a registrar to manage it through, or just put it directly into the root for themselves.
Susan Payne:to go to Claudio's point - the RA has been amended to address this
George Kirikos:Directly into the zone, rather.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@George, Registry have right for this nic.TLD to put themself, and the same for up to 100 names
Mary Wong:Thanks very much, Kurt, that is exactly it.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):in Charter 6 - 60 day of end date is minimum according to RPMs, and for start date - 30 days of notice in advance + 30 days mininum duration of sunrsie
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):+ not all days were allowed to have start/end moments
Susan Payne:I think it would be better to filter out the spec 13 for this as they skew the numbers a little
Griffin Barnett:agree
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):they usefull info would be for SPEC13 - was SPEC 13 executed before the sunrise or after
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):to understand how many decided to change their mind
George Kirikos:Berry answered the question I was going to ask. :-)
Griffin Barnett:are there any new gTLDs that executed Spec 13 after launching as an open tld>
Susan Payne:but Maxim if the registry allocated names to third parties they wouldn't be eligible to adopt spec 13
George Kirikos:Actually, new question (new hand).
Susan Payne:so cannot have run an open sunrise
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):spec 13 was approved on 26mar2014, and some TLDs launched earlier
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__newgtlds.icann.org_en_announcements-2Dand-2Dmedia_announcement-2D14apr14-2Den&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwll3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=DRa2dXAvSFpCIgmkXhFzL7ar9Qfqa0AIgn-H4xR2EBk&m=EQX2oP_h3dneSn5OhOUbr2L2gIRoGfHS_URDf2n8iWU&s=nQzKlTiAPDXWiRVz6Dw-KJc_SyUmK8iTpzMvyx9XoMw&e=
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Susan, they could have 0 registrars sunrise
David McAuley:Nice presentation Berry
Griffin Barnett:@maxim, just bc spec 13 was approved after some new gTLDs launched doesn't mean there were any that launched as open and later executed Spec 13...
Susan Payne:but then they didn't really run a sunrise Maxim
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):formally 0 registrars sunrise was elegible
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Registries had to have sunrise, not RRA executed
Griffin Barnett:might be interesting to see some data on new gTLDs that technically ran a sunrise but without any accredited registrars
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):also many registrars did not want to implement sunrise in their SRS
Berry Cobb:I was just trying to fit it on as few pages for viewing.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):and executed RRA only after end of sunrise

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):to avoid it

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):aand only after end of Claims (due to issues with integration)

Berry Cobb:@George: Understood. It is that way in the raw spreadsheet.

Kathy Kleiman:Tx you, Barry, for all of your work, and this discussion of these charts!

George Kirikos:Thanks, Berry. Is the raw spreadsheet on the wiki?

Berry Cobb:and as the WG wants to add more info from claims, etcs, other data sources we can add to that.

George Kirikos:(and the raw wiki will continue to have more columns, as we get more data sources, presumably)

George Kirikos:raw spreadsheet, rather

Berry Cobb:@George: at this time, no it is not because it does contain information that the WG should not be revealed.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):that is why I refferenced to .zurich as not so good example

Susan Payne:yes i think the graphs are helpful

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):charts and numbers were fine - simplified understanding

Scott Austin:very helpful

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):+1 Kurt

Kurt Pritz:pretty much

Poncelet Ileleji:The graphically data very helpful

Terri Agnew:next meeting: Review of all Rights Protection Mechanisms (RPMs) in all gTLDs PDP Working Group is scheduled for Wednesday, 18 October 2017 at 17:00 UTC for 90 minutes.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):the week after this week and after ICANN is going to be lost due to transit

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*ICANN meeting

Mary Wong:@Maxim, yes, as is customary.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):deputy co-chairs?

claudio:what are our WG goals to accomplish during icann60?

George Kirikos:Bye folks.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):bye all

Griffin Barnett:thanks all, bye

J. Scott Evans:thanks berry. thanks all.

Greg Shatan:Bye all.

David McAuley:Good bye all, thanks Berry

Ariel Liang:thank you all

Susan Payne:thanks all. thanks Berry

Scott Austin:thanks all