

YEŞİM NAZLAR:

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the AFRALO Hot Topics Working Group call, taking place on Monday, 2<sup>nd</sup> of October, 2017, at 1900 UTC. On our call today, on the French channel, we have Aïcha Abbad and Ramanou Biao. On the English channel, we have Mohamed El Bashir, Tijani Ben Jemaa, and Daniel Nanghaka. From staff, we have Silvia Vivanco, Ariel Liang, and myself, Yeşim Nazlar. We have received an apology from Sarah Kiden, and Aziz Hilali has joined us on the French channel, as well. Our interpreters today are Camilla and Isabelle, and before we start, I would like to remind everyone to state their name before speaking, not only for the transcription purposes, but also for the interpretation purposes, as well, please. And back to you, Mohamed. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

OK, thank you very much, and we can start the call. Welcome, everyone, to—I think this is the third call for the working group, and I appreciate everyone's support and effort. We're making good progress. The main purpose of this call is to try to hopefully agree on the final list of hot topics, so we can proceed, and define, as well, review structure of a report for the hot topics and ask for volunteers, as well. So, without further delay, we can go and proceed to the meeting agenda. On the roll call—I guess we already had the roll call of the people currently participating either on the dialogue on the phone or on Adobe Connect. The second item on the agenda—we have the review of the action items from the previous call, which is currently in front of us in Adobe Connect. And for the people who are not in Adobe Connect, I will just

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

go quickly through it. We had to get through the working group, which has been done by Daniel, and we had an action item for further discussion of the topic of internationalism and the impact on DNS and the relevance to ICANN or not, and we had a good debate and discussion involving Dev, Tijani, Alan, Daniel, and a couple of our colleagues, and we finished that item. We agreed that everyone to submit on the mailing list the topic that they consider to be added, and we had that done as well. We agreed to remove the reference to the sustainable development agenda and remove regional support as hot topics. That was done. And there was an action item on my side to develop a skeleton structure for the working group project, which I already shared with the staff, and hopefully we can present to you in this meeting.

So, those are the action items from the previous meeting. I'm good that most of them have been completed. I have Tijani, who has raised his hand. Tijani, go ahead, please.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

With respect to the last one, I think there is another action item. It is for people who have already submitted subjects for inclusion in the hot topics—an action item for them to write a small paragraph to explain what you are intending by the title of this hot topic. And I think this has not been done. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

OK, thank you, Tijani. Actually, you are the only one who did that for the item that you suggested in the mailing list, so thank you for that.

---

But yes, the only one of the action items is that we need more people to write that down. You're right. So, if we can move ahead to—this action item is outstanding, and we need to continue working on that. If we move ahead to the agenda, you can see—

DANIEL NANGHAKA: It's Daniel.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Oh, Daniel, I'm sorry. Daniel has a raised hand. Please go ahead, Daniel.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Thank you very much. I think, since Tijani made the initial posting of the suggestion to the hot topics, I think we could, in this case, begin that discussion to go ahead, as we wait on other issues to be sent to the mailing list. I think we should not wait for everyone or for a strict number of items to be sent and then begin to go through the deliberation process. At least, let's go ahead with that, so that's my thought about that. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, thank you, Daniel. That's what exactly we're going to do. The next agenda item is the list of topics we need to discuss on this call, and you can see that the item suggested by Tijani is already included there, so we have now, in this, a list of hot topics that came from the discussion on the mailing list. And you can see it now in Adobe Connect, and if

---

you're not in Adobe Connect, we can go through it and debate it. I'm just going to go through it quickly, so people on the phone can know it. Number one, promoting DNSSEC implementation in African TLD registries, number two, new gTLDs and geographic names, number three, new gTLDs and subsequent procedure, number four, similar to that, data protection regulation/privacy and WHOIS, number five, ICANN accountability and transparency, number six, diversity and participation in ICANN—actually, Tijani proposed diversity in ICANN, and I added participation, with open end for discussion, number seven, Internet governance, activities and issues, and number eight, general ICANN issues, awareness and outreach to Africa. And I think that includes access to material in Africa in other languages than English. So, those are the eight points, and I'll open the discussion about them. Let's try our best to finalize this list, hopefully, in this call, so we can have an agreed list, and then we'll continue our work on this list further, because we need to develop a document around that. Tijani, please?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Mohamed. I noticed that you have merged two of my proposals, which—one is GDPR, and the other is RDS. They are different, Mohamed. The GDBR is about data, is about privacy issues. The RDS is another way to treat the WHOIS, so there is a lot of aspects of them. And you know that we went to thick WHOIS, thin WHOIS, and now we are thinking about a new generation, so I think this is a subject different from the GDPR, which is about privacy, about data protection regulations. Thank you.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: All right, thank you, Tijani. Tijani's proposal is to separate RDS and WHOIS in a separate hot topic in the initial proposal, and having data protection regulation and privacy as one item. Go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: We may keep what is now GDPR and privacy and WHOIS, because this is where we will have to address the GDPR, and put another hot topic, which is the RDS and the WHOIS from the other side, as well.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: All right, thank you. That's also good proposals. It will be useful to hear from others.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Daniel here, can I say something?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yeah, please go ahead, Daniel.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Yeah, I am agreed with what Tijani is saying, because RDS is a whole subject at this point, and the work that is being done on the RDS, I being a member of that working group, is tremendous work, and there is no participation from AFRALO towards that. I think we could be two or three people representing AFRALO on the RDS working group, so I think that should be a special item for discussion, and I'll be happy to

---

contribute or maybe write a paragraph about it. Thank you. Back to you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: OK, thank you, Daniel. OK, so it's just logged out of Adobe Connect. I'm trying to connect again. But it seems there is support for Tijani's proposal. I have Fatimata. Please go ahead, Fatimata.

[pause]

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Fatimata, if you would like to speak, you have time. Please, go ahead.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Yes, I would like to go back on the proposal regarding the GDPR and RDS. What has been proposed is to separate them. Of course, they are linked themes. We can separate them to focus on each area, but they also are linked topics, whether it's the general data protection regulation or—the WHOIS both actually addressed the issue of protection, so that's why we decided to put them together. I'm not against necessarily separating them, but I wanted to just mention the reason why we had put them together to begin with during the last two meetings. So, if now we consider the option of separating those two topics, will we have enough people to work on each one of them? I'm not against it. That's not what I'm saying. But I just want us to consider that.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Fatimata. Tijani, do you have a response to that? Please go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Mohamed. Can you hear me on the French channel?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, please go ahead. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I wanted to mention that the GDPR is a very important topic. It is a very important topic for ICANN in general. It is the European initiative, as you might already know, and it has to do with all data, so it's data protection regulation in general, and so it is something that we need to address. It is a hot topic. First of all, it is a general debate. It is a topic that touches on several levels of ICANN, and it also is important for us in Africa. So, RDS and WHOIS has to do, first of all, with public data. We need public data. Otherwise, we don't know who is behind what. But with those public data, there are also private data of people that you need to protect, so that is quite complex, and the other issue is, how are we going to define as public—how are we going to define what is private? That is two issues. So, the first question is, how are we going to define information? And I think that this topic is quite a large topic. I don't think that we should address both topics at the same time, because they each require certain attention that is different.

- 
- INTERPRETER: Interpreter apologizing—I have a very bad sound and an echo. I hope I got everything here.
- MOHAMED EL BASHIR: OK, thank you very much, Tijani. So, if there is no further topic, I think that we're all in agreement that we're going to separate the two topics, because they are important. OK, and so, I don't want to be going in a circle discussing the topics, but if any person has any comments about specific topics in the list to be removed or merged with another topic, please provide us with your opinion. Fatimata, please?
- FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Yes, thank you very much. If I understand correctly, we have been talking about the WHOIS for years, so this is something that is a long-term project that has been going on for a long time, and it is still going on. So, why is it actually a hot topic for us? Why don't we just simply talk about topics that we know we can work on and come to a solution, come to a conclusion, on? Thank you.
- MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Fatimata. OK, I have Tijani first, and then Daniel. Please go ahead.
- TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed. It seems that my sound on the French channel is very low, so I will speak on the English channel. Why we have to address the RDS and WHOIS—because there is a huge part done now
-



---

on ICANN, and we are speaking about new ways to address it. The RDS is another way to address the WHOIS, and now we speak about WHOIS generation of the directories. So, I do believe that, if we want to ignore this debate, this work done, this work which is now connected by working groups—if we ignore it, I think we are ignoring an important part of the work of ICANN.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani. Daniel, please?

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Thanks, Tijani and Mohamed, for this. Yeah, the one thing that I certainly advocate for is for African participation in this discussion here. Speaking as a member in the RDS, we need more African participation, and I think if we list this as a hot topic and encourage members to participate in it, we need to get people into this global policy. And once we get them, then we will be able to make an impact. And also, in reference to—this may not be a very popular belief, but I will just reference the African members of the RALOs. The RDS has key input that is limited from the African region, which plays a very important role, so I don't think it's time to ignore it. That's why I'm in strong support that it should be added to this list, so it can't get simply passed over. I said at first that there's a lot of milestone work that has gone on, but there is even more coming. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Daniel. Aziz, please?

---

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Mohamed. I hope you can hear me. I just wanted to respond to Fatimata. I don't think that we really had an answer to her question. I don't want to necessarily decide which topic is important, which is not. I think they are all important, but there is one thing that bothers me, or maybe something I'm a little bit worried about, and that is who will actually be involved in the discussion. Who will be the voice of Africa? Who will be able to express the concerns of our community of AFRALO? There is a meeting coming up within AFRALO, and I would like—you know, for me, all of these topics are important at different levels. I think that, with the time that we have left, what is key is to discuss how we can do outreach and really involve the community in the discussion, so that we can actually come to a result. That's what I wanted to mention here.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Aziz. I agree with you that I think we need to have more discussion about how we're going to achieve our objective, in terms of having a meaningful reaching out to our ALSs and also our topics. And so, I suggest that, if there is no further comment, we can move to item number four. If really you have an issue on one of those items currently on the list of hot topics, you can raise it now, or you can use the mailing list. I think now we are close to having an agreed list, and it will be useful if we can share this list to the mailing list, so we can finalize it. Personally, I think maybe I might be interested in merging diversity and participation in ICANN and access to ICANN materials and the issue of awareness of ICANN. The last one seems very general. I'm

---

not sure—do we just say that, OK, we identify issues and we do awareness based on that? But maybe we can merge the African participation in ICANN and raising awareness and outreach to Africa. So, I will try to propose a new name of this hot topic, because as Fatimata said, we have a limited number of active participants within the RALO, so we don't want to stretch people, really. We have lots of things to be done. So, if there's no further comment, I would like to go to the item number four, which is a review of the report structure. That was an action item on my side, in Adobe Connect now, we can see a template that is used.

Unfortunately, if you're not in Adobe Connect, you will not be able to see it, but we will post it on the wiki, hopefully. So, this might not be in the standard for writing ICANN documents, but I think what's important to review now is the structure of the document, so we can agree on the structure, so we can start drafting things. So, my idea of the report is that it have a document objective, which is that this document should provide an overview of the key issues that AFRALO is currently working on within ICANN and what are—define also the outreach and engagement activities that are required. And there's an introduction about AFRALO on the front page. And we are listing the hot topic issues that have been agreed by AFRALO for the community. Following that, which is the important part, we need to have each hot topic, and each hot topic has to have a summary. You can see it now in Adobe Connect, if you are there. For example, I put an example of promoting DNSSEC implementation in Africa TLDs, and then we need to write a summary about that topic, as well, which is basically details about DNSSEC implementation. After the summary, we need to answer the question

---

about why this topic is important to AFRALO and African users, so either we can write a couple of bullet points, or a summary, like a few paragraphs about why this topic is important to AFRALO and to users in Africa. I think that's important.

Following that, we need to have some sort of action items and what we're going to do to raise awareness about this topic. I'm not really having strong feelings about the names of the components, so it could be action items. It could be outreach activities. It could be activities. That's not a concern. We can agree on that now. But we need to list down what we're going to do to raise awareness. So, in the case of DNSSEC, I did propose two things as an example, promoting DNSSEC and raising awareness among African ALSs about the importance of DNSSEC implementation, and then the gTLD registries, besides coordinating with ICANN and African TLDs and organizing DNSSEC implementations for AFRALO ALSs. So, what you are seeing here, if you are already part of Adobe Connect, is an example of the structure. I think we'll open the discussion so we can agree exactly what we need to see in the report and move ahead. Daniel, please. Daniel, go ahead, followed by Tijani, please.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Hello, can you hear me now?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Yes, we can hear you.

- 
- DANIEL NANGHAKA: What I was saying is that I like the structure that is proposed in this document, as it's currently being shared. It's really good. But I also suggest reaching out to the different ALSs. We could have maybe a 15- or 10-minute discussion during the AFRALO calls, whereby the members can speak about the different hot topics, because if we get the opinion of the members, then we would also be able to gauge their level of engagement. We can see how they participate in these different hot topics or different working groups related to this, on top of these other suggestions. Thank you.
- MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Daniel. Tijani, please?
- TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed. I think that the last part of the structure is the most important part, and I think that it makes sense to have it like this. What I raised from the second call, because I guess I wasn't part of the first call—what I proposed to discuss was the objective of this work. What is the aim? What do we want to reach again? And I gave some proposals to discuss it and think about it. Now, here, action item or way forward—I prefer “way forward,” and the way forward for each hot topic—we have to think what is our aim, what we have to do. First of all, I think deciding the hot topics for AFRALO is already an important thing to do, and I think this is a success, if we manage to have an agreement on those eight topics. And eight are not very much, believe me. Even if we don't have the boundaries for each of those topics, we identify them, and when we have someone who can
-

---

dedicate time and energy for it, we will know to address it. But already, deciding them is important.

And the way forward—we have to say what we want to do, for example—it depends on the topic—to solve the problem or to promote the issue or to complain, to decide it, etc., etc. And for topics where we don't have an issue to address, we can say, even if we don't have someone—because we have to identify champions for each one, so if we don't have a champion, we can say we're waiting for a champion for this issue or for this topic, at least in my point of view. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Tijani. Let's see if there's anyone else. Sorry, I have a very bad sound myself, but maybe anyone else who has a comment is fine. So, answering Tijani's question regarding the objectives of the working group, Daniel proposed, and I think it's already part of the wiki, and we agreed about that on a previous call, but basically, the main objective of the working group is selecting topics and all that, and agreeing on topics related to ICANN and priorities for our topics. But if you would like to have an objective for the document, I tried to capture that, as well, and yes, we can definitely write something about what exactly is the objective of this document. I agree with you that—thank you, Silvia, for posting the link to the wiki page where this can be found—I agree with you that it's important that we also focus on what we need to do, in terms of delivering those objectives, or having an outreach.

So, it seems from the feedback from Daniel and Tijani that they are fine with the structure for the hot topic issues and the breakdown, in terms

---

of a summary and why it's important and action items. And if that's the case for others, I think we can start maybe also discussing or asking for volunteers to work and help drafting the report, based on that assumption that we have a list of topics identified, which is—we need to, yes, report it back to the AFRALO call in two days and hear from the others, as well, but it will be useful to identify and have people who are volunteers drafting the report, and I think that's important.

And there's an example of a report that has been done by EURALO. It's a similar structure, where they look at issues, why it's important for EURALO and its members, and what action items they will do. So, I'm just opening the discussion now for anyone interested to discuss how we're going to proceed with drafting the report. Thank you. Fatimata, please, go ahead.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

I think we'd also discussed the purpose of the group, and after some exchange, I thought it had been adopted, but seeing what Tijani's just said, I think we might have to go back to that discussion. Regarding Daniel's suggestion, I think it is absolutely accurate, and we should do things transparently, as we always do, but we should impose deadlines on ALSs to ensure that we get their replies. But I entirely agree with him, in the sense that we should include ALSs in our discussions and keep them up to date, in order to attract them to participate. That's what I wanted to say.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Fatimata. Aziz, please go ahead.

- 
- AZIZ HILALI: Yes, thank you. I just wanted to add something. On the agenda for our meeting on Wednesday, we included that there would be a summary of our discussion. It is actually also a response to what Daniel proposed and what Fatimata mentioned, namely to expose all of the ALSs who will be present during the Wednesday meeting to what we have talked about, to what we have decided, and it's also a call for volunteers, for those who want to be involved in the discussion on the topics.
- MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Aziz. That's a very good suggestion, and it will be definitely useful to present the list of hot topics to the community in the common AFRALO. I think I will be happy to present that, and I guess everyone here, Daniel, Tijani, I'm sure, will be able to, as well, provide their feedback, and others, as well, in the working group, in the call, who will do that. Thank you. So, if there is no further comment here, I think I propose that we just present these hot topics to the AFRALO at the main call, and ask for volunteers at that time. Any further comments? OK, Silvia, please—you have your hand up.
- SILVIA VIVANCO: Mohamed, as you see, I posted on the chat, there is a wiki page where we have posted a link to the EURALO hot topics and the RALO hot topics, and there you will see what they have proposed, and for example, EURALO is currently working on a Google Doc, and they are commenting everything on the hot topics at the moment. So, that may be a good reference for you, and if I may suggest a methodology, I find
-



---

it very useful to put the document in a Google Doc format, so people can actually work and see it at the same time. So, I just put that on the link, so if you find it useful, you have that resource. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Silvia. That's great. Good to know. That's great. We can utilize the same approach for our case. We have ten minutes to the call. I just was curious about if there's anyone within the group who's interested to help in drafting the report, so at least maybe we can identify any volunteers within ourselves first, before going to AFRALO. Fatimata, OK?

INTERPRETER: I'm not hearing her. Let me check. This is the interpreter. I'm not hearing anything on French.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: OK, so that is fine. And I have Daniel. Daniel, please go ahead.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Drafting that report—yeah, wherever there's need. Thank you. Back to you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you. Thank you, Daniel, for volunteering to help in the report. I'm not sure if Fatimata's still muted, but I'm not sure if she wanted to speak now or not.

---

INTERPRETER: This is the interpreter. I'm still not hearing her on French. She's not responding.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: OK, no worries, so that's fine. I think the best now is to go through the action items from the call, so everyone is aware about the outcome of this call. We agreed that we're going to split the RDS and WHOIS and have a separate item, and there's an action on my side to try to merge diversity and participation with ICANN with ICANN general issues, awareness, and outreach. We agreed that you have reviewed, you have seen, the template of the report, specifically the part of the issues, the summary, and why the issues are important, and the action items, and it seems there's an agreement to use this format. We agreed, as well, to present the hot topics to AFRALO next conference call and ask for volunteers outside the working group to help drafting the report.

So, those are the main action items that we have agreed on, and we have volunteers identified, as well, from the call. We have Daniel, and we have Fatimata. And I can see Fatimata has nominated Tijani, so Tijani, if you are on the call, if there are no objections, you have to take it.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Mohamed, it is not that I want to object, or I don't want to participate or continue, but I'm afraid I will not have the bandwidth to do that, because I have a lot of things to do. And I do prefer that other people

---

engage and try to participate and do this. I am here. I may contribute. But I want it to be on another basis, on a basis that when it is necessary, when it is absolutely necessary—because I have really a lot of things to do, and I may not do the work as it must be done, and in a timely time. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Sure, thank you, Tijani, no worries. Before just concluding and closing the call, I'm not sure if Gabriel has anything to say. I have your name, and I'm not sure what that means. Are you objecting, or do you want to speak, Gabriel? OK.

GABRIEL BOMBAMBO: No, I don't need to speak, actually.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: OK, thank you very much, Gabriel. So, with that, I'd like to thank everyone. Thank you for the discussion and being practical and moving ahead with the items. And we have three minutes, but to save time, this time we'll finish early, three minutes before, and no overtime. Thank you very much, everyone. Have a good night, and I'll hope to see you on the AFRALO conference call. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed, and thank you all.

---

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Thank you very much.

INTERPRETER: Thank you. Bye.

YEŞİM NAZLAR: Thank you all. This meeting is now adjourned. Have a lovely rest of the day. Bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]