

Michelle DeSmyter:Dear All, Welcome to the Review of all Rights Protection Mechanisms (RPMs) Sub Team for Sunrise Registrations call on Friday, 19 May 2017 at 14:00 UTC.

Michelle DeSmyter:Meeting agenda page:

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_DxHfAw&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrw113mSV_zgfkbpSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWG1BLWwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=P9TNHib0rMuSdEgjNZ_lf4TecWw1Z_HrCwaI5Y_Brnr8&s=buoCo3_Tyce1ZUPfyFnT46N3sVV36FOvVRMDSxMsRUQ&e=

Mary Wong:Thanks for uploading the Google Doc - I had just PFD'd it!

Amr Elsadr::-)

Amr Elsadr:But like you said, it doesn't include Maxim's comments.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Hello All,

Matt Mlsna:Hello

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):As I understand it is possible to print comments usign

Griffin Barnett:Thanks Mary

Griffin Barnett:Sounds good

Matt Mlsna:Agreed

Amr Elsadr:@Maxim: If I'm not mistaken, the only possible action on comments is to resolve them, which would remove them entirely. In the future, we could paste them into the comments/discussion column?

Matt Mlsna:thanks :)

Jeff Neuman:Hello. I have to leave early (at half past) as well

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):please pring Google doc to PDF again an upload to Adobe

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*and

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I included comments into the last column

Amr Elsadr:Am doing that now, Maxim. See your comments in the columns.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):unfortunately, last call was done during the flight time from the GDD summit for many Registries.

Amr Elsadr:Action items, notes, recordings, transcripts, etc... from last week's call can be found here:

https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A_community.icann.org_x_Ow3fAw&d=DwICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrw113mSV_zgfkbpSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=8_WhWIPqsLT6TmF1Zmyci866vcPSF04VShFqESGe_5iHWG1BLWwwehFBfjrsjWv9&m=P9TNHib0rMuSdEgjNZ_lf4TecWw1Z_HrCwaI5Y_Brnr8&s=tit7d7Lvpa0V0KWqqhX_acgtfyZCt3ab5GkRj_-yqng&e=

Griffin Barnett:+1 Kristine, fine to leave this question in, and a-is

Griffin Barnett:*as-is

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Q1: as is

Matt Mlsna:Agree leave as-is

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I have a notice: Do we know if ICANN is have right to regulate prices?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*have the right

Griffin Barnett:I'm personally comfortable with the reformulated Q2

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I suggest we request the answer from ICANN Legal.

Amr Elsadr:I understood the question as Kristine does. I don't believe the intent was to recommend any pricing regulation via consensus policies.

Griffin Barnett:Agree again with Kristine on this

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):if ICANN does not have right to regulate prices, then any kind of policy related to price regulation can not be implemented.

Griffin Barnett:I think ICANN could regulate prices if policy recommendations demanded it - would require a change to the base RA presumably

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I think we need to report to our whole RPM PDP WG that we might need the answer to this question (we can not request as a subgroup)

Griffin Barnett:Doesn't ICANN regulate prices in legacy TLDs?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):only increase of prices

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):and old contracts are irrelevant to new RAs

Kathy Kleiman:Hi All!

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*irrelevant

Kathy Kleiman:Was a question dropped?

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):due to registries , as independent legal bodies are not responsible for actions of other non-affiliated legal bodies.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*independent

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):we might need to reword question Q2 (to show that was it a pricing or any other reason which prevented you from Sunrise registration?)

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):and we need to add " any additional reasons: please write more about it"

Griffin Barnett:Or perhaps we add a sub-question saying "Were there other registry practices other than pricing that chilled brand owner participation in Sunrise?" or something along those lines

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):@Griffin, we need to add open field , "or was it something else"? I do not think that everything was only due to registries policies.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):*happend this way

Griffin Barnett:Point taken
Amr Elsadr:I'm at Starbucks too. :-)
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):additional note about challenging "premium" status - it is written in RA that names reserved according to ICANNs inclusions to contracts (like ICANN reserved lists) and everything else it solely up to a registry.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):me too
Griffin Barnett:Very hard to understand Kathy...just me?
Matt Mlsna:cutting out for me as well
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):the sound is better now
Jeff Neuman:Kathy - what is the issue with the order?
Matt Mlsna:I have to drop now, but would support Griffin's proposed wording for a fourth bullet point on Question 2
Jeff Neuman:i have to drop
Amr Elsadr:@Kathy: Could you provide a suggested question to be added to cover the concerns you are raising?
Amr Elsadr:Correct.
Amr Elsadr:I believe this is the 4th version.
Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Amr....to be clear, the left column is directly from the charter, no changes?
Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:thanks
Amr Elsadr:@Kristine: Yes. The last table was a comparison between the last version and the updated one. Staff were then asked to revise the table to include the original Charter questions, and match them against the most recent refinements/batching.
Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Great, thanks. I thought so!
Griffin Barnett:I'm not sure "chiling effect" is the right terminology....the question is really getting at whether reserving names that match TMCH-recorded marks circumvents Sunrise when the reserved name is later released after Sunrise
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):Do we have supporting information to these allegations?
Griffin Barnett:Exactly right Kristine
Griffin Barnett:and also risking losing them to a third party when they should have had the opportunity to register them during Sunrise
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):are we still on Q2 or on Q3?
Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:new Q3
Griffin Barnett:Maxim, that's a fair enough point, but we might be getting ahead of ourselves. Seems like you are starting to respond to the Q, while we are still working to finalize the Q wording.
Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it is not APLs it is the single ALP .MADRID

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Agree with Maxim about the fact that putting some brands on a reserved list for registry operator reasons/plans is not always bad. I think a good WG discussion will include this.

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Agree with Mary...it's about the effect.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):all other GEOs decided to to risk

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):ith ALPs

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):police is a real example

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Griffin used a good word: circumvent.

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:.MADRID reserving POLICE for the actual police is not circumventing in my world.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):and according to local law they have this name

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):it is not about premium - it is about reserved

Griffin Barnett:No one is disagreeing that there may not be legitimate reasons for reserving certain names such that they are unavailable during Sunrise, but that's a discussion we can have at the appropriate time.

Griffin Barnett:Sorry that was a lot of double negatives

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:+1 Griffin

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):since reserved names + release+ QLPs are quite tied, these needs to be discussed together, to avoid destruction of current GEO model.

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Agree Maxim, that is one consideration. But the majority of TLDs are NOT Geos

Griffin Barnett:Agree it may make sense to bundle any questions relating to reserved names, premium names, pricing, and ALP/QLP together, as they are inter-related

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:So we need examples from both Geos and Non-Geos

Griffin Barnett:Agree Kristine. And we might ultimately decide to carve out Geos from any recommendations, or otherwise make recommendations that treat Geos differently than other TLD types

Griffin Barnett:But again, getting ahead of ourselves

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):GEOs represent quite big number of real people

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Completely agree...we just need to remember that there are a lot of models

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:I don't think brand owners think all the models are problematic.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):ROs are prohibited from TMCH access

Griffin Barnett:Ok again, that's a fine point, but that's getting into substantive responses to the Question. Can we try

and stay focused on agreeing to the wording of the Question itself?

Kathty:Back to the "chilling effect" of questions 2 and 3.

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Question 4 is a solution - if Question 3 is a problem.

Kathty:I think this will introduce a range of questions, definitional issues, etc.

Kathty:any objection to rewording??

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:I like Q6 moved to the top of the list.... at this point.

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Q5 is also a solution to Q3, if there is indeed a problem

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):I still do not understand how ROs will access TMCH with current prohibition of access to it

Griffin Barnett:It's a good point Kristine - reworded Q6 seems like it should be Q1 doesn't it

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Maxim, the group may decide to make the TMCH public still.... if not, then the WG will need to say "sorry, no can do."

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):agree

Griffin Barnett:Don't ROs have access, just limited to the specific purposes of facilitating TM Claims and SUNrise? Might need to go back and review the RA/TMCH T&C

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):then we need to add a note that since Registries do not have access to TMCH - then it is not simple

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):RO's are prohibited from access ... we had issues with simple "ping" of TMCH (to understand if it works or not at all)

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Maxim, it's our job as ROs to remind the group of that when we get there.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):ok

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):but adding notice will not allow us to forget about it

Amr Elsadr:@Kathy: That corresponds to the original Charter question 13 in the column on the far left.

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:Kathy, the point was to make the reworded questions more general...too specific points to suggesting the solution

Kathty:Can you circulate the current version and the last version? Mary and Amr?

Kathty:That will be helpful, tx.

Kathty:To the Notes, please add concern about phrasing, wording, need for balance, and consideration of TM owners, registries and registrants in the questions.

Maxim Alzoba (FAITID):bye all

Griffin Barnett:Thank you Mary, all....bye

Kristine Dorrain - Amazon Registry Services:great job pinch-hitting, Mary!

Amr Elsadr:Thanks all. Bye.