Brenda Brewer: (9/12/2017 07:35) Good day! Welcome to CCTRT Plenary Meeting #55 on 12 September 2017 @ 13:00 UTC.

Gaongalelwe Mosweu (PC): (08:01) hello everyone
Drew: (08:02) Maarten is having trouble logging in
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:04) Good Morning all
Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:04) We are waiting for one of our presenters to be able to join. We will begin shortly.

Brian Aitchison: (08:04) we're working with Maarten to get him on. Standby
Drew: (08:05) Maarten is rebootting
Drew: (08:05) rebooting
Drew: (08:05) he had the Adobe Connect app hanging issue
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:05) Thanks Jordyn. Typing sounds only explained! :-(
Drew: (08:06) I'm pretty sure he's a victim of DNS abuse ;-(
David Taylor: (08:06) I like the term rebootting!
Drew: (08:06) rebooting = to become a robot again
Waudo Siganga: (08:06) Hi. Just for info of MSSI team my meeting notification for this meeting had wrong local time; earlier by one hour
Waudo Siganga: (08:07) Am I really online?
Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:07) Yes, we are just waiting for one of the presenters to be able to join.
Gaongalelwe Mosweu (PC): (08:07) Yes Waudo it would seem so.
Waudo Siganga: (08:08) I do not see my messages when I type, can someone speak so I cross-check my connection?
Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: (08:08) Hi Waudo, and which timezone are you referring to?
Calvin Browne 2: (08:12) none here
Waudo Siganga: (08:13) Hi all. Im back online
Brenda Brewer: (08:13) scroll for all
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:14) I have the same question Waudo? Why the name change?
Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: (08:14) Maarten is in the adobe room now
Drew: (08:24) they're referring to total domain names, not zones
Drew: (08:25) Waudo - can you mute your mic?
Waudo Siganga: (08:27) thanks Drew - done it
Waudo Siganga: (08:28) I have unreliable link. Request callout +254xxxxxxxx
Brenda Brewer: (08:28) Yes, Waudo, please stand by
Waudo Siganga: (08:29) Thanks Brenda
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:30) Must look to ensure the reputation of legitimate services should be highlighted in the DNS Abuse paper
Calvin Browne 2: (08:32) these are all logarithmic
Calvin Browne 2: (08:32) aaah - i was just about to type what DT asked
David Taylor: (08:32) great minds
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:34) Slide said 10K
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:34) that is in the rate calculation!
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:38) Echo on Waudo's
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:38) Hard to hear
Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: (08:38) Waudo, we can't hear you properly
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:39) He's losing packets
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:41) Question: The nGTLDs without abuse, are there any common attributes?
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:45) Question: Did your dataset extend to identifying the registrars who predominate in registering these malicious domain names?
David Taylor: (08:47) @Carlton - We do have the registrars yes. You may recall my Gibraltar "its a rock" comment at our last F2F
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:48) @David: Yes indeed. I want to go further and see if the registration process/mechanism may be tagged
David Taylor: (08:48) like that
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:50) @Argument on DNSSEC VERY important!
David Taylor: (08:50) The DNSSEC point needs some discussion
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:50) The bad guy is "inside the fence" as it were!
David Taylor: (08:51) which undermines confidence
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:51) At least this is what I'm extracting from Maarten's
Calvin Browne 2: (08:51) like when spammers tagged on to spf records
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:51) @Calvin: Exactly!
Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:52) Well, DNSSEC is not supposed to prevent the owners of TLDs from doing bad things.
Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:52) Er, owner of domains.
Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:52) It's supposed to prevent non-owners of domains from pretending to be the owner.
Jordyn A Buchanan: (08:52) So you probably wouldn't expect it to have an effect on most of these abuse vectors.
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:53) @Jordyn: This indeed true. But as David say "confidence" is undermined. And ICANN spend A LOT of time and Treasure, especially in my region promoting DNSSEC.
Kaili Kan: (08:53) Sorry to be late. Just got out of another meeting.
Carlton SAMUELS: (08:57) @Type should link back to registration policies and/or registration process, no?
David Taylor: (08:59) I have a question on the slide before Privacy or Proxy if we can come back to it after the presentation please
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:08) Never mind carry on!
David Taylor: (09:08) ah that mute function.....
Gaongalelewe Mosweu (PC): (09:08) Is that Waudo?
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:09) @Gao: Yes it was. Private argument
Drew: (09:11) Waudo - can you mute your mic again?
Waudo Siganga: (09:11) haha Carlton, not really. People are leaving office here I thought someone had switched off the network. Apologies
Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:11) I think the interesting thing about this table is more the concentration in # of incidents rather than the percent
Waudo Siganga: (09:12) done it Drew
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:13) Question About overlaps in registrars for new and legacy abuse registrations. IS there any qualititative difference in appointment process?
Jean-Baptiste Deroulez 2: (09:15) Jordyn, there are also questions in the chat.
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:15) Interesting the time between registration and weaponizing. Is this related to any sunset period?
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:16) @Jean-Baptist: That last is a question
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:18) @David: Same question I would like explored
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:18) Can't hear a thing!!
David Taylor: (09:18) cant hear
Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:18) Waudo, we're getting lots of noise from your line.
Waudo Siganga: (09:19) Apologies again. By network disappears and when it comes back the mic is on by default
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:20) @David: See, the registration process could be a good variable for analysis
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:21) Yes, it makes sense! And a process for analysis.
Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:23) Laureen, my question is related to David's. Do you mind if I jump ahead of you in the queue (or is your question also related)?
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:23) @Maciej: Yes, that would be very interesting! See my previous question
Laureen Kapin: (09:23) Jordyn: no problem
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:24) David went off!
Laureen Kapin: (09:24) David: I can't hear you anymore.
Laureen Kapin: (09:25) @ David: could you draft language re: your recommendation and send to Drew?
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:25) @Maciej: It looks to me that there is some periodicity in the data. Which is why I asked about 'sunset' periods for domain sales.
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:26) 'sunset' + 'Promotional' periods
Carlton SAMUELS: (09:26) That + should be =
Brian Aitchison: (09:29) From observer John McCormac - HosterStats.com: "John McCormac - HosterStats.com: Also a domain name length spectrum graph would identify a lot of malicious registration activity."
David Taylor: (09:29) Im back. kicked off. The recommendation I would like is that which matches exactly the data that Maciej said they can run and get that registrat / registry comparison
Brian Aitchison: (09:29) John McCormac - HosterStats.com: (algorithmically generated registrations concentrate in specific domain lengths)

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:30) @Jordyn: Exactly!

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:34) @Maceij: Do you have a qualified set of data labels and definitions that you work from?

Brian Aitchison: (09:35) Time permitting, question from observer John McCormac - HosterStats.com: How deep were the web surveys in terms of page depth?

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:35) @Maciej: Yes.

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:35) @Maciej: Would you be willing to share with ICANN?

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:38) @Maciej: Would you also be willing to share your current data structure, including your perceptions of the gaps?

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:38) Two observations:

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:39) 1) The dip here isn't really a dip. It's just the end of a spike

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:39) 2) The privacy/proxy numbers are relative to the fraction of abusive domains.

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:39) @Maarten: I understand that the registration of the domain may not coincide directly to their use in malicious actions.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:40) 3) The privacy and proxy numbers are really teeny.

Brian Aitchison: (09:40) John McCormac - HosterStats.com: The July spike coincides with the XYZ 1 cent promotion - perhaps that's the reason?

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:40) Much lower than the overall fraction of domains using privacy and proxy.

Drew: (09:40) Thanks Jordyn - with those two specific factors you mention in mind, I'm wondering why the use of privacy/proxy went up despite the end of that spike

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:40) @Maarten: But may be correlated to some market activities, such as 'sunset periods, sales campaigns etc.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:41) It could be that the people in the summer weren't using privacy and proxy.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:42) So when they stopped their abuse spike, it stopped depressing the fraction of domains using P&P
Brian Aitchison: (09:43) John McCormac - HosterStats.com: XYZ had approximately 3.3 million new registrations in June 2016 alone.

David Taylor: (09:43) I guess in the summer people wear bathing suits so hide themselves a little less Jordyn :-)

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:43) John's theory makes sense--it would be interesting to see this graph broken out by TLD.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:44) It would be cool if we had all of these data sets in BigQuery or something so we could run quick queries on questions like this.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:46) I think the answer to John's questions is that there weren't web surveys--this data is all based on blacklist data not on proactive surveys.

Jamie Hedlund: (09:50) ICANN enforces against resellers through their registrars: 3.12 Obligations Related to Provision of Registrar Services by Third Parties. Registrar is responsible for the provision of Registrar Services for all Registered Names that Registrar sponsors being performed in compliance with this Agreement, regardless of whether the Registrar Services are provided by Registrar or a third party, including a Reseller. Registrar must enter into written agreements with all of its Resellers that enable Registrar to comply with and perform all of its obligations under this Agreement.

Drew: (09:51) yup - just no direct contract between a reseller and ICANN

Jamie Hedlund: (09:51) doesn't matter

Jamie Hedlund: (09:51) we get to reseller through RAA

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:51) @Jordyn: The reason I'm asking is that if the data structure + gaps is shareable then thats one way to reduce the length of time for ICANN to make a data structure fit to purpose. I firmly believe we already have the enforcement requirements in contract but we missing the reporting mechanisms and the curation process in place. It does not require a new policy!

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:52) Excellent presentation. Thanks guys.

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:55) @Drew: There are at least three (3) named categories of abuse referred in contract that are not considered 'technical'. I think for referential integrity these at least should be acknowledged.

Brian Aitchison: (09:55) have to log off folks for another call. thanks!

Carlton SAMUELS: (09:58) @Jordyn: Yes, thanks.
Waudo Siganga: (09:58) Sorry I have to leave now to attend to something..

Jamie Hedlund: (09:59) I remain concerned that the recommendations are not recs but mandates on the Board. The CCTRT lacks authority to prescribe board action but is empowered to make recommendations. The language should be modified to clarify that these are in fact recommendations for the board to consider rather than mandates.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (09:59) Jamie--we agreed to look at this issue holistically, but to do it prior to the final report.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (10:00) I think?

Laureen Kapin: (10:00) I have another meeting that I need to get to. However, I'm thinking we should pick up discussion of this draft in the sub team call tomorrow. We could also discuss INTA draft.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (10:00) Laureen, I'd suggest we maybe just do another plenary tomorrow.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (10:00) We don't have anything interesting to discuss on Competition.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (10:01) So all of the next step issues are on your side. :-)

Laureen Kapin: (10:01) That makes sense to me.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (10:01) Although I guess the calls are at different times.

Jamie Hedlund: (10:01) There are two issues - to whom to address the recs (which is what we agreed to punt) and the text of the recs themselves. Happy to defer on both.

Kaili Kan: (10:01) Regarding recommendation, as our time is up, I will send email instead.

Jordyn A Buchanan: (10:01) Thanks, Kaili.

Carlton SAMUELS: (10:01) I have to drop off now. Very interesting conversations today. Thanks all

Calvin Browne 2: (10:05) bye

David Taylor: (10:05) thanks Jordyn

Kaili Kan: (10:05) Bye!

Gaongalelwe Mosweu (PC): (10:05) bye