

RAW FILE  
ICANN  
APRIL 26, 2017  
12:00 A.M. CST

Services Provided By:

Caption First, Inc.  
P.O Box 3066  
Monument, CO 80132  
1-877-825-5234  
+001-719-481-9835  
Www.Captionfirst.com

\*\*\*

This is being provided in a rough-draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

\*\*\*

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Hello everyone. We will start in a couple of minutes. Okay. Can we have the recording started, please?

>> Recording has started. You may begin.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you. Welcome to the cross Committee Working Group. We have today an agenda with a second reading and a guidance request from another subgroup. But to start with let me start with the roll call. And we'll use the (inaudible) as usual to list participants but if anyone is not audio only, now is the time to mention it.

>> Hi. This is Niels on the audio bridge. Thank you.

>> Thank you, Niels. Anyone else?

>> Mathieu?

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Yes.

>> KAVOUSS ARASTEH: I am using audio from 615 UTC. Have another meeting at 1 o'clock Geneva time. I have to leave. It won't be able to continue on Internet but audio from 6:15 up to 7. Thank you.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you Kavouss. Thank you for mentioning it. And that will be the case for me, I will switch to audio only. I note that we have apologies from Ed Morris and

Renata Aquino and with that we have our roll call. Now to the update to statement of interests, are there any other statement of interest? Okay. So I would put on the record that I have a statement and related to my statement of interest since -- my term as is going to end on -- a couple of days now. And as a consequence I informed CCWG Chair that I am stepping down as a CCWG member in this group as well as co-Chair. And I'm going to take a new position that I am not able to put on the record right now in a few days. And that will unfortunately not enable me to remain as a participant either in this group. Although I will certainly maintain some form of monitoring of ICANN and will be eagerly awaiting the outcome of workstream 2. This is going to be one of my last Adobe Connect calls for a little while. I might log in to empty rooms once in awhile to peruse the cutoff might be too fast for (inaudible). So that's -- that was worth mentioning I guess as a statement of interest. Kavouss is that a new hand or an old one is this.

>> KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Yes. In fact, thank you very much for -- I was shocked. However because of (inaudible) I wish to express that it was a great honor and a great pleasure to work with you. Your competence, your skill and your sense of humor, informedness and firmness and above all your (inaudible) have been fundamental, instrumental to the success of work workstream 1 and workstream 2 so far and I remember when you delivered the work in workstream 1 to Steve. It is a great pleasure from the French hand receiving in the first part of the transition or transition itself. I wish you all the best and we hope to see you and show you from time to time and benefit from your advice and I request the Secretariat perhaps to please kindly in completion with the other two co-Chairs preparing a real letter of appreciation and gratitude to what you have done and then that will be signed by the co-Chair of the CCWG, two co-Chairs on behalf of the entire CCWG and submitted to you. Best chance. Best career and see you in the future. Thank you.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you very much Kavouss Arasteh. It is very much appreciated. And as you can imagine this has been a wonderful journey with a wonderful team. We have been doing some great work together. It has been hard work but very rewarding and thanks to our amazing support staff, to my fellow co-Chair friends and a number of the Rapporteurs we have been working so closely with. An amazing experience I will take with me anywhere I go and certainly stay close to my heart and I look forward to meeting many of you in the years to come in whatever occasion shows up. Thomas.

>> THOMAS RICKERT: Thanks. And just to echo what Kavouss said. Let me say both at personal and professional level we will thoroughly miss you. You have really made this work with

your diligence, with your expertise, with your kindness and humor and therefore I don't want to spend too much time on this. We spoke already. Thanks thanks and thanks again for everything that you did. It has been truly an honor and a pleasure working with you and to have found you as a friend. Thank you.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thanks, Thomas. Well, this is not the last time we will interact on. Now it is the Leon.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: It is hard to add anything to what Kavouss and Thomas just said. It has been an honor and a privilege to work side by side with you. I have learned a lot from you. Not as many jokes from you as I did from Thomas. But it has been great to work with you. And I thank you for being the teammate that you have been for this journey. Of course, I wish you the very best on your future endeavors. Thank you again, Mathieu.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you. We had keep the personal words personal. But let it be put on the record German and Mexican going in to a CCWG I think was the perfect team for that and it helped with great things. So it has been working out all right. But we still have work to deliver, remember? And that would be a perfect gift if we could deliver on this I wouldn't say in a timely manner because someone else used that words. But at least make it so that it is also remembered as a success from our group. So I am confident that is going to be the case.

So with that I suggest that we move to the review of the agenda. And it is on your screens in the notes section. Just asking whether there is any comment on the agenda itself. No? So moving on with review of the administration and the action items from the previous meetings. Greg can you update us on the various action items?

>> BERNARD TURCOTTE: Hello. Yes, I will be able to do that. Can you hear me?

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Yes. Perfect.

>> BERNARD TURCOTTE: Okay. Don't believe I have control of the slides. So let's go over to the review of the action items. Okay. From our last meeting we had Greg Shatan provide a next update on the 21 June. So that will be pending until then. Staff, prepare draft to submit comment for fiscal year 18 OP and B plan and notice to chartering organizations. So we have got the notice, the public comment has been put in. You have all been copied and we'll be completing the note to the chartering organizations tomorrow. That's my update for the action items of the previous meeting.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you Bernie. I think on the next slide we will see a number of items on the various consultations. Maybe you can keep going with this with this one as well?

>> BERNARD TURCOTTE: Sure. Let's put up that slide Yvette and Brenda. There we go. Updates on the various consultations. So the diversity questionnaire has been distributed and we have not received response yet but that's not surprising. Interpretation for diversity subgroup calls is now active and has been operating for the last two calls. Captioning as we can see today is operational and seems to be working very well. Although we have to ask presenters who speak very fast to slow down just a bit.

Update on jurisdiction questionnaire has now been closed. And the final comment was received on Monday and the jurisdiction sub subgroup that's working on the analysis will be considering the input. Transparency and public consultation, excuse me, update on transparency, public consultation is closed. The transparency subgroup had its first meeting since launching the public consultation a few hours ago. And they are I would say attacking all the comments aggressively and hope to have the next meeting of that group in two weeks when they should be considering responses to most of the comments. Public consultation is proposing. We haven't gotten a lot of comments but the comments have been positive. And the update on this SOAC accountability consultation was just launched last week and we are taking comments as of this time.

So that's my update on the various consultations and submissions we have got. Thank you.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you. I see Sebastien's hand is up.

>> Sebastien: Yes. Thank you very much. Just for the previous item I just not lost a co-Chair but I am also losing a (inaudible) and that will be hard to replace you. But we will try. And thank you for all the work you have done. I have two things here. For the captioning, not just speaking not too fast but also as I didn't do it, Sebastien (inaudible) speaking. Captioning takes the right name. For example, at the beginning Bernard was named Greg Shatan. There is currently a survey open regarding the assessments of the Ombudsman offices in ICANN and you are all welcome to answer this survey. If you wish I will add the link to the chat room. And the link to the announcement and I am sure that you will find a way to go to the survey. It is in the six or seven (inaudible) of ICANN and with different way of doing it but all can be done. Thank you very much for your participation. Thank you.

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you Sebastien. It is indeed worth mentioning. Encourage everyone to respond to the survey. And I think this closes our agenda item No. 3. I will hand over to my dear fellow co-Chair, Leon for the legal community update.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much. Leon Sanchez. And

the legal community has no pending requests. There is not much to update the Plenary on the legal community. With that I would like to go to our next agenda item which is the updates and the presentation from subgroups and for this call we have the second reading document rights considerations. As you might remember I see that Sebastien's hand, I don't know if that's a new hand or an old hand. Thank you. In our previous Plenary call we went through the document presented by the Human Rights subgroup and we reviewed the second part of the document because the first part was already -- had already been reviewed and had already had a first reading. So this time what we are going to do is do the second reading of the complete document and I believe that there were no comments to the proposed document between the last Plenary and this Plenary. So I would, of course, try -- I will, of course, ask either Niels or Greg just to confirm whether there were any comments received or not and if there were not comments then I would definitely encourage us to call for any objections on approving the second reading. And continue our process to polish this document for public comment. So either Niels or Greg, could you please take the floor just to confirm whether there were any comments received to this version of the document?

>> Niels: Thank you very much. There have been no comments received on this version of the document. Thank you.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much Niels. And I would like to call for any objections on approving this version of the document of the Human Rights subgroup for public comment. Okay. I see some ticks from Cheryl Langdon-Orr from Jordan carter, from Mathieu, Julie hammer, Greg Shatan and hand raised from Thomas Rickert. There is no objections to having approved the second reading for the Human Rights document and therefore I would ask staff to please prepare this document to be published for public comment. Thank you very much. And once again congratulations to the Human Rights subgroup for this very good document and for all of your hard work. And I would now like to turn to my co-Chair, Thomas Rickert. Thomas.

>> THOMAS RICKERT: Thanks very much Leon. In fact, this is a slightly unannounced change to our agenda since Mathieu is going to leave this call in a few minutes or at least not be on Adobe and I would like to turn it over to our dear staff member Bernie.

>> BERNARD TURCOTTE: Thank you, Thomas. Could not, of course, let Mathieu leave without having some sort of a little recap of his time with us. And so we put together a little presentation which we will call the story of the CCWG-Accountability in pictures. So here we go. It all started at ICANN 50. And Steve Crocker asking you want what for the

transition. And then, of course, what was asked for was accountability and IRP. And, of course, we have had a great shot of Becky there and what we have tried to do is capture all the key meetings and have a shot from at least one or two of the people. And so the story of the three Amigos begins. I can 51 enthusiasm co-Chair enthusiasm of the project was always 110% and I think there is a great shot of. ICANN 52 some had doubts but there was always someone to explain it. Istanbul, who wants to leave? Everyone has got their hands up. ICANN 53, Buenos Aires, you said what model hombre. ICANN 53, what happens in Paris stays in Paris. ICANN 54, seriously all we need is a model. ICANN 54, they are just never going to make that deadline, are they? And staff kept at it. Of course, we can do that. ICANN 55, told you we could do it if we all work together. And with a little help from our friends. We even got Daisy to sing. But seriously -- ICANN 57 where was Mathieu? We missed him. ICANN 58, what more can I do. It has been exceptional, Mathieu. Thank you very much. We will miss you. For those that are interested I'll be posting this in the chat. There is a tribute page. We'll be asking people to post their comments to Mathieu and we will get that done up and over to him. Thank you very much everyone. Just a little photo recap which we put together and we'll be sending to Mathieu so he can remember and back to our co-Chairs. Thank you.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: As always the work of our staff has been outstanding. So thank you so much Bernie for this and unfortunately our group is so disciplined to have their microphone muted that we didn't hear laughter or applauding but you can see some reactions in the chat as well as in the Adobe where people are applauding or ticking green. Thank you ever so much for doing this and I think it has been a great collection of some -- nice memories, some more threatening memories that we had in our journey and again thank you very much Mathieu and just for those who were hoping that after Leon is going to the board and Mathieu is leaving that you would get rid of the three of us in fact, I do plan to stay on until this over and done successfully. So you will have co-Chair continuity in this group at least from my Point of View. So having said that, unless there are any further remarks from your side, I would suggest that all of you want to leave a few thoughts or words for Mathieu go to the tribute page and do it there so that we continue with our discussion on the subject matters in this call. And in fact, the next topic is our work on staff accountability and in order to speak to that I would like to hand over to one of the Rapporteurs of the cut team. I am not sure whether John -- John your hand is raised. Over to you.

>> John: One of the co-Rapporteurs for the staff

accountability group. Can you hear me?

>> We can hear you all right, John. Go ahead.

>> John: Great. Okay. This is -- I just need to give a little bit of context for what we are asking you for here. Following the meeting that we had face to face in Copenhagen in March you let our group change the way we were working to focus on issues and problem identification phase to try and get beyond sort of sterile documentation of HR processes and really understand from examples from cases and from experience in ICANN what the issues were with staff accountability. And then we would move on to developing some ways to solve that and that would be our work product, some proposed changes to the organization to look at and we will get public comment on those at some point in the future. So what you have got the first draft of the issues table where we try and work out what the issues are that have been experienced or raised by a community-based on real things that have happened, not based on hypothetical fears. And to list them down, to try and analyze what might have contributed to that problem or issue and try and understand what the impact of it is and this is just the first part of problem solving if you like. We don't want to rush to ways to solve these. That's our next piece of work. But the reason that we are sharing this with you now is that the staff accountability subgroup is quite small. And we needed a bigger set of eyes, more people's perspectives to answer two kind of key questions. One is and I just wrote this down so I didn't forget it. One is are there any issues that you think are missing from this list. Relatively short document. There are only eight or nine issues I think on the list. Is there major staffing on the accountability problem that you know that we aren't thinking about or aren't considering? If there is, we need to know about it. And in the second one is are any of these that are already listed extraneous. Are they over the top and they are problems that aren't problems. Now you might have an example of something that's happened in ICANN that you think is a staff accountability problem. And what we are trying not to do with this process is to use it as a way to look at individual behavior or to document or try and embarrass or any of that kind of stuff about the conduct or work of individual staff or individual departments. But the potential of that is that we are also trying to be really clear that the issues of the various debates of things that have happened, if you have things that should be on the table but don't think it is appropriate to put on the record, please feel welcome to and come and speak with Avri or me directly, send us an e-mail, send us a Skype message, contact us in some way and come along to a staff accountability group and raise it, find out how to contact

us there. If you have that option. The other is to add it as a more generalized issue in the issues table in the Google document which I will paste here. The reason we wanted to put this on the agenda for the Plenary to get your attention with it. It isn't a first reading, it isn't anything like that. I don't want to spend time here in the Plenary verbally adding issues or anything like that. I have pasted those links with Google doc in the window. It would be much preferable if you had an issue to enter in on the doc. Skype or phone call to raise an issue. And our group is working weekly to get a first set of documents ready for reading in the middle of May. If you have any input, if you there is some issues in staff accountability that the group should pay attention to please raise them with us over the next week or so. That would be great and with that I would ask my co-Rapporteur Avri Doria if there is anything that she would like to add or qualify or modify on that. And Avri that's up to you and if not that's fine. I will hand it back to the co-Chairs.

>> AVRI DORIA: This is Avri speaking, I wanted to add two things and thank you for calling on me and I also wanted to say if somebody looked at all this and said gee, I have got some more time now that some of the other stuff is done, I think I will go participate in that group. That would be a good thing. The other thing I think is important is to look at the list of issues -- that are listed there and with any issues that you have had and see if they fit in to one of other category types and if they do, then look at the contributions to the issue and its impacts to make sure that we are getting things described correctly and completely. So that would be the other perspective I would people to take on as they sort of take some time and delve in to the table. Thanks.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: Thanks very much Avri and John for this update and let me just pause for a second to see whether there are any comments from the group. That does not seem to be the case. Thanks for the hard work and for this paper and again let me encourage everyone to contribute to this and maybe even join the team to discuss these items during their regular calls. So thank you very much for that. I think with this we can close this agenda item and move to the sixth agenda item which is going to be very brief and that's basically to announce that we are going to have our next Plenary call on May the 10th at 13 UTC. As usually we will discuss the contents of this meeting and the updates to be provided to the Plenary with the Rapporteurs in the preparatory call and certainly as usually there will be a deadline for submitting documents but details on that will be sent to the accountability list by Bernie. Let me now ask whether there is any AOBs that you would like to put



forward. Mathieu is typing. Let me just wait if there is anything coming up for AOB. So that was a comment relating to the work of the staff accountability subteam and that will surely be resolved by Avri and Jordan and I see that Kavouss' hand is raised. So please go ahead. Kavouss in case you wanted to speak the floor is yours.

>> KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Excuse me. I repeat are you on AOB at the end of the agenda or AOB on this issue? Thank you.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: We are now at agenda item No. 7. So it is the AOB at the end of the meeting before we adjourn. In fact, this was a very quick meeting. Kavouss your hand is raised.

>> KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Yes, I would like to express our sincere thanks to ICANN for the captioning, online captioning provided, with the agenda notes and everything. So all things is going down or it is done in order to make everything ready for our meeting. I would like to express the appreciation for facilitating captioning at the same time as recap.

>> LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much. That is well said. This is great to follow what's being said by looking at it. It is live. It is a great help particularly if you have bad audio line and I'm sure that I will benefit from this new feature as well many of you will. So again, you know, this is -- this has been a record time meeting and I think we have been so quick in order to ensure that we can close this meeting before Mathieu has to leave for audio only. He has been able to enjoy the full Plenary meeting on Adobe Connect. The only thing remaining for me to say while you have the three original co-Chairs, thank you to all of you and thank you to the Rapporteur and thank you to our great staff and particularly the -- thank you to Mathieu we will miss you and this will be the last words for this meeting. Thank you ever so much. Bye-bye

(Applause.)

>> MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you.

>> Thank you everyone.

>> I actually wanted to --

\*\*\*

This is being provided in rough-draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

\*\*\*