

---

MARIO ALEMAN: This is Mario Aleman speaking. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening. Welcome to the LACRALO governance working group call. On Thursday, October 5<sup>th</sup>, 2017, on 18 UTC. On the English channel we have Dev Anand Teelucksingh. On the Spanish channel we have Carlos Vera, Maritza Aguero, and Alberto Soto, and Aiida Noblia as well. Apologies have been sent by Humberto Carrasco. And from staff we have Claudia [INAUDIBLE 00:00:38], Silvia Vivanco, and myself, Mario Aleman. I will be also managing this call. Our interpreters today will be, on the Spanish channel, Paula and Veronica. And I would like to remind you all to please state your name before taking the floor, not only for the transcript, but also for the interpreters. So with this, Sergio, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio Salinas Porto speaking. This is Sergio speaking. Thank you very much, Mario. I would like to thank you all for participating in this call. We have a long way to go. First of all, we have two important topics to deal with today. And I think it would be a good idea to start working on these topics. The first one would be to find a definition of the General Assembly and externally assemblies. We need to define a monthly meeting. And on the other hand, we had a discussion, which was not finished, regarding participation. And the participation of individual users who are not represented by any ALS within the region.

So first of all, I would like to start by discussing the first item on the agenda. And this is to review the, to review this definition that we have.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

And then we can continue with the other items on the agenda. Silvia, I see your hand up. Go ahead, please.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

This is Silvia Vivanco speaking. Just a comment. I would like to introduce our new colleague Claudia [INAUDIBLE 00:02:49]. She is based on LA. She is from Mexico and she is working with us. She will be providing support to us. And she would be providing support to [INAUDIBLE 00:03:05]. So she will be participating with us in many LACRALO calls. So Claudia, welcome to this call.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Sergio speaking. Welcome, Claudia. It's a pleasure to be here with you. Thank you for being here and thank you for your support. I know that you will be listening to us, you will be listening to our discussion. So it's a pleasure to have you here. Thank you. In our Wiki page I posted a comment. I had a kind of definition, I posted a kind of definition, my personal definition. I'm going to paste the link on the chat for you to see the definition. And has to do with a definition of externally meeting.

When I wrote this definition, and I would like to consider this, I tried to be very careful so as not to go into details when it comes to the procedures. Because we have a first stage. And the first stage has to do with the operating principles and how we will be working with them. So I would like to put to consideration, if you all agree with that... I know that we don't have an English translation yet of this. But we have the English translation, this is an automatic translation, and sometimes

---

when we use this type of automatic translation there is a change in the meaning of the text. So the idea is to be able to discuss.

Dev, have you seen the link? I see that you're asking where the link, or where the text is. Okay. So if you agree with that, I would like to start discussing this so as to move forward. Do you agree with this? Please indicate yes or no in the chat. I mean, if you agree or not. Dev, what do you think? Alberto Soto says yes. Aiida says yes. Bamba [phonetic] is also chatting with me. She wants to be part of the meeting. So I'm going to send her the links for her to connect to the call. Okay. Dev, I see your hand up. Aiida, Alberto. I'm going to start reading.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Okay.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: This is just a drop, just a contribution. And of course you can provide your input and your ideas, so that we can have a better definition. When it comes to ordinary assemblies I said the same. This is a meeting carried out by representatives of ALSes and LACRALO members. This is carried out once a month according to operating principles in accordance with the rules of procedures.

This text, I selected this text because I meant reference to the operating principles and the ordinary meeting. Operating principles will determine what the ordinary meeting is. This should be called before, or with calling of members, these type of meetings are carried out to discuss with such in LACRALO. And to discuss institutional matters And to re-

---

elect members of these attributions or these powers of the ordinary meetings to define upon the representatives to elect the members of the council or to elect officials, to renew terms and to appoint representatives, to decide upon the budget.

This has to do with the budget, with expenses. But also it is related to proposals. Second item, externally meeting. And this is where Aaida may have contribution because I said this is also a meeting called by ALSes and LACRALO members. This is similar to the ordinary meeting. The external meeting is called for two reasons. Because one of the members of the ALSs wants to have an external meeting, and this is in accordance with the operating principles and rules of procedures. Or because the secretary or the chair would like to have an external meeting. So this is in accordance with the operating principles of LACRALO and the rules of procedures. And like the ordinary meeting, it is carried out to deal with specific topics. It has a restrictive and exceptional nature, and it is only done according to the rules of procedures.

Then we have monthly ordinary meetings. These meetings that are carried out once a month, called by the chair or the secretary of LACRALO. The objective is to allow discussions and proposals to be presented by each ALS or representative. These meetings allow to provide management or participation of ALSes in specific topics related to ICANN and topics that are of interest for LACRALO. They should adhere to the operating principles of LACRALO.

So these are the three definitions that we have. I would like to ask the interpreter if I read too fast or if it is okay. Is there any comment about this text? Alberto Soto, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

---

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto, for the record. Sergio, I would like to discuss this part by part. First I think we have to discuss about the ordinary assembly or meeting and then go to the other. Because otherwise we get lost. When it comes to the first concept, I quite agree with the definition but for one thing. And this is when you say, "This type of assembly will be carried out to discuss response of management in the RALO. The report and the renewal of position." I mean, this is the ordinary assembly. In summary its powers are, and this is item number two, to elect members of the council and remove or appoint [INAUDIBLE 00:12:34]. Do we have this clear?

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. I mean, I think this should be described in the matrix on the operating principles. Because we need to revise all this. But when it comes to these two items we... This is the core of a matter. This is not the operating principles. These are the principles, these are the main principles. And in the matrix we also have to consider this, if you agree.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto. Okay. So we need to describe how they will be removed, because that is not set in any place. So this cannot be in effect. I mean, this is the act, or the law, but we need the regulation.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Okay, Alberto. Dev, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

DEV:

Thank you, this is Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. So thanks for the first draft attempt at this, Sergio. I do think that's... I kind of would want to, I'd say, simplify this even further. Because I think by making it so rigid potentially you might be constricting how the assembly can operate. I would like to think...

But generally the thinking of assemblies... Essentially, an assembly would be... And this was what was kind of discussed on the last call. And that is that an assembly is a meeting for decision making that requires the entire membership of LACRALO to participate. And so to me that's where the clear distinction lies. Ordinary meetings, whether it's extraordinary or ordinary meeting... How should I put it? Anybody can bring additional motions at the ordinary meeting. Right? So even though you may can say it's yearly thing for the reporting by the representatives and electing of members to various positions, and so forth, anybody can introduce motions at such an ordinary assembly.

So to me, that's why I don't understand why we need to distinguish so rigidly the ordinary and extraordinary. To me the [INAUDIBLE 00:15:33] definition is the assembly is a meeting for decision making. I.E., a motion has to be considered, or by... Sorry, let me say that again. An assembly is a meeting for, whereby motions that requires the entire membership of LACRALO to participate and consider. And that would cover it.

And then if you wish to describe further, there are two types of assemblies. Ordinary assemblies, which are scheduled once a year, and

---

extraordinary, when somebody calls for a motion to be debated. Then you could define it that way. So in other words, you want to summarize what's the similarities and then note the differences. Because, reading it, listening to what you said, it still kind of feels kind of... That stuff is kind of confusing, [INAUDIBLE 00:16:46] to discover the nuance behind it. And perhaps it could be a little bit clearer. So but I appreciate the good first attempt. Thanks.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Thank you very much, Dev. Now we'll give the floor to Alberto Soto. Go ahead please, Alberto.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto speaking. Dev, the thing is this. We have been discussing something, and this is to take already existing models of meetings in different kinds of organizations. And this is what we did in the group. We really thought that this was already clear when it comes to the definitions. I mean, we first defined in a [INAUDIBLE 00:17:35] way the types of meetings. And we decided we had three. Monthly meetings, ordinary assemblies, and extraordinary assemblies. So this is an already existing model for meetings in any part of the world.

The ordinary assembly deals with certain issues. The extraordinary assembly deals with some other issues. Now, the formal way in which each of these meetings should be carried out, well, this will be described in some other place and the description of the topics that will be addressed by each of these meetings will also be described. I mean, motion, the need for participation, the quorum. To deal with some

---

specific topics, at least, we would ask for fifty percent of participation. For some other topics seventy five percent of participation will be requested. But this is something that has to do with the topic, with the issue. But not with the meeting, because these are three models that are already established around the world.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Thank you very much, Alberto. I'm going to give the floor now to Aiida Noblia. Aiida, are you there? Sergio speaking. Are you there, can you hear us? I think that Aiida is typing. No, we cannot hear you. So if you agree perhaps you can type, and in the meantime I'm going to take the floor. I'm Sergio Salinas Porto, for the record.

The truth is that I think that there has been so much ambiguity in our operating principles and rules of procedures before vis-a-vis what we have now that we need to have some accuracy. So it would be a good idea to have some redundancy. So as not to have such a vague or broad definition, we can specify the [INAUDIBLE 00:20:10] participation tools that we conclude in principle, in the operating principles. These tools would be the ordinary assembly and the extraordinary assembly, only to discuss some specific topics. And finally the monthly regular meeting that is the one that we usually use to discuss and address different topics.

I believe it is necessary to have this differentiation. Because if we don't go into that kind of description and we just gave a broad definition for the second stage when we will have the different rules.. This will be a good guidance for us to follow each of the steps. And I'm saying this

---

because in an assembly we will need all the participants, and if we don't have one of the ALSes there, one of the members, then it will no longer be an assembly. And if we are talking about too high a quorum, perhaps we can never get to do anything because we will never have such a high level of quorum. So we need to think strategically and tactically about each of the processes that we are going to implement to make sure that we will have available different tools that will enable us to operate in the region.

Today it is not possible to do this in the region. All of us know that we never get to the majority required. That the assemblies, other than the regular monthly meetings, do not take place according to the rules. And so we need to be very precise with our definition to make sure that there is no misunderstanding, that there are no different readings so as to have clear rules and to have enough broad rules in order to move ahead with a participation.

I wanted to say this because I think that it is necessary for us to have a basic definition. Perhaps I went too far in some of the sentences. But I don't think that this is too far away from the end result. I see that Dev is asking for the floor, so you have the floor.

DEV:

Thanks, Sergio. So again, thanks Sergio, this is Dev. So again, okay. I understand what you're saying regarding... Sorry about that, yeah. I understand what you're trying to say but again, the conversation I am hearing, it sounds like a [INAUDIBLE 00:23:12] of the differences between the tree. And again, let's try to simplify.

---

I would say that [INAUDIBLE 00:23:23] to say, is that assemblies are meetings of LACRALO members to consider motions raised by members of, you know, to consider motions. Motions include voting, any other issue that can be raised by any LACRALO member. Okay? So that means that.. Then you could describe, assemblies must be [INAUDIBLE 00:23:50]. And if you want to describe the characteristics of the assemblies, specific characteristics. So you are mentioning that you have to make sure that there's enough people present at the meeting and so forth. But remember, most of our assemblies will be virtual, which means that quorum is not... It's [INAUDIBLE 00:24:12] already. All virtual meetings are [INAUDIBLE 00:24:14]. Everybody gets a vote credential or a ballot to cast their vote on a particular motion.

So you could say, "Define that assembly. Define the quorum." Okay? And then mention ordinary meetings, or how should I put it, ordinary monthly meetings, as you describe it, are just regular meetings where we just consider the policies, and no motion are considered. And therefore the quorum requirement is not needed. So I hope I'm making myself clear on tha, to ordinaries. So I guess we need comments from Sergio. Ordinary assembly.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Thank you, Dev, for your comment. Just to explain to you what I'm writing in the chat window, we have a big differentiation between an ordinary and an extraordinary assembly, on the one hand, and on the other hand we have the regular monthly meeting. We do this because in an assembly we try to take stock so that the President, the Secretary, and members, they can report on what has been done

---

during the year. And authorities, officials, are elected. We can have a change of authorities just by raising their hands. Perhaps the election can actually take place a couple of weeks before that assembly, in order to get to that assembly already with that definition.

And we need to have an assembly once a year, regardless of what we do on a monthly basis, in each of the LACRALO activities where we convene a meeting, where we have a session to work together where we organize the different activities. But these are two different things. So on the one hand we have the assembly and on the other hand we have the meeting. So I hope that this sheds some light and allows you to understand what is our view.

Those who come with a Roman law background, I understand that those have a different type of laws system, like you, may see things differently. Those of us in Latin America under Roman law have a different view. So we need to describe the two legal procedures that are available. I'm going to give the floor first to Aiida and then to Alberto.

AIÍDA NOBLIA:

Aiida speaking. Can you hear me? Yes. I ratify what you say, Sergio, regarding the three types of meetings. The general assemblies, where we discuss a predefined agenda and motions that are submitted. The extraordinary meetings that are specially convened. It is not that they are necessarily convened by the ALSes. Actually the call is made based on a request by the ALS, but the call is just the administrative part. So the extraordinary assemblies are convened based on the request of some ALS. And the monthly meetings are not assemblies.

---

There are two types of assemblies, the ordinary and the extraordinary assemblies. This is something that I agree with. As Alberto said, this is included in all the bylaws of corporations, and all types of corporations.

The meetings would take place in a more informal manner. We also have an agenda for the meetings but we don't have votes. And it has more to do with discussing different topics. It's a third type of event, let's say. That is what I wanted to say. And the general or ordinary assemblies have an agenda, motions are submitted, and a vote takes place, and the quorum has to be established.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Thank you, Aida. I have two requests for the floor. Alberto Soto and then Silvia Vivanco. Silvia, if you agree, I'm going to give the floor first to Alberto and then you will take the floor. Go ahead, Alberto.

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto Soto speaking. I will try to simplify things. I believe that Dev's concerns have to do with the submission of motions. Naturally, what we are doing here is defining three types of LACRALO meetings. In the regulations that come after the definition we will say how we convene and how we operate each of these assemblies. We can have motions in any of these three types of meetings.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Oh.

---

ALBERTO SOTO: In monthly meeting I can submit a motion of order. I can submit a motion of order in a monthly meeting, I cannot submit a motion to ask for a change to the rules of procedure of LACRALO at that point. In order to do that I will have to request that an extraordinary assembly be convened, because that is what is needed for modifying the rules of procedure. And in a certain place we will have a definition of the operation of the quorum.

The same applies to ordinary meetings. I can submit different motions. What I'm trying to say is that...I'm going to disagree a little bit with Aaida. The agenda for today and the topics to be addressed in the three types of meetings, we would have that already previously defined. The regular monthly meetings are convened in a usual manner. For the general assemblies we agree on a date. And the extraordinary assembly is called or convened because of an extraordinary circumstance. But we will have motions in all of them. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Thank you, Alberto. Silvia, you have the floor.

SILVIA: Silvia speaking. I just wanted to say that I'm concerned about Dev's comment. I want to make sure that there is a difference, really, between the Anglo-Saxon countries and Latin American countries. This idea that we have motions to be considered by the general assembly. So let me summarize my understanding of a general assembly according to

---

our law. And specifically for Dev, because I think that those of us from civil law background, we understand this.

An ordinary assembly happens on a regular basis, usually annually, with a predefined agenda. A motion is an expression of an [INAUDIBLE 00:33:07] LACRALO of raising a point for a specific purpose. I think that there are some differences between assemblies and motions. And I think that Anglo-Saxon countries can coexist with this definition of assembly, like we have in the civil law. And motion is one thing and an assembly is a different thing. I'm interested in making this difference from a conceptual standpoint. I just want to make sure that I understand correctly. Because all the rest can be confusing. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Thank you, Silvia. I don't know whether Dev understands the view of the two legal systems, the Anglo-Saxon system and the Roman Latin system.

DEV: Well, this is Dev.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Perhaps...

DEV: Okay. Okay, okay.

---

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: An assembly... Not to any meeting, only to the one that takes place once a year. An extraordinary meeting will be convened only to address specific topics. The rules of procedure should determine what topics should only be addressed in an extraordinary assembly. When we attend meeting of the management committee from a different organization we do not convene an assembly. Actually it is a meeting of voluntary ALSes. And there we work on the daily issues, the things that affect us on a daily basis, to move ahead with LACRALO's work. This has nothing to do with the assembly, where we do take stock of the performance of management.

And according to civil law we should have an evaluation of the performance of management, also the financial evaluation, and also the election of the officials. In other cases, so in our case, it should be the evaluation of performance management, and then, we don't deal with money, so it would be just the election of authorities. Dev, you have the floor if you want.

DEV: Okay, thanks. Thanks, Sergio. This is Dev. So yeah, I definitely... I think we're trying to say the same thing, but I think we're getting slightly confused in the terminology. I think there's a difference. Like, what exactly are motions? Maybe that needs to be defined. As I understand it. And I do not claim to be a legal expert by any means. But I can say that any motion is like any proposal raised by any member. That, be it at the annual general meeting, or AGM, in our organization, or a special meeting convened as requested by the members of the organization. Or extraordinary meetings. Okay?

---

So to use the terminology, as we have discussed before, the motions are considered at ordinary assemblies and extraordinary assemblies. Because motions are any proposal that has to be considered by all of LACRALO. And proposals has to be carried, usually either by consensus that nobody objects to or by vote. Okay? So that to me is really the core definition of a motion. And elections are motions, for example.

If you want... And some motions require certain quorum requirements. Like if you want to change our bylaws or operating principles there's usually a higher threshold, a higher majority threshold needed. Okay? So that's my core point. Motions are considered at assemblies. Be it ordinary assemblies or extraordinary assemblies. And you know, the assemblies can be face to face or virtual.

But ordinary monthly meetings, we do not have motions that require a formal vote to be considered. So I hope I've made myself clear. I think we're just getting a little confused on what our interpretation of the word motion is. So but I'll stop there.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Thank you, Dev. Alberto has the floor and if there is someone else, please go ahead.

ALBERTO SOTO: This is Alberto Soto, for the record. I do agree about the motion. But what happened is this. There are different types of issues that need to be solved. For example, in a monthly meeting I can put forth a motion of order, for example, because there are some issues or some problems to

---

deal with. I can also request a motion to create an action item, for example, for the next meeting or for the fulfillment of a certain action. And that is a motion. A motion means proposal.

So in each meeting we will have different types of motions, different motions with different degrees of importance, if you will.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio speaking. Alberto, are you there?

ALBERTO SOTO: Alberto speaking. Okay. But that is not defined by the definition [INAUDIBLE 00:39:35] of the meetings that LACRALO will carry out. I mean, we don't need to decide this here. This should be, as Sergio said, in some other place. For example, in the operating principles or in some other document. And we are not going to request or demand the total amount of votes for such things. I mean, if I need to remove, for example, or if we need to remove the LACRALO Chair, for example, I cannot say that that motion can be put forth by one person but supported by two people. And then I would be able to remove the chair. These type of issues should be addressed with certain quorum, with a certain amount of people present. So if I need to present or put forth a motion for someone to travel to some place, this will have a different quorum. I mean, there are different type of motions. And then different types of meetings. Different types of motions, as I said before, and different types of quorums for these motions to be addressed. And there is something that we are leaving behind in these definitions, because it might be the case these three types of meetings might be

---

virtual or face-to-face meetings. We have online meetings and we have face-to-face meetings. We have ordinary meetings and extraordinary meetings, so we can have face-to-face or online meetings. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio Salinas Porto speaking. Thank you, Alberto. I'm going to start from here: Do we agree with the fact that the operating principles are right definitions of the rules of procedures? If we do agree with that, there are many things that we, in this first draft of operating principles, are going to go deeper into.

Now how a meeting will work. How, for example, a motion will be put forth? Well that will need to be very clearly stated on the rules of procedures. We do need to define the fact that we have three types of meetings or assemblies. One is the ordinary meeting that we usually carry out once a month, that is our monthly meeting. There is another type of meeting, and this is the case of the general assembly, or the ordinary assembly and the extraordinary assembly. We are changing the bylaws, and this change of bylaws should be carried out by external assemblies with a certain quorum. And we also need to decide if this is going to be a face-to-face meeting or an online meeting.

So I propose the following. Let's see the definition of assembly, only that. Let's not pay attention to the way in which these meetings will work, let's only pay attention to the definition of the assemblies. And the definition of the meetings. Because if we can define that, it will be okay. Because otherwise we will be adding concepts that will have to do with the operating principles and we will be going backwards and not

---

forward. So we need to take these three concepts and define the concepts in order to move forward. And we need to close these items to proceed with some other item on the agenda, because we need to finish with it. Otherwise this will be a never-ending discussion.

But once we have these definitions we will be able to decide the steps to follow and the regulation to follow. But we need to finish with the operating principles and begin to work with the operating principles. Dev, you have the floor. Go ahead please.

DEV:

Okay, thanks, Sergio. I'll tell you what, let me try to take a chance to respond to what you proposed, Sergio, and try to explain it. And then see if we understand each other. I think we are. I think that it's just that, like I said, I think it's the terminology that were using and I think that's causing the confusion on it.

So let me...I'll try to send something via email. I know you sent this comment yesterday evening. So let me take a look at it and then try to write something just to address the two things. And then, and so you can look at it via email, and then we can continue the conversation via email, in time for the next call of this group. Okay? And I'll try to define the assemblies and define the characteristics regarding the motions. Yeah. Okay? So let me try to respond to it. Okay? All right. And you can put that as an action item, so I'll [INAUDIBLE 00:45:38] something in response to it.

---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: I do agree that... Go ahead please.

DEV: Okay. This is Dev. [INAUDIBLE 00:46:03] recorded the action item for me to submit a response to the definitions of the three types of meetings. Okay? So I'll send it via email to the list, or to the wiki page, where Sergio posted a comment. I'll reply to that. And then we can continue the discussion online before the next meeting.

There's a motion? No. That's, I guess, that's the response of Alberto. I think that's, again, it's coming down to the definitions. To me, that's not a motion as such. I appreciate what the people are saying, as that might be confusing. So okay. Good.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Dev, have you finished with your comment?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. I'll work on the text [inaudible] and send it via e-mail. I'm not going to try to wordsmith it right now.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Okay. Thank you very much, Dev. I would kindly ask you to post that information on the wiki as well so that we can have that information as well on the wiki page. I'm going to post also this information on my comment, so you can continue below so as to be able to [merge] both points of view. If we can work on this this week based on Dev's posting

---

and based on my comment, and perhaps someone else would like to make a contribution, we can move forward during this week and perhaps close this topic by the end of the week. I think we have two or three big issues to address, we need to decide on that. I don't know if we will have enough time. But we also need to address the issue of participation. The participation of end users and individual users, because that is representing a group, as you know.

Alberto, you have the floor. Go ahead, please.

ALBERTO SOTO:

When it comes to end users and individual users, I believe – whether we like it or not – that we need to add them, we need to incorporate that, because otherwise, we will be forced to do that item. I don't know what happened with ITEMS. We haven't received any information, but I know that the issue is being addressed by ITEMS and three ALAC members and the Board.

The Board has just received comments by ITEMS and comments by ALAC members. The subcommittee that is working on that chaired by Rinalia will have to analyze these explanations provided by both parties, and they will make a decision.

Sincerely, I don't know what the Board will decide, but I have no doubt at all, because I was participating in all the meetings with ITEMS and with the Board, and I participated in all meetings with the Board and ITEMS together. And if something is being approved, that will be the incorporation of end users.

---

So we need to see this, we need to analyze this. I won't say anything else about the rest, if we are still going to be ALSes or not, but I'm pretty sure that individual users will be incorporated.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Alberto, for your comment. And I would like to say for the record that I don't mind if someone is imposing something to me that will be recorded, because it is being imposed. So we have end users, we represent users in Argentina, and it's crazy to dissolve ALSes and to incorporate individual users to represent the points of view and the voices of the end users of Internet around the world.

Secondly, I would like to state for the record that I do not oppose to have end users to participate. In fact, on many occasions, I have encouraged people to participate within ICANN. But I'm well concerned of the fact that they would represent me. How can someone represent you if that person is not part of any other group? How one person will represent a whole group if that person is not participating in any other group? So that is really a big concern for me.

I do agree with their participation. It's okay. I do agree with the fact that they will have the possibility to discuss and to contribute to the policies that we have in LACRALO, but I am very concerned about representation. It's not the same having someone alone, not being able to deal with other people in an organization, than someone who has a practice, someone who works in group and who is able to represent genuine interest of groups. So that is something different, and that is why I'm concerned.

---

If ICANN is being imposed this or is going to impose that, that is ICANN's problem. ICANN will have to be responsible for that, but I'm not going to support that. If ICANN is willing to do that, it will be okay, but as a representative of Internet users in Argentina, I don't think it is correct to have the representation of end users in this way, because they will not be able to discuss topics with any other groups around the world. So, Aiida, you have the floor, and then Dev. And then we only have five minutes left.

AIÍDA NOBLIA:

I agree with what you said, Sergio. End users, this is an idea that the ITEMS people have. They're always insistent on the same topic. I have already mentioned that there are some other regions which do have individual users, but they have one ALS, and those individual users are integrated into that special ALS. So that ALS is a group of people, and they have the right to one vote. And when they have to vote – that is NARALO – all end users vote.

Now, when it comes to representation, I believe it is really logical, and this goes against the history because even companies talk about brainstorming, they talk about group work, and this is from the inception of history. That's all. Thank you.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:

Dev, go ahead, please.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks for that, Sergio. Just one point to note on what was being said. You talked about representing the users, and I think it's important to note a key distinction. The At-Large community represents the interest of end users, and that's because in a sense, there was no general election with every single Internet user voting on who will represent them. None of us can claim – I would say – ownership that all the users have in a particular country or around the world elected us. So it's important to note the difference. We represent the interests of Internet end users in ICANN activities, policies and so forth. Just to note that core difference.

Obviously, the ALAC has submitted its response to the ITEMS review to the Board, and the Board is now going to be considering it. And the Board could either go one or two ways. They could actually reject the ALAC's position and say, "We have to adopt ITEMS's recommendations completely." Or if it decides to accept the ALAC's recommendations.

In either case though, what the ALAC has said and what [it] has said is that individuals are being worked on, and we're the last organization or RALO to look at how individuals can participate fully in LACRALO. I know there is a tension regarding how votes would be counted, but like I said, I do think that it can be accommodated within our framework for how we calculate votes regarding ALSes per country.

And I think we should not [inaudible] because to be quite honest, it makes more people easier to participate in LACRALO and in At-Large. And that's what we need. We need new people to join, and removing the barriers to joining and participating are always good things in my opinion. So that's it.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you very much, Dev, for your opinion. It is very valid. We have only one minute left, so I'm going to give the floor to Alberto. And before that, I would like to say for the record that we need more participation in the region. We need to incorporate more people. But the way of adding people is to open or to create new ALSes. ALSes with many people, not ALSes with only one person, because the ALS is the engine for discussions and for new topics. Otherwise, we will have a group of people discussing by themselves but who cannot discuss in group.

INTERPRETER: Dev, nobody is speaking now on the Spanish channel. It seems that they're having some technical difficulties.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Yes. Alberto has been disconnected, so he's being called again. So please bear with us.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks for that. I wasn't too sure what's happening.

INTERPRETER: You're welcome. And I think it was Carlos, not Alberto who disconnected.

---

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thank you.

INTERPRETER: You're welcome.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Can you hear me? We are going to adjourn this call. I would like to ask you to think about two things. We will have a meeting next week at this same time. I'm planning to convene it. If you agree, we can set the time and date, and if the staff and the interpreters are available, they can tell us whether we can have that call at the same time. And Dev is going to send us via e-mail and also through the wiki page a proposal for the definition of the two types of assembly and the monthly meeting, and we will reveal the participation of end users in our region.

So I think that will be all today. Bye to all of you. Thank you for your participation.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you all.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, everyone. And thanks again to the interpreters.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**