Pamela Smith: (12/20/2016 13:50) Welcome, everyone, to the 29th Plenary Call of the CCT Review!

Pamela Smith: (13:50) Please note that this meeting will be recorded. Please mute your phones by pressing *6. Press *6 to unmute.

Jonathan Zuck: (12/21/2016 06:00) SOMEONE knows the proper way to address me!

Waudo: (06:00) Goodevening all

Pamela Smith: (06:01) Good morning, good day, good evening...merry Christmas, happy Channukah, joyful Kwanzaa, and happy day.

Carlton Samuels: (06:03) Good morning Pam and all. Seasons Greetings

Laureen Kapin: (06:04) Happy holidays to all!

Dejan Djukic: (06:05) Seasons Greetings! good afternoon

Carlton Samuels: (06:06) Everytime somebody's rooster crow my A/C room go bonkers!

Calvin Browne 2: (06:07) afternoon all - having some connection issues

Carlton Samuels: (06:07) Oh, maybe its not just me! Up and down like a yo-yo!

Gao M (tablet): (06:09) good afternoon all,

Drew: (06:09) yes, we can hear you

Gao M (tablet): (06:10) we can hear you Waudo

Gao M (tablet): (06:11) it was one company with 10 gTLDs or so.

Eleeza Agopian: (06:12) I think Dave may be mistaken -- if they applied and were one of the 1,930 applications, they should have been represented in the contact list we drew together for the survey.

Eleeza Agopian: (06:12) regardless of if they withdrew.

Carlton Samuels: (06:12) @Eleeza, can you verify? Given the numbers and geolocation, I would like to see further exploration
Eleeza Agopian: (06:14) I would need the applicant's name to verify. We don't have the contact list segregated by region/country.
Carlton Samuels: (06:15) @Eleeza. OK. Lets start with the Withdrawn pool and see. Is that quickly extractable?

Eleeza Agopian: (06:15) But the contact list was constructed from all 1930 applications, which of course includes any that withdrew.

Eleeza Agopian: (06:15) No. We did not segregate them by application status -- just applicant name and contact email.

Megan Richards: (06:19) could someone put the correct slide up

Eleeza Agopian: (06:19) We're on slide 15, Megan. You all have scroll control.

Gao M (tablet): (06:20) the company is MultiChoice

Megan Richards: (06:20) right. found it again

Carlton Samuels: (06:21) There is an echo on the line

Waudo: (06:22) cannot make out what Davi is saying. Please repeat his question

Pamela Smith: (06:22) It seems to have been resolved, Carlton. Everyone, please make sure your computer is muted if you are on a phone line as well.

Carlton Samuels: (06:22) David very low. Straining to hear

Pamela Smith: (06:24) David, could you speak a bit louder?

Megan Richards: (06:24) agree with David

Carlton Samuels: (06:24) So approx 2 applications in the set were withdrawn in the contracting process. These could be 2 of the 10 African withdrawals. Could we finger these directly?

Eleeza Agopian: (06:25) Only if they waived their anonymity in responding to the survey.

Carlton Samuels: (06:25) Aaah ok.

David Taylor: (06:26) thanks

Carlton Samuels: (06:28) @Eleeza, 10 applicants from the global south withdrawing at contracting is significant. I really would like to know more. So I'm making an official request for further exploration.

David Taylor: (06:28) Also note that the refund was far greater the earlier you withdrew. Certainly a factor.

Eleeza Agopian: (06:28) Carlton, happy to help, but I'm not sure what you'd like me to explore.
Pamela Smith: (06:29) Slide 20, everyone

David Taylor: (06:29) T

David Taylor: (06:29) thanks Pamela

Carlton Samuels: (06:29) Oh, the reason[s] for that action, assuming they will share it on record

Eleeza Agopian: (06:30) The reasons for why those particular applicants withdrew at contracting?

Carlton Samuels: (06:30) Yes ma'am, much thanks

Eleeza Agopian: (06:31) Carlton, we need to discuss this in more depth. That's a substantial task. We did reach out to all applicants via this survey.

Megan Richards: (06:31) interesting assessment on GAC ew as the statistics we showed in the draft report indicate a rather different outcome namely avoiding legal problems, geographic conflicts etc

Carlton Samuels: (06:32) @Eleeza. Ok. Willing to. Let's talk after this on Skype

Eleeza Agopian: (06:32) I think we should discuss this on the call with the full team, if we have a few minutes.

Carlton Samuels: (06:32) Not a problem

David Taylor: (06:40) Love the comment on Digital Archery :-)

Megan Richards: (06:41) Robin Hood :-)

Megan Richards: (06:45) could we have scrolling rights again. I wanted to look again at one of the slides

Jonathan Zuck: (06:45) became 512

Pamela Smith: (06:47) You should be able to scroll again, Megan

Pamela Smith: (06:47) Yes,

Jean-Baptiste Deroulez: (06:48) @Megan done, you have also received the slides via email yesterday.

Carlton Samuels: (06:48) Here's why. Of the 1930 applications, 17 were from Africa. There were 683 applications withdrawn in total. When 10 (of 17) withdrew and at contracting, its mildly interesting.

Carlton Samuels: (06:48) Correction, 583 withdrawals.

Carlton Samuels: (06:49) https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__newgtlds.icann.org_en_program-2Dstatus_statistics-2Dtype&d=DgICaQ&c=FmY1u3PJp6wrcrwl3mSVzgfkbPSS6sJms7xcl4I5cM&r=xen1OHG3G0eZcGi0xsS5bhCduioE11i4EKh7Jw9mxM&m=rAWI-
David Taylor: (06:49) It is certainly mildly significant!

Eleeza Agopian: (06:50) Calvin, is that a new hand?

Megan Richards: (06:51) David could you repeat re the sample size on the GAC questions?

Jonathan Zuck: (06:52) probably a bias against those who withdrew early

Waudo: (06:52) sspeaket inaudible

Waudo: (06:52) speaker

Megan Richards: (06:56) clear. thx

Waudo: (07:00) could just be an extension of THIS survey?

Carlton Samuels: (07:02) Can I speak? I'm now on the audio bridge

Waudo: (07:05) maybe we can jsu make a note on this in our report

Waudo: (07:05) maybe we can just make a note on this in our report

Carlton Samuels: (07:05) @Waudo: Exactly! Just so people know we noticed and attempted to get to the bottom of it.

Carlton Samuels: (07:07) Let's not bounce the rubble!

David Taylor: (07:08) Re the agenda, just to let you know I will have to drop off 15 mins before the end of the call so perhaps better speaking on the RPMs earlier than later for my 4 mins

Carlton Samuels: (07:09) @David: Met Lori/INCTA in Hyderabad

Waudo: (07:09) Thanks David

Carlton Samuels: (07:09) Sorry, not Hyderabad, Guadalajara

Carlton Samuels: (07:10) Thanks David

Laureen Kapin: (07:13) Can we get scrolling for RPM doc?

Eleeza Agopian: (07:13) Laureen, you should be able to scroll now.

Megan Richards: (07:20) I had similar questions but David has answered them particularly on qualitative aspects

Megan Richards: (07:22) all ok for me
David Taylor: (07:22) I will keep listening until I have to go?

Carlton Samuels: (07:24) Can we have scrolling control please?

Pamela Smith: (07:25) You got it!

Carlton Samuels: (07:38) @Laureen: +1 to applicants specifying what is being mitigated and how we know!

Carlton Samuels: (07:40) @Laureen: There was a notion that the team would have a focused conversation in re PICs and measurements with ICANN Compliance. Are we still thinking this would be useful?

Carlton Samuels: (07:43) @Jonathan: Very useful qualification you make on prescription: between data being collected and available vs coding and reporting.

Megan Richards: (07:49) very useful and clear

Jamie Hedlund 2: (07:51) Could not disagree more.

Jamie Hedlund 2: (07:53) Voluntary PICS are offered by the applicant, and range over a variety of matters. Inclusion of the voluntary PICS make them enforceable like all other provisions in the agreement. That’s it.

Pamela Smith: (07:53) It's Kaili's line. I am trying to mute it but it is not cooperating

Jamie Hedlund 2: (07:53) They may or may not be "practical" or measurable by metrics.

Jamie Hedlund 2: (07:54) There is no requirement or criteria around the voluntary PICs

Carlton Samuels: (07:54) @Laureen: Yes, that's exactly what I'm, saying!

Kaili Kan 2: (07:55) Sorry that I have a very bad connection, on and off.

Kaili Kan 2: (07:57) Sorry that I have a very bad connection, on and off. Also not able to control it.

Carlton Samuels: (08:02) @Jamie: We understand there were no criteria set and no policy direction. But some of us saw that soon as these were announced and said so. Now that we can agree they were substandard we are making a recommendation for future rounds

Jamie Hedlund 2: (08:04) Thanks for the clarification @Carlton.

Carlton Samuels: (08:05) I have to drop off now folks. Thanks very much for this discussion. Happy Holidays to all.
Drew 2: (08:05) I have to jump off the call. I think we should keep these recommendations future-focused. If anything, this analysis has shown us that it's very difficult to look back at any effect of the existing voluntary PICs (other than the types of mechanisms created).

Carlton Samuels: (08:05) @Margie: +1 to directions for the next folks!

Drew 2: (08:05) Happy holidays! Merry Christmas! Happy Hannukah! Happy New Year!

Drew 2: (08:06) sounds good Jonathan

Kaili Kan 2: (08:06) Happy holidays! Bye!

Gao M (tablet): (08:06) happy holidays all

Megan Richards: (08:06) happy holidays to all celebrating

Pamela Smith: (08:07) Merry Christmas! Happy Channukah! Blessed Kwanzaa! Happy Holidays!