

Adobe Connect Chat_CCT-RT F2F Meeting at ICANN59 25 June 2017

----- (06/25/2017 00:05) -----

Pamela Smith: Hello, and welcome to the CCT RT meeting in Johannesburg. We are momentarily delayed because people are still arriving. Thank you for your patience.

----- (06/25/2017 00:10) -----

Pamela Smith: We are in session.

----- (06/25/2017 00:17) -----

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: Jonathan, just some half-remembered economic theory might provide a metric for consumer choice and trust in gTLD. The deletions should show trust by registration date. Doing some calculations on the databases here now.

----- (06/25/2017 00:32) -----

Carlos Gutierrez: On recommendation #1, I made emphasis during my very short comments about the fact that the proposal has elements of permanency and being an internal job instead of outside consultants.

Carlos Gutierrez: Sorry it did not come across as such

----- (06/25/2017 00:34) -----

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: Just on the data, it is better to have the data and not need it than need the data and not have it. When you have data, other possibilities and theories can be tested and some of them might provide excellent economic or technological metrics that were not thought of at the time of data collection.

----- (06/25/2017 00:35) -----

David Taylor: @John: A well made point.

----- (06/25/2017 00:36) -----

Carlos Gutierrez: so far we have made outside consultants a little richer, and there is no track record on the impact of prices the expansion has done. Hard to navigate in such an environment

----- (06/25/2017 00:41) -----

Jonathan Zuck: Agree Carlos

----- (06/25/2017 00:43) -----

Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: We are currently reviewing the input on page 7 of the document projected in the Adobe Room.

----- (06/25/2017 00:47) -----

Presentation: Drew Bagley is referring to page 9 of the document being displayed

Presentation: Correction: Page 10

Megan Richards: also agree with David re John's comment

----- (06/25/2017 00:50) -----

Jonathan Zuck: @John, agree completely with your point. I don't know if it would go over well with ICANN ORG because of cost, however. They view everything as zero sum

----- (06/25/2017 00:51) -----
Pamela Smith: Carlton Samuels is referring to page 11 of the document displayed.

----- (06/25/2017 00:53) -----
Pamela Smith: Laureen Kapin is referring to page 12 of the document displayed.

----- (06/25/2017 01:03) -----
Phil Buckingham: Do we have a link . The Subsequent Procedures WG WT2 (of which I am Co Chair) would be very interested in the same audit reports by Registry ..

----- (06/25/2017 01:07) -----
Pamela Smith: Waudu Siganga is referring to page 14 of the document being displayed

----- (06/25/2017 01:09) -----
Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: @Phil Buckingham, <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/audits-2012-02-25-en> is the main audit page with links to all the materials.

----- (06/25/2017 01:14) -----
Pamela Smith: David Taylor is also referring to content on page 14.

----- (06/25/2017 01:19) -----
John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>Measuring parking accurately is quite difficult and the CCT data is not good. It might not be possible for ICANN ORG to do this well.</comment>

Pamela Smith: We are taking a 10 minute break.
----- (06/25/2017 01:40) -----

Pamela Smith: We are back in session.
----- (06/25/2017 01:53) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: I'm here now, but my connection is not keeping up with the video so who knows how this will go

Pamela Smith: Hi, Jordyn, and welcome.

Jordyn A Buchanan: I missed the previous conversation, but roughly agree with Calvin and Carlton about incorporating by reference

Calvin Browne: Hi Jordyn! welcome back.
----- (06/25/2017 02:00) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: It may be helpful to try this a couple of ways with one or two recommendation and see how we like the result.

Jordyn A Buchanan: This discussion is a bit too abstract to get a good handle on how any of the approaches may actually work.
----- (06/25/2017 02:04) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: By abstract I mean that it's hard to really get a feel for what the results will look like.
----- (06/25/2017 02:06) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Drew's approach sounds appealing to me, but will the comment breakdown actually lend itself well to being easily summarized?

Jordyn A Buchanan: I think I need to call a phone number to talk

Carlos Gutierrez: Clarification, by Footnotes to each recommenadtion, I think endnotes are as well appropriate, based on the monster spreadsheet

Pamela Smith: Yes, you do, Jordyn. Shall I text that info to you?

Pamela Smith: I sent it via email but happy to resend.

Jordyn A Buchanan: I need to get to a more stable location for that

----- (06/25/2017 02:09) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: I should be able to dial in in maybe 20 minutes

Pamela Smith: OK. I texted you the info for convenience. We will be happy to hear from you when you are able.

----- (06/25/2017 02:24) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: yeah, 10 minutes

----- (06/25/2017 02:27) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Where do we recommend that a PDPengage in data gathering?

----- (06/25/2017 02:30) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: I'm going to try to dial in. Be right back.

Jordyn A Buchanan: Agree with Eleeza. we should clarify that

----- (06/25/2017 02:36) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Hopefully I'm on.

Jordyn A Buchanan: Well, I'm on. Hopefully you can hear me.

----- (06/25/2017 03:30) -----

Pamela Smith: We will break for lunch for 45 minutes, reconvening at 13:15.

----- (06/25/2017 04:19) -----

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: Jonathan, that deletion registration age as a metric seems to be working out well. Basically by checking the age of dropped domains, it is possible to see which are 1Y, 2Y etc regs being dropped. If 2Y drops exceed 1Ys, then it could be a sign of loss of consumer confidence in the TLD.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: Running it on all new gTLDs and AMBIONIC legacy TLDs now.

----- (06/25/2017 04:31) -----

Pamela Smith: We are waiting for a few stragglers to return. We will start momentarily.

----- (06/25/2017 04:38) -----

Pamela Smith: We are back in session.

Jordyn A Buchanan: I still don't have audio.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: ditto

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: audio now

Pamela Smith: Great. Thank you, John.

----- (06/25/2017 04:42) -----
John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>It might be better for ICANN to monitor renewal by domain name internally. It already has much of the data.</comment>

----- (06/25/2017 04:46) -----
John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>Domains without content delete at a higher rate than domains with content.. The December 2016 domains don't renew/delete until Dec 2017-Mar2018 so comparing the 2015 regs against this set is misleading .

Jordyn A Buchanan: Yeah, I'm happy to incorporate any findings around abuse.

Jordyn A Buchanan: This may imply that this paper belongs somewhere else in the report.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>parking by registrars can be misleading too as a lot of retail registrations may be parked and the size of some registrars, like Godaddy, will skew the results.</comment>

----- (06/25/2017 04:50) -----
John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>A lot of DNS abuse connections with parking may be false positives because parking is automatic for a lot of registrars.</comment>

----- (06/25/2017 04:54) -----
Jordyn A Buchanan: Yeah, I think we need to understand the DNS Abuse correlation a bit better.

----- (06/25/2017 04:55) -----
John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>Spam e-mail domains don't need active websites. This is where one of the false positives may emerge.</comment>

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>The spam dom is often a throwaway domain.</comment>

----- (06/25/2017 05:02) -----
Jordyn A Buchanan: Did Nanjing have any affiliates who are also contracted parties?

Jordyn A Buchanan: I guess the review will find the answer to that.

----- (06/25/2017 05:20) -----
Jonathan Zuck: good point

----- (06/25/2017 05:27) -----
Jordyn A Buchanan: I think the difference is not that it's not "in scope", just that there's not a presumption that it's abuse like malware.

Jordyn A Buchanan: The complainant would have to justify why they think it's abuse.

----- (06/25/2017 05:28) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: This conversation actually reflects why spam isn't listed, I think: it's not as clear-cut that it's inherently "abuse" as the others.

----- (06/25/2017 05:30) -----

Jonathan Zuck: Yes. There might still be a trust implication and there is certainly an operational effect

----- (06/25/2017 05:53) -----

Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: Jordyn, we informed Jonathan your hand is raised.

----- (06/25/2017 05:54) -----

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: <comment>It isn't necessarily impossible to collect retail pricing.. There are scripts available for this kind of thing. Registry data is a completely different issue because some registries depend on pricing deals with their registrars to maintain registration volume.</comment>

----- (06/25/2017 06:03) -----

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: It is possible to reconstruct registrars offer spikes from ICANN registry reports. This could link retail with registry-registrar deals.

----- (06/25/2017 06:08) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Just to circle back to pricing for a second: I don't think we need to know wholesale prices to figure out whether the introduction of new gTLDs has increased registry competition. Improving wholesale competition should hopefully result in better prices to consumers and be visible in retail price analysis.

----- (06/25/2017 06:09) -----

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: It might also be possible to guesstimate wholesale prices from the prices that registrars charge their resellers.

----- (06/25/2017 06:12) -----

Jonathan Zuck: Jordyn, that seems like an assumption based on a direct link between wholesale and retail prices which hasn't seemed to be the case, no?

----- (06/25/2017 06:16) -----

Pamela Smith: We are on a 15 minute break.

----- (06/25/2017 06:39) -----

Pamela Smith: We have returned.

----- (06/25/2017 06:50) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Supplement to the Preliminary Report

----- (06/25/2017 07:00) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: It's just shifting work around because we'll have to read a bunch of stuff on the old content.

Jordyn A Buchanan: Once people ignore our instructions, which they will.

----- (06/25/2017 07:03) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Jonathan's last suggestion will be SUPER confusing.

Jordyn A Buchanan: Since we'll want comments on some of the redline but not on others.

----- (06/25/2017 07:06) -----

Laureen Kapin: +1 Jordyn, hybrid approach would be very confusing.

Alice Jansen: I don't think you can publish new recs on a "stand alone basis" - If you publish new recommendations, you will need to publish findings that underpin your recs.

----- (06/25/2017 07:13) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Yeah, Alice not suggesting just publishing new recommednations--it would be new text that is derived from the new information, including any changes to recommendations.

----- (06/25/2017 07:17) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Makes sense to me!

----- (06/25/2017 07:18) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: +1 Jonathan

Jordyn A Buchanan: We just want to understand the data.

----- (06/25/2017 07:20) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Hmm.

Jordyn A Buchanan: My audio died?

Jordyn A Buchanan: Oh, maybe I got disconnected.

Jordyn A Buchanan: But I am not getting anything through Adobe either.

John McCormac - HosterStats.com: audio fine here

Jordyn A Buchanan: Okay.

Jordyn A Buchanan: I have fixed it.

----- (06/25/2017 07:24) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: I still like Jonathan's approach.

Jordyn A Buchanan: Maybe we can pull together the subteam that wants to work on the INTA report this week to get started on that?

----- (06/25/2017 07:42) -----

Eleeza Agopian: I think David is working on that now with Lori.

Eleeza Agopian: of INTA.

----- (06/25/2017 07:44) -----

Jordyn A Buchanan: Well, I'm suggesting that the folks on our side who want to look at the INTA study huddle in person to figure out what we want to do with it.

Jordyn A Buchanan: And then in parallel work on settin gup a meeting with INTA.

Eleeza Agopian: I see.