
GISELLA GRUBER: Hello, everyone. Welcome to this AFRALO call on the 1st of February, 2017 at 18:30 UTC.

On the French channel we have Aziz Hilali, Tijani Ben Jemaa, Michel Tchonang, Aïcha Abbad, Ramanou Biaou, Adam Ahmat Doungous, Ndeye Amy Seck, Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong , Fatimata Seye Sylla.

On the English channel we have Daniel Nanghaka, Sarah Kiden, Isaac Maposa, Alan Greenberg, Leon Sanchez, and Mohamed El Bashir.

We have apologies from Barrack Otieno.

From staff we have Ariel Liang, Evin, and Gisella Gruber. Heidi and Silvia will not be with us tonight. So Ariel is going to write down the items to work on.

Our interpreters are Camila and Isabelle.

May I remind you to state your name when you speak so that you might be identified on the other channels so that the interpretation of what you say is precise.

Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Gisella. Hello, everyone. I am very glad to be gathered again for this online meeting of our RALO of AFRALO for the month of February. Before we start, I wanted to mention that there is a little change to our agenda. For very understandable reasons we

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

decided to invite Leon Sanchez and Alan Greenberg as you can see on Adobe Connect. They will take the floor to speak to the ALSes who are present because over the next few days we will hold the election for Board members for the ALAC seat that is available. So they will take the floor. They will each have about five minutes to describe their program and what they want to do as candidates to the seat.

So we will start with the first point – public consultations – and then we will give them the floor. I know that they are not home so I'm very grateful that they were able to come and speak to our ALSes in our African region. So thank you, both of you.

Without further delay I'm going to now mention our public comments as usual. Some of them are in process. First of all, the update of independent review. Those processes were elaborated based on the requirements of the final report of the working group – the Cross-Community Working Group on Accountability.

The second point that I would like to mention – and first, let me mention that my Internet connection is not very good as usual, of course, and so I cannot access Adobe Connect so I cannot see if you raise your hand. So I am now asking the staff to help me and tell me if someone would like to take the floor while I speak.

So second point – proposed renewal of the .MOBI Sponsored Registry Agreement. That Agreement is a little bit old. And so it is a proposed renewal –

[speaking in French]

Excuse me, the interpreter cannot interpret. We have major sound issues at this point with the French line. Okay.

So what we need is to have the comments of the community on the proposed renewal of this GNSO business area. So as far as that is concerned, it is an [amendment] decision.

Fourth point, the changes proposed for several extensions for registration. That is a point that we see very often. This concerns the release of country and territory names. There are several of them – .saxo, .scor, .walter, and so forth – and they require certain changes to be registered, to register country and territory names.

Fifth point, the initial report of the GNSO of the Curative Rights Protection Mechanisms Policy Development Process for IGO and INGOs. Again, we need the contribution of the community. A report that was drafted by the working group that worked on this process. So again, the Policy Development Process for the GNSO. So it addresses the IGO and INGO access to curative rights.

Last point referenced Japanese Label Generation Rules – for short, LGR – within ICANN for the second level. And so again, as you know, there are tables that were drafted for these reference IDNs so we need a proposal for reference Japanese Label Generation Rules for the second level. The comments that we are requesting concern the Japanese language for LGR generation rules.

So that is it for this first point on public comments and we will right away give the floor – [Wafa] or Gisella, is there someone who would like

to speak? Is there somebody who raised their hand before we move to Alan and Leon's interventions?

GISELLA GRUBER: No. Nobody raised their hand.

AZIZ HILALI: No. Very well. So we will start with the more mature of the two, the older one of the two. So Alan, you have the floor. Welcome, first of all. You have the floor and you have five minutes to address the ALSes who are present during this call. You have the floor, Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Can you hear me?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Fatimata had raised her hand. I apologize, Alan, but Fatimata had raised her hand before I gave you the floor. So Fatimata, you have the floor first. Go ahead.

GISELLA GRUBER: I actually don't see that Fatimata raised her hand, but I think that Ndeye did, however.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Hello, everyone. Can you hear me?

[GISELLA GRUBER]: Go ahead, Fatimata. We can hear you.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: I did not raise my hand, but I think that Ndeye might have done so. However, I would like to take this opportunity to introduce two new members who are interested in finding out a little bit more about AFRALO. So that's all I will say for now.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Fatimata. Let's go back to what we were saying earlier. Alan, you have the floor. Go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Can the interpreter confirm that you can hear me.

INTERPRETER: I can hear you but it's very muffled. I'm not sure. We'll see if I can interpret fine.

ALAN GREENBERG: Okay. Is this any better?

INTERPRETER: Yes, it is better. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Okay. Thank you very much. I appreciate the opportunity to do this. Leon and I are both in a meeting in Los Angeles and... Excuse me. Now my other phone is ringing. Thank you. And we stepped out of another meeting so thank you very much for giving us this opportunity.

A few minutes to quickly introduce myself. The [Inaudible]. Okay, sorry. My phone just went beep here.

I've got about 40 years of experience in building networks – both national and international networks. In the period at the end of the 1990s – 1995 to 2001 – I ran a series of networking workshops training people from developing countries to build the Internet and we trained over 1,000 people from 140 countries including both something over 40 African countries and pretty much every country that connected to the people we trained. Among our graduates were Aziz, [inaudible], and a whole bunch of other people who many of you know.

After that, I spent about [eight] years working in ITT for development, primarily in Africa and so I think I have a moderately good idea of what the state of affairs is.

In respect to being on the Board, I've got 10 years of experience in At-Large. I offered a significant percentage of the statements over the last number of years, so I think I'm in a position to understand the philosophy and the needs of At-Large and I've put enough time into it that I think I can demonstrate that I believe in it and it's an important issue.

One of the critical issues that we need to consider is – and they are bringing food into the room now so it may be a bit noisy – is that for the last nine years, there’s been one person on the Board who has been the definitive person to go to that the Board went to for knowledge and information on gTLDs, which of course is the largest single policy area that ICANN works with. And that’s been Bruce Tonkin. Bruce is no longer on the Board, and that’s a gap that I believe I can fill. There is nobody else who has [inaudible] gTLD knowledge, and being able to fill that position on the Board and do it from an At-Large perspective, I think is rather critical.

To be blunt, Leon is a friend of mine. He’s intelligent, he learns quickly, and –

AZIZ HILALI:

Gisella, what do you think? Should we give the floor to Leon?

GISELLA GRUBER:

Okay, we need a minute. Alan was with Leon. They were together on the same phone so we actually need to call both of them back to see what the best solution is. They can’t speak at this point.

AZIZ HILALI:

I think that maybe we need to move on to the next point so that we don’t waste time. What do you think, Gisella?

GISELLA GRUBER: We are calling them right now. I think that they had a hard time with their connection but I think that it's going to be better at this point.

Okay, we have Leon. So I think –

ALAN GREENBERG: It's Alan. Can someone tell me [inaudible].

GISELLA GRUBER: Leon, can you speak? Can you hear us? Leon?

ALAN GREENBERG: We can hear. Can you tell me where I was when the phone dropped?

GISELLA GRUBER: Okay. Just a second. I will ask. Okay.

AZIZ HILALI: I think that he stopped at the point where he said that he wanted to bring the point of view of At-Large to the Board, that he would represent the point of view of At-Large to the Board.

Go ahead, Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: Okay. Thank you. I will continue and I will be very brief.

Currently up until now, the one source of knowledge on gTLDs to the GNSO and on the Board has been Bruce Tonkin. He is now off the Board and I believe a critical role that I could play is bringing knowledge of gTLDs to the Board and doing it with an At-Large perspective.

I then went on to say that I believe Leon is an intelligent person, he learns quickly, he did a great job on the CCWG, but unfortunately that took him away from At-Large a lot. And although he has many good qualities, I don't believe that's a replacement for real knowledge and experience, and I do ask for your support.

Thank you and here's Leon.

LEON SANCHEZ:

Thank you very much. May I address the audience? Or are there any questions for Alan? Aziz?

AZIZ HILALI:

You can go ahead, Leon. We will have questions afterwards.

LEON SANCHEZ:

Thank you very much, Aziz. Thank you very much, Alan, for your reference. I would like to thank you all for the opportunity to interact with the AFRALO community. It is very important to me to have this interaction with you. Many of you already know me. Some of you don't know me still. But what I have is also experience on Internet related issues for more than 20 years. Maybe not as long as Alan, of course, for obvious reasons but I do offer this experience in the field and my [input]

with ICANN for the last four years. And essentially my participation as co-Chair of the [CCWG] as Alan pointed out.

I would also like to offer the diversity in terms of linguistic and cultural means that I offer coming from a developing country that is familiar with the challenges that both regions – Latin America and Africa – face. And I also have some proposals on how to overcome these challenges.

If I am benefited with the vote of the African region I could, of course, elevate those proposals by [inaudible] the Board. And I have also the advantage of managing my own working time and allow me to [inaudible] when and where to address my day job obligations and also allows me to fully dedicate my energy to ICANN-related issues and as [inaudible] demonstrated that my participation in the CCWG.

I have no problems of committing as many time as it is required for this to address the issues that are discussed in the Board as I allocated more than 20 hours a week for ICANN-related issues in my involvement with the CCWG.

I have also what I think is an advantage which is that I am younger and, again, and I feel that there must be [challenge] involved [some pressure] in ICANN I think it is a good time to continue this generational succession as Rinalia was also younger and I think that the fact that she didn't have as much knowledge as Alan has spoke about didn't refrain her from being an excellent Board member. And I think that my advantage of being a fast learner and being able to get involved in really no time with all the matters discussed within ICANN is also an

advantage for me and I will, of course, come back if and when needed for advice from those who have a deeper knowledge in certain subjects.

It has been demonstrated that I am a team player. I always try to base my decisions not only on my own needs but also on the value that other views add to certain topics on concrete problems, and I have also the ability to work to act independently and have demonstrated to be a person that likes to build bridges and alliances and I don't let my emotions get into the decisions that I make.

I always make decisions with an objective view, with an impersonal view, and try to make the most sound decision without letting any outside situations influence these decisions as far as emotional matters [inaudible].

I am also an open person and I have always tried to build close relations across the regions. And it is my commitment to continue to be close to all regions and fit my knowledge with the views of every region in order to be able to make better decisions. As I said, I have a track record of being a balanced person and [inaudible] with sound judgment. That doesn't [inaudible] my decision process.

As well as my diversity comes I am also trying to learn a little bit of French so I could better communicate in my French speaking counterparts and while that would be for me I would like to, of course, remain at your disposal to answer any questions that you might have. Thank you very much for your time.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much. Thank you, Alan. Thank you, Leon, for your presentations. We all know that you both are very involved and have been so for years within ICANN. We also know that you are very dedicated. So let me see first if some of our ALSes have questions.

Do any of you have questions for them?

Tijani, go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Alan and Leon. You are making our work very hard because both of you mentioned how wonderful the other candidate was, so you are making our work very difficult. I appreciated that actually, that you both spoke about the other candidate and highlighted their qualities.

AZIZ HILALI:

Are there any questions? If not, I have a question for the candidates. As I said, we know you very well – at least for those of us who come to the meetings. We know how dedicated you are, but what I would like to know is that the seat is not necessarily come from ALAC but it's not a representative from the ALAC per se. So how do you see your contribution? How would you defend the end user? And will you – and this is something that a lot of people within ICANN are asking about – will you ask to have a second seat for ALAC within the Board?

Who would like to speak first? You can go ahead and answer if you like.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you very much. Since we did it in this order before, we'll continue in this order and then Leon can tell me where I'm wrong. Sorry, that's a joke.

The At-Large Director does not represent and cannot plead cases on behalf of At-Large, just like the other Directors from the SOs. However, one hopes that At-Large picks a Director that they believe thinks very similar to the kinds of things At-Large wants and therefore naturally will discuss those kinds of things. And as I said, since I have a long history, I believe that my ideas are very close to that are generally felt within At-Large.

Clearly, if you just look at – as Leon says, I am older. I admit that. I can't deny it. I do put about 60 hours a week into ICANN. I'm retired and I don't have any other time constraints other than my wife [inaudible] from me. And the time that I put in is what allowed me to understand what At-Large is. So I think I could feel comfortable that I can represent At-Large without formally representing At-Large.

In terms of the Director, I feel very strongly that [inaudible].

INTERPRETER:

Alan, this is the interpreter. I am very sorry, Alan. This is the interpreter. I missed the last few sentences. It's very hard to hear. I apologize.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Okay, I'll try talking closer to the microphone. Does that help?

INTERPRETER: It is better. Yes. Thank you. Go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. I have put 60 hours a week or so into At-Large. I'm retired and I do have that flexibility. And I think that has allowed me to come very much in touch with what At-Large believes and thinks through the ALAC and all of the RALOs. So I feel I am very much in touch and can present similar ideas as if I was allowed to represent the ALAC.

In terms of the Director, Rinalia has done a superb job [inaudible] in last few years, but that does not equal having two different voices. The other SOs that have members on the Board have two voices, and I think two voices presents these in different ways is very important and I would certainly fight for trying to get a second Director for At-Large. Thank you.

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you for the question. I of course have something to add to what Alan said. As he said, it is not up to the Board member to actually push to have a second seat but it is up to the Board member to do a great performance so that the appreciation for the work done by the Director selected by the At-Large community is valued in a way that people begin to consider a second seat [indeed]. As he said, having two seats, of course, adds to the diversity of views and adds to the richness of the points to be discussed through the Board of Directors.

Hence, I would encourage you to vote for me because I believe that I can do the best work in representing [inaudible] in the Board in order

to, of course, reflect the views of the end users in the positions that I am involved in and, of course, this could be in [inaudible] to having a second seat for the At-Large community.

So at this point I would just answer this concrete question and, of course, turn back for more questions from the others.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. I have a last question. I'm not sure whether Fatimata still requests for the floor. Do you still wish to speak?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Yes. Thank you. Aziz, can you hear me?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. Go ahead.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: I just wanted us to take a second so that we can explain to the newcomers what it is that Alan and Leon have been doing and what they have applied for. I think through the answers that they've given it is somewhat clear why they have applied for this position so that was the comment I wanted to make.

Otherwise, I think we could also share some of the questions that were asked on the chat in French.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Fatimata. Indeed, there is a question from Abdeldjalil Bachar Bong and I'm going to sum up. I won't read his entire question, but he's speaking of the diversity of Internet users within ICANN and he asks how both candidates intend to defend the end users' voice, especially in connection with the African community and the underserved regions as we call them.

I'm going to give the floor to either of the candidates, whoever wishes to answer can now take the floor.

LEON SANCHEZ:

Thank you very much. We have [inaudible] in the reply. So coming from a developing country, I know the challenges that we face in order to be included in many discussions that take place in ICANN. I know that we have constraints in regard to Internet access, for example. We have restraints in regards to funding to attend ICANN meetings. We have restraints in linguistic issues. We come from countries that may or may not have official languages that are included in translations of ICANN meetings. And we have also dialects and other languages that are spoken throughout the many countries that form our regions.

One thing that I would strive and push if elected to the Board would be to enhance these translation services and promote, of course, for more available funding to try to bring more people into the discussion from underserved regions and from developing countries. I am a passionate defender of diversity and inclusion, and this has been demonstrated by my ability to bring in new people not only to the discussions within ICANN but also in other institutions in which I work for, for example, in

the Internet Governance initiative in my country I have been known for trying to include as many users as possible to bring their views into the discussion and better drive the public policies that shape our Internet governance environment in Mexico.

With this I would, of course, try to defend the end users' interests and rights to take place in the discussions and to raise their voice and to have them heard within the positions that are made in the point. And now I will hand over the phone to Alan so he can answer the question.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you, Leon. I'm afraid I can't deny the fact that I'm a North American. I was born and I've lived much of my life in North America. But I don't think I'm your typical North American. I have spent over the last 20 years working with people from developing countries and in developing countries to try to help the situation there and I think I have a very good comprehension of the issues and the constraints. Within ICANN I have been passionate to try to convince the ICANN management – not always successfully, I'm afraid yet – that people from At-Large are different than the rest of the community in that we are not making our livings from the Internet, and that if ICANN really wants us to have strong voice that it has to provide resources for us.

I participated in the last Accountability Review and I explicitly added a recommendation – which ICANN has not addressed unfortunately – that this issue has to be looked at.

As much as people from North America, for instance, or Western Europe, need support in At-Large, it's doubly so for people from

developing countries and places where English is not a predominate language. ICANN has to do a lot more in both of those areas if it is to be able to claim that it really has representation from around the world and from a diversity of cultures, languages, and perspectives, that it needs to set the right policy.

There's just no question that we are nowhere near where we want to be within ICANN in making sure that underserved areas are represented well here, and I don't think Leon and I differ at all on that. I think we are both quite passionate that this has to get better and I think both of us will continue pushing that regardless of whether we're on the Board or not. But it's certainly an area of deep concern to me. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you both very much. We've extended the time we had intended to dedicate to this item. I'm going to give the floor to Asha briefly and then I'm going to give you each one minute to reply. It is Wafa he was giving the floor to. I'm sorry.

Wafa. Go ahead.

WAFDA DAHMANI:

Thank you, Aziz. I wouldn't want to take too long. I just wanted to say that I know both candidates are excellent. But I wanted to tell them that it would be positive if we could all assume that maybe we should have a different position as ALAC and not just be based on industrial countries and such an industrial viewpoint. So I think we should always consider the voice of other actors within ICANN. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Wafa. I hope you both heard what Wafa said. I would like to echo what she is saying regarding the quality of both your applications. We wish you both the very best and I only wish there were two seats so that you would both win. Thank you very much for having joined us today. Since we have Alan and Leon with us, I would like to let you all know before they leave that there might be one more meeting if the ALSes so requested it. There is going to be a wiki page dedicated to the candidates so that any ALS member or individual or representative may ask questions to the candidates directly and for them to be able to reply on that wiki page. So thank you both very much, and like I just said, we're going to meet very soon in March in Copenhagen.

We're now going to move on. If you agree, I think we should get a number of the items on our agenda and go over what's most important then go back to the rest if we have the time. So I suggest we skip the reports on recent and upcoming activities of ALAC. If there are no objections to doing so, I'd rather we skip the subject and move on to the Board member selection directly.

As you've seen, we have Tijani here with us today. He is the Chair of the sub-group that's in charge of the Board member selection – that's the BMSPC if I'm not mistaken – then we have other two people who represent AFRALO within that group. So I'm going to give the floor to Tijani so that he can very briefly in two minutes, Tijani, explain to us what the selection procedure is, let us know what the deadlines are, what we can do, how you plan to complete your work, what should be done regarding Africa, and how the vote is going to be taken.

Go ahead.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you. Aziz. As you know, we have Alan Greenberg and Leon Sanchez as candidates. They are the ones we have selected. As of this moment, the procedure for the interactions between candidates and the community has started, so that is why we just had Alan and Leon join us to answer [your] questions. That is part of their interactions with the community.

That is part of the interactions, and the entire community and the candidates can choose what they think is the best means of communication and a deadline to receive a reply to that question has been set tomorrow. So tomorrow is the deadline to answer to that question.

Wafa and Seun are the other two representative of AFRALO within the BMSPC. So maybe if they wish, they can take the floor to tell us about the consultations and let us know what the interaction is like. So maybe what would matter is understanding what the programs are, what the candidates intend to do, should they be appointed to the Board, and that would also give us the community a chance to make questions. But until February 20th we have the time to do all that.

So from February 4th to February 20th there is going to be a number of interactions. That is the deadline and the period that has been set for the interactions between the candidates and the community. We've also set up a wiki page on which the community has the possibility of asking questions and where candidates will reply to those questions.

There is also a teleconference that's been planned that has already taken place actually. Both candidates introduced themselves throughout the teleconference, what they intend to do were they selected as Board members. That teleconference between the candidates and the community will be held live. That is going to give the community the possibility to interact with the candidates directly.

And then after February 20th we're going to start with the election. We've already selected two candidates.

AZIZ HILALI: Tijani, can you hear me?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, I hear you.

AZIZ HILALI: I'm sorry to interrupt you, but you are too close to the mic I think. There is lots of noise coming from your line so could you perhaps step a bit further away from the microphone? There's things that we don't understand when you speak and we have interpreters trying to accurately interpret what you're saying.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay. So as I said, February 21st is the date at which we're going to start the election. We have already two candidates that have been selected

and the winner at that election is going to be the person we designate as Board member to represent in Seat #15.

As I said, there were questions regarding the interactions between the community and candidates, and once we have finished up all [of] regarding the means of communication chosen would be, we're going to let you know. And then on the other hand, there's also going to be other decisions to be taken. There's going to be a poll to decide on the date of the teleconferences. All that will be informed as soon as we have definitions regarding that.

I'll stop here, Aziz. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Tijani. I would like to ask whether there's any questions, but in two words, Tijani, can you tell us how many votes our region has and who will vote on behalf of our region?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Great, Aziz. Okay. There are 15 ALAC members and RALO Chairs. Those will be the voters. So every RALO sends one representative to ALAC so they are going to vote through their ALAC members and then the Chair of the RALO. The Chair of the RALO in our case would be the AFRALO Chair. So AFRALO will have to decide who to vote, but they could also choose to have someone else vote on its behalf. They could either choose to have Aziz vote and its representation or else they are going to have to choose who else will vote in our name and then Wafa, Seun, as you know, ALAC members are going to be our representatives.

We have three ALAC members from our region so they're going to be representing us. I see Ariel raising her hand. Can we give Ariel the floor?

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. Thank you, Tijani. We're going to discuss this but before doing so, I'm going to give the floor to Ariel. I don't see her raising her hand but I give her the floor. You can go ahead.

I'm not hearing you, Ariel. Can you please unmute yourself?

ARIEL LIANG: I've already unmuted myself. Hello, can you hear me? Hello?

AZIZ HILALI: I hear you now.

ARIEL LIANG: Okay. Thank you. Thanks very much, Tijani and Aziz. I just want to add one small point. Between now to the beginning of the final election on the 21st of February, if AFRALO is going to direct the vote for Aziz to vote in this final election poll then AFRALO needs to decide whether it wants to conduct an internal vote first. That's just a procedure point and I'm hoping you can take that into consideration for this general timeline.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. That is very clear. Thank you, Ariel, for reminding us of this, so I would like to ask all our AFRALO members present here

today whether they wish to have a directed vote or not. A directed vote would mean that we would hold an election where each ALS would vote on who I should vote for. A second proposal would be to give the RALO Chairs a possibility of voting without having to justify his vote. It is up to you to choose.

I would just like to remind you that within AFRALO we've just had the experience of voting regarding Sebastien Bachollet's decision which we didn't have quorum to vote so I don't want to go back to that. It is true that we didn't have enough time perhaps, but we don't have a lot of time in this case either. We have until February 21st so we can either decide what to do now – either we discuss this on our mailing list and take a decision on the list.

My question to you is whether you would like to have a directed vote or else if you would like to have the AFRALO Chair have this preliminary vote. You can answer to my question now.

GISELLA GRUBER: Aziz, sorry. Tijani is raising his hand.

AZIZ HILALI: Who is it?

GISELLA GRUBER: Tijani.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I just meant to say that I thought Ariel said AFRALO decided on whether it is Aziz voting or someone else will have to vote.

INTERPRETER: I'm sorry but I cannot understand what Tijani is saying. Tijani is inaudible. I'm sorry.

GISELLA GRUBER: Tijani, I'm sorry. I don't know what you're doing but we cannot understand you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Can you hear me now?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. Please step away from the microphone and start over because we didn't understand what you're saying.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Can you hear me now?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. That's fine.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Like I said, the question is whether it will be Aziz voting. The rule is that it should be Aziz voting and then he would decide on who to vote or else to vote as directed by AFRALO members. So the first question, as Aziz was saying, is whether you would like Aziz to vote as directed by you or else whether he should have the liberty to choose who to vote.

So if you wish to have him vote as directed by us, you should let him know who you would like him to vote for.

AZIZ HILALI:

Okay. So starting over – would you like to have a directed vote or would you like to give the RALO Chairs the possibility of choosing who to vote for?

GISELLA GRUBER:

Is there any way we could have a vote right now – to have a yes/no vote regarding this question?

Yes, Aziz. People can choose to vote with a green symbol which they will find where they raise their hand. So they can have a green symbol and of course, only those connected on Adobe Connect will be able to vote in that case.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. Thank you, Gisella. Once again, can the RALO Chair vote without having to have directions from members of the RALO? Would anyone wish to take the floor? Are there any requests?

GISELLA GRUBER: Yes, Aziz. We have Sarah Kiden. Sarah Kiden raised her hand.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, so I'm going to give her the floor. Sarah, you can go ahead.
I'm sorry. Michel is going to have the floor after Sarah. Sarah, I cannot hear you. Can you make sure you're not muted?
Sarah, can you try now, please?

SARAH KIDEN: Hello. This is Sarah. Can you hear me?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes, I hear you now. Okay, go ahead.

SARAH KIDEN: I just wanted to go with the option where we have the RALO Chair vote on our behalf. Basing on the experience we just had where we have very few RALO [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Hello?

SARAH KIDEN: That's it. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Sarah. I am going to give the floor to Michel.

MICHEL TCHONANG: Thank you, Aziz. Good evening, everyone. I would like to answer to your question. I think there are some technical shortcomings within our RALO. But everyone should be entitled to vote as to what we should do. Still, I think we all elected officers to our RALO and we've entrusted them with the work we need to do.

But given that it isn't always possible to proceed with general consultations, I think we should trust our Chair to decide what would be best since we've already entrusted him with this. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Michel. Thank you, Sarah, as well, for your contributions. Are there others who would like to take the floor? I do not have the Internet right now so I can't see. Here it is. My Internet is back so I can see Adobe. Fatimata says yes for Aziz. [Jean] [inaudible] [Abdeldjalil] also.

It seems that there is a desire that the vote might be done by the Chair without going through a voting process.

Thank you very much for this. Let's move to the next point. First of all, thank you for your trust and your confidence. I am even more proud of the work that we do.

I apologize. I've jumped around. I didn't follow the agenda exactly as it is, but let's move to what is most urgent that we haven't discussed yet – the General Assembly that we need to put together and we really want to see successful in Johannesburg. It will be in Africa, Johannesburg, as you know and so every time that we meet, AFRALO tries to innovate. We do have an Organization Committee. We also have Sarah who will take on the responsibility of coordinating this Organization Committee and she will be in charge of making sure that each person contributes, but she will be the focus point. She will be the contact point for this General Assembly and for any other activity that we are involved in.

As you know, we need to work on Capacity Building for the new ALSes that will be there. As you know, we will have new people. I think that we have almost 50 ALSes. That is huge. And I am very happy to see that. It means that a lot of good work was accomplished. Over seven years we went from 18 ALSes to 50 ALSes, and that is something that we can really be proud of.

So we will try to use this meeting in Johannesburg to meet the new members. We know them virtually for some of them but we don't know them in person. That's the goal. That's what we want to do.

Because some of them are new and because for some of them they don't have a very clear idea of what ICANN is, of what the Policy

Development Process is, we will try with the help of the team of volunteers to put together a training activity for those ALSes.

We will also try to work on awareness and engagement at the level of a university as we did in Marrakech. We know that this is something that is difficult to put together but it is very important and I really believe in it. I am trying to find different people to contact in Johannesburg Universities. As you know, the last General Assembly that we had was in London, and you might remember that for London we had many issues with our visas. Many of our colleagues coming from Africa were not able to go to London even though we had the budget to finance their trip. But they couldn't be there due to visa issues. We also will have the joint meeting – the classical AfrICANN/AFRALO Meeting – and also the Showcase.

Since you are all present, I would like to take this opportunity to address all of you – [Jeanvieve], Fatimata, Ramanou, Sarah – all of you, Michel also, if you know people, if you have contacts in South Africa and especially in Johannesburg, please do help. We need someone on side to put together the Showcase. We need a folklore group, some type of cultural activity, and as of right now we do not have someone who can take care of that.

Second point and then I will give the floor to others. But second point, as some things were discussed within e-mails and I will now give the floor to Sarah and ask her if it would be possible to organize a first meeting for the Organization Committee for next week.

Sarah, you have the floor.

SARAH KIDEN: Hello, this is Sarah. Can you hear me?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes, I can hear you. Go ahead, Sarah.

SARAH KIDEN: We have a meeting this week [inaudible] for the Organizing Committee. I will follow up with Silvia from staff so that we can send out the call details maybe later today or tomorrow. That's [inaudible] this week. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Sarah. It wasn't quite clear. Did you already have a meeting? I couldn't quite get what you said. Did you have a meeting already?

SARAH KIDEN: We will have the meeting this week. I am going to follow up with Silvia on the call details that we can share them with other members of the Organizing Committee. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Very good. Thank you. So now I would like to ask the staff since we are talking about that, I would like to ask Silvia and Heidi – well actually they are not here – so whoever represents them I would like to ask, as you know, AFRALO leaders will start inviting people right now and so I would

like to have a meeting between the leaders – Sarah, myself, Tijani, Heidi, Gisella – as you know, Gisella will be our resource. She is the contact point for our activities within AFRALO. I would like to have a meeting so that we might figure out how we can start so that we might figure out who will do what and so I would like to, starting at the very end of February we can start to send invitations.

If there isn't anything that anybody would like to ask, we will move to the next point. Very good.

Our next point is the AFRALO/AfrICANN Joint Meeting in Copenhagen. I would like to give the floor to either Tijani or Seun or myself. It looks like Tijani wants to speak. Go ahead, Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

No. Go ahead, Aziz. I think you can go ahead and present that.

AZIZ HILALI:

I don't know if you all received the call for topics that I sent out and we only had one answer to that from that list as usual. There were some quite odd actually replies. I think that the timeline was about two weeks, so within two weeks I would like that Seun, Tijani, help us because they are the experts on several topics so I would like to ask them to help figure out a topic. My question for Tijani, if you can please address that, is whether you have suggestions that might be appropriate. Can we avoid the topic of the transition or do we still need to discuss that topic?

Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: No, I think that we are past that. There are many other topics that we can discuss. We can talk about the RDS or other things.

AZIZ HILALI: Very good. Again, I am asking you to think about a topic that we might be able to work on. Again, it is a topic that can give rise to a statement that we will address to the decision-makers – the Board of ICANN. Thank you very much.

The next ICANN meeting is only a month away – the Copenhagen meeting – so please give this some thought.

Next urgent point that we need to talk about –

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Excuse me, Aziz. If I may, I would like to say that as far as the topics that we could put forward, they could be topics that we discuss within ICANN and basically use those topics and make sure that the voice of Africa is heard. It can be a topic that is discussed within the entire ICANN community that we want to give our opinion on – connectivity, access, and so forth – is naturally a topic that is discussed within ICANN, but for example, we have the issue of the RDS – the new WHOIS. We have other topics. There are many other topics that are current issues within ICANN and I think that what we need to do is choose a topic that is newsworthy within the entire community and discuss it and give Africa's point of view.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Tijani, for this.

Now, let's talk about new ALS applications. As you know, I believe we gave our approval for two associations based in Brazzaville – one on Education and one in Morocco – the Women's Association for Development and Cooperation – that was received on January 10th. We need to decide on two new ALSes, and if we approve them, we will be at 52 ALSes. So the group for Education and Promotion of Women in Chad. The application was received on December 9th. Due diligence was received on January 22nd – so just a week ago or so.

Do you agree? Do you think that AFRALO should give a positive recommendation on that ALS?

The second one is an NGO of women – Women and ICT based out of Abidjan in Ivory Coast. We received due diligence on January 25th.

I do have a question for all of you. Do you – yes or no – want to approve these ALSes? I see two hands – Tijani and Mohamed El Bashir.

[MOHAMED EL BASHIR] :

Hello? I think I'm muted.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes, you can go ahead and give the floor to Mohamed. Mohamed, you have the floor.

Mohamed? We cannot hear you. Are you muted perhaps? Would you like to check?

AZIZ HILALI: We're going to give the floor to Fatimata. Fatimata, you have the floor now.

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Thank you, Aziz. I wanted to go back to the GA in Johannesburg. I've been discussing with Seun to make sure we could send a video from the community and I think Seun would like to take the floor but he's having trouble with his mic so he cannot speak, so he asked me to let you know this.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. So Seun has people in South Africa? He knows people there? Is that right?

FATIMATA SEYE-SYLLA: Yes. We have active members in South Africa and at the Durban meeting, in fact, we discussed with Seun to make sure we could reach some of the academic community there.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Fatimata. As you say, it is true that we had already undertaken this work for the Durban meeting and it went very well. So thank you very much, Seun. Seun, you can send us an e-mail to

the Organizing Committee e-mail if you have any local contacts, if you have anyone you would like to put us in touch with over there.

Going back to my question, I would like to know who objects to giving our support to the new applications for l'Education et la Promotion de la Femme in Chad and the other ALS which is FEMMES &TIC from Abidjan in Ivory Coast. Does anyone object to our support to these applications?

I don't see anyone raising their hands. Abdeldjalil is saying on the chat, "We could also use the [inaudible] South Africa [Axis] office members." I'm not sure what you mean by that. But in the absence of any [inaudible], I would therefore like to declare that we're going to give our support for these applications and I'm going to ask Ariel to take note of this action item which is the fact that Sarah as the Secretary is going to send Natalie and the rest of the staff the affirmative vote of AFRALO regarding these applications, our support to these applications.

There is one more application that is not included in our support. Please consider this application. It is something we've received recently. It's interesting and it comes from a country that is not represented within our RALO right now, that is Malawi, and it is called the ICT Association of Malawi.

Seun, I'm not sure whether or not you can hear me, but if you can, you have the floor.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Is that me, Seun? Hello?

AZIZ HILALI: We hear you, Seun. You can go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. Thank you. Finally. Sorry I've been having challenges with the mic for quite some time. I just wanted to say that yes, [inaudible] the first one [inaudible] on the topic that I will be using for the next meeting ICANN [inaudible] for statement. [inaudible]. That is something in relation to the [inaudible]. Fatimata mentioned that. I will try to reach out to some contact that we have in South Africa, in Johannesburg and follow up with Aziz and the team on that.

The last one is one thing I said before [inaudible] in relation to the Board election. I would suggest that we still give RALOs who are not currently on the call the opportunity to express their preference on whether they'd like to vote for their choice or whether they should leave it to Aziz [and to] the Chair to vote on their behalf.

It would be good if we give maybe one or two days or three days and [inaudible] timeline for people to express their interest, their preference, and because [inaudible] and then the Chair can declare what the consensus [inaudible] so that they would be able to show [inaudible] interest into consideration. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Seun. I'm not sure you were here for the discussion we had. I asked clearly whether members wanted to have a directed vote or else if they preferred to let the Chair vote and it was unanimously decided that the Chair would vote so as not to have to go

through the consultation for the directed vote. That decision was taken earlier today. Do you agree with that, Seun? Is that what you were discussing?

SEUN OJEDEJI:

I personally am fine with that. What I'm just saying is that right now we probably don't have all the ALSes on this call. [Let us] take note of that and also give the opportunity for other ALSes to express their view between now and the next three days on the list. That is the point I was trying to make.

I am also fine with that suggestion [but let out of] the other ALSes the opportunity to make their suggestion on the list as well. So don't finalize yet. That is my point. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Yes, it's a different point of view. Is there someone else speaking? I think all ALSes were invited to attend our meeting, and as you know, whenever we have discussions on the mailing list very few members actually reply. I don't know what the rest of the members here think. Tijani, would you like to reply?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes. I'd like to say that Seun's request is reasonable and I think we could have a consensus call going on for two to three days during which we would ask ALSes whether the vote of the AFRALO Chair should be directed or not. We give them three days to reply to that question and if over those three days there is a majority of members saying that they

wish to have a directed vote, in that case we're going to take another three days for ALSes to be able to say on the list who they wish the Chair to vote for.

That would be a total of six days. Maybe that is what we could do.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Tijani. But that means we're going to start over. I have no objection to doing that.

Please hold on, Michel. I'll give you the floor next. I would like to finish saying what I'm saying.

What Tijani and Seun are saying is that they wish to reorganize our entire process so we're going to have to have a second vote. If we were to do this, Ariel would have to organize an anonymous vote for people to vote anonymously, and then I think we would have the same problem because we wouldn't know who answered and who didn't. So that would be a bit of a challenge to the procedure. It would make no point because we would still have many people who would not vote.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Can I clarify something, Aziz? I would like to clarify what I was saying.

AZIZ HILALI:

Go ahead. Yes, Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: No, I'm not asking you to have an anonymous vote. I just mean we should have a consensus call.

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. What I'm saying is, having an e-mail sent out to ask for a consensus call is not the way to go. That wouldn't work. Then if we have a vote, there are going to be three or four people replying. That makes no point. As we all know, it is at our monthly teleconferences that people most participate, whether actively or orally. So I think this is the best level of participation we would get.

As Chair I should say then we should have a formal vote of which Ariel would organize a vote for every ALS and in the event that we don't have enough quorum over the one week that it would take us, we would have to proceed to a second vote and then whatever the results of the vote, we would have to send that out.

Michel, you have the floor.

MICHEL TCHONANG: Aziz, I'm not comfortable with the way you're summing up what was saying. I think the question to everyone present here is whether they consider this meeting to be valid or not. If it is not, fine. I would agree with Tijani in that case, with Aziz in that case, and we should organize an anonymous meeting. But we are supposed to have a valid quorum here today and the decision we took a while back would then be valid. In that case, our Chair would have the power to vote on our behalf as he wishes.

Otherwise, every ALS should vote electronically. So I think it depends on how we interpret this. What's the point of voting [inaudible] if we won't trust [inaudible] later on.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Michel. We are running late. They're asking us to wrap up. I'm first going to give Seun the floor so that he can have the right of reply. I just wish to clarify that all the people present here who are – we have 23 people connected here at our meeting – so Seun, do you suggest we hold a formal vote? In that case I think we should ask the staff to organize an anonymous vote. I wouldn't want us to decide if it is not unanimously.

Seun, you have the floor. You have the right of reply right now. Do you want me to ask the staff to organize a vote regarding a directed vote – yes or no, Seun? Go ahead. You have the floor.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

I [inaudible] that this is going to take this long discussion. All I was just talking about was a consensus check. This is the [outcome] of the meeting we had today. Is there anyone who oppose who is not in the meeting who oppose to what we actually decided in the meeting? It's just a consensus check. There is no need for a vote or organizing a vote or something. [Inaudible]. We have already made a decision here so people who are [ALSes] are not currently on the call. Let's give one or two days [inaudible] to [post] that decision on the list and [see if there is] anybody who would say, "No, I object."

One of the reasons why it is good to have [inaudible] decision is because it's also [inaudible] the ALSes. Of course, no one [inaudible] have made the effort to reach out to them on this very, very, important matter.

I personally have no opposition to the decision that was made here. I just think it would be good for us to – we have the time anyway. You can [inaudible] three days. So that's just my point. Otherwise, [Inaudible] the decision that has been made. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Seun. So to answer you, I have actually a suggestion. What we are going to do – and actually I would like to make sure that things are very clear on both channels – what I would like is that Sarah sends a review of this meeting, an update, to explain to all ALSes that there is going to be an election. I would like for her to explain how it will happen and for her to explain that each RALO will have a voice, will have a vote and the President will have that vote. We had a meeting and we decided to give a proxy to the Chair of AFRALO who will vote on behalf of AFRALO and we are asking the ALSes who are against that decision to express it so that we might address that. We will give them a timeline to answer. If there is no answer, it means that we have consensus of all ALSes.

Do you agree with my suggestion, Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you very much. That is exactly what I was talking about, just a consensus check. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Could you repeat? I couldn't hear you. I'm sorry.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Can you hear me now?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes. Go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. Thank you, Aziz. That is exactly what I was saying is just a consensus check, and I'm sure [inaudible] respond that agree [inaudible] with everybody. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Very good. So Sarah, could you please take care of that? Of course, I will help you. We will come to an agreement as to what the exact e-mail will say, but could you take care of that?

Sarah, you have the floor.

SARAH KIDEN: Yes, I will take care of that. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. Very good. So we have an agreement. We do have to stop our meeting at this point. There are several things that we were not able to discuss and I would like to apologize again to the interpreters for the delays, but Ariel, you have something to add, I think. I'm sorry. Do you agree with the decision?

Ariel, you have the floor.

ARIEL LIANG: Thanks, Aziz. Seun, yes. I think that's a good way forward. I just want to add, if we decide to conduct a vote for all the ALSes the time is not a lot and if we [can't] reach a quorum we can't really afford to extend the vote a long time because ultimately it's only about 16 days from February the 4th to February the [inaudible] all the RALOs to make their decisions. So the [inaudible] limitations here. But I think what Aziz proposed is a good way forward.

AZIZ HILALI: Good. Thank you very much, Ariel. Are there others who would like to take the floor at this point?

It doesn't look like it. Thank you all. Thank you, Camila and Isabelle. We did go over time again. Thank you, Ariel. Thank you, Gisella. Thank you to all of the staff members who helped us organize this meeting. Thank you all for being present. It was a long meeting but I think it was for a good cause.

Thank you all. Have a good evening.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you, Aziz. Thank you, everyone. Bye-bye.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you, everyone for the meeting. It is now disconnected. Have a wonderful evening.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]