[CROSSTALK]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Susie is trying to see if the technology, so – okay? So, as soon as [inaudible] the roll call.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Welcome to the NARALO General Assembly 2017. The time is 12:37. I will read out your names out loud. If you could please say "present" and I will say "present" on your behalf. Dana Perry. Present. Judith Hellerstein. Present. Evan Leibovitch.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Thomas Lowenhaupt.

THOMAS LOWENHAUPT: Here.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Howard Deane.

HOWARD DEANE: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Glenn McKnight. Present. Scott Sullivan. Present. Yubelkys Montalvo Carrión. Present. Seth Reiss. Present. Mike Schoenecker. Shelley Robinson.

SHELLEY ROBINSON: I'm here.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. John More.

JOHN MORE: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Avri Doria. Present. Louis Houle.

LOUIS HOULE: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Eduardo Diaz.

EDUARDO DIAZ: [inaudible]

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Leah Symekher. Present. Garth Bruen. Present. Matthew Rantanen. Present. Allan Skuce.

ALLAN SKUCE: Yup.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Marita Moll.

MARITA MOLL: Here.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Alan Greenberg.

ALAN GREENBERG: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present.

ALAN GREENBERG: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: William Cunningham.

WILLIAM CUNNINGHAM: I'm here.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. John Laprise.

JOHN LAPRISE: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. Javier Rúa. Present. Joshua Price.

JOSHUA PRICE: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: Present.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Present. We are also having [inaudible] the –

ALFREDO CALDERÓN: I can't go on here.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Alfredo Calderón?

ALFREDO CALDERÓN: Yes.

SILVIA VIVANCO: [inaudible]? Jason Hynds?

JASON HYNDS: Yes.

SILVIA VIVANCO: José de la Cruz? Nancy [inaudible]? And we are – we also have, from ICANN Staff, Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, [CROSSTALK] – Heidi Ullrich, Silvia Vivanco, Lucy Johnson, Christopher Mondini, [CROSSTALK], Ron da Silva, and Joe Catapano. And Adiel Akplogan. Did I miss anyone else?

UNKNOWN: We're all good. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you so much, Silvia.   Just one short, quick, housekeeping announcement. Please use your mics on your computers because this is

being recorded. [inaudible] we have a very short agenda today. Judith, would you mind coming up and talking about the NARALO ALAC [inaudible]?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: [inaudible] my [inaudible]?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: No, [inaudible].

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay, [inaudible] now you can hear me. Okay, so we touched on the elections a little bit earlier. NARALO has a thirty-day nomination period, and to make it in time for the election cycle that is happening in May, we are announcing the – opening up the nomination period today. And then, the positions – each of you has a page that updates open positions. We have four open positions. So, we have NARALO Chair – that's currently occupied by Glenn McKnight. His term ends by the end of the 2017 annual general meeting, and the next term starts immediately afterward. So, Glenn is not [inaudible]. So, if he wants to, he can run again as Chair. And then, the next position is the NARALO Secretary, which is held by me. The terms are the same; it ends at the annual general meeting, and [inaudible] afterwards; the secretary is not term-limited and can be run again. Next, we have one spot on the ALAC that is open. It's being held by [inaudible] although there is a little slight mistake on it – this page – he is not – he has only done one term, so if he chooses, he can run again as an ALAC. The last position is for

NomCom representative; that's currently being held by Eduardo. Eduardo is [inaudible], so he cannot run again. The last ALAC [inaudible] it was a two-year term, and that's expiring next year, so that slot is not open. And that is the elections that are open. Nominations period is on the website. You nominate someone, and then [inaudible] posted as who supports the nomination, and whether the nomination is accepted; and then, the nominee has to put in a Statement of Interest, as well as a several-paragraph description of why they are running for the [inaudible] and how they think people – why they think people should vote for them. We will then have a meet-the-candidates call, and at the meet-the-candidates call, you can talk to the them, you can talk to the [inaudible] positions of the candidates. If there are no – if there's only one person nominated to every position, we will likely ask for [inaudible] consensus on a special meeting. If there are more than one candidate that is running for a particular office, we will hold elections, and they will be held according to the timeline with the [inaudible] – I can't see it. And that, it will be on May 13 – is that what we're saying? And so, that is the schedule on that. If there are any questions, I can take a quick question now, or we're going to move on to the next topic. Any questions? No questions. So, we'll go on to the Rules of Procedure.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, so I'd like to ask John to come up. Everyone should have a document of the last draft, and John's going to walk us through the [inaudible].

JOHN MORE:
[inaudible] whether I was going to walk through [inaudible] – I don't know whether I was going to walk through the individual – this is John More, the leader of the Working Group on Rules of Procedure.

So, one of the things that I first want to say is that there is a Working Group, but when I looked at what we had [inaudible], I thought it best to create a careful, cleaned-up document that the Working Group could really be engaged in. We already have had a first [inaudible] from Alan Greenberg, extremely helpful [inaudible] in on all the finer definitions of things, and he also [inaudible] group of comments and questions about what should be in the Rules of Procedure.

So, my general approach is to create something that is fairly clear – hopefully not in too much legalese, easily translatable into our other languages, and basically, a document that allows us to get on with the real purpose that we have, which is the engagement and creation of information and recommendations to [inaudible]. So, there are specific areas of importance that people should look at.

First is the voting. We have a general approach that the NARALO has used, and I think it's linked to a quality and how people in NARALO and the groups of NARALO and – how we've worked together cooperatively. I don't believe we really need a complicated procedure, but voting, at least for the positions we have to vote for, needs to be clear – and, again, I think there are going to be squeaks, but what we have been doing has worked as a general [inaudible], so I didn't say we change it just to make it [inaudible]. That doesn't mean it's not open to comment and change. Any [inaudible].

Another area of potential interest is the officers. What duties should we prescribe for them? [inaudible] open? I think I've gotten one correction [inaudible] already, and that is, the Chair of the NARALO is not necessarily the Chair of the General Assembly, and that is [inaudible] maybe there's an issue there. But one of the questions is, if the Chair is not available, is there a way to have an Acting Chair, or if for some reason, the Chair [inaudible], what's the procedure for having someone in the interim until the next full election [inaudible]? So, that's a relevant issue that it would be helpful to have comments on.

The other clear thing that comes up in many conversations and also has [inaudible] core of NARALO, and that is the qualifications [inaudible] of the ALSes and of the unaffiliated members. What are the [inaudible], what are the procedures for determining that? So, one of the things that's clear to me in my experience [inaudible] with NARALO is that we don't want to create blocks; we want to create a pairability and the ability for NARALO to know that the ALSes actually operate. So, the whole purpose is to actually try to [inaudible] in that context, the question of voting representatives, and representative of the ALSes, I think needs to be fairly open about what that's done [inaudible] proxy [inaudible] having alternate voting representatives. I'm open to suggestions on that.

The other issue is subject to the ALSes [inaudible] not necessarily fully engaged in a particular set of topics [inaudible] how do we make sure that they haven't just disappeared in a complete ghost ALS. So, that's another thing that I think comments and recommendations on that will be extremely important.

The other one that comes up is the removal of an ALS. What are the circumstances where that should occur? Now, remember, the NARALO cannot [inaudible] of an ALS; it has to be a recommendation [inaudible] the ALAC requesting that the ALS be decertified. So, that's the other [inaudible]. Finally, I think any suggestions, whether it's in the principles are elsewhere that would encourage [inaudible] ALSes and the unaffiliated members, anything that could add to that pairability that the NARALO is operating [inaudible]. I think that [inaudible].

So, the document now [inaudible] and that's going to be open to the Working Group and anyone else who wants to have an input into it. But the purpose is to keep it very straightforward, and in [inaudible] language. Thank you. So, I'm open to questions and comments.

ALAN GREENBERG: Alan Greenberg speaking. I've got a couple of things that I'd like to mention, that as I was going through it, I found either anomalies or things that really, I don't think a single person should decide [inaudible]. One of the things – perhaps just – maybe it's trivial, maybe it isn't. We use the term "general assembly" in two different ways. This meeting here [inaudible] the general assembly. The Rules of Procedure also use the "general assembly" as the group of voting people, voting entities. And I think we use enough terms in ICANN multiple ways that we don't need to add [inaudible].   And I would change some other terms [inaudible] membership [inaudible] to use the term general.

UNKNOWN: [CROSSTALK]

ALAN GREENBERG: I'm sorry, we need [CROSSTALK] – [inaudible] suggested that we change it to something like "regional assembly" [CROSSTALK]. In fact, I think [inaudible] there's at least been an attempt to make sure that the "general assembly" only refers to this and not the voting membership. I had it the other way, but [inaudible] continue [inaudible] clean up [CROSSTALK].

The second thing is voting. We've always had a problem with what happens to people [inaudible] vote, and we right now in NARALO have only asked for a representative. The ALAC [inaudible] that to require at least a second representative fallback, and perhaps two. I am going to suggest to NARALO that if the first person does not vote within the first five days, that we automatically send a ballot to the default next person. In addition to that – and we can talk more about it – we don't have a process right now for reassigning it if that person really disappears, and therefore [inaudible] no votes. So, that's something to talk about online. I hope we've reached [inaudible]. Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: This is Judith Hellerstein – [CROSSTALK]

ALAN GREENBERG: [inaudible]

EN

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:	I think what we should do – an easier way of getting around that is that what we've done now in NARALO is, [inaudible] notifies us if we didn't reach quorum with the [inaudible]. And so, some of them don't have the ballot, some of them don't know; or [inaudible] contacting them, and we always have on the list the second call to [inaudible] that the ALS has given us. And so, we contact [inaudible] and oftentimes they've said, "Oh, I didn't get it. Can you resend it?" And then they get it. Or they say, "Oh, no, we switched. Only one of us [inaudible] vote on that." And [inaudible]. So, I don't think giving five days for them to vote is [inaudible]. We leave that to them, and then we can contact them if they didn't get it. Because sometimes what happens is that the ALSes have told us, they are cognizant of the timeline, but they are waiting for a vote from their Board, because they are giving their members an opportunity to make a selection and to discuss this, and we want to give them that chance.
ALAN GREENBERG:	I don't think we really need to give them [inaudible] – the issue right now, if I may, is giving it to the second – to the ultimate is not within our rules. And I'm suggesting that we put this in our rules, that it can be [inaudible].
JOHN MORE:	This is John More. I agree that this provision is necessary to make sure that there is [inaudible]. I strongly believe that the communications out to the voting representatives [inaudible]. I personally don't like the idea of an automatic [inaudible].

EN

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, I don't like that.

UNKNOWN: I thought of – this is [inaudible], for the record – I agree with John and slightly disagree with Alan in the sense that [inaudible] send the information about the votes to all the contacts, it has to be the decision of the ALS who their representative is going to be. It can't be just an automatic default decision [inaudible]. That still has to be an internal decision of the ALS, in my opinion.

ALAN GREENBERG: The main point that I was making was, we should have our provision that [inaudible] the ultimate or ultimates are allowed to vote. Right now, they are not. The other thing that was in the draft rules was that the recommendation of removal of an ALS would [inaudible] serve as the [inaudible] ALSes. This has been a leadership decision until now, and I would strongly suggest that it be maintained that way. It becomes very sensitive to be in a position where you are evicting your friends. And although removal should be for a documented reason, I don't believe that it should be overrideable, because no one wants to [inaudible] the last [inaudible]. Just a thought.

SHELLEY SULLIVAN: So – oh, sorry, this is Shelley, representing [inaudible]. I think any point can be said about leadership [inaudible] make things awkward when [inaudible] ultimate responsibility [inaudible] personal relationship with

these people, and [inaudible] just say either way, and I think ALSes should hold each other accountable. And then, [inaudible] I'm trying to [inaudible] also the [inaudible]. You can have provisions where somebody can automatically [inaudible] number of meetings, and [inaudible]. So, then, it's nobody's decision [inaudible].

ALAN GREENBERG: In any case, it's ultimately the ALAC's decision, based on rationale provided by the leadership to the ALAC. But that's [inaudible] we can't change. And [inaudible] introduce a vote – I think it messes up the process because, among other things, if you have a vote [inaudible] secret ballot, as we normally do when [inaudible] people [inaudible], if we are then asked to justify after the fact why we removed [inaudible] they voted that way – you don't know why they voted. That takes away our ability to explain why it happened, and that's a legal issue.

JOHN MORE: So – this is John More again – so, my experience on having set up various [inaudible] membership is called upon to be responsible, which included for the chapters of the Internet society, but also [inaudible]. One of the things that I think members want to know is that they have some protections, and it's not just a decision by a small group. And at the end of the day, reasons have to be given for the vote, but the vote is the one [inaudible] protection [inaudible] responsibility. So, that's what I will argue. Now, I am not making decisions that will go into the document for everyone to see, so people can see which way they think they go. But my experience is that what this is, is actually for the ALS.

EN

We also have provided in there an opportunity for any ALS to come in and argue on the basis, even if it's late in the game to come in and argue [inaudible]. And I also believe that [inaudible] where the NARALO goes [inaudible] having people within the organization [inaudible] communications will be. But I [inaudible] put it in with the other comments, so we will be able to look at that. Thank you.

UNKONWN: [inaudible], John.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, so this is great. So, thanks again, and this is not complete. John will set up the time for another conference call for [inaudible] and if anyone wants to join the review committee, we'll welcome you to join, as well. Okay, we have another housekeeping duty. We need [inaudible] pick it up [inaudible] other room, and take a group picture, then we can reconvene and go on to the next [inaudible]. So, if we can just all pop in the other room, and [inaudible].

[CROSSTALK]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, we're getting down to the [inaudible] leg of our [inaudible] back from each of the breakout groups, so we'll just identify the four groups – who is going to be speaking for your group?

Okay, [inaudible] just waiting for everyone to sit down. Leah just mentioned [inaudible] make sure that there are [inaudible] that she has.

And in fact, we'll minimize this again so that people can see where that link is.

Okay, just waiting for everybody to come back in. Is anyone [inaudible]? Okay, so who would like to step up first? Okay, the Strategy Group – and I'll [inaudible] playing over there. So, you two guys want to come up and go over your flowcharts and tell us about your notes on the meeting? [CROSSTALK] [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: First thing when we started the meeting [inaudible] I mean, we had to straighten up a couple of things. [inaudible] talking about [inaudible]. And afterwards, it was kind of like a [inaudible]. So, this is why I wrote it on the slide to the left. I [inaudible]. So, seriously, the overall strategy [inaudible] the survey [inaudible]. And some of the considerations like how to get involvement going, how [inaudible] users and their rights, and their business. So, some [inaudible] that we had to take to analyze in our strategy. We [inaudible] and showed the [inaudible] simple message that needs to be used to outreach, because we are speaking ICANNish, and the structure is very complicated, so it's difficult to raise any interest for newcomers. We've been suggesting that maybe using the [inaudible] strategy [inaudible] radio, that kind of [inaudible] would be appropriate. We've been mentioning that we need [inaudible] for policy, [inaudible] about that project, which is very [CROSSTALK] – yes.

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] pretty much is that [inaudible] looking to have [inaudible] one of the [inaudible], but so we can learn from them how they run that event, and that we can do the same.

UNKNOWN: So, [inaudible] best practices from RALOs or any other organizations, chapters, and so forth. So – yeah.

UNKNOWN: Metrics.

UNKNOWN: Metrics, and [inaudible]. Okay. So, [inaudible], do you want to keep [inaudible] strategy?

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] strategies pretty much to improve communication [inaudible] radio was recommended. [inaudible] connection, better communication and connection between NARALO and ICANN with the [inaudible] Groups and NARALO and Working Groups at ICANN [inaudible] how to [inaudible]. NARALO [inaudible] be able to make that [inaudible] with the ALSes and NARALO and ICANN. [inaudible] to the Rapporteurs [inaudible] be more efficient [inaudible]. [inaudible] the issues, identify [inaudible] the issues [inaudible] for NARALO, and [inaudible] be able to [inaudible] unaffiliated members and be able to [inaudible] their contribution. I think that's all we came up with. [inaudible], are you happy with that?

UNKNOWN: I'm so sorry, [inaudible] the main issue is that we would like to [inaudible] a [inaudible] something that's useful –

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: [inaudible] It's Judith. We also talked about that NARALO may want to look at [inaudible] old policy statements [inaudible] LACRALO does, and [inaudible].   And I know that we have never done that, [inaudible] joined in the ALAC [inaudible] in the NARALO [inaudible], so [inaudible] looking at [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: Any questions, or [inaudible]?[CROSSTALK]

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] next group. Can you just [inaudible]?

UNKNOWN: Yeah.

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] identify key elements in a NARALO strategy.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, great. So, I did [inaudible]. So, Alfredo [inaudible]. He's going to be leading the Review Group and [inaudible] with a [inaudible] for

[inaudible] plan, so anyone who wants to be part of this Working Group, please [inaudible] Alfredo.

ALFREDO CALDERÓN: Yes, in the coming weeks we're going to be announcing the strategy for [inaudible] to implement this, so anybody that is interested, you can contact me through Glenn so we can working on that. Great. Just note that [inaudible] strategic planning processes organization.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, thank you. [inaudible] round of applause for [inaudible].

Okay, Evan and Garth, their [inaudible] group is called "Ensuring End User Accountability through Effective Policy and Process." [inaudible]?

Okay, [inaudible] Garth Bruen.

UNKNOWN: This is [inaudible]. So, we're using one example to talk about ways in which ICANN can [inaudible]its ability to deliver accountability to the consumers. And we look at one [inaudible] case – we've been working on it for a while – to demonstrate how ICANN's compliance [inaudible], and that sites that are potentially violating the law and potentially violating ICANN's procedures can actually [inaudible] and never really get shut down. There are actually a number of [inaudible] about how we can afford to address this. We need to collect some more data, and I think that's something that can be done. Does anybody who was in

the group want to talk about any of the suggestions that came up [inaudible]? Yes.

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: This is Evan. Just to add a little bit [inaudible] what the other [inaudible] comments. [inaudible] was in the room with us, so we were talking a little bit about the challenges of actually executing this. [inaudible] policy, some is process. Things are falling through the cracks, and so, part of our challenge is even knowing what to be able to do. ALAC has the ability to create [inaudible], but we can't just do it for a single instance. We have to [inaudible] compelling problem to be able to put forward, but once we have that, there are supposedly processes in place that will allow us to be able to do it. It's just been a slow, [inaudible] process. [inaudible] point that [inaudible] system that [inaudible] monitored and used for the first step. Now, we need to make use of [inaudible] and try to move forward [inaudible] happening, and how we can [inaudible] to fix that abuse as an end user issue.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Anyone have any questions for Garth or Evan?

Great. Thank you; let's give them a round of applause. I'd like to go back to John Laprise's group with Eduardo, the first breakout group – "Identifying NARALO's Hot Policy Topics and their Potential Impact on End Users." Thank you.

UNKNOWN: [inaudible]

EN

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] next group [inaudible]. One of the hot topics is clarity, which [inaudible] as by, for example, the [inaudible] information [inaudible]. [inaudible], we're up.

UNKNOWN: I can [inaudible] was, you know, [inaudible] implementation, but [inaudible] –

UNKNOWN: And trust [inaudible] both ways [inaudible] greater trust, or what ICANN brings to the trust people [inaudible] more generally. So, it [inaudible] ICANN and trust [inaudible] two [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: So, we went into the [inaudible] EURALO's relationship [inaudible] end users, and we are [inaudible] users.

UNKNOWN: Yeah, and the recognition that the interests of NARALO may overlap, but the concerns of other RALOs may [inaudible] global reason [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: So [inaudible] we are talking about the [inaudible]. [inaudible] like a [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: Yes, commercial surveillance [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] censorship and [inaudible]. [inaudible] outreach [inaudible] hot topics. [inaudible] and to be able to [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: And [inaudible] ignorance is really important, because ignorance [inaudible] we're trying to pass down the [inaudible] most directly building capacity and lowering [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] in society.

UNKNOWN: There [inaudible] examples of what it means, what the difference is between [inaudible] what [inaudible] are open [inaudible] and then [inaudible] is growing greater [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: And [inaudible] we are talking about [inaudible] users [inaudible] information, it lowers opportunities [inaudible] strategy and [inaudible] community.

EN

UNKNOWN: And [inaudible] the last [inaudible] survey. But that still leaves 20% of U.S. [inaudible] without [inaudible] and that's important [inaudible] serve communities [inaudible]

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] and that is Internet access [inaudible] right, [inaudible]?

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] impact [inaudible] instruction, clarity, views from [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: Yeah, I mean, if you look across [inaudible] certain [inaudible]. So, I mean, that's sort of – if you want to distill a couple of key topics across the specific topic [inaudible] that's what [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: So, [inaudible] next [inaudible]. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. Two questions. First of all, on privacy [inaudible], you mentioned – is that absolute for everyone, or for users?

UNKNOWN: In which sense [inaudible]?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: If someone's taking my money, should I be able to find out who they are?

UNKNOWN: [inaudible]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: So, it's individuals you're looking for, not necessarily commercial [CROSSTALK] big difference. And number two, you mentioned things like privacy [inaudible] that temptation, but in general, surveillance, net neutrality, universal access to the Internet, [inaudible] and ICANN? I understand why [inaudible] be interested in [inaudible], but is that [inaudible] interest [inaudible] ICANN, [inaudible], or not?

UNKNOWN: That's [inaudible] question [inaudible], because [inaudible] we were looking at – for hot topics for NARALO members, and there were [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. [inaudible] Javier [CROSSTALK]

JAVIER RÚA: When that was discussed, it was early in the [inaudible]. Given the lack of knowledge out there, people think that ICANN does everything. So, when you do outreach [inaudible], you will touch upon some of these

EN

[inaudible] people [inaudible] ICANN. But, you know, it is a hot topic because people constantly ask [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: I [inaudible]. I don't think anybody likes being called [inaudible]. So [inaudible], because lots of people want to increase and improve, but nobody wants to [inaudible].

[CROSSTALK]

UNKNOWN: Can we say "increasing knowledge?"

UNKNOWN: Sure.

UNKNOWN: "Increase awareness."

UNKNOWN: "Awareness" [CROSSTALK]

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] awareness [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: We have time for one more comment or question before we move on. Thank you. Okay, no one else? Thank you so much.

I have to really [inaudible] on how much you guys got done in such a very short time, but I think you guys should be talk hoe showsts [sic] [CROSSTALK]

UNKNOWN: Talk show hosts.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I'm not sure [CROSSTALK]

Okay. [CROSSTALK]. Okay, I just want to [inaudible] Heidi was just saying – go ahead, Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah, so basically, this is really critical, this society. But I was wondering if [inaudible] top ten [inaudible] topics [inaudible] impact on [inaudible] futures. Then [inaudible] outreach, talk about what NARALO does, and drive people to [inaudible] continue [inaudible] that policy [inaudible]. [inaudible] you and [inaudible] could lead an internal group [inaudible] NARALO and [inaudible] can use that [inaudible] to help [inaudible] understandable.

[CROSSTALK]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: [inaudible] what Heidi said and what Alan said, it's [inaudible] one step further [inaudible] and [inaudible] was mentioned earlier, when you're [inaudible] with somebody new, [inaudible]. Great, thank you. Just for [inaudible] Working Group as sessions [inaudible], and they're always looking for topics [inaudible].

Okay [inaudible] next group, and I'll just read it out, is "[inaudible] Solution Circle" [inaudible] listen to the [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] questions [inaudible] barriers, and then [inaudible] initial solution. The first one was [inaudible] barriers [inaudible] participation [inaudible] there was a view [inaudible] they were misled to their solution that was [inaudible] this one was that [inaudible] signed up [inaudible] why you signed up, and [inaudible] make sure that the agreement was [inaudible] understanding. [inaudible]

The next barrier was that ALS [inaudible] that they have [inaudible] was that [inaudible] leadership [inaudible] degree of hostility and a lack of respect [inaudible] and [inaudible] suggested was to [inaudible] initially go to [inaudible] to have a formal discussion and [inaudible].

The next one [inaudible]. [inaudible] technology [inaudible] far away was that people online can't hear [inaudible] hold the mic closer to your mouth [inaudible]. And some [inaudible] new technologies [inaudible] adherence to [inaudible] in some cases where [inaudible] some people on the call [inaudible].

Next point was around difficulty with time zones. One person indicated that [inaudible] pm Eastern [inaudible]. One option was to get [inaudible] around it. I know [inaudible] change the [inaudible] that was one of the discussions in the [inaudible] included. Another suggestion was [inaudible] for some of the issues [inaudible] on issues of [inaudible] online [inaudible] with the [inaudible]. The other suggestion was a strict adherence to the "never make a decision as [inaudible]" [inaudible] very strict adherence to that [inaudible] make sure that [inaudible] online [inaudible] listen to it at night [inaudible] be able to participate in the ultimate decision.

The next one was [inaudible] indicated [inaudible] implemented [inaudible] that person [inaudible] suggested that it's very difficult and frustrating to deal with [inaudible] new type of [inaudible] and [inaudible] how [inaudible] business NGOs, communities [inaudible] other ways [inaudible]. The other comment was [inaudible] split up the [inaudible] non-structural. Another [inaudible] was [inaudible] how big [inaudible] understand your point of view [inaudible] bring it to the meeting. The one thing I will mention is, I was shocked at how effective this was. [inaudible]. But at the end of it, I was stunned at how much we got [inaudible] initially [inaudible] might be a better word. Because I was very, very impressed. [inaudible] issues around [inaudible] participation [inaudible], [inaudible] it's like [inaudible] approaching iceberg on the Titanic [inaudible] it doesn't look like a lot of [inaudible], once you hit the iceberg, you're sunk.

[inaudible] articles and summaries, and not just ones [inaudible] listed [inaudible] ICANN [inaudible]. One was [inaudible] and then sort of later retracted, but [inaudible] Wiki source, recognizing [inaudible]

together. [inaudible] was make sure that [inaudible] honor the committee [inaudible] understanding [inaudible] closer. Another one was look at the ways new generations [inaudible] generations [inaudible]. [inaudible] send an email, reach out to [inaudible] subgroup people on the [inaudible] some of [inaudible] start with them, because we have to assume [inaudible] sometimes give them your [inaudible] newbie [inaudible] multiple perspectives from [inaudible].

[inaudible] there were so many different people [inaudible] that person did get [inaudible]. One [inaudible] suggestion [inaudible] that they were shy [inaudible] big difference in how they [inaudible]. [inaudible] think of acting class, [inaudible] find a way that works for you. Another one was [inaudible] all forms [inaudible] something in [inaudible] email [inaudible] way [inaudible] step into a conversation. And [inaudible], because I [inaudible] about this. I'm certainly not shy, but [inaudible] initially, I might be [inaudible] ask a question or [inaudible], so make sure that [inaudible]. You have to create an environment in which people are comfortable.

Another one was have people raise their hands. Ask a question, raise your hand. Because what happens is, [inaudible] the louder [inaudible] people [inaudible] in before you get a chance. If you raise your hand, [inaudible]. Another one is [inaudible] meeting understand [inaudible] in perspective [inaudible] Chair [inaudible] start [inaudible] knowing that person may not say something [inaudible] knowing they have something to say [inaudible] were talking last night [inaudible] speak for that person [inaudible]. I understand that [inaudible] or not. But having an understanding of that and drawing people in gently without shaming or embarrassing them is a very effective way to [inaudible]. Quiet

people can put the bug in someone else's ears. [inaudible] bring it up [inaudible] what do you think about [inaudible] can you bring it up at the meeting? [inaudible] Chairs, set ground rules for participation, and encourage discussion of ground rules that help quiet people.

Oh, this is a general comment from the solution circle, and this is mine. But [inaudible] said, I am a [inaudible]. [inaudible]?

JOHN LAPRISE: John Laprise, for the record. We're [inaudible] off of your iceberg-Titanic [inaudible] –

UNKNOWN: That wasn't mine; that was [inaudible] –

UNKNOWN: That was mine.

JOHN LAPRISE: Okay, working off [inaudible], but I think that maybe [inaudible] if people [inaudible] to where a [inaudible] lighthouse on it, as people [inaudible] oh, this is someone I can go to [inaudible] answer questions [inaudible]. Because so many times, [inaudible] ICANN [inaudible] having a visual marker so, "Oh, this is someone I can ask and [inaudible] asking a question, someone who's a safe answer point," would be useful.

UNKNOWN: [inaudible]

UNKNOWN: Three things. You mentioned that we should ask ALSes' individuals [inaudible] signing up, and in fact, that is one fo the things on our list that we are going to be doing in the future, of actually trying to make sure that it's not just the nice computer results, but we actually [inaudible] that we realize that [inaudible].

The second thing was [inaudible] is [inaudible] voluntary leadership [inaudible] and clearly, that kind of [inaudible] is troublesome. The Ombudsman is one good source, either of [inaudible] discussion. On the other hand, [inaudible] come see me. I have [inaudible] authority [inaudible] RALO issue. But I care, and [inaudible] I've got a bunch of adjuncts and Vice-Chairs [inaudible] that can also be contacted. But we all care a lot [inaudible]. That's a big issue [inaudible]. And lastly, on the [inaudible] meetings, [inaudible] ICANN-wide meetings [inaudible] somewhere in the world. And although we can easily avoid 3pm in North America, in the wider [inaudible] community, [inaudible] can't avoid every hour and I think [inaudible] yours. But we really have to make sure that [inaudible]. And agendas ahead of time, so that we can [inaudible] if you have something to say but can't be there to say it. [inaudible]. We're [inaudible] time zones.

UNKNOWN: [inaudible], for the record. It would be nice if – I started to [inaudible] everybody [inaudible] Hyderabad [inaudible]. The [inaudible] talk to each other, because sometimes we get [inaudible] talking to [inaudible],

and we don't [inaudible] when I speak to [inaudible] are more [inaudible]. [inaudible] everybody to be a part of something that's not going to [inaudible]. [inaudible] computer [inaudible] has a [inaudible]. That's a very courageous thing to do, [inaudible]. [inaudible] each other. [inaudible] talk to people [inaudible]. I like small [inaudible] all we've got to do [inaudible] helps newcomers [inaudible]. I also think [inaudible] I'm trying to do this [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: [inaudible] Okay. So, what I'd like to do is [inaudible] thank the Staff that prepared the food, [inaudible]. I watch you guys. I watch every interaction that you have with [inaudible] and I think one of the things that you need to do is, I think that you need to thank the Staff.

[inaudible] the food was so [inaudible]. Thank you, [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: Okay, on the [inaudible] issue, [inaudible] – did we meet your requirements in terms of the [inaudible]?

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] Dana Perry is a vegan, so –

UNKNOWN: Okay, well –

UNKNOWN: [inaudible]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, so we're running out of time, but thank you for acknowledging the Staff. Something I was going to say that [inaudible], it's worth mentioning twice.

Okay, I just want to recap some of the results of what we've done and the items [inaudible] highlighted in the last few days. [inaudible] also possible to regurgitate everything that was said during the break [inaudible]. [inaudible] report. It's not [inaudible]. [inaudible] work on it after this, but one of the big requirements of Action Items is the survey that Alan Skuce has worked on, and that survey will be sent out, asking for your feedback – what we did right, what we did wrong. So, that survey will be sent out very soon afterwards. The second thing is [inaudible] showed it earlier on – you have it [inaudible] – [inaudible] that's a new item. Some of you didn't do it, some of you cut and paste your material [inaudible] chance to [inaudible] go back and do it properly. Add your information if you're a current ALS [inaudible] materials [inaudible] add to it. I know I have to make some changes to mine, as well.

The other Action Item that I heard from the – particularly today – is [inaudible] get involved in the Working Groups that [inaudible] and John were talking about. So, hopefully, [inaudible] Working Groups [inaudible] schedule a call [inaudible] detail on particular Working Groups. So, let me just recount some of the Action Items [inaudible] the last [inaudible].

We participated in the ARIN orientation. We participated in ARIN meetings. We had two short meetings that we had prior [inaudible] name of John [inaudible]'s and others. We had [inaudible] tabletop [inaudible] outreach [inaudible] during the event, and there was a lot of effort to share with a lot of ARIN people what we're doing, and definitely at the orientation session, half the people that seemed to be there [inaudible] from [inaudible] and she explained it. We had four social events. There was a lot of feedback on where we take these policy solutions [inaudible] strategies. One of the [inaudible] that task is to come up with a real strategic plan, rather than just a CROPP plan. We need to ask people to give more [inaudible] policies, and to shepherd a policy through, too – to work with [inaudible] that are leaders [inaudible] policy. Many of the people in this room, as you know, have been around for a while and would be happy to give you answers. We really want to encourage your participation in meetings, Working Groups, and others, and [inaudible] that the breakout groups were way beyond my expectations in terms of [inaudible]. So, I just want to turn to Heidi – oh, Alan, you were going to say something.

ALAN GREENBERG: I [inaudible] take off my [inaudible] hat and put on my ALAC Chair hat for a moment. These meetings, things like this General Assembly, are expensive in terms of money and are exceedingly expensive in terms of volunteering Staff. The survey will give us some idea of what you value [inaudible]. To the extent you feel you can do it, if you can put together a paragraph or two of why these are valuable, what you got out of them, that would be a really good [inaudible]. [inaudible] Staff [inaudible] Glenn. And we're not planning to cancel; we actually – for

the first time, about a year ago, we got formal ICANN approval that this will be [inaudible]. So, we're in better shape than we were for a long time [inaudible] year when we had to [inaudible]. But it's a lot of work, and [inaudible] financial pressure [inaudible] it's inevitable, I think. And I want to be able to put together a good casebook [inaudible] by and large would be more effective [inaudible] anytime over the next days, weeks, and think about what the benefits of this were to you, personally, or to the group.

HEIDI ULLRICH: [inaudible] Alan, I sent out a note asking for reflections [inaudible]. It says the same thing [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Let me clarify that. That was one conversation with the CIO of ARIN. He wanted to know the synergies, what [inaudible], particularly what we're getting out of it, what ARIN gets out of NARALO's relationship [inaudible] very [inaudible] question. So, having [inaudible]. Yeah, so he's been engaged [inaudible] with Richard on that. But please, any comments – I think they really got the message really loud and clear. [inaudible] they got real value [inaudible] from our participation. So [inaudible] a game-changer. Remember, we just had an [inaudible] good. But they rolled out the red carpet. Unfortunately, none of them are here, but we're going to [inaudible]. I'm sure the ladies will like [inaudible].

EN

HEIDI ULLRICH: So, Alan, you're asking for a paragraph [inaudible] and how [inaudible].

ALAN GREENBERG: If you are so –

HEIDI ULLRICH: [inaudible]

ALAN GREENBERG: I'm not demanding a [inaudible]

HEIDI ULLRICH: [inaudible] I'm – so, I have tons of things to say. And so I will endeavor to send them to you. I just wanted to say [inaudible] maybe everybody would [inaudible] anyway, but I am incapable of [inaudible].

ALAN GREENBERG: I've asked you to come up [inaudible]

HEIDI ULLRICH: [inaudible]

UNKNOWN: Hi. This is [inaudible]. So, thanks so much for coming and taking your time here. And now, we may have hounded you many, many times about issues and agendas and all that, but I just want to say we are – it's

basically because we see a lot of issues that could go wrong. [inaudible] planned way in advance, so that when we come here, we don't have to [inaudible]. And so, that's one of the logistical issues of why we [inaudible]. But also, thank you. [inaudible] those of us [inaudible] also to the Rapporteurs, and to Leah, and to others, and to those who are staying late and who are not leaving right away [inaudible] are welcome to come and help us [inaudible] different documents [inaudible] that may not be [inaudible] so that we can make it a [inaudible] report. Because while we have Rapporteurs, they may not have captured everything, and some people may have different memories – "Oh, yes, I [inaudible]." So, [inaudible] that would be very helpful.

I think that's it, but if you have any questions on Working Group [inaudible] on a future call, have the Chair of the Working Groups in At-Large come on and give a little few sentences about what they're doing, and ask us [inaudible] volunteer, that type of thing. We probably cannot – we may not be able to ask for the [inaudible] Cross-Community ones, but we definitely can get the At-Large and [inaudible], where At-Large is [inaudible] one of the founding members, that we have one of our people as a Co-Chair, and they certainly can come on the call [inaudible] CCWG on Internet Governance, and Olivier Crépin-Leblond is one of the Co-Chairs. I'm sure he'll be happy to come on and talk about what his group is doing. And Alan is [inaudible] members on the CCWG on [inaudible] can also talk about what that group is doing, what they're doing. I'm sure the other groups [inaudible] similar way. And so, I'll be happy to help arrange that, so people can get a better idea of what the group is doing. And that might help, I think, other people join these groups. And I think – oh, and Glenn has another thing to say.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes, okay. So, as we keep saying the same thing over and over again – we need to know your [inaudible] ALS [inaudible], so take your time. Think of where you fit into the legal system. What would you like to do? Who would you like to work with? What policy issues are there that are strong for you [inaudible]? That is going to help us. The first thing [inaudible] survey, but I had it earlier on, the profile. So, look at the various different policies [inaudible] and hopefully will organically [inaudible] Working Group so that [inaudible] you can schedule [inaudible] look at ways of how that group can actually circulate some ideas and [inaudible] policy comments.

Second of all, I was just informed by Heidi that EURALO has an annual [inaudible] assembly, but not face-to-face, so don't [inaudible]. But we can try to schedule something for a year from now and [inaudible] General Assembly. In fact, that's probably a good idea. Why don't we [inaudible] number of months [inaudible]. Where are we now? What did we accomplish a year ago? Where do we go from here?

HEIDI ULLRICH: [inaudible] all of the RALOs [inaudible] each of the ALSes be together at the summit [inaudible], and that [inaudible] March 2019. Again, if you can commit to a virtual meeting [inaudible] each other [inaudible].

UNKNOWN: [inaudible]

HEIDI ULLRICH: That's a meeting that [inaudible].

[CROSSTALK]

UNKNOWN: Thank you very much for [inaudible]. It was part entertaining and part [inaudible]. One thing that's [inaudible]. We also thank you for having so many [inaudible] discussions with me. As you probably know by now, I love [inaudible] discussions. I don't [inaudible] again. You do it [inaudible] in a world where [inaudible] people trying to help other people. [inaudible] you never know [inaudible]. [inaudible] only [inaudible] than you put into it. [inaudible] No one has done [inaudible]. Thanks for all your input. [inaudible]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, so we're at the end of the show, so Judith and I, Staff who worked on the planning of this, we'd like to thank you all for attending, wish you safe travels, and – again, it's worth mentioning – Heidi's been absolutely phenomenal, like a duck in the water.

[inaudible] water, but you don't know [inaudible] she'd come and whisper in my ear, "Don't forget this," [inaudible]. [inaudible] done a great job, as well.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: [inaudible] thanks for making sure that [inaudible] got the lunches fixed, the food, and all those other things that fall through the cracks and that

[inaudible] when she found out that [inaudible] or something else, [inaudible] jumped on it and made sure it all got done.

UNKNOWN: [inaudible] to Glenn and you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]