

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Review and draft recommendations regarding SOAC transparency                            | 1  |
| Draft Recommendations regarding SO/AC transparency: <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |    |
| Participation   | 5  |
| Outreach  | 10 |
| Policy and Procedures for Accountability of SO/ACs                                      | 14 |
| Reviews of policies and procedures  | 17 |
| Challenging Decisions   | 20 |
| Any unwritten policies  | 22 |

## Executive Summary to be added

### Review and draft recommendations regarding SOAC transparency

Drafted by Steve DelBianco, last updated 2-Feb-2017

The new Bylaws tasked us to:

“review and develop ... recommendations on SO/AC accountability, including but not limited to improved processes for accountability, **transparency**, and participation that are helpful to prevent capture”

We asked each SO/AC (and subgroups):

“What are the published policies and procedures by which your AC/SO is accountable to the designated community that you serve? Specifically, **transparency mechanisms for your AC/SO deliberations, decisions and elections.** “

**Review:** A summary of responses and resources provided on Transparency, supplemented by independent research by the SO/AC Accountability working group:

ALAC:

- o ALAC Rules of Procedure are posted at <https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/Rules+of+Procedure>
- o ALAC’s member At-Large Structures (ALS) are listed at <https://atlarge.icann.org/alses>. Individual members may choose to keep their names private.
- o 21-day public notice is given before voting is conducted.

- o All ALAC, RALO, and working group meetings are open to the public.
- o Meeting minutes, recording, and transcripts are published.
- o Most ALAC, RALO, and working group mailing lists are published.
- o Results of elections are published. Individuals may use secret ballots.
- o ALAC response spoke specifically about risk of “capture”:

The ALAC itself is effectively immune from capture, since its members are selected by very geographically and culturally diverse populations. To be admitted as an At-Large Structure (ALS), the organization must be largely controlled by its members, again spreading the responsibility over large areas. In the one RALO where there was a fear that a few countries, because of their relative size compared to the majority, might dominate, weighted voting was instituted giving each country an equivalent vote and if there are multiple ALSes within that country, the vote is divided among them.

There is a potential for multiple ALSes to be linked and “controlled” centrally, despite the local membership. There are a few potential examples, but these tend to be more a case of perceived possible control rather than real control. Overall, in all such cases, the real risk is not of some entity capturing a large percentage of votes, but is apathy of the rest of the organization. And that is true in much of ICANN.

#### ASO/NRO:

- o Members of the regional numbers community are listed at <https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/regional-internet-registries>
- o NRO officers are listed on ASO website
- o ASO sessions at ICANN meetings are open to anyone.
- o ASO provides glossary for acronyms and an FAQ page.
- o ASO publishes minutes of NRO meetings.
- o ASO email archives are published for anyone to see.

#### ccNSO:

- o ccNSO Guidelines are published at <https://ccnso.icann.org/about/guidelines.htm>
- o Allows non-member ccTLDs to be present at ccNSO meetings.
- o All ccNSO Council decisions are immediately published on ccNSO website and wiki.
- o All documents and materials are published on the wiki at least a week before ccNSO Council meetings.
- o ccNSO Guidelines Review Committee is reviewing current practices and documentation and may recommend updates and/or new guidelines.

#### GAC:

- o GAC Operating Principles are published at <https://gacweb.icann.org/display/gacweb/GAC+Operating+Principles>
- o Materials on GAC membership, meetings, key topics, correspondence and meeting notes are published on the GAC website.
- o Correspondence between the GAC and the ICANN Board is published on the GAC

website.

- o All GAC face-to-face meetings are open and anyone can monitor real-time or through recordings and transcripts.
- o GAC Communiqué and meeting minutes are published in the six UN languages.

#### GNSO:

- o Operating procedures are published at <https://gnso.icann.org/en/council/op-procedures-01sep16-en.pdf>
- o Anyone can monitor Council meetings via audio. Meeting recordings, transcript, and minutes are published.
- o The GNSO Council email list is archived and published for public view.
- o GNSO Working Group meeting recording and transcripts are published on Working Group wiki.
- o GNSO Working Group meeting recording and transcripts are published on Working Group wiki.
- o Draft reports of GNSO Working Groups are published on Working Group wiki.

#### GNSO-BC (Business Constituency):

- o The BC Charter is published at <http://www.bizconst.org/charter>
- o BC members are listed at <http://www.bizconst.org/bc-membership-list>
- o All BC filed comments and ICANN correspondence are published on the BC website.
- o At ICANN meetings, the BC holds some closed sessions and at least one open session.
- o BC members can monitor BC meetings via adobe and/or audio. Meeting recordings, transcript, and minutes are published to member email list.
- o BC members all have access to a private email archive.
- o Open email communications are published at <https://forum.icann.org/lists/bc-gnso/>

#### GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- o Bylaws are published at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/bylaws>
- o Members are listed at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/current-membership>
- o Officers are listed at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/officers>
- o Filed comments are published at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/public-comments>
- o Archived emails are available at <http://mm.icann.org/pipermail/ipc-gnso/>
- o Meeting minutes are published at <http://www.ipconstituency.org/meeting-minutes>

#### GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):

- o ISPCP Charter is published at <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pagelD=27854098>
- o ISPCP Operating Procedures are published.
- o Officers are listed at <https://gnso.icann.org/en/about/stakeholders-constituencies/csg/isp>
- o Comments filed prior to 2014 are published at <https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pagelD=27853808>

GNSO-NCSG (Non-Commercial Stakeholders Group):

- o NCSG Bylaws are published at <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsononcomstake/Charter>
- o NCSG members are listed at [https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1o0n2H5xkTPmon8K8wbFg0dAZTouHWgkWjcyNsSs\\_YXw/edit#gid=0](https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1o0n2H5xkTPmon8K8wbFg0dAZTouHWgkWjcyNsSs_YXw/edit#gid=0)
- o Executive Committee listed at <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsononcomstake/Leadership+Team>
- o Meeting minutes are published at <https://community.icann.org/display/gnsononcomstake/Meeting+Records>
- o Email archives are published for both NCSG and Executive Committee
- o Statements and letters are published and archived

GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

- o Bylaws published at <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/bylaws/bylaws-revision-2016/differential-document/>
- o Organizational Members are listed at <http://www.ncuc.org/about/members/>
- o Executive Committee is listed at <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/executive-committee/>
- o Executive Committee meeting minute are published at <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/executive-committee/>
- o Email archives are published at <http://lists.ncuc.org/cgi-bin/mailman/listinfo>
- o Statements and letters are published at <http://www.ncuc.org/policy/statements/>

RSSAC:

SSAC:

- o Charter is published at <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac/charter>
- o Operational Procedures published at <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/operational-procedures-20jun16-en.pdf>
- o Member bios and SOIs are listed at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/ssac-biographies-2016-12-15-en>
- o Officer (chair) is named at <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac>
- o Reports and Advice published at <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac/documents>
- o Correspondence is published at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/ssac-correspondence-2016-01-08-en>

Note that **transparency** is part of the structural review of the ALAC, ASO, ccNSO, GNSO, RSSAC, and SSAC, to be conducted at direction of the ICANN board every 5 years. ICANN Bylaws Section 4.4 requires the Board to cause an independent, periodic review (every 5 years) of each SO/AC, except that the GAC “shall provide its own review mechanisms”. Note that these are required to be independent reviews and are usually conducted by outside consultants hired by ICANN.

Recommend that each SO/AC and subgroup consider adopting the following “best practices”  
**Draft Recommendations regarding SO/AC transparency:**

Our review leads us to recommend regarding transparency mechanisms:

1. Charter and operating guidelines should be published on a public web page and updated whenever changes are made.
2. Members of the SO/AC or subgroup should be listed on a public web page.
3. Officers of the SO/AC or subgroup should be listed on a public web page.
4. Meetings and calls of SO/ACs and subgroups should normally be open to public observation. When a meeting is determined to be members-only, that should be explained publicly, giving specific reasons for holding a closed meeting.
5. Minutes for all membership meetings should be published.
6. Filed comments and correspondence with ICANN should be published for anyone to view

## **Participation**

Drafted by Tatiana Tropina, last updated 2-Feb-2017

ALAC:

- Policies related to the certification or decertification of ALSes are documented within the ALAC RoP and (related to decertification) in the RALO rules coupled with the ALAC RoP.
- Acceptance of individual RALO members is governed by the RALO rules.

- 4 Work Teams (WT - under a number of different names such as Working groups, Drafting Teams, Subcommittees, etc.) are general open to all except as limited in the WT charter, mission or motion that creates it.
- Locating such documents, like all records in ICANN, can at times be problematic, but there are few if any instances where that has caused a problem. As noted, virtually all meetings are open, and subject to time and the Chair's discretion, who can speak is not generally limited.
- Who can vote in elections is defined in the appropriate ALAC or RALO rules. Each RALO is free to set its own position on issues and the ALAC speaks for itself and all of AtLarge as appropriate.

#### ASO/NRO:

Process is open and inclusive of any entity or individual that wishes to participate in the Numbers community and the Global Policy Development Process (GPDP). As the GPDP by its nature includes engagement of the Numbers community at the five RIR regions respectively, see: <https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/rir-accountability#141>.

- [Further, to assist members of the community, particularly newcomers, in understanding the NRO NC, its processes, and how a community member can be involved in the GPDP, an FAQ is available at https://aso.icann.org/about-the-aso/asofrequently-asked-questions/.](#)
- [The ASO also maintains mailing lists for dissemination of information and engagement with the community. See https://aso.icann.org/contact/asomailinglists/.](#)
- [To assist members of the community, particular newcomers, in understanding terms that may be used in disclosed material, a glossary is made available at https://aso.icann.org/about-the-aso/glossary/.](#)

**Formatted:** Indent: Hanging: 0.25", Space Before: 6 pt, Don't add space between paragraphs of the same style, Outline numbered + Level: 1 + Numbering Style: Bullet + Aligned at: 0.75" + Indent at: 0.5"

#### ccNSO

The general rule is that any ccTLD, regardless of its membership of the ccNSO, is always welcome to participate in the meetings of the ccNSO, contribute to discussions, and participate in the work of the working groups. However, only ccNSO members elect ccNSO Councillors and ICANN Board members (seats 11 and 12), as well as vote on the ccNSO policies

#### GAC

- Procedures for becoming a Member of the GAC are available on the GAC website. All Members may participate in GAC face-to-face meetings, discussion via the GAC e-mail list, inter-sessional teleconferences and GAC Working Groups, and are actively encouraged to do so.
- All GAC face-to-face meeting sessions are open (recognising community feedback on this point) and anyone interested can follow them in real time as well as through recordings and transcripts.
- The GAC Communiqué and minutes of the meeting are published in the six UN languages.
- The schedule for GAC face-to-face meetings is subject to extensive consultation with

GAC members, including teleconferences arranged for different time zones.

- Real-time interpretation in the six official UN languages is provided (by ICANN) for GAC face-to-face meetings and inter-sessional teleconferences.
- Travel support is provided (by ICANN) to assist a limited number of GAC members and observers from developing economies to attend face-to-face meetings according to published criteria.

#### GNSO

- Only Council members can participate in GNSO Council meetings. Subject matter experts outside the Council are sometimes invited to attend a Council meeting to provide information on a dedicated topic. However, all decisional meetings are recorded, transcribed, and audiocast.
- Anyone interested can participate in a GNSO Working Group. The only requirement is that a statement of interest is provided (it is not a problem to have a specific interest as long as it is declared). Those not willing or able to participate in working groups as a member have the option to following deliberations as an observer (read only access to the mailing list). All GNSO Working Groups have their mailing list publicly archived as well as recordings and transcripts posted online.

#### GNSO-BC

- Policies for determining whether individuals or organizations are eligible to participate in BC meetings, discussions, etc., are outlined in §3 of the current BC Charter (<http://www.bizconst.org/charter>). In the new Charter, eligibility is outlined in §5.
- In order to be eligible to participate within the BC, organizations and their representatives (primary representative and others), the organization must first become a member. Eligibility criteria is outlined in §3 within the current charter and §5 in the new charter.
- The process for becoming a member of the BC begins with submitting an application to the BC Secretariat ([info-bc@icann.org](mailto:info-bc@icann.org)) or via the website [bizconst.org](http://bizconst.org), which is then reviewed by the BC's Credentials Committee (CC) for consideration per the membership eligibility criteria. If an application is approved, the applicant (i.e., the organization/association/company) is notified within 14 business days and sent an invoice to be paid. Once the invoice is paid, the applicant is approved as a BC Member. The BC maintains a public list of all members, at <http://www.bizconst.org/bc-membership-list>.
- Appeal mechanisms for membership applications and membership credentials are outlined in Section 5.6.2 of the new BC Charter, which gives empowers the Credentials Committee to conduct a review upon request.
- The specific steps are outlined in the Charter, including when the termination of a membership is deemed appropriate. If a BC member is not satisfied with EC decision, that member may pursue the complaint with ICANN's Ombudsman.
- The BC's teleconference meetings are held bi-weekly, and are open to all BC Members.

The BC holds a meeting open to guests during each ICANN Public Meeting. The procedures outlining BC Meetings are in the new BC Charter, in §8.

#### GNSO-IPC

- In order to be eligible to participate within the IPC, organizations, corporations, law firms and individuals must first become members of the IPC. Eligibility criteria are outlined in Section II(A)- (C) of the IPC Bylaws:  
Information on joining the IPC, including an online application, is on the IPC Website, in the “Join the IPC” section: <http://www.ipconstituency.org/join-the-ipc>. The membership application process is described in the IPC Bylaw, Section II(D) (Application for Membership).
- Potential applicants shall complete an IPC application form that shall be publicly available on the IPC website or through contacting any IPC officer.
- All applications for membership are forwarded to the IPC officers for consideration and will be voted on by the IPC Council on a regular basis. All applicants may request the status of their application and admission decision and, in the event of any objection to said application, shall be given the opportunity to ask clarifying questions about the objection and shall be given the opportunity to reply with clarification or to reply in general.
- Membership applications are first reviewed by the IPC Membership Committee. If approved by the Membership Committee, the application is then referred to IPC Leadership. If approved by IPC Leadership, the application is lastly referred to the IPCC (Intellectual Property Constituency Council), which consists of the IPC Category 2 (local, state or purely national intellectual property organizations) and 3 (international intellectual property organizations) members.
- Members’ eligibility to participate in IPC activities is set out in the IPC Bylaws, Section II(F) (Participation).
- There is an appeal mechanisms for the refusal of a membership application or the expulsion of a member. Any decision of the IPC officers can be appealed to the IPCC, with the possibility of further review by the ICANN ombudsman in accordance with the ICANN by-laws. [The IPCC may refuse or expel any member where on reasonable grounds it feels it is in the best interest of the IPC to do so; provided, that any such action is subject to review by the ICANN Ombudsman in accordance with the ICANN by-laws.

#### GNSO-ISPCP

- The ISPCP’s policies for determining whether individuals or organizations are eligible to participate in ISPCP meetings, discussions, etc., are outlined in Chapter II., Membership, of the Articles (<https://community.icann.org/x/EgWpAQ>).  
In order to be eligible to participate within the ISPCP, organizations and their representatives (primary representative and others), first must become a member.
- The process for becoming a member of the ISPCP begins with submitting an application



to the  
ISPCP Secretariat (secretariat@ispcp.info) or via the website <http://www.ispcp.info/>,  
which is  
then reviewed by the ISPCP's Credentials Committee (CC) for consideration per the  
membership  
eligibility criteria. If an application is approved, the applicant (i.e., the  
organization/association)  
is notified within 14 business days and the new member is added to the mailing list.  
Appeals: Process not yet included  
The ISPCP's teleconference meetings is held once a month, and is open to all ISPCP  
members.  
The ISPCP holds a public meeting open to guests during each ICANN Public Meeting.  
Agenda, meeting notes and mp3 recordings from the public meetings held during ICANN  
meetings are posted on the Constituency website.

#### GNSO-NCUC

- NCUC's policies and procedures for membership eligibility are stated in section III of the NCUC bylaws. Any organization or individual that becomes an NCUC member will be able to get involved with all policy matters discussed at NCUC, working groups etc. <http://www.ncuc.org/governance/bylaws/>
- Each membership application is individually vetted by the NCSG executive committee. There are also new procedures in the recently amended bylaws to ensure that organizations or individuals whose eligibility status changes can be removed if appropriate.
- NCUC is also aligned with GNSO operating procedures,
- Members are encouraged to join the different PDP working groups and information about policies are shared in regular basis in the main mailing list.

#### SSAC

- SSAC meetings, discussions and work groups are normally closed to other than SSAC members, SSAC Support Staff and selected members of ICANN Security and Technical Staff. Occasionally, the SSAC will invite individuals with specific expertise to participate in discussions or on Work Parties if that expertise is lacking in SSAC members.

#### Recommendations:

- 1) the rules of eligibility and criteria for membership should be clearly outlined in the bylaws or the annexes of the bylaws or in their operational procedures
- 2) if applicable: the process of application for membership should be clear
- 3) if applicable: there should be a process of appeal when application for membership is rejected
- 4) for any meetings, be they closed to members only or open to anyone, the members have to be able to access minutes and recordings and where applicable a public mailing list needs to be

in place.

5) A glossary for explaining acronyms used by SO/AC is also recommended

#### **Outreach:**

Drafted by Farzaneh Badii, last updated 2-Feb-2017

ALAC: [expecting responses by 1-Feb]

- o Outreach events while at ICANN meetings;
- o Interaction with ICANN Fellows and NextGen;
- o Use of CROPP funding to attend meetings and other events, or targeted visits (such as to a country with no current At-Large participation);
- o Attendance at various regional and international events. Examples include: Regional IGFs, Global IGF, RIR meetings, regional Internet-related meeting (such as APRICOT),
- o Organizing, teach at or otherwise participating in Schools of Internet Governance.
- o Using social media to increase awareness.
- o Each RALO has an Outreach Strategic Plan.
- o Outreach to attract new organizational members (ALSes) is a constant focus. More recently, we are working to increase the number of individual members in the regions the allow them (NA, EU, AP) and results show we are successful.
- o We also are about to launch a new program to increase penetration within our ALSes.
- o Often, in many cases, it is just one or a few people in the organization who are active within At-Large, and we are determined to increase our breadth of coverage within the ALSes.

ASO/NRO:

- o Anybody who would like to be involved with the Internet number resource community in their respective region is welcome to suggest or comment on global policy proposals, be elected to serve on the ASO Address Council (ASO AC), or vote in elections. Anyone is welcome to attend ICANN meetings and come to the ASO session(s). Anyone is welcome to attend RIR events in person or remotely, and participate in policy discussions.
- o The NRO Number Council (NRO NC) performs the function of the ASO AC. For information on how the NRO NC is constituted, see <https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/the-nro-number-council>
- o Further, for information on how members of the NRO NC are elected/appointed from their respective RIR regions, see:
- o AFRINIC: <https://www.afrinic.net/en/community/ig/nro>
- o APNIC: <https://www.apnic.net/community/participate/elections/nro-elections>
- o ARIN: <https://www.arin.net/participate/elections/nronumbercouncil.html>
- o LACNIC: <http://www.lacnic.net/en/web/lacnic/aso-nro>
- o RIPE NCC: <https://www.ripe.net/participate/internet-governance/internet-technical-community/nro> [RACI program for the academics]
- o In addition, for information on the individual RIRs, see the RIR Governance Matrix at

<https://www.nro.net/about-the-nro/rir-governance-matrix>, specifically Section 1,

- o RIR Bylaws and Operational Documents, and Section 2, Regional Policy

ccNSO: (extracted from CCNSO wiki page)

- o CCNSO has regional outreach  
<https://community.icann.org/display/ccNSOCWS/Outreach>

GAC:

- o GAC face-to-face meetings regularly include capacity-building and outreach sessions to encourage the widest range of participation by members.
- o GAC has membership of 170 national and territory government. GAC does outreach to the remaining governments through the biennial ICANN High Level Governmental Meeting, where Ministers from GAC and Non-GAC member governments are invited. Also, individual governments and IGOs also do outreach to the non-members - e.g. UK has been in contact with Bangladesh administration.

GNSO:

- o ICANN newsletters, and outreach to other SO/ACs.
- o Specific newcomer webinars and training tools are available for those that want to learn more about what it takes to participate in GNSO working groups.

GNSO-BC (Business Constituency):

- o The BC's commitment to outreach is described in the current BC Charter at §12 and in the new Charter at Section 9:2009 CHARTER, §12 "Business users' participation in ICANN is critical. The BC will, in tandem with other members of the CSG, make best efforts to broaden the participation of business users wherever possible according to available resources."  
2016 CHARTER (undergoing review by ICANN Staff), §9.2:  
The new BC Charter in §9.2 presents the Chair and Vice-Chair for Finance and Operations as being "primarily responsible for allocating funds, proposing plans/programs, and encouraging Member participation in activities designed to achieve the Business Constituency's outreach and recruitment goals." Complete text of new BC Charter can be read [here](#).
- o Outreach Committee
- o Outreach Strategy
- o Annually, a BC Outreach Strategy is created and approved within the BC, outlining its implementation strategy for the upcoming year, and expected outcomes. BC Outreach strategy is administered by the BC Outreach Committee with the support of its Executive Committee and ICANN staff. In FY16, the BC's Outreach spending totaled 12,750.00 €, which includes activities such as support of events and travel requests.
- o The Outreach committee meets via teleconference before each ICANN Public meeting

for planning purposes. The Outreach team also drafts an Outreach and Strategic Plan annually, which can be found on the ICANN Wiki space (<https://community.icann.org/x/XQKbAw>) and actively participates in the Community Regional Outreach Pilot Program (CROPP).

- o Newsletters are published by the BC in advance of every ICANN Public Meeting (<http://www.bizconst.org/newsletter>). Articles are written by BC members and designed by the BC for outreach purposes at each ICANN Public Meeting, and various outreach events that the BC participates in (such as AfICTA Summits, trade events, and IGF forums).
- o BC's CROPP travel forms for past and upcoming travel and outreach events in FY17 will be tracked here: <https://community.icann.org/x/zw2OAw>

#### GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- o IPC has an Outreach Engagement Committee, which is responsible for planning, oversight and some execution of the IPC's outreach and engagement strategy.
- o Outreach Strategy: The IPC Outreach and Engagement Committee is tasked with developing the Outreach Strategy for the upcoming year. The IPC Outreach and Engagement Strategic Plan for FY17 can be found at <https://community.icann.org/x/GgybAw>. After the Outreach and Engagement Committee develops a draft Plan, it is reviewed and approved first by IPC Leadership (Officers and Councilors) and then by IPC Membership.
- o The IPC participates in ICANN programs such as the Fellows program, the Leadership Training Program, CROPP, and various Business Engagement activities.
- o planning team in advance of each ICANN meeting to coordinate the logistics and events of the IPC, including any outreach and engagement planned for the meeting.
- o The IPC holds an open meeting of the Constituency at each International Trademark Association (INTA) annual meeting and promotes the IPC at meetings of the INTA Internet Committee. The IPC also conducts informal outreach at other meetings where Intellectual Property Constituency stakeholders will be present (e.g., the annual meeting of MARQUES).
- o The IPC has a website and a print brochure for outreach purposes.
- o IPC Bylaws: <http://www.ipconstituency.org/Bylaws>
- o IPC Outreach and Strategic Plan for FY17: <https://community.icann.org/x/GgybAw7>
- o IPC's CROPP travel forms for past and upcoming travel and outreach events in FY17 will be tracked in the CROPP space, <https://community.icann.org/x/2A2OAw>.
- o ICANN Leadership Program: <https://community.icann.org/x/4hK4Aw>
- o The IPC brochure can be found here: [https://ipc.memberclicks.net/assets/FactSheets/ipc\\_onepager\\_2016.pdf](https://ipc.memberclicks.net/assets/FactSheets/ipc_onepager_2016.pdf)

#### GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):

- o Outreach efforts, per the ISPCP Procedures, are described in Section 7: "The ISPCP will undertake best efforts to broaden participation and awareness of the Constituency and its activities wherever possible and with the resources at its disposal. All ISPCP members

should be expected to assist with this goal within their own sphere of activities and flag opportunities for outreach to the Executive Committee.”

- o Outreach Strategy: Annually, an ISPCP Outreach Strategy is created and approved within the ISPCP, outlining its implementation strategy for the upcoming year, and expected outcomes, which includes activities like, but not limited to, the support of events and travel requests.
- o The Outreach committee meets via teleconference before each ICANN Public meeting for planning purposes. The Outreach team also drafts an Outreach and Strategic Plan annually, which can be found on the ICANN Wiki space (pending) and actively participates in the Community
- o Regional Outreach Pilot Program (CROPP)
- o Bulletins: Bulletins (sometimes referred to as Newsletters) are published by the ISPCP in advance of the annual ICANN Public Meeting and archived on the ISPCP website.
- o ISPCP Articles (2009 - current): <https://community.icann.org/x/EgWpAQ>
- o ISPP's CROPP travel forms for past and upcoming travel and outreach events in FY17 will be tracked here: <https://community.icann.org/x/2w2OAw>
- o ISPCP Bulletins archive: <http://www.ispcp.info/ispcp-bulletin>

#### GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

- o Outreach events before and during each ICANN meeting
- o Brochures in different languages
- o Free membership
- o Exhibitions and booths in various events outside ICANN meetings, such as IGF
- o Maintain a website
- o Participation in Internet governance related civil society email lists and events, such as WSIS, the Internet governance caucus list, Bestbits, global and regional IGFs and civil society organized events such as Rightscon and Internet Freedom Festival, among others. NCUC members aim to carry out outreach and inform the broader community about NCUC and ICANN at different IG-related events. A new initiative is underway to facilitate further the outreach requests from NCUC members and the external noncommercial users.
- o Close collaboration with ICANN global and regional engagement teams
- o Supporting noncommercial and civil society events outside of ICANN and informing them about our work
- o Use of CROPP to hold events and send delegates to meetings to encourage the NCUC designated community to join

#### SSAC

- o Appointment of new SSAC members is undertaken in accordance with OP Section 2.3 New Member Selection. Other SSAC outreach is focused primarily outside the designated community and is focused on publicizing SSAC Reports both to the Board and within the broader ICANN community. Additionally, individual SSAC members participate in many other technical fora such as the Internet Engineering Task Force

(IETF), the Anti-Phishing Working Group (APWG), etc. and share any relevant SSAC work in those fora.

**Recommendations:**

1. Each AC/SO should publish newsletters or other communications that can help eligible non-members to understand the benefits and process of becoming a member.
2. Each AC/SO should maintain a publicly- accessible website/wiki pages to advertise their outreach events and opportunities
3. Each AC/SO should consider creating a committee to manage outreach programs to attract additional eligible members, particularly from parts of their targeted community that may not be adequately participating.
4. Outreach objectives and potential activities should be mentioned in AC/SO bylaws, charter, or procedures
5. Each AC/SO should have a strategy for outreach to parts of their targeted community that may not be adequately participating at the time.

**Policy and Procedures for Accountability of SO/ACs**

**ALAC**

At-Large is governed by a number of somewhat inter-related documents. Some are outdated and in need of revision and others have been revised relatively recently. They include the ICANN Bylaws which are quite specific in some areas, Rules of Procedure, Operating Principles, Memorandum of Understanding between ICANN and RALOs (actually with the organizations constituting the initial RALO members).

These include:



- ICANN Bylaws: <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/governance/bylaws-en/#XI-2.4>
- ALAC Rules of Procedure and associated documents:  
<https://community.icann.org/display/atlarge/Rules+of+Procedure>
- RALO documents (see “Organizing Documents” in left sidebar of each page): 3
  - o <https://atlarge.icann.org/ralos/afralo>
  - o <https://atlarge.icann.org/ralos/apralo>
  - o <https://atlarge.icann.org/ralos/euralo>

o <https://atlarge.icann.org/ralos/lacralo>

o <https://atlarge.icann.org/ralos/naralo>

These documents cover how the entity operates, how decisions are made, how leadership and other positions are selected.

#### ASO:

- the operating procedures of the NRO NC are available at <https://aso.icann.org/documents/operational-documents/operating-procedures-aso-ac/>
- To help clarify the work the NRO NC undertakes, an annual work plan is provided to the community. For the current year work plan, see: <https://aso.icann.org/documents/as-ac-work-plan-2016/>.
- 
- 

**Deleted:** To assist members of the community, particularly newcomers, in understanding terms that may be used in disclosed material, a glossary is made available at <https://aso.icann.org/about-the-aso/glossary/>.

**Deleted:** Further, to assist members of the community, particularly newcomers, in understanding the NRO NC, its processes, and how a community member can be involved in the GDPD, an FAQ is available at <https://aso.icann.org/about-the-aso/as-frequently-asked-questions/>.

#### ccNSO

- The ccNSO has developed a range of guidelines, which define and delineate the accountability of the ccNSO Council with respect to the ccNSO membership and broader ccTLD community. These guidelines and rules define, inter alia, internal ccNSO relation between the ccNSO Council and membership, allocation of travel funding, participation in working groups and newly created bodies. All these rules should be considered internal rules in the sense of the ICANN Bylaws and can be found at: <https://ccnso.icann.org/about/guidelines.htm>
- The general rule is that any ccTLD, regardless of its membership of the ccNSO, is always welcome to participate in the meetings of the ccNSO, contribute to discussions, and participate in the work of the working groups. However, only ccNSO members elect ccNSO Councillors and ICANN Board members (seats 11 and 12), as well as vote on the ccNSO policies.

#### GAC:

GAC Operating Principles

#### GNSO

All processes and procedures related to the GNSO Council and GNSO Working Groups are, in addition to the relevant sections of the ICANN Bylaws, detailed in the GNSO Operating Procedures (see <https://gns0.icann.org/en/council/op-procedures-01sep16-en.pdf>).

#### GNSO-BC

- The published policies and procedures to which the BC are accountable to are the

ICANN Bylaws and Expected Standards of Behaviors, GNSO bylaws and procedures, the CSG Charter, and the BC Charter.

- The Commercial and Business Users Constituency (BC) is a member of ICANN's Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO), and is located within the Commercial Stakeholders Group (CSG) in the Non-Contracted Parties House (NCPH). As such, it is accountable to the procedures outlined by the groups' respective governing documents. The CSG has its own charter, at <http://www.bizconst.org/assets/docs/ICANNCSGCharter2010.pdf>
- For example, the GNSO Procedures, in Section 6.1.2 j state: "No legal or natural person should be a voting member of more than one Group," meaning, that organizations cannot vote in more than one Constituency within the GNSO.
- Further, under the BC's current Charter, the BC requires any organization/company/association that participates in more than one Constituency/SG to maintain a "divisional separation" between their work in the BC and other Constituencies. As such, they need to identify which other Constituencies they and their organization participate in, and identify in which specific Constituency the organization chooses to vote. Their representative to the BC must not represent their organization in another Constituency within the GNSO.

#### GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- The IPC is a member of ICANN's Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO), and is located within the Commercial Stakeholders Group (CSG) in the Non-Contracted Parties House (NCPH). As such, IPC accountability is governed by the GNSO and CSG governing documents, as well as the IPC Bylaws. These include the ICANN Bylaws and Expected Standards of Behavior, GNSO Bylaws and Procedures, the CSG Charter, and the IPC Bylaws.
- GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):
- The published policies and procedures to which the ISPCP are accountable to are the ICANN
- Bylaws and Expected Standards of Behaviors, GNSO procedures, the CSG Charter, and the
- ISPCP's two governing documents: 1.) Articles and 2.) Procedures. The ISPCP is a member of ICANN's Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO), and is located within the Commercial Stakeholders Group (CSG) in the Non-Contracted Parties House (NCPH). As such, it is accountable to the procedures outlined by the groups' respective governing documents.

#### GNSO-NCUC

- (Non-Commercial Users Constituency): NCUC is a member of ICANN's Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO), and is located within the Non Commercial Stakeholders Group (NCSG) in the Non-Contracted Parties House (NCPH). As such, it is accountable to the procedures outlined by the groups' respective governing documents. NCUC also functions in accordance to NCUC bylaws. NCUC holds annual elections for Chair and Executive Committee members. We find elections to be one of the most



important aspect of NCUC accountability. All appointed offices are also renewed annually and term-limited. This means that there is a very regular process for renewing or replacing elected officers. Elected representatives have to report and show progress on a regular basis to be considered for reelection. NCUC has the highest degree of geographic and gender diversity by design (regional representation in the EC) in its elected officials and its membership (list of members is public and automatically updated <http://www.ncuc.org/about/members/>) of all the GNSO constituencies, and there is a high degree of change in its leadership.

#### SSAC

- SSAC Operational procedures

#### Recommendations:

1.

#### Reviews of policies and procedures

(drafted by Farzaneh Badii)

##### ALAC

- ALAC Bylaws: written in 2003 and updated
- The Memorandums of Understanding creating the RALOs all date back to 2006-7. The original ALAC Rules of Procedure and RALO governance documents also date to that same era, as do the regulations governing how ALSes are certified and decertified. The ALAC Rules of Procedure (RoP) were completely rewritten in 2013, and many other of the associated documents and processes formalized at that time. APRALO rewrote their Rules of Procedure in 2014 and the other four RALOs are at various stages of rewriting their operating documents. Rewriting such documents tends to be a monumental effort and time devoted to that must be balanced with volunteer time spent on the real reason we are here.
- All of these have been revised or re-written based on the recognition by those trying to govern themselves by these documents that they were insufficient (and that new/revised ones were worth the effort taken to effect the changes). Either as part of the internal review we are conducting on ALS membership criteria and the expectations we have from ALSes and RALOs, or as a result of the current At-Large Review, we expect an extensive rewrite of the ICANN Bylaws for the ALAC (ensuring that they say what actually is happening and not what people in 2002 thought we should be doing).

##### ASO/NRO

- pursuant to the ASO MOU (<https://aso.icann.org/documents/memorandums-of-understanding/memorandum-of-understanding/>) which references Article IV, Section 4 of the ICANN Bylaws (<https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/bylaws-2012-02-25-en#IV>), the NRO provides its own review mechanisms for periodic review of the ASO.

- For the current RFP related to the upcoming review, see: <https://www.nro.net/news/request-for-proposals-for-consulting-services-independent-review-of-the-icann-address-supporting-organisation>.
- In addition, see <https://www.icann.org/resources/reviews/org/aso> for information on current and past reviews.
- Most recent completed report is available at <https://www.nro.net/wp-content/uploads/ASO-Review-Report-2012.pdf>.
- RIRs have their own accountability assessment report

#### ccNSO

- The ccNSO has developed a range of guidelines, which define and delineate the accountability of the ccNSO Council with respect to the ccNSO membership and broader ccTLD community. These guidelines and rules define, inter alia, internal ccNSO relation between the ccNSO Council and membership, allocation of travel funding, participation in working groups and newly created bodies. All these rules should be considered internal rules in the sense of the ICANN Bylaws and can be found at: <https://ccnso.icann.org/about/guidelines.htm>
- The general rule is that any ccTLD, regardless of its membership of the ccNSO, is always welcome to participate in the meetings of the ccNSO, contribute to discussions, and participate in the work of the working groups. However, only ccNSO members elect ccNSO Councillors and ICANN Board members (seats 11 and 12), as well as vote on the ccNSO policies. All decisions of the ccNSO Council are immediately published on the ccNSO website and wiki space. After discussions with the community, the ccNSO Council decided to implement additional measures to ensure that community members are better informed about the issues discussed by the ccNSO Council. It means that all documents and materials are published on the wiki space at least a week before the ccNSO Council meeting and the community is invited to provide input prior to the meeting.
- 3 Since December 2014 a ccNSO working group - the Guidelines Review Committee (GRC) - is reviewing current practices and related documentation of the ccNSO. If considered necessary by the GRC, updates of the documentation and/or new guidelines are suggested and after consultation with the ccNSO membership are adopted by the ccNSO Council. The GRC has also been tasked to develop and propose guidelines, practices and working methods to implement the ccNSO related direct and indirect aspects of the 1 October 2016 ICANN Bylaws.

#### GAC:

- The GAC participates by appointing members to ATRT and other review teams. All GAC-related recommendations in both the ATRT1 and 2 Final reports have been implemented by the GAC. The GAC also reviews its internal processes and Operating Principles when developments so require.

#### GNSO

- Review of such policies and procedures is covered as part of the structural review of the

GNSO which has resulted in previous improvements and updates. The recommendations of the current GNSO Review are in the process of being implemented.

#### GNSO-BC

- The current Charter displayed on the BC website was revised in 2009. In 2014, the BC established a Charter revision committee to explore another charter update. A new Charter was approved by BC Members in Oct-2016 and submitted to ICANN to undergo the five-stage approval process. The new charter appears in the Appendix and at <http://www.bizconst.org/assets/docs/Charter/bc%20charter%20v3%200-final%20draft%20v5.pdf>
- The BC updates its Charter based upon cumulative requests from BC members. Requests typically note a need for clarifications, for specific amendments, or the need to update the Charter to account for changing circumstances.

#### GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- The IPC Bylaws were adopted on November 15, 2010 and replace the Bylaws that were effective November 14, 2005. The Bylaws were updated, at least in part, to respond to specific community requests/concerns. For example, there were concerns that under the old Bylaws, 12 there was no voting role for individual members. Such a role was provided in the revised Bylaws.

#### GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):

- Not updated

#### GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

- NCUC just conducted a major review and revision of its bylaws. The process, which started almost two years ago, has involved a major redrafting and finally approval by a supermajority of the membership. The revised NCUC bylaws provide more clarity on membership eligibility requirements as well as formal procedures for removal of members and officers. The new bylaws also contain a clause reaffirming NCUC's commitment to accountability.

#### SSAC

- The SSAC OP is reviewed annually. The current Version 5.0 is dated 20 June 2016. These reviews have resulted in several changes, such as to the New Member Selection and Annual Review processes undertaken in late 2015/early 2016, resulting in Version 5.0. The SSAC has previously advised that it wishes to continue providing its input to the ICANN Community in a purely advisory capacity and does not wish to take on any role in exercising community powers. Additionally, in the annual review of the OP the SSAC takes into consideration concerns, if any, raised by the community and ensures that the OP is not in conflict with the ICANN Bylaws with respect to the SSAC and its role.

Recommendations:

1. All SOACs should review their procedures annually and make changes to their operational procedures as needed

### Challenging Decisions

ALAC

- In general, we do not have rules formally appealing decisions or elections. Some RALOs rely (somewhat inappropriately, but for historic reasons) on the United Nations General Assembly Rules of Procedure (UNGA RoP) and those do include a number of such recourses.
- On the relatively rare occasion where there has been unease over a decision, the processes within our own rules have been used to address the issue (usually by someone requesting that the issue be re-visited).
- We have only had three situations where the rules and processes we had in place could not address a situation. One was settled somewhat easily by the RALO Leadership deciding (with the support of the membership) to re-hold an election, but first to amend the Rules to cover the situation of a tie vote which had caused the problem.
- The other two were more problematic and occurred in one of the other RALOs. The first was (fortunately) ultimately addressed by a serendipitous action out of our control. The second involved invocation of the UNGA RoP and ended up in extreme crisis which is still not settled.
- The ALAC's RoP do provide to the recall of all appointments (including ALAC Chair and Leadership Team) and the dismissal of ALAC members (both those appointed by RALOs and the NomCom).
- The APRALO revised RoP have comparable recall/removal procedures and it is expected that as the other RALOs revise their rules, there will be similar provisions.

ASO/NRO:

- With regard to disputes or appeals of elections of members of the NRO NC, any such procedures are found at the respective RIRs' election procedures. The process of decisions made by the NRO NC are available in its Operating Procedures document found at <https://aso.icann.org/documents/operational-documents/operating-procedures-aso-ac/>.

#### ccNSO

- With respect to the formal policy development process, the ultimate decision is with the ccNSO members, as they will take the final vote on adoption of the recommended policy (see Annex B section 13).

Basic mechanism for appealing decisions is documented in the Rules of the ccNSO

(<https://ccnso.icann.org/about/ccnso-rules-dec04-en.pdf>). Accordingly, 10 members of the

#### GAC

#### GNSO

- Review of such policies and procedures is covered as part of the structural review of the GNSO which has resulted in previous improvements and updates. The recommendations of the current GNSO Review are in the process of being implemented.

#### GNSO-BC

- Appeals – BC Charter (new) §2.6 In the new BC Charter, the Executive Committee (EC) is entrusted with responsibilities in §2.6: BC response to questions from Work Stream 2 group on SO/AC Accountability 12-Dec- 2016 Page 3 of 1 BC\_SOAC Accountability Report source documents\_20161128

#### GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

- Appeal mechanisms for the refusal of a membership application or the expulsion of a member are as follows:
  - 
  - Any decision of the IPC officers can be appealed to the IPCC, with the possibility of further review by the ICANN ombudsman in accordance with the ICANN by-laws.
  - 
  - [The IPCC may] refuse or expel any member where on reasonable grounds it feels it is in the best interest of the IPC to do so; provided, that any such action is subject to review by the ICANN Ombudsman in accordance with the ICANN by-laws.

#### GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers)

- Not yet covered. There wasn't any case so far.

#### GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

- Yes, see section IV (G) of the new NCUC bylaws.  
<http://www.ncuc.org/governance/bylaws/bylaws-revision-2016/differential-document/>

#### SSAC

- Existing SSAC members can challenge the appointment of new members proposed by the Membership Committee in accordance with OP Section 2.3 New Member Selection. Where an objection is raised, the matter is resolved by consensus of the whole SSAC. SSAC members agree to the content of all SSAC Publications by consensus. SSAC members who have contributed to an SSAC Publication are listed in the document. If an SSAC member wishes to object to the work product or asks to withdraw from consideration of the work product for any reason, the member is offered an opportunity to provide a statement explaining their dissent or withdrawal (OP Section 2.1.2), and/or to be listed in the final document under the section for dissents or withdrawals. Election of SSAC Office Bearers is undertaken in accordance with OP Section 2.8.1.1 Chair Election. Other SSAC Officer Bearers defined in OP Section 1.5 are elected by the same procedure as the Chair. The election of SSAC members to other roles also follows this process. Provisions for challenges to election results are contained within the detailed process.

#### Recommendation for Review of the Policies and Accountability Mechanisms

- Reviews should be more regular and also address members concerns ( self-assessment)

#### Any unwritten policies

##### ALAC

- No

##### ASO/NRO:

- The ASO is committed to the open, transparent and bottom-up nature of the multistakeholder model and pursuant to this commitment, the ASO conducts itself accordingly.

##### ccNSO

The discussions in the context of the enhancing ICANN's Accountability and a survey launched by the ccNSO Council on community's expectations in respect to accountability of the ccNSO Council have resulted in an increased awareness and need for transparency of the ccNSO Council decision making process and more transparency of the ccNSO Council working methods in general. Currently the ccNSO is developing new practices and methods through its Guideline Review Committee, and the ccNSO Council already acts in accordance with some of these working methods, for example, by increasing community awareness about publication of ccNSO Council meeting agendas and background materials. These new practices & working methods will become effective, after being discussed with the ccTLD community and adopted by the ccNSO Council.

#### GAC

The GAC has funded, through several of its Members, an independent secretariat function, currently carried out under contract by the Australian Continuous Improvement Group (ACIG). The ability to have policy and procedural analysis and advice independent of ICANN corporate support has enhanced the GAC's ability to communicate effectively with Members and the broader community on substantive issues, and to implement many of the recommendations from the ATRT1 and ATRT2 Reviews.

#### GNSO

N/A

#### GNSO-BC

The BC endeavors to put its policies in writing, as part of its charter. While there are unwritten prior practices cited for some activities, we are not aware of any that are responsive to these questions.

#### GNSO-IPC (Intellectual Property Constituency):

At the commencement of each election, the candidates participate in a "Candidate Call," a conference call (by phone and Adobe Connect) in which the candidates respond to questions. Questions are posted to the IPC mailing list prior to the Call, and new questions are asked on the Call as well. This is not a written policy.

The IPC has an unwritten policy that all draft public comments should be posted to the IPC mailing list one week before the end of the comment period, so that the membership can review, discuss and revise the draft public comment before it is submitted.

Informally, IPC leadership can be held accountable on the IPC mailing list at any time, or on a membership call. Members can also raise any issue, at any time, on the IPC mailing list for the IPC's consideration or awareness.

Current IPC practice varies from the Bylaws in certain ways. IPC is undertaking a Bylaws review and amendment process in order to bring the Bylaws in line with current practice.

Accountability of the IPC's Councilors is informally maintained through the taking of detailed notes on the deliberations decisions and rationales of the GNSO Council in matters raised in Council meetings. These are circulated promptly to IPC members, who are invited to raise comments, concerns and questions on the IPC's participation in these decisions.

#### GNSO-ISPCP (Internet Service Providers and Connectivity Providers):

#### GNSO-NCUC (Non-Commercial Users Constituency):

Before elections, candidates are expected to express in their SOI the ways they will be keeping the members (regional groups and full membership) up to date with their activities - through bulletins, use of social media or other communication strategies. The interval of time which these updates is done (fortnightly, whenever there is an event, other options) is also discussed with membership or potential voters. Members appointed by NCUC 4 for different working groups or committees or members receiving funding for particular activities may also submit reports.

SSAC

N/A

Recommendations:

- It is advised to document as many procedure and customs that have been developed in the course of SO/ACs practice periodically, this can be done in procedural operation documents as well as the bylaws