
YEŞİM NAZLAR:

Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening to everyone. Welcome to the first NARALO webinar on ARIN basics, an introduction to the NARALO membership, taking place on Monday, 6th of February 2017 at 18:00 UTC.

We will not be doing a roll call. It is a webinar, but if I could please remind all participants on the phone bridge, as well as computers, to mute your speakers, and microphones, when not speaking. Also, please don't forget to state your name before speaking for the transcription purposes.

Thank you all for joining. I'll not turn it over to Glenn McKnight, the chair of NARALO. Thank you very much. Over to you, Glenn.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Great. Thank you so much Yeşim. Thank you all for coming today. Judith and I welcome you to this call. We see great value in having someone as informed and active in ARIN on our call, and I thank Chris for his opportunity to join us.

I would like to just tell you a little bit about Chris before we start. So, Chris is a lawyer. He's based in Ottawa. He has over 36 years of technical, business, and legal experience. Chris is a founder of [inaudible] Law, and it's known as a boutique law firm, providing a wide range, broad range, of legal and consulting services to clients in the information technology sector, communication, regulatory industry, and broader commercial and not-for-profit sectors.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

In addition, he provides traditional legal services. Chris assists clients with strategic planning, governance, risk management, business reviews, commercial transactions, as well as corporate and regulatory compliance. Chris's past professional experience includes holding a senior executive role in a publicly traded company, being a partner in a major regional law firm, and working in a national law firm.

Prior to practicing law, he had another venue that he pursued, and he pursued engineering and managerial positions in the private sector. He's not only a lawyer, he's a registered trademarked agent, license professional engineer, and also holds a MBA. Chris serves on numerous boards, not-for-profit boards in Canada, and a green technology start-up firm.

He also is involved in the internet governance through various volunteer activities, including ARIN advisor. Welcome Chris. And as a personal friend, I know Chris for a number of years. He's been very active and very seminal in helping the Internet Society of Canada to be as successful as it is. So, welcome again Chris.

Okay, folks, so our agenda today is we want all of those who are attending our ARIN session and our General Assembly, that's going to be in New Orleans, we want you to have a heads up on the actual ARIN organization, and what Chris is involved in that as an advisory counselor. So, I'm going to turn it over to Chris on his presentations. And if we could hold back on the questions until the end of it, and thank you William for posting a question already, I will make sure that it's asked at the end of the presentation.

So, I'm turning it back to Chris. Thank you.

CHRIS TACIT:

Thank you very much, Glenn. And thank you all for your attention today. I very much appreciate the opportunity of giving you this presentation. And for those of you who have not yet been familiarized with ARIN to give you a little bit of an introduction. Today's introduction will just be a very high level overview of ARIN and where it sits in the internet ecosystem.

I'm not going to get into how ARIN does its job, but that will be left for some future time, if you're interested. Then I will be happy to come back and do that presentation at another time. So, ARIN's job is the same of that of the four other regional internet registries, and that is, really, to look after predominately the allocation of internet numbering resources.

The world is divided up into five regions. And as you can see, ARIN is predominately North America. It's Canada, the U.S., much of the English speaking Caribbean, and a few other little odds and ends, including Antarctic, for those who are interested.

So, what do RIRs do? They manage the distribution of IP addresses and autonomous system numbers. They provide reverse DNS, and provide a public WHOIS database. If any of you don't know what any of that terminology is, please ask during the question and answer session, and we'll get into that.

And they also deport technical infrastructure through various technical coordination. So, just like you have on the domain name sides, that whole ecosystem, the RIRs look after the numbering resources. The way that they're structured is they're independent organizations, they're not for profit. They charge fees for the services that they provide.

They don't sell or lease numbering resources as such, but they do charge fees for the services that they provide, and they're 100% community funded. And typically, they are membership based. The members within ARIN, for example, are ISPs and large telecom organizations that have their own network.

And those are the parties who get resources, they can also be members. The community itself developed the policies for the allocation and assignment of numbering resources. It is a function that's done by the community, and the community is broader than just the membership. Anybody who has an interest in this area can participate in that process.

So, how are numbering resources allocated? Well, they come from IANA, in accordance with IANA global policies through the five RIRs. And each RIR then, has its own policy process for how it allocates and assigns addressing space. The most common way is for address space to be allocated to ISPs who then may sub-allocate to other ISPs or assigned to end users.

However, it is also possible as an end user to get an allocation, I'm sorry, an assignment directly from the RIR. So, focusing now on ARIN more specifically rather than RIRs generically. ARIN supports the operation of

the internet through the management of internet number resources, which is done in accordance with the public policies, the policies that are developed by the community and related, contractual arrangements that are developed and approved by the Board of Trustees of ARIN.

ARIN's staff helps to coordinate the development of policies by the community, but it's the community and not staff to develop those policies. And it's engaged in outreach, so what I'm doing today here is part of ARIN's outreach effort. There are others, and we'll talk about those in a bit.

So, as I was saying, this is ARIN's service region. And so that's the area that ARIN covers. In terms of numbers, right now, ARIN has about 20,000 plus direct customers, 5400 plus members, and 80 plus professional staff based near the Washington, D.C. area.

But I want to stress again that anyone interested in number resource management and policy development can participate in that process. Geographically, you see the split here. Most of the member organizations are based in the U.S., with a smaller percentage, about 12%, in Canada, and a small sliver in the Caribbean, and a much smaller sliver that isn't even visible there, in the other few locations where ARIN operates.

How is ARIN structured? It's governed by a Board of Trustees. Six are elected for three-year terms. And then by an advisory council of 15 elected people who have three-year terms. Then there is also part of the organization called the NRONC, they are elected for three-year terms, and that is our link to ICANN, and I'll explain that in a minute.

The Board of Trustees, and six are elected by the membership, and the president and CEO is also automatically a member of the Board of Trustees. They do rotating elections, so you don't have the whole Board of Trustees turning over in any one year, and so typically two seats open up in each election year.

And there is an ability to appoint an additional voting member for diversity, and diversity can be demographic, it could be geographic, it could be professional skillset. And basically, the Board of Trustees has a fiduciary duty to make sure that the activities of ARIN are conducted in a manner that is appropriate and lawful, and in accordance with what governance, corporate governance practices.

It's also responsible for the strategic plan and fiscal, strategic planning and fiscal oversight. The advisory council, we have 15 members. I'm one of them, elected for a three-year term. Advisory seats open up each year, again, the idea is not to have a massive turnover in any one year.

And basically, the advisory council people serve as advisors to the Board on interest numbering resource policy. We take the policies that people bring in and work with them, we assign people to shepherd them, and to ensure that they accord with the requirements for policy, and that there is consensus, community consensus before they are forwarded to the Board for ratification.

And again, this one slide, this one bullet is a subject of a whole separate presentation on how that process works, which I'm not going to get into today. The NRONC is a 15 member body. Each RIR gets three, two

elected and one appointed. They assist in the ICANN global policy development process, and they select two of the ICANN Board seats.

And they provide advice to the ICANN Board, on a number of resource allocation policy, in conjunction with the RIRs. As I said earlier, the Board of Trustees is responsible for the strategic planning for the organization. Each year, it states the strategic plans, and this drives the priorities of the organization, the operational plan and so on. And you can see there is a link there to where you can find the plan.

In terms of organizational objectives, what we've got, well, what we've got right now, I don't know what's happening there, but somebody else is tinkering with this.

Organizational objectives. You can see here, there are a variety of organizational objectives, I'm not going to read them all. They're self-evident from the slides, but it clearly, in addition to the purely functional role that ARIN has, there is a big role that ARIN sees for itself in terms of including participation from the community, and promoting diversity, promoting participation from the Caribbean, which is a little more difficult because of geography sometimes, and so on.

We also end up, the WHOIS database is an important tool for law enforcement. So, we're constantly, you know, working to ensure that the WHOIS database is accurate, both for law enforcement purposes and for other reasons as well. Obviously, everybody wants to have an accurate registry. And at the same time, ensuring that there is compliance with privacy laws and so on.

The ARIN organization is very involved in sort of technical issues associated with routing at a high level to make sure that routing of numbers works properly and efficiently. As I'm sure most of you, if not all of you, already know, in the ARIN region, IPv4 addresses have run out. It's not possible to get anymore from ARIN.

So, one of the things that ARIN is trying to do is to promote the transition to IPv6, create awareness, and also provide the technical support organizations that are, by going in that direction. So, these are the functions that ARIN manages, IP addresses and assignments, autonomous system number assignments, transfers.

Now, ARIN's role in transfers to make sure that transfers are authorized in accordance with policy. In other words, that any transfers that happen, happen in accordance with ARIN policy, and to record the outcome of those transfers that are approved, so that the registry records are accurate when IP resources are transferred from one entity to another.

As I said, the DNS function and the directory services like WHOIS. There are a whole bunch of technical things that ARIN is doing to harden the routing of numbering, and to prevent fraud. They're involved in DNSSEC, which is a way of securing DNS. Resource certification, also known as RPKI. They are also, ARIN also provides the community software project repository where developers can actually deposit software tools, that make it easy to use and manipulate ARIN's formations, and various forms of WHOIS directory services, and they maintain, you know, they do testing and so on for new ways of doing things.

So, it's a very forward looking, innovative organization. ARIN has a very good conidium of training and educational materials and videos. And there are also opportunities to learn more about ARIN at both, at what are called, ARIN on the road meetings, or ARIN [inaudible] on the road meetings.

And what happens there, ARIN staff, AC members and trustees in small groups, will travel to do different cities within the ARIN region, and basically put on a one-day seminar, sometimes alone, sometimes in conjunction with [inaudible], in which they explain, in greater detail, what ARIN does, how it does it, and introduce the members of the community who don't know much about ARIN to other tools and so on.

So, if any of you are interested, as you go to ARIN dot Net under the participate tab, you'll be able to see what ARIN on the road sessions are coming up. And if there is one near you, you can participate. Similarly, if you are in the ARIN region, and you think that ARIN should be coming to do an ARIN on the road, and you can contact me or Susan Hamilon at ARIN, and make a request, and if there is enough demand, ARIN is pretty happy to go where there is a significant demand for such presentations.

So, that whole thing of ARIN on the road and so on, is part of the outreach and community engagement part of ARIN's mandate. Another big way that the community participates is twice a year, there are public policy meetings in April and October of each year within the ARIN region, and they're spread around between Canada, the U.S., and the Caribbean portion.

They rotate around through various locations. In addition, sometimes at [inaudible] meetings, ARIN gets a slot for what's called the public policy consultation, which from a policy development process, has the same status as one of the major public policy meetings, although usually in a PPC, unlike a PPM, there will only be a substantive policy considered, rather than the entire, rather than the entire docket.

At the upcoming [inaudible], there was a choice made not to have a PPC because there wasn't anything really pressing, so anything that needs to be discussed will be discussed at the PPM in April in New Orleans. And one of the things that, as I said, we do with the technical community, and we put a lot of effort into working with Caribbean organizations to maximizing collusion.

Also, we foster working relationships on a global scale, which is, again, what this presentation is all about as well. And through the NRONC and its other forums within ICANN, and so on, ARIN is present to interact with other entities that are involved in internet governance, and to both share with them what ARIN does and learn from them.

As I alluded earlier, that you can get help if you're looking at IPv6 implementation and you're not sure where to start, there is a whole, there are [inaudible] people at ARIN who are willing to help, and there are resources available as well. And, ARIN has a bunch of mailing lists. Only one of them is a closed list for members only, but you can participate in any of the other lists that you want.

And so, if you have an interest, for example, in public policy, you can join ARIN dash PPML at ARIN dot Net. If you're interested in expressing

your views on sort of more strategic and other types of issues, you can join ARIN dash consult. If you're a technical person, you can join the technical list, and so on.

Announce is one that you can join just to get generic announcements from ARIN about things in the community that happen from time to time. Okay. And, ARIN is very present on social media as well. So, feel free to follow ARIN and link up with some using these other social media vehicles.

So, how can you participate? Subscribe to an ARIN mailing list, attend the public policy, and member's meeting. And on that point, I want to add that ARIN has a Fellowship program. So, people in the ARIN region can ask to be subsidized to attend an ARIN meeting, and if they want to learn more about ARIN and have a genuine interest in its mandate and the industries for whatever reason, and if accepted, it's accepted, all travel and attendance costs are covered for that particular meeting.

And you can also voice your opinion in various consultations. Very important if you are deploying IPv6, we'd love to hear from your experiences like, and others can learn from your experiences. You can connect on social media. They're also some committees that have various volunteers from the community. You can volunteer to serve on those.

And if you're a member, you can vote in the annual elections for trustees and AC representatives, and [inaudible] representative. And that concludes my presentation. So, at this point, I would be happy to

take any questions that you may have, and I'll put myself on mute while I'm listening.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Thank you so much. Judith Hellerstein has joined us as well. For the sake of expediency, I've copy and pasted the questions into our logistics page, and some of them are questions, some of them are comments. And the first question was from William Cunningham, who basically asked, what is the ARIN advisory council?

And I know you dealt with that, Chris, but I want to make sure I turn back to William, and ask William directly, did you get the answers you expected from Chris on this issue? Or is there a follow-up questions to Chris? Over to you, William.

I think you're on mute, William. Can you hear us?

WILLIAM MICHAEL CUNNINGHAM: Can you hear me?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Go ahead, William.

WILLIAM MICHAEL CUNNINGHAM: Okay. Yeah, for the most part, got most of the answers. But I'm interested in, you know, just a real quick 10, 15 second overview. The other thing on the advisory council, the other thing I'm interested and

I'm not sure, was more information on the link between ICANN and ARIN. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, thank you William. That's a great question. Back to you, Chris.

CHRIS TACIT: All right. Yeah, thank you. Thanks Glenn. So as to the AC, so basically, you know, it's a whole separate presentation, but the AC basically stewards the policy development processes. So, what happens is when a [inaudible] proposes a number in policy, the chair of the AC assigns to shepherd to basically take that policy, see if it meets ARIN criteria, and then work with the author and the community to basically develop that policy and see how far it will go.

Usually a policy... Well, a policy has to be vetted in at least one public policy meeting, and the shepherds have the role of presenting and explaining the policy to the community of that meeting, and taking back any feedback it has. The AC also has monthly meetings, which it discusses policy and [inaudible] policy and so on.

AC shepherds have the discretion to change policy language. Once a policy is handed over and becomes a draft policy of ARIN, it's under the control of the shepherds and not the original author, although typically, the shepherds will continue to work with the author if the author wants to be involved.

And ultimately, if there is support for that policy after there was decisions, indication of community consensus, the AC will vote to ask

the Board of Trustees to actually adopt the policy. So potentially, the AC acts as stewards in the policy development process, but they do not in and of themselves, we do not actually approve policy, we just recommend, you know, we take a draft policy, we take a proposal, and if it's not rejected, we turn it into a draft policy, and then we work with that and if it's not rejected at that stage, we turn it into a recommended draft policy.

And at that point, if it's not abandoned, we urge for it go to a last call and eventually adoption. From there, it's really the Board's responsibility. During that process, we can get advice from staff, and their lawyers, on operational and legal implications of adopting the proposed policy, and whether it's clear enough to be implemented and so on, before it goes to the Board.

And once a proposal is adopted, there is usually a period of time that's required to actually implement it. Once that happen, the numbering and resource policy manual, which contains all numbering policies, aided to reflect the new policy. So, that's the AC's role.

Does that answer that part of the question sufficiently?

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Yes, William says he has... In fact, that was a great question, because I actually love the shepherding process that you guys do, and I've always suggested this process for ICANN. I want to turn it over to Judith, who is the secretary and vice-chair for, and allow her to continue on with the questions. Judith, please.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, thanks so much for your questions. So, the next one are two questions that are kind of interrelated. Eduardo asked, why are policy processes different in each region if the function is the same? And Alfredo asks, how feasible would it be to have an unified policy process and reciprocal rule?

CHRIS TACIT: Okay. Well, you know, I wasn't there when the sort of numbering, the regions all sort of developed, but what I can say is that due to the unique needs of each region, and part of that need is the different rates at which internet numbers are used and deployed and so on, and cultural reasons, and a whole host of reasons, the RIR did develop, and each is responsible for its own region, just like, you know, each country has its own country code domain rules, and we can say, well why isn't there a global one?

I don't know why there isn't, but there isn't and each country does its own country codes policies in the domain... And similarly, the RIRs do a numbering. Now, there is, there can be global coordination of policies, but it's a very difficult process because what it really requires is five RIRs to agree on identical policy language, and then ask for that to become a coordinated global policy.

So as you can imagine, there are very few global policies. There are, though, more globally coordinated policies. And for example, in the [inaudible] space, one example of that is, and maybe not necessarily

globally, but as among different regions, sometimes it's all five, sometimes it's two or three.

But for example, some regions allow out of transfer, out of region transfer of addressing space, but they will only allow it if the other region also allows the transfer, other region transfers and so on. So, there could be sort of indirect coordination by virtue of the fact that RIRs adopt similar rules, and so when they have to interact with each other, the rules become somewhat similar.

But, you know, I've attended a few APNIC meetings now, and I'm going to another one in late February, and, you know, it is interesting, you now, it's different in that part of it is just the vultures, part of it is that they're in a different state than the ARIN region, and so those sensitivities are addressed by having the different RIRs develop their policy, in their own backyard.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much. That was very helpful. So, you mentioned about transfers, and that brings up another question that we had, but we didn't have as much information. Eduardo has a question on transfers, but whether you answered it already, or whether Eduardo, you want to mention it?

EDUARDO DIAZ:

I just, when he was mentioning transfers in the presentation, I'm not sure what you were talking about. I have another question about

autonomous system numbers, and which I'm not sure what it is. When you transfer, you transfer what? Numbers?

CRHIS TACIT:

I'll answer your second question first. Autonomous system numbers are numbers that basically are used by organizations to delineate the boundaries of their network, then it is this network, as opposed to devices, to route traffic among them. So, an IP address is usually at the device level, and an autonomous system number delineates an entire network as defined by the network operator.

So, that's the sort of high level answer. When you talk about transfers, that relates us to IP addresses, and there are a kind of three circumstances under which transfers take place. One is if you have something like a corporate merger, or a reorganization, where it's basically, in order to maintain the accuracy of the registry, as a result of that corporate transaction, you want to have the number and resources properly identified, in terms of who they're allocated or assigned to.

Another is, the transfer market itself. Entities are allowed to transfer resources to each other, and that is a very active market in North America, for example, in the IPv4 transfer market, because IPv4 resources are not available from ARIN, generally speaking, anymore, with some very minor exceptions.

So, what people do is they basically enter into commercial transactions to transfer resources to each other, but as the stewards of numbering resources, those transfers, although ARIN does not get involved in the economic aspect of any such transfer, that's strictly between the

purchaser and the seller, there are some criteria relating to whether recipients validly needs the resources, because again, one of ARIN's role is resource conservation.

So, in order to approve the transfer and record the change in the registry, they need to, the transfer has to meet policy requirements. And the other way transfers occur is between regions, and the primary reason for that is operators and global networks who need to move their resources around in the world in order to improve the efficiency of routing of their global networks, so they may want to deploy some of their numbering resources better than the ARIN region and one of the other regions, so there has to be a mechanism for them to be able to export those into the other regions to accept them and vice versa.

So, those are kind of the three broad categories under which transfers take place. I hope that answers the question.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Okay. Thanks so much. We have another question from John Laprise, wanting to know about audits and whether they're conducted internally or by third party.

CHRIS TACIT:

So, I can only give you a partial answer. As an AC member, I don't get involved in that side of things. That's really a Board of Trustee and staff function. I am pretty sure there is an annual sort of financial audit that is done externally, as most organizations of a significant size would have. As to the details of audits, I know ARIN is a pretty well run

organization, so I'd be very surprised if it doesn't, you know, do some of its own internal auditing.

Now, if you're talking about auditing of the accuracy of the database, that's a different issue. And ARIN does have a validation program where it reaches out, at least once a year, to the point of contact, also called the [POD?] for resources to try and validate the information in the database relating to the resources held by the [POD]. And that that [POD] is still the [POD] in fact.

So, I don't know if that really could be considered an auditing function so much as a validation function, but so that's kind of tested the limits of my knowledge on it.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much. Alfredo wanted to know about whether the materials for ARIN on the road are in any other languages besides English.

CHRIS TACIT:

Well, I think the ones that happens in the English speaking part of ARIN are in English. I honestly don't know if anything is translated into other languages. That's a good question. I haven't personally seen them. From a Canadian perspective, I haven't seen them translated into French, for example, and I don't know whether they've translated them into Spanish or not, but is there a suggestion there or a request that we should consider doing that?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, there is.

CHRIS TACIT: Okay, well, that's something [CROSSTALK]...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: And especially as currently, there is going to be ARIN on the road in Puerto Rico, and we would expect them to be in Spanish, but that would be a great idea beforehand to find out, so they don't come down and only give them in English.

CHRIS TACIT: So, that's an interesting point. I think to do that, may require simultaneous translation because I don't think every single ARIN staff, Board, or AC member that participates in the ARIN on the road is fluent in Spanish or French.

So, to arrange that, that's an interesting point. So, I'll get back to staff with that concern. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Okay, great. Okay. Again, it's Judith again. Eduardo has another question about whether NRO Board members in ICANN, NRO Board members who are also in the NRO constituency in ICANN, do they have voting rights?

CHRIS TACIT: Voting rights where? In ICANN?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: In ICANN.

CHRIS TACIT: So, the NRONC, which is comprised of NRONC members from all five RIRs, elect, together elect the Board seats nine and 10, and those Board seats nine and 10 certainly have votes on the ICANN Board, like another other ICANN Board member would.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks. This is Judith again. Thanks so much. Does anyone have any additional questions, because we've gone through all of the listed questions that people had. Oh, Eduardo, you have another question. Okay. So, Eduardo, go ahead.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yes, I... Thank you. Chris, when you mentioned that you have 20,000 customers and 5,000 members, what's the difference between customers and members? I couldn't get that.

CHIRS TACIT: Yeah, so remember, at the beginning, I said that there are two ways resources are doled out. One is through allocation, and allocations are to organizations like ISPs and network operators, and assignments which is directly to end users. End users are not, cannot be members

typically, but ISPs and organizations that spend, get allocations from ARIN, and then have to manage those resources themselves, either through sub-allocations or assignments, are the members.

So, typically, that's why you see a big difference because, as an individual, assuming you qualify under ARIN policy, you can get a direct assignment, but you won't necessarily be a member if that happens.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

This is Judith again. Eduardo, is that...? Are you fine with that? Okay, good. And Glenn asked, in seats nine and 10, is that the NRO Council? Or maybe you can give a little bit more information about that?

CHRIS TACIT:

So, seats nine and 10 are just two of the seats on the ICANN Board, they're numbered nine and 10, and they are voted by the NRONC as a whole. I don't know what more I can say about that.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

The question was...

EDUARDO DIAZ:

This is Eduardo...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I guess the question was, that are those ARIN...? So ARIN is just...? It's in the NRO, so the whole NRO council appoints those two seats. So, it could be that an ARIN member would be a Board member too.

CHRIS TACIT: They might come from the ARIN region, they might come from one of the other regions. Like, there are only two seats and five RIRs at any one time, two are in and three are out. So, you know, typically, but that's, you know, it cycles through so that's kind of the way it works. But the NRO among itself decides, which are the two equal from the NRO, and see that it will serve on the ICANN Board, but it's only two out of the five RIR regions, and it's two out of the 15 that are NRONC members.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much. Eduardo, you had another question.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Well, it's about the same thing. The reason I'm asking is, if these two candidates have both been invited on the Board, and you just answered that, is because in your presentation, they provide advice to the Board, and when they're not providing advice to the Board, they just a Board member, just like the rest of the other ones.

I mean, they have been appointed by that organization...

CRHIS TACIT:

Okay. So, the NRONC provides advice to the Board, because it is still a separate entity, but the two people who sit on the Board are Board members. There is a difference between the two who happen to be Board members, and the NRONC as a separate entity of 15 people from five RIRs, who can at any time, as a group, you know, give advice to the ICANN Board as a whole.

So, there is a distinction there.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Thanks so much, Chris. This is Judith again. Do we have any other questions? That we have some other people, because I think we ran out of the questions that were posted originally. So, if anyone has any other questions, now is a good time.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Judith, it's Glenn, if I could just intercede for a second. I would like to welcome Alan Greenberg, the chair of At-Large, and if he would like to just introduce himself or make any comments, I'm sorry that you were tied up on the evolution call, Alan, but we've been getting a great presentation and fantastic questions from the community of our participants today.

So, I would like to give Alan an opportunity to say a few words.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Glenn, this is Judith. I don't think he's on the bridge yet.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, sorry about that. Okay, as Judith has said, these are great questions. I've been listing them, the recording will be available. Sorry Avri, I apologize, I didn't notice you in the list. Avri, did you have any questions as well? I think that's it.

So, okay, I think, Judith, I think that's basically it. And I just want to turn back to Chris. Are there any final comments, Chris, that you would like to say to the group?

CHRIS TACIT: I just want to thank you all for the opportunity to give this presentation. I am a big believer in ARIN's mandate and how ARIN goes about fulfilling that mandate. And I always loved to share that with the broader internet community, so I'm grateful for the opportunity to make this presentation. And thank you for your engagement.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Chris, thanks so much. This is Judith again. I guess, the question also is, I know we're going to be asked, is... Can we post the PDF copy to our site?

CHRIS TACIT: I believe so. Just hold off until I get clearance from staff, they really control that. I can't imagine it's going to be a problem. Because they post all of the materials on ARIN on the road on their website, but let

me... I will get back to you more formally once I get an answer from staff.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Great. And I see Alan Greenberg has now joined our bridge, and I wanted to introduce him. Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you very much. I wanted to apologize for not making this meeting. Unfortunately, there were overlapping meetings scheduled, one of them to do with the ICANN accountability stream and keeping At-Large up to date, and unfortunately, that meeting ran over significantly.

So, I've missed most of this. I will be on the call later in March to be there for the whole thing, but I did want to try to make this one as well. All I can say is, I'm just delighted that we're holding the GA at the ARIN meeting.

As most people know, the second N in ICANN stands for numbers, but we spend a tremendous amount of our time on the names aspect, and particularly the GNSO. So, I think it's marvelous that we're having this opportunity to get acquainted with the whole concept of internet numbers, and how ARIN works, and the involvement with ICANN.

And I'm looking forward to the meeting in New Orleans. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you so much, Alan. And Alan has been a big supporter of us having this type of call. He feels that this is a great way for us to get to know each other, A, and B, we are co-hosts in doing this. And going back, when Evan proposes this idea, which was supposed to be Montreal.

We saw really great value in the synergy, and we have a MOU signed with ARIN. And what better way to get to know each other, is to have this pre-call in advance? And I see Leah has put her hand up. Leah, go ahead.

Leah? Just waiting for...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: You might be on mute.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Leah, you're on mute. Leah was one of the attendees. She was a Fellow in Montreal. Leah is with the San Francisco Bay ISOC chapter. And we still don't hear you, Leah. [CROSSTALK]...

No, she says, sorry, Judith. Folks, at the beginning of this call, we were making sure everything was going well, and what Chris said he had two presentations in mind today. One, the basics on ARIN, and then another one on the policy process. We've had such a great turnout today. Unfortunately, the second one that we have is for those that couldn't make it today, but if the community is really interested in it, possibly I could twist Chris's arm to possibly arrange another time to do a policy purpose call.

Is that a possible idea, Chris, to you, to do an additional call just on policy?

CHRIS TACIT: Yeah, I'd be happy to do that session as well at some point, sure, absolutely. Just as long as we can work out the schedule well in advance, I don't see a problem.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Great. Thank you so much...

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: ...Glenn and Leah asked me to read out her question. So, her thing was that her chapter, the San Francisco Bay ISOC chapter, it was an ALS, is planning a collaborative meeting with ARIN in California this October, and they're working with Susan Hamlin, and I guess the thought was maybe they could have some more insight on how this is happened, or what they should be doing.

And maybe you guys can talk together about that. And I'm guessing that was her question. That was her statement.

CRIS TACIT: Yes, anything that we can do to help, I think the ARIN on the road is very much staff driven, so Susan Hamlin is a great resource for that, but if you have any specific questions on AC matters of PDP, policy development process, or anything else, I'm always available to take

questions, and to interact, and if I can't answer your question, or if I'm not the right person, I'll refer you to the people who are the correct people.

So, I'm happy to interact and help in whatever way I can.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Great. Thanks again Chris. Okay, I think that's it for today. This is a great kick off of the call, and if you miss some of the links, we're trying to capture all of the links, and thank you Alfredo for doing that, and Chris you'll get back to us on distribution of the PPT or the...

CHRIS TACIT:

I will do that.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Great. Okay folks. Thanks again, and don't forget, we have our NARALO call coming up next Monday, and it's going to have a special 30 minutes with the two candidates, so we look forward to hearing you and talking with you next week. Thanks again. Bye everybody.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]