

**ADOBE CONNECT CHAT TRANSCRIPT  
CCT REVIEW PLENARY CALL #25  
16 NOVEMBER 2016**

Pamela Smith: (11/15/2016 12: 38) Hello, everyone, and welcome to the 25th Plenary Meeting of the CCT Review!

Pamela Smith: (12: 38) Please note that this meeting will be recorded. Please mute your phones by pressing \*6. Press \*6 to unmute.

Carlos Raul G.: (11/16/2016 05: 00) good morning

Pamela Smith: (05: 01) Good morning, Carlos.

Gaongalelwe (mobile): (05: 02) good morning!!!!

Fabro Steibel: (05: 03) Good lunch everyone!

Jonathan Zuck: (05: 04) we're expecting Jordyn, right?

Pamela Smith: (05: 04) As far as we know, JOnathan.

Gaongalelwe (mobile): (05: 07) not mine SOI

Calvin Browne: (05: 08) hi all

Waudu: (05: 22) My connection keeps breaking - sorry about that

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 24) Now we now is Kaili.....

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 24) : )

Laureen Kapin 2: (05: 36) Have to sign off now, apologies.

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 37) by Laureen

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 38) bye

Jordyn A Buchanan 2: (05: 45) Yes, that's Donuts.

Fabro Steibel: (05: 47) I support the suggestion.

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 48) @Zuck: Who's comment?

Fabro Steibel: (05: 49) Not sure if it implementable, because it is based on contract arrangements and voluntary actions, however... it is a good understanding that if you start a voluntary opportunity, you should sustain the commitment bilaterally, and not withdraw it unilaterally

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 49) I can raise my hand....

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 49) can't raise my hand

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 49) comes down automatically

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 53) regular self reporting of the PICs

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 54) if they want to build the argument to take it back, they have to show serious arguments in their regular reports

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 54) I would strongly recommend to think about self regulation, self reporting

Carlos Raul G.: (05: 57) BEFORE we fall into compliance issues

Pamela Smith: (05: 58) Megan, have you joined us?

Pamela Smith: (05: 58) Who is the number beginning 32 and ending 2443, please?

Jonathan Zuck: (05: 59) there were some that were meant to overcome GAC concerns, no?

Pamela Smith: (06: 00) 2nd request: who is the number beginning 32 and ending 2443? Please answer or I will need to disconnect you.

Jordyn A Buchanan 2: (06: 00) Jonathan, yes that's why some of them exist. It's also not clear that the PICs had any effect on GAC advice. : -)

Jordyn A Buchanan 2: (06: 01) (i.e., for two different applications that received the same Early Warning, did we see that it altered the behavior re: GAC Advice?)

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 03) i want to comment on Jordyn's

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 13) hand raised

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 14) my hand keeps falling down

Waudou: (06: 14) i'm still on and off unfortunately

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 16) public session #2

Waudou: (06: 17) make periodic reports of ...

Waudou: (06: 18) without price data it is basically not possible to establish "competition"

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 18) Can somebody check why I cant raise my hand longer than 1 second please?????

Pamela Smith: (06: 18) I have Carlos. I am not sure what the problem is.

Pamela Smith: (06: 18) Will continue to check.

Waudu: (06: 20) registrar price data is basically PUBLIC -though hard to compile - it should be possible for registrars be required to make periodic reports to ICANN

Waudu: (06: 23) cant seem to get the mic

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 23) averages and medians is a first step

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 24) for transactions

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 24) real transactions

Waudu: (06: 25) sale price, renewal price, transfer price. That's what is required. Avoid the promo prices, bundling etc.

Waudu: (06: 26) Caveat that the time span is short to make the assessment

Waudu: (06: 26) make the

Kaili Kan: (06: 27) A fundamental issue was just raised: What is ICANN? Is it a regulator or not? In my opinion, it is a regulator of the DNS industry. Although we are not governmental, but this is only because of the very nature of the Internet. This does not reduce our responsibility by any means.

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 29) ICANN has the role of assigning the unique resources. (like spectrum)

Waudu: (06: 29) Have to check Andy's report on that.

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 29) so it has a good case to be the repository for statistically relevant data, that would not be traceable to any individual market agent

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 30) any publicly quoted registry would also report the number of registrations and its income.

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 30) so we would have a good value for the average pricing

Brian Aitchison: (06: 31) Having a talk with Stan about it today

Waudu: (06: 31) Carlos you are awaiting HHIs measuring what?

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 31) Thanks Brian!

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 32) @Waudu: country HHIs

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 32) for the countries that were analyzed in the regional market studies

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 32) @Jonathan you are right we have to get that point also in the list

Eleeza Agopian: (06: 33) All, my apologies as I have to log off.

Waudu: (06: 34) That's a good measure Jordyn. It will also indicate competition level

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 34) I also have to go

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 34) sorry

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 34) and thanks

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 34) I think 90minutes is the optimal time....

Carlos Raul G.: (06: 35) will follow on the phone while driving if staff can request a bridge please

Pamela Smith 2: (06: 35) Will call out, Carlos.

Jonathan Zuck: (06: 42) Yep

Waudu: (06: 54) the renewal rates study is interesting but I'm still wondering about the "real" cost of a domain. It may be approaching zero, meaning that real renewal costs are insignificant especially if registries are involved in parking

Waudu: (06: 56) recommend a study on parking

Waudu: (06: 57) ok

Kaili Kan: (06: 58) the parking issue must be included in our report, it is so important an issue: 2/3 of the total new registrations!

Pamela Smith 2: (06: 59) Thank you all!

Kaili Kan: (06: 59) not only in future studies.

Kaili Kan: (06: 59) Bye!

Drew 2: (06: 59) ciao!

Calvin Browne 2: (06: 59) ciao

Pamela Smith 2: (06: 59) Ciao!